

INDISKE STUDIER VII

ĀRYADEVA'S CATUḤŚATAKA

ON THE BODHISATTVA'S
CULTIVATION OF MERIT AND
KNOWLEDGE

by Karen Lang


Akademisk Forlag
Copenhagen 1986

© 1986 by Chr. Lindtner

Composing: Satsform, Århus

Printed in Denmark by Narayana Press, Gylling

ISBN 87-500-2619-4



Preface

The *Catuhṣataka* is the major work, in four hundred verses, of the Madhyamaka scholar Āryadeva. Despite the interest in Madhyamaka philosophy and the abundance of articles published on Nāgārjuna, his illustrious teacher, Āryadeva's work has received scant attention. Although the *Catuhṣataka* was originally written in Sanskrit, and later translated into Chinese (the last eight chapters only) and Tibetan, only fragments of the Sanskrit text now remain. An incomplete manuscript of Candrakīrti's commentary on the text, the *Bodhisattvayogācāraca-tuḥṣatakaṭīkā*, was discovered and published by Haraprasad Shastri in 1914. P. L. Vaidya and V. Bhattacharya, working with Shastri's edition and the Tibetan translations, have edited the later half of the *Catuhṣataka*. In preparing this new edition of the complete text, I am indebted to their previous work.

My own work on this text began as part of my doctoral dissertation work under Prof. D. Seyfort Rugg at the University of Washington. Much of what I know about Madhyamaka has been acquired through attending his lectures and seminars on Madhyamaka texts, and I am grateful to him for sharing his knowledge with me. During my stay in Dharamsala in 1978, aided by a Fulbright-Hays doctoral dissertation fellowship, I benefited by hearing Geshe N. Dhargyey's lectures on this text and rGyal tsab's commentary and by discussions of it with Losang Gyaltsen and Geshe Sonam Rinchen. I also wish to thank Prof. Chr. Lindtner for his numerous and helpful suggestions for improving my translation, for lending me his own translation of chapter 16, and for his additions to the edition of the text and its annotation. I hope that the publication of this work will stimulate other scholars to correct whatever errors still remain and to make further contributions to the understanding of Āryadeva's *Catuhṣataka*.

K.L., Charlottesville, VA.

Abbreviations

AK	Abhidharmakośa
AŚ	Akṣaraśataka
Bhatt.	Vidhusekhara Bhattacharya
BS	*Bodhisambhāra(ka)
BV	Bodhicittavivaraṇa
C	Cone
CL	Christian Lindtner
CŚ	Catuḥśataka
CŚT	Catuḥśatakaṭikā
CS	Catuḥstava
D	sDe dge
Dhp.	Dhammapada
DṬ	sDe dge edition of the Catuḥśatakaṭikā
HPS	Haraprasad Shastri
LVP	Louis de La Vallée Poussin
MĀ	Madhyamakāvatāra
MK	Mūlamadhyamakakārikā (ed. LVP and CL)
N	sNar than
P	Peking
PP	Prasannapadā
PṬ	Peking edition of the Catuḥśatakaṭikā
RĀ	Ratnāvali
SL	Suhṛllekha
SN	Suttanipāta
ŚS	Śūnyatāsaptati
T	Taishō
Thag.	Theragāthā
Thig.	Therīgāthā
Uv.	Udānavarga
VV	Vigrahavyāvartanī
YṢ	Yuktiṣaṣṭikā

Introduction

1. Life and works

Traditional biographical accounts identify Āryadeva as Nāgārjuna's student and his successor in the Madhyamaka lineage. These accounts concur also on his high status birth, his renunciation of this status for life as a monk, his impressive intellectual abilities, and his skill in debate; they differ, however, on the details. The earliest of these sources, translated into Chinese by Kumārajīva at the beginning of the fifth century C. E., the *T'i p'o p'u sa chuan* (T. 2048), says that the bodhisattva Deva was born a brahmin in south India, studied with Nāgārjuna, defeated heterodox teachers in public debate, and retired to the forest to compose his works, the **Śataka* and the *Catuḥśataka* (CŚ), where a student of one of the defeated teachers murdered him.¹ But Candrakīrti, in his commentary on the CŚ, the *Bodhisattvayogācārakatuhśatakaṭīkā* (D f.31b, P f.34b) tells a different story in a brief biographical note: Āryadeva was born on the island of Sīnhala as the king's son, gave up his royal position to enter the religious life, and came to south India to study with Nāgārjuna. Hsüan tsang's record of his pilgrimage to India, the *Ta T'ang Hsi Yu Chi*, also reports that the bodhisattva Deva left the island of Sīnhala to go on pilgrimage to India, met the aging Nāgārjuna in the southern kingdom of the Śāta-vāhanas, and became his student.²

Some scholars associate this island with Śrī Laṅkā and suggest that Āryadeva is the *thera* Deva mentioned in the Sinhalese chronicles, the *Mahāvamsa* (XXXV,29) and the *Dīpavamsa* (XXII, 41).³ É. Lamotte, who places Āryadeva in Śrī Laṅkā during the latter half of the third century C. E., believes that he left the island at the time of the Vetulla-vāda heresy, that is, Mahāyāna, came to India as an already accomplished scholar, became an advocate of Madhyamaka under Nāgārju-

1. R. Robinson summarizes this biography in *Early Mādhyamika in India and China*, Madison, 1967, p. 27; Yamakami Sōgen translates excerpts in *Systems of Buddhist Thought*, Calcutta, 1912, pp. 187-194. See also the entry on Āryadeva in *The Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, ed. G. P. Malalasekera, Colombo, 1966, pp. 109-115 for a summary of this and other biographical material.
2. See S. Beal, *Buddhist Records of the Western World*, II, London, 1884, pp. 209-212.
3. See *Extended Mahāvamsa*, ed. G. P. Malalasekera, London, 1937, p. 346 and *Dīpavamsa, the Chronicle of the Island of Ceylon*, ed. B. C. Law, *Ceylon Historical Journal*, v. VII (1957-1958), p. 123.

na's tutelage, and published his own works after his master's death in the first years of the fourth century C. E.⁴

The problem of dating Āryadeva is linked with the difficulties of determining the date of his teacher.⁵ Lamotte, relying on Chinese sources, calculates third century birthdates for Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva and for the composition of Harivarman's **Tattva/Satyasiddhi*.⁶ But Harivarman quotes CŚ,II,8, which makes Lamotte's 253 C.E. date for this text's composition incompatible with a birthdate of 243 C.E. for Nāgārjuna and an even later date for Āryadeva's birth. If Kumārajīva's information on the mid-third century date of the **Tattva/Satyasiddhi* is accurate, Āryadeva must have been active earlier, flourishing sometime between the middle of the second and third centuries C.E. Other Chinese sources, Seng chao, who says that Āryadeva lived eight hundred years after the *nirvāṇa* of the Buddha, and Hui yuan, who says that Nāgārjuna lived in the ninth century A.N., also place both Madhyamaka scholars in the third century C.E.⁷ This information, along with the probable association of Nāgārjuna, and perhaps Āryadeva also, with one of the Śātavāhana kings, whose dynasty ended in the mid-third century C.E.,⁸ favors the hypothesis of dating Āryadeva's literary activity between the years 225 and 250 C.E. Although there is no conclusive evidence to support the identification of the *thera* Deva with Āryadeva, these dates are compatible with the theory that he left Śrī Lankā for India when King Voharikatissa (215-237 C.E.) suppressed the innovative ideas of the Vetullavādins.

South India, where Āryadeva studied under Nāgārjuna, was fertile ground for the development of innovative ideas on the transcendent nature of the Buddha, the career of the bodhisattva, the selfless and empty nature of both persons and phenomena (*dharmapudgalanairāt-*

4. É. Lamotte, *Le Traité de la Grand Vertu de Sagesse de Nāgārjuna*, III, Louvain, 1970, p. 1373, n. See also J. May, *Chūgan, Hōbōgirin*, V, p. 479.

5. See D. S. Ruegg, *The Literature of the Madhyamaka School in India*, Wiesbaden, 1981, pp. 4-5, n. 1 (ref.).

6. É. Lamotte, *L'Enseignement de Vimalakīrti*, Louvain, 1962, pp. 72-76; *Traité*, III, p. lii. Cf. J. W. de Jong's review of *Traité*, III, in *Asia Major*, n.s. 17 (1971), p. 107.

7. Robinson (1967), p. 22.

8. See Lamotte (1962) and *Traité*, I, Louvain, 1949, p. xiii. On the chronology of the Śātavāhanas see K. Gopalachari, 'The Śātavāhana Empire' in K. A. Nilakanta Sastri, *A Comprehensive History of India*, v.II, Bombay, 1957, p. 295; K. Gopalachari, *Early History of the Andhra Country*, Madras, 1941, pp. 28-29, and A. K. Warder, *Indian Buddhism*, Delhi, 1970, pp. 326-327, 392-394.

mya), and on the two levels of truth. These ideas, which later became associated with the Mahāyāna sūtras and the Mahāyāna śāstras of Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva, may have originated in the various Mahāsāṅghika groups.⁹ Tradition associates both scholars with the Andhra site of Nāgārjunakoṇḍa, a site inhabited by Mahāsāṅghikas and monks from Śrī Laṅkā.¹⁰ The limited information we have on the Andhra Mahāsāṅghikas and their works – they may have authored early versions of *Prajñāpāramitā* and *Ratnakūṭasūtras* –¹¹ suggests they may have influenced the development of both Mādhyamikas' thought.

Traditional sources on Āryadeva's life and his own surviving works attest to his skill in defending the Madhyamaka tenets against adversaries from within the Buddhist community and heterodox 'outsiders'. The latter half of the CŚ is an important source of information on the views of Āryadeva's adversaries: Ābhīdharmikas, as well as Vaiśeṣika, Sāṃkhya and Jaina philosophers.

Candrakīrti says in the CŚT (D f.31b, P f.34b) that there is no fundamental difference between Nāgārjuna's philosophy in the Madhyamaka śāstras and Āryadeva's point of view in the CŚ. A close study of Āryadeva's and Nāgārjuna's work is certainly desirable, but I will leave that for the future. There is no doubt that Āryadeva has been much influenced by Nāgārjuna's writings, and the annotation to this translation of the CŚ indicates Nāgārjuna's parallel treatment of the topics. In the first half of the CŚ, he treats in similar fashion some of the topics covered in Nāgārjuna's epistles, the *Suḥr̥llekha* (SL) and the *Ratnāvalī* (RĀ). He draws upon these epistles in his exposition of such practices as generosity (*dāna*), which form the basis for the bodhisattva's accumulation of merit (*puṇyasambhāra*). In the second half of the CŚ, he draws upon the logical works, the *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* (MK), the *Vigrahavyāvartanī* (VV), the *Śūnyatāsaptati* (ŚS), and the *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā* (YŚ), in his defense of the Madhyamaka philosophy of emptiness against its detractors; it is this insight into emptiness that forms the basis for the bodhisattva's accumulation of knowledge (*jñānasambhāra*).

9. A. Bareau, *Les Sectes Bouddhiques du Petit Véhicule*, Saigon, 1955, pp. 55-109 discusses the views of the Mahāsāṅghika sects.
10. See P. S. Sastri, 'Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva', *IHQ* 31 (1957), pp. 195-198; H. Sarkar and B. N. Misra, *Nāgārjunakoṇḍa*, 2nd ed., New Delhi, 1972, pp. 3, 13, 31, 74; and Ruegg (1981), p. 5, n. 11 (ref.).
11. Warder (1970), pp. 357-358 and E. Conze, *The Prajñāpāramitā Literature*, 2nd ed., Tokyo, 1978, p. 19.

With the exception of the fragmentary remains of the CŚ and the *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa*, none of the works attributed to Āryadeva in the Chinese and Tibetan canons survive in Sanskrit. The *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa* is the work of a second Āryadeva, a Vajrayāna master.¹² The Tohoku catalog of the bsTan 'gyur does not distinguish between these two Āryadevas; all the Vajrayāna texts attributed to Āryadeva are the works of this later author. Apart from the treatises on Vajrayāna, this catalog lists the following works of Āryadeva: *Hastavālaprakaraṇa* (3844);¹³ *Hastavālaprakaraṇavṛtti* (3845); *Hastavālavṛtti* (3849); *Catuḥśatakaśāstrakārikā* (3846); *Skhalitapramathanayuktihetusiddhi* (3847);¹⁴ *Madhyamakabhramaghāta* (3850); and *Jñānasārasamuccaya* (3851). The Taishō contains the following works attributed to Āryadeva: **Śataka* (1569);¹⁵ *Akṣaraśataka* (1572);¹⁶ **Mahāpuruṣaśāstra* (1577); *T'i p'o p'u sa shih lang chia ching chung wai tao hsiao sheng nieh pan lun* (Treatise on the explanation of *nirvāṇa* by heterodox and Hīnayāna teachers in the *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*) (1640);¹⁷ and *T'i p'o p'u sa p'o shih lang chia ching chung wai tao hsiao sheng ssu tsung lun* (Treatise on the refutation of heterodox and Hīnayāna theses in the *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*) (1639).

Finally, a few verses not to be found in any of these works are ascribed to Āryadeva by Buddhapālita and Śāntarakṣita.

There are questions about the authenticity of the **Śataka*. J. W. de Jong points out that all nine of the seventeen quotations from Āryadeva in Chinese Buddhist scriptures identified by Ui were from the CŚ. Moreover, Candrakīrti's quotation of the CŚ in the *Prasannapadā*

12. Edited by P. Patel, *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa of Āryadeva*, Santiniketan, 1949. On the authorship see Patel's introduction, L. de La Vallée Poussin, 'A propos du Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa d'Āryadeva', BSOS 6 (1931), pp. 411-413, and Ruegg (1981), pp. 105-106.
13. Edited by F. W. Thomas and H. Ui, 'The Hand Treatise, a Work of Āryadeva', JRAS 1918, pp. 267-310, and by F. Tola and C. Dragonetti, 'The Hastavālanāmaprakaraṇavṛtti', *Journal of Religious Studies* 8 (1980), pp. 18-31.
14. Translated by R. Clark and L. Jamspal, 'The Dialectic which Refutes Errors Establishing Logical Reasons', *Tibet Journal* 4 (1979), pp. 29-50.
15. Translated by G. Tucci, 'The Śataśāstra' in *Pre-Dinnāga Buddhist Texts on Logic from Chinese Sources*, Baroda, 1929, pp. 3-89.
16. Translated by V. V. Gokhale, *Akṣara-Śatakam, The Hundred Letters*, Heidelberg, 1930.
17. Translated by G. Tucci, 'Un traité d'Āryadeva sur le Nirvāṇa des hérétiques', TP 24 (1926), pp. 16-25; discussed by H. Nakamura, 'Upaniṣadic Tradition and the Early School of Vedānta', HJAS 18 (1955), pp. 93-102.

(PP) under the abbreviated form *Śataka* is further evidence that the **Śataka* and the CŚ were not separate works.¹⁸ Candrakīrti notes in the CŚṬ (D f.31b, P f.34b) that the *catuḥ* is sometimes omitted. In the *Madhyamakāvatāra* (MĀ), composed prior to the PP and the CŚṬ, however, he does give the full citation.

He says (CŚṬ, D f.31b, P f.34a) that he has not divided the CŚ into two parts, one on virtuous behavior (*dharma*) and the other on the settlement of disputes, as had Dharmapāla, who commented only on the latter half.¹⁹ Hsüan tsang, who translated both the CŚ and Dharmapāla's commentary, follows Dharmapāla's example and translates only the last eight chapters of the CŚ. The Chinese translators did not consider the translation of an entire work always useful. One of Kumārajīva's students observes that he translated only half of the **Śataka*. 'The treatise consists of twenty chapters altogether, each with five verses. Because Kumārajīva did not think that the last ten were of any use to this country he did not translate them'.²⁰ What Kumārajīva and Hsüan tsang chose to translate were the sections in each work that discussed disputed points; the untranslated portion of the CŚ, and presumably also of the **Śataka*, discussed the more general topic of meritorious practices.

The translated section of the **Śataka* covers the following topics, with one chapter devoted to each: I. merit and demerit; II. the self; III. unity; IV. multiplicity; V. sense perception; VI. sense objects; VII. the existence of the effect in the cause (*satkārya*); VIII. the non-existence of the effect in the cause (*asatkārya*); IX. permanence; and X. emptiness. The last eight chapters of the CŚ investigate similar topics: IX. permanent things; X. the self; XI. time; XII. speculative views on eternalism and annihilationism; XIII. sense faculties and their objects; XIV. extreme positions, for example, unity/multiplicity, identity/difference; XV. conditioned (*samskrta*) things; and XVI. emptiness. G. Tucci, who has translated from the Chinese both the **Śataka* and CŚ, finds the following correlations between them: **Śataka* V and VI with CŚ XI and XII; **Śataka* IX with parts of CŚ IX and X; and

18. de Jong (1971), p. 110. J. Hopkins, *Meditation on Emptiness*, London, 1983, pp. 862-863, notes that the *Śataka* mentioned in the colophon of PP refers to the CŚ.

19. On Dharmapāla's commentary see Ruegg (1981), p. 51, n. 42 (ref.).

20. Robinson (1967), p. 211.

**Śataka* X with CŚ XVI.²¹

There are additional correlations between the chapters of these two texts. Āryadeva discusses meritorious and demeritorious practices in the first chapter of the **Śataka*. He explains that impure gifts are those which are given in the expectation of a reward and compares this type of giving to trade in the marketplace (T.1569,XXX,169c [*Śataśāstra*, p. 131]). Similarly, in CŚ,V,20 the anticipation of a reward from giving is said to make giving and receiving seem like profiting in trade. An earlier passage from this chapter, which says that the Buddha teaches generosity, morality, and insight to people of low, middling, and high ability, respectively, (169b [*Śataśāstra*, p.121]) closely parallels CŚ,VIII,14.

The **Śataka*, II and CŚ, X criticize Vaiśeṣika and Sāṃkhya views on the nature of the self. Both reject the Sāṃkhya concept of the self as characterized by consciousness (*caitanya*), the Vaiśeṣika concept of the self becoming connected with consciousness (*jñāna*), the self as an agent of the body, and the argument that a permanent self exists because of the memory of past lives (cf.170c-172a, 173a [*Śataśāstra*, pp. 20-22, 25-31, 34] with CŚ,X, 10-12, 8-9, 5, and 7).

The theses of identity and difference with regard to the relations present in a thing and its component parts come under attack in **Śataka*, III and IV and CŚ, XIV. Both texts deny that a thing, for example, a pot and its marks (*lakṣaṇa*), namely, existence, one, are either identical or different (cf. 173a-175b [*Śataśāstra*, pp. 37-48] and CŚ,XIV, 2-4, 6-7). Chapters V of the **Śataka* and XIII of the CŚ reject various theories of sense perception, namely, that the cognition (*jñāna*) of the object arises before, after, or simultaneously with the perception (*darśana*) of its visible form (*rūpa*); that this perception of the object occurs with or without the movement of the eye towards it; and that the eye by its very nature is involved in perception (cf. 175c-176a, 177a [*Śataśāstra*, pp. 51-52,58] and CŚ,XIII, 12-14,16). Both **Śataka*, VI and CŚ XIV repudiate the thesis that the whole pot can be perceived when the visual or tactile faculty apprehends one of its parts (cf. 176b-c [*Śataśāstra*, pp. 54-55] and CŚ,XIV, 8,11).

21. G. Tucci, 'Studi Mahāyānici: La versione cinese del Catuḥśataka di Āryadeva confrontata col testo sanscrito e la traduzione tibetana', *Rivista degli Studi Orientali*, X, (1925), p. 523.

Chapters VII and VIII of the **Śataka* criticize the Sāṃkhya thesis of *satkāryavāda* and the Vaiśeṣika thesis of *asatkāryavāda*. The CŚ treats the same topic briefly in XI, 15, using an illustration not found in the **Śataka*: if the effect, namely, the pillars, pre-exists in the cause, namely, the house, one need not adorn the house with them since they are present already; but if the effect does not exist, the pillars will never adorn the house! Both chapters' criticism of the Ābhidharmika positions on the three marks – origination (*jāti*), duration (*sthiti*), and cessation (*bhaṅga*) – correspond to the treatment of the same topic in CŚ, XV (cf. 177c-179a [*Śataśāstra*, pp.64-71] and CŚ, XV,11,14-16). Both chapters conclude with statements closely resembling two CŚ verses (cf.178a13-14 [*Śataśāstra*, p.56] and CŚ,X,25; 179a14-15 [*Śataśāstra*, p.71] and CŚ,XV,14a,c).

Chapters IX of the **Śataka* and the CŚ refute permanent things, such as space (*ākāśa*), direction (*dik*), and atoms. Both texts refuse to describe *nirvāṇa* as the extinction of bondage and deny that *nirvāṇa* is a place that some individual can reach (cf.179b,180a-c [*Śataśāstra*, p.73,78-81] and CŚ,IX,4-6,20-21). The final chapters of both works respond to criticism of the philosophy of emptiness (*śūnyatādarśana*). They deny that one's own thesis (*svapakṣa*) can be established through the refutation of the opponent's thesis (*parapakṣa*). The proper understanding of emptiness, however, will eliminate all logical qualms that opponents might raise (cf.181a-182a [*Śataśāstra*, pp.83-88] and CŚ,XVI,3-8,14-15,21-22). Both texts conclude that bondage results from false conceptions (*kalpanā*) and liberation results from renunciation of the self (cf.181c,182a [*Śataśāstra*, pp.86-7, 89] and CŚ,IX,24).

This brief comparison of the **Śataka* and the CŚ indicates that these texts treat many of the same topics in much the same fashion. But the arrangement of these topics and the arguments advanced against the opponents' theses differ. The **Śataka* contains material not found in the CŚ; much of the discussion in **Śataka*, I on merit and demerit has no direct parallels in the CŚ. Most of the examples and logical reasons employed in the **Śataka* do not occur in the CŚ, though the frequent use of examples in the **Śataka* may reflect Kumārajīva's editing of the material to make it more intelligible to a Chinese audience unfamiliar with Indian philosophical arguments. The extent to which he may have altered the wording of an original Sanskrit text, or even whether or not the **Śataka* is a rearranged and abridged version of the CŚ, simply cannot be determined in the absence of any Sanskrit manu-

scripts or existing Tibetan translations of the **Śataka*.²² On stylistic grounds, however, the two works differ. The CS is written in *anuṣṭubh* meter; but Kumārajīva's translation of the **Śataka* seems to be that of a text written in *sūtras* of varying length.

The *T'i p'o p'u sa chuan*, which was in Kumārajīva's hands at the beginning of the fifth century C.E., clearly says that Āryadeva wrote two works: 'He composed the **Śataka* in twenty chapters and the *Catuḥśataka* to refute heterodox views'.²³ An entry in the IDan dkar catalogue's list of texts, extant during Khri sroñ lde brtsan's reign (775-797 C.E.), may confirm this statement. In a section entitled 'miscellaneous Mahāyāna treatises (*theg pa chen po'i bstan bcos sna tshogs*)', the cataloguers dPal brtsegs and Nam mkha'i sniñ po seem to list a translation of the **Śataka*: 'The **Śataka* was composed by Āryadeva; it contains one hundred *ślokas*'.²⁴ Unfortunately, this text was not among those later collected and incorporated into the bsTan 'gyur and no longer survives.

Included in the bsTan 'gyur is the *Akṣaraśataka* (AŚ), here attributed, along with its commentary, to Nāgārjuna. The Chinese translation of this text and the Tun huang Tibetan translation by Chos 'grub from the Chinese give Āryadeva as its author. Both translations of the commentary open with a verse praising Āryadeva, an indication that another, unnamed person wrote the commentary.²⁵ The topics that the AŚ considers follow the same order as those in **Śataka*, II-X. The AŚ begins with the statement that things are neither identical nor different. The commentator explains that this criticism attacks Sāṃkhya and Vaiśeṣika theses. The AŚ says that things cannot be established from causes that either pre-exist in their effect or do not exist in their effects; nor can things arise without some cause because things exist in a relation of dependence. Moreover, it is inappropriate to cite the tenets of one's own school as proof. The text then attacks the notion that the five sense cognitions (*vijñāna*) apprehend their respec-

22. Robinson (1967), pp. 34, 77-78 cites these examples and discusses Kumārajīva's translation methods.

23. *T'i p'o p'u sa chuan*, T.2048, L, p. 187c: *tsao pai lun erh shih p'in. yu tsao ssu pai lun i p'o hsieh chien*.

24. Marcelle Lalou, 'Les textes Bouddhiques au temps du roi Khri sroñ lde bcan', JA 261 (1953), p. 335: *chigs su bčad pa brgya pa || slob dpon 'phags pa' i lhas mjad pa || 100 ॥*

25. Gokhale (1930), p.2.

tive objects; since visible form exists only as a name, perception has no real nature of its own. No conditioned thing has a real nature of its own, the AŚ claims, now concerned with the Ābhidhārmikas' views; unconditioned things, for example, space, likewise have no nature of their own. Since all things are like dreams, their marks have no nature of their own, the text concludes. Because both the AŚ's choice of subject matter and the manner of its treatment resemble Āryadeva's work in the **Śataka* and the CŚ, the Tibetan ascription of the text to Nāgārjuna should be rejected. The commentary's organization of the topics, as well as its specific objections and responses, suggest that either the author was familiar with Vasu's commentary on the **Śataka* or that both commentaries are the work of the same person.

The Chinese and Tibetan canons differ also on the author of the *Hastavālaprakaraṇa* and its commentary; the Chinese canon attributes it to Dignāga and the Tibetan canon attributes it to Āryadeva. This short text considers epistemological issues, primarily, the reasons for erroneous cognition (*bhrāntajñāna*), for example, the snake's superimposition on a coiled rope. It is more likely to be the work of Dignāga than of Āryadeva.²⁶ Three treatises which the Tibetan canon attributes to Āryadeva, the **Skhalitapramathanayuktihetusiddhi*, the **Madhyamakabhramaghāta*, and the *Jñānasārasamuccaya*, are thought to be the work of later scholars²⁷; however, the *Ratnapradīpa*'s citation of the first work may confirm its attribution.²⁸ The *Madhyamakabhramaghāta* is identical with an extract from Bhavya's *Tar-kajvālā*.²⁹ The Chinese canon's attribution of two short treatises on heterodox and Hīnayāna views mentioned in the *Laṅkāvatārasūtra* also has been questioned.³⁰

26. Dragonetti and Tola (1980), p. 20, cite several contemporary opinions on this text's authorship: A. Bareau and T. R. V. Murti attribute the work to Āryadeva; F. W. Thomas, P. L. Vaidya, and M. Winternitz attribute the *kārikās* to Āryadeva and the *vr̥tti* to Dignāga; E. Frauwallner, K. H. Potter, H. Ui, and A. K. Warder attribute both *kārikās* and *vr̥tti* to Dignāga. M. Hattori, *Dignāga, On Perception*, Cambridge, 1968, p. 7, also credits Dignāga with the composition of both the verses and the commentary; Ruegg (1981), p. 53, thinks they are probably by Dignāga.

27. H. Nakamura, *Indian Buddhism*, Tokyo, 1980, p. 245.

28. C. Lindtner has brought this to my attention.

29. C. Lindtner, 'Adversaria Buddhica', WZKS 26 (1982), p. 173, n. 21.

30. Nakamura (1980), p. 245. See also J. Takasaki, 'Analysis of the *Laṅkāvatāra*' in *Indianisme et Bouddhisme*, Louvain-la-neuve, 1980, p. 346.

2. Summary of the CŚ

As the title of Candrakīrti's commentary on the CŚ indicates, this text concerns the disciplined conduct (*yogacārya*)³¹ of a bodhisattva. This early introduction to a bodhisattva's conduct prepares the way for Śāntideva's later and more detailed treatment of this topic in the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*. Āryadeva's CŚ shows the worthy student how to acquire the requisite equipment (*sambhāra*) for enlightenment. The first eight chapters discuss the accumulation of merit; the latter eight, the accumulation of knowledge. These two accumulations, as Nāgārjuna says in RĀ, III, 13, bring about the attainment of Buddhahood.

The CŚ begins with advice on removing the impediments to the accumulation of merit. The first four chapters show how to abandon the four erroneous conceptions (*viparyāsa*) of things as permanent (*nitya*), pleasant (*sukha*), pure (*śuci*), and self (*ātman*). Candrakīrti comments (D ff. 31b-32a, P ff. 33b-34a) that these four chapters explain the nature of mundane (*laukika*) things so that later, gradually, the ultimate (*paramārtha*) can be taught and Buddhahood attained once these erroneous conceptions have been eliminated.

Āryadeva first attacks the mistaken apprehension of impermanent things as permanent. In particular, he opposes the tendency people have to think of themselves and their loved ones as continuing to live on indefinitely. The first half of the chapter focuses on the need for awareness of one's own impending death (vv. 1-11); the second half, on the inappropriateness of grief over others' deaths (vv. 12-22). In this chapter, Āryadeva uses the ordinary person's fear of death as a motive for the accomplishment of meritorious acts. He advocates mindfulness of death (*marañānusmṛti*) as an antidote for the first erroneous conception.

He begins the second chapter with the advice that one should take care of the body, since much merit may be accumulated in the course of a long life. He uses the human body as an example of something which ordinary people imagine to be a source of pleasure, but which, in fact, is a source of *duḥkha* (vv. 1-23). The body experiences the

31. On the use of the term *yogācāra/yogacārya* in the title of the CŚ and CŚT see Ruegg (1981), pp. 52-53. As Ruegg points out, p. 53, its use in the CŚ title suggests 'as general term to denote practisers of Buddhist spiritual and intellectual disciplines without reference to a particular philosophical school'. Cf. *Kāśyapaparivarta* (ed. Staël-Holstein), p. 159: *evam eva Kāśyapa yogācāro bhikṣur yatra yatraivaṃ cittasya vikāraṃ paśyati*, and the use of *yogāvacara* in *Milindapañha*, p. 366.

ordinary pain (*duḥkhaduḥkhatā*) of hunger and illness; the pain engendered by the transformation of pleasurable sensations (*vipariṇāmaduḥkhatā*), for example, when an initially pleasant horseback ride lasts too long; and the pain inherent in the very nature of conditioned things (*samskāraduḥkhatā*) which make up the body. Meditation on the body demonstrates that its nature is both impermanent and painful (v. 25); consequently, it is an antidote for the second erroneous conception.

The cessation of *duḥkha* comes about through understanding its cause, the craving (*trṣṇā*) for sensual pleasures. In the third chapter on the erroneous conception of things as pure, Āryadeva urges people to give up their vain pursuit of sensual pleasures (vv. 1-2). He draws upon the theme of women as temptresses who ensnare others in the cycle of birth and death and condemns all attachment to women (vv. 3-17). Women's bodies, moreover, exemplify things wrongly apprehended as pure; neither bathing nor scented garlands can counteract the body's inner impurities (vv. 18-22). Meditation on the body is an antidote also for the third erroneous conception (vv. 24-25).

Āryadeva attacks in chapter four the last of these erroneous conceptions, namely, belief in a real and substantial self. He addresses his remarks on egotism to an unnamed Indian king. He criticizes this king's pride in his position and possessions and reminds him that his welfare depends upon compassionate treatment of the people he protects (vv. 1-7, 13, 15). But in protecting the people, the king engages in demeritorious actions, for example, the punishment of criminals and war (vv. 8-11, 16-17). Past merit, not birth as a *kṣatriya*, makes a man a king and the demerit that the king now accumulates will destroy his future (vv. 20, 24). An intelligent king, Āryadeva concludes, will lose all pride in his sovereign power after he has seen others with equal or superior power (v. 25). The following chapter suggests that he has in mind the inconceivable power of Buddhas and bodhisattvas.

In this fifth chapter on the bodhisattva's career, he emphasizes that the Buddhas and bodhisattvas work actively for the benefit of all beings. He uses the analogy of illness and treatment in describing their compassionate and skilled actions in teaching others (vv. 1-3, 8-17). The bodhisattva's career begins with the generation of the intention (*cittotpāda*) to work for the benefit of all; according to Candrakīrti (D f.94b, P f.103b), the bodhisattva attains the first stage of the ten stage path to Buddhahood after the completion of this initial act. The gene-

ration of this intention produces a vast store of merit, which accumulates over time and counteracts the negative results of past demeritorious actions (vv. 5-7, 18-21). Worldly pain cannot harm a bodhisattva's powerful mind and so for him there is no difference between the cycle of birth and death and *nirvāṇa*; this control over mind, furthermore, enables him to be reborn continuously a world ruler in whom temporal and spiritual power coalesce (vv. 22-23). Āryadeva concludes this chapter with the advice that people should recognize the inconceivable power of the Buddha and not fear his profound teachings (vv.24-25).

Since the afflictions (*kleśa*) of desire, hatred, and confusion (*moha*) impede a bodhisattva's career, Āryadeva, in chapter six, explains how to eliminate them. Although each of these afflictions daily harm people, he especially warns against desire, since it has a deceptively friendly appearance (vv. 6-7). A skilful teacher identifies which of these afflictions most affects a student and then applies the appropriate antidote: harsh treatment to counteract desire and kind treatment to counteract hatred (vv. 3-5, 12-24). It is most important to eliminate confusion, since it sustains the other two afflictions; the best antidote to counteract it is the understanding of the operations of interdependent origination (*pratītyasamutpāda*) (vv.2,10-11,25).

In the seventh chapter, Āryadeva discusses how to eliminate these afflictions, which arise from attachment to deceptively attractive sense objects. Because both the afflictions and karma work together to perpetuate bondage in this painful cycle of birth and death, karma also must be exhausted; even the most desirable of sense objects are best repudiated since they are impermanent and the source of pain, rather than pleasure (vv. 1-17,20). He criticizes people who accumulate merit in the expectation of a future reward – wealth, power, or a good rebirth (vv. 18,21-23,25). Only those people who see the illusory nature of the world break free of bondage and attain the highest state (*param padam*), he says (v. 24).

Chapter eight serves as a transition between the earlier chapters' concentration on merit and the subsequent chapters' concentration on knowledge. Āryadeva now explains how a student becomes a worthy recipient of the Buddha's most profound teachings on the selfless and empty nature of phenomena (*dharmanairātmya*). First, the student must eradicate the afflictions and exhaust all karma that would result in involuntary rebirth. These afflictions, he says, can be eliminated because they have no real object (*nirarthaka*) and are due to conceptu-

al constructions (*kalpanā*) (vv. 2-3). Since most people fear the Buddha's teachings on emptiness, these teachings must be introduced gradually and adapted to the needs and intellectual capacities of each student. Beginning students learn about worldly activity (*pravṛtti*) and its result, namely, a good rebirth, due to the merit produced by generosity and moral conduct. But Āryadeva criticizes this approach when he instructs more advanced students on withdrawal from worldly activity (*nivṛtti*) and its result, namely, *nirvāṇa*, which is attained through knowledge of the empty and selfless nature of persons and phenomena (vv.8,13-21). Knowledge of the ultimate truth ends the cycle of birth and death, he concludes, since the seed for continued rebirth is destroyed once its cause, karma and the afflictions, are destroyed (vv. 23,25).

Āryadeva critically examines the defects of his opponents' philosophical systems in the last eight chapters of the CŚ. His arguments attempt to show that their theses are either logically inconsistent or incompatible with everyday experience. He characterizes their systems as representative of the extreme positions of eternalism (*śāśvata-vāda*) and annihilationism (*ucchedavāda*). In contrast, the Madhyamaka teachings on interdependent origination and emptiness constitute a philosophical middle position.

In chapter nine, Āryadeva refutes belief in permanent things. He argues that the operations of cause and effect in establishing things demonstrate that the things which they create are not permanent (vv.1-4,7-11). Moreover, some things such as space and atoms, which the Vaiśeṣikas consider partless and permanent, in fact, have parts and are impermanent (vv.6,12-19). He criticizes Buddhist (vv. 20-21) and non-Buddhist (vv.22-23) belief in a permanent state of liberation, entered either by the self or the aggregates. He concludes that the self may be of some value on a mundane level (*laukike*), but it should be rejected by those who seek liberation, since it does not exist on a ultimate level (*paramārthe*) (vv. 24-25).

This permanent self comes under further attack in chapter ten. Āryadeva rejects the Vaiśeṣikas' belief in an unconscious, permanent self, distinct from the body, which instigates the body's actions and experiences the result, since such a self must undergo change and thus cannot be permanent (vv.3-8,13-14, 17). He rejects also the Sāṃkhyas' belief in a conscious, or potentially conscious, permanent self (*puruṣa*); he argues that the senses are useless if the self is always

conscious; and, furthermore, if it is potentially conscious at one point and actually conscious at another, it undergoes change and thus cannot be permanent (vv. 10-12). His refutation of the eternalist thesis, however, does not prove the annihilationist thesis, since impermanent things continue to arise (vv. 22-25). Moreover, because these impermanent things – in relation to which we apprehend past, present, and future time – arise, endure, and cease, time also, he argues in chapter eleven, is not permanent (vv. 1-8, 16-25). He argues further that to maintain that things exist before and after their arising is incompatible with their impermanent character (vv. 9-15).

Most people lack the intelligence and impartiality needed to understand the Buddhist view of *samsāra* and *nirvāṇa*, Āryadeva contends in chapter twelve (vv. 1-4, 24-25). Right practice (*dharma*) he summarizes as not harming others (*ahiṃsā*); the right view he summarizes as understanding *nirvāṇa* as emptiness (*śūnyatām eva nirvāṇam*) (v.23). The first of these two teachings leads to heaven; the second, to liberation from the cycle of birth and death; and, therefore, one loses much more by rejecting it (vv.11-12). Weak people doubt and fear the Buddha's powerful view of the selflessness of persons and phenomena and cling instead to the less subtle views of brahmins and naked ascetics (vv. 5,8-9, 13-17, 19-22).

In chapter thirteen, Āryadeva refutes various views on the sense faculties' perception of their respective objects. He argues that one faculty's perception of part of an object, for example, the eye's perception of a pot's visible form, cannot establish the apprehension of the whole (vv.1-9). Moreover, the divergent views on perception fail to establish how contact occurs between the sense faculty and its object, namely, is motion involved or not (vv. 12-21)? He concludes that the perceiver (*manas*, *saṃjñāskandha*) and the perceived object have no real existence (*sadbhāva*) and resemble mirages and illusions (vv.22-23,25). The object has no real existence, he argues in chapter fourteen, because it has arisen in dependence upon a combination of causes and conditions (vv.1,22-23). The interdependence of a marked object (*lakṣya*) and its marks (*lakṣaṇa*), for example, a pot and its color, is the basis for denying the existence (or any other of the extreme positions, namely, non-existence, both, and neither) of their identity or difference (vv. 2-15, 19-21). The knowledge that the object has no real substantial nature will lead the wise to destroy the seeds of the cycle of birth and death, he concludes (v. 25).

The real existence of conditioned things (*saṃskṛta*) and their marks, namely, origination (*utpāda*), duration (*sthiti*), and cessation (*bhāṅga*), comes under attack in chapter fifteen. These marks, Āryadeva claims, do not exist independently of one another; they neither arise simultaneously nor sequentially (vv. 5,11). Similarly, conditioned things do not arise from themselves or from something different (v.6). He denies that the mark called origination applies to the arising of an existent thing, a non-existent thing, or something in between (*jāyamāna*) (vv.1-4,14-24). When cause and effect exist in interdependence, he concludes, there is no real origination of the effect and no real cessation of the cause (v.25).

The fifteen previous chapters, Āryadeva says in the first verse of his final chapter, refuted the theses of people who perceived things that are empty as if they were not empty. He now discusses, in a dialogue between a teacher and his student, the logical problems raised by critics of the philosophy of emptiness. He argues against the view that the negation of one thesis implies a commitment to the establishment of the opposite thesis (vv. 3-4,7-8,14). He denies that a person who rejects the error found in all four alternative positions (*catuṣkoṭi*) holds a thesis; and therefore, no opponent can refute him (vv. 10, 15,21-22,25). Furthermore, the use of ordinary language does not establish the real existence of things referred to in propositions such as 'it exists' (vv.16-18,24). The advantage of perceiving the emptiness of things, he concludes, lies in the destruction of the bondage produced by conceptual constructs (*kalpanā*) (v.23).

3. Previous editions and translations of the CŚ

The CŚ is no longer extant in its entirety in Sanskrit, although fragments of the text and Candrakīrti's commentary were discovered by Haraprasad Shastri in 1911,³² which he edited and published three years later, 'Catuhśātikā of Ārya Deva', *Asiatic Society of Bengal*, n.s.7 (1914), pp. 449-514. Unfortunately, these fragments represent less than a third of the four hundred verses. Citations of the text in

32. Haraprasad Shastri, 'Notes on the newly-found manuscript of the Chatuṣśatika by Āryadeva', *Asiatic Society of Bengal*, n.s. 7 (1911), pp. 431-436.

other works³³ and its translation into Tibetan and Chinese have preserved this contribution to Madhyamaka philosophy. The Tibetan canon contains Pa tshab's and Sūkṣmajana's translations of the CŚ and CŚṬ: *bsTan bcos bži brgya pa zes bya ba'i tshig le'u* (D 3865, v.2, tsha, ff.1b-18a; P 5246, v.95, tsha, ff.1b-2-b) and *Byan chub sems dpa'i rnal byor spyod pa bži brgya pa'i rgya cher 'grel pa* (D 3865, v.8, ya, ff.30b-239a; P 5266, v.98, ya, ff.33b-273b). The Chinese canon contains Hsüan tsang's translation of the last eight chapters of the CŚ, *Kuang pai lun pen* (T.1570) and his translation of Dharmapāla's commentary on them, *Ta ch'eng kuang pai lun shih lun* (T.1571).

Critical work on an edition of the CŚ began with the publication of P. L. Vaidya's doctoral thesis, *Études sur Āryadeva et son Catuḥśataka*, Paris, 1923. Vaidya edited chapters eight to sixteen, using Shastri's edition and the Peking and sNar than editions of the Tibetan translations of CŚ and CŚṬ. He retranslated into Sanskrit the verses not preserved in Candrakīrti's works and translated these nine chapters into French. Two years later, G. Tucci criticized some of Vaidya's work in the notes to his own translations into Italian of chapters nine to sixteen of the Chinese text, 'Studi Mahāyānici: La versione cinese del Catuḥśataka di Āryadeva confrontata col testo sanscrito e la traduzione-

33. The **Akutobhayā* (P f. 113a) cites VII, 5, as does Ch'ing Mu's *Chung lun*. On the relation between these two texts see M. Walleser, *Die Mittlere Lehre des Nāgārjuna, Nach der chinesischen Version*, Heidelberg, 1912, pp. ix-xii, 189, n.1. The same verse is also cited in Buddhapālita's *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (P f.316a). W. Ames (letter, 2.2.84) has identified in Buddhapālita's commentary the following additional citations of the CŚ: VIII,9 (P f.276a); VIII,16 (P f.203a); VIII,20 (P f.274a); VIII,22 (P f.278a); IX,18cd (P f.281b); X,20 (P f.272b); X,25 (P f.278a); XI,17,23,24 (P f.211a); XII,23 (P f.273a); XIII,16 (P f.197b); XIV,13 (P f.189b); XIV,25 (P ff.182a, 255a, 274b); XV,5 (P f.239a); and XVI,23 (P f.299b). Cf. C. Lindtner, 'Buddhapālita on Emptiness,' *IJ* 23 (1981), p. 212, n.22. L. de La Vallée Poussin, *Mūlamadhyamakakārikās de Nāgārjuna, avec la Prasannapadā commentaire de Candrakīrti*, St. Petersburg, 1903-1913, pp. 625-626, has identified the following citations of the CŚ: II,25 (PP, pp. 460,506); VIII,15 (PP, p. 359); VIII,19 (PP, p.370); VIII,20 (PP, p. 372); VIII,22 (PP, p.378); IX,2,3 (PP, p.505); IX, 6 (PP, p.397); X,3 (PP, p.199); X,17 (PP, p.116); X,25 (PP, p.376); XI,15 (PP, p.393); XII, 23 (PP, p. 352); XIII,1,2 (PP, p.71); XIII,25 (PP, p.173); XIV,14 (PP, p.71); and XVI,25 (PP, p.16). Vaidya (1923), p. 119 and Bhattacharya (1931), p. 253, have identified the quotation XV,16 in PP, p. 80. Bhattacharya, pp. 210, 250 notes that XIV,13 is quoted in PP, p. 89 and that XV,14 is identical with MK,XXI,12.

On the citation of CŚ in Jaina texts see C. Lindtner, *Nagarjuniana*, Copenhagen, 1982, p. 279, nn. 262-263.

ne tibetana,' *Rivista degli Studi Orientali*, X, (1925), pp. 521-567. Another critic of Vaidya's work, Vidhusekhara Bhattacharya, began a new edition of the CŚ, along with a partial edition of the CŚT, with the publication of his edition and translation into English of chapter seven, 'The Catuḥśataka of Āryadeva', in *Proceedings and Transactions of the Fourth Oriental Conference*, Allahabad, 1928. He criticized Vaidya's Sanskrit retranslations and provided his own in his edition of chapters eight to sixteen, *The Catuḥśataka of Āryadeva*, Calcutta, 1931. His edition also includes extracts from the surviving Sanskrit fragments of the CŚT and from the sNar than edition of the Tibetan translation, which he retranslated into Sanskrit. Bhagcandra Jain Bhaskar's recent edition of the CŚ, *Āryadeva's Catuḥśatakam*, Nagpur, 1971, contains the surviving Sanskrit verses of chapters one to five, the verses and commentarial extracts from Bhattacharya's editions of chapters seven to sixteen, and his own translations of the later ten chapters into Hindi.

E. Frauwallner, *Die Philosophie des Buddhismus*, Berlin, 1969, pp. 12-19, translated v. 12-19 of the ninth chapter of the CŚ into German. S. Yamaguchi has translated the ninth chapter of the CŚT into Japanese: 'Gesshō-zō Shihyakuronchūshaku Hajo-hon no kaido. Translation and Annotation on the Chapter "Negation of eternal things" in Candrakīrti's Catuḥśatakaṭīkā'. Suzuki Gakujutsu Zaidan Kenkyu Nempo, *Annual of Oriental and Religious Studies*, No. 1, Tokyo, 1964, pp. 13-25; and J. May has translated the same chapter into French: 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence' in *Indianisme et Bouddhisme*, Louvain-la-Neuve, 1980, pp. 217-232; 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (II)', BEFEO, LXIX (1981), pp. 75-96; 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (III)', *Études Asiatiques*, XXXV, 2 (1981), pp. 47-76; 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (IV)', *Études de Lettres*, 1982, pp. 47-76; 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (V)', *Acta Indologica*, Narita, 1984, pp. 115-144. Chapter eleven of the CŚT has been translated into Japanese by O. Ikkyo, 'Jikan ron ni taisuru Daijō Bukkyōteki shiten Gesshō-zō Shihyakuronchūshaku daijuichi Shō', *The Annual Report of the Researches of the Otani University*, no. 29 (1976), pp. 1-56.

In preparing a new edition and translation of the CŚ, I have consulted Shastri's edition (HPS) and those of Vaidya and Bhattacharya (Bhaskar's edition is virtually identical to Bhattacharya's). I have used also the Peking edition of the Tibetan text of the CŚ (P, tsha, ff. 1b-

20b) and CŚT (PT, ya, ff. 33b-273b), published by the Tibetan Tripitaka Research Institute; the sNar than edition of the CŚ (N, tsha, ff. 1b-18a) in the Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, Dharamsala; the microfiche edition of the Cone edition of the CŚ (C, tsha, ff. 1b-18a), published by the Institute for the Advanced Study of World Religions; and the sDe dge edition of the CŚ (D, tsha, ff. 1b-18a) and CŚT (DT, tsha, ff. 30b-239a), published by the Faculty of Letters, Tokyo University. The Chinese translation (T.1570, XXX, 182a-186c) has also been consulted.

Catuḥśataka-śāstra ||

bsTan bcos bži brgya pa ||

I. *rTag pa 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste |*

1. | gañ la 'jig rten gsum mña' bdag | rañ ñid 'chi bdag byed po med |
| yod des rnal bžin gñid log na | de las ma ruñs gžan ci yod |
2. | 'chi bar bya phyir skyes gyur ciñ | gžan dbaň 'gro ba'i ñaň can la |
| 'chi ba bya ba ltar snaň ste | gson pa bya ba min ltar ro |
3. | khyod kyis 'das dus thun ñu ltar | mthoň žiň ma 'oňs gžan du na |
| khyod mñan mi mñam ltar sems de | gsal bar 'jigs pa'i 'o dod 'dra |
4. | gžan dag la yaň spyi thun phyir | khyod la 'chi ba'i 'jigs med na |
| gcig la gnod gañ de phrag dog | sgo nas sdug bsñal bskyed 'gyur
ram |
5. | nad bcos rga ba gso bya des | de dag la khyod mi 'jigs mod |
| chad pa phyi ma bcor med pas | khyod ches gsal bar de la 'jigs |
6. | gsad par bya ba'i phyugs rñams ltar | 'chi ba kun gyi thun moň žiň |
| gžan yaň 'chi bar snaň 'gyur na | khyod la 'chi bdag 'jigs cis med |

1c yod des NP : yon ñes CD

3c de CD : te NP

4a thun NP : mthun CD; b la CDP : la'i N; c bskyed NP : skyed CD

6c 'gyur NP : gyur CD

The Four Hundred Treatise

I. Showing the Method for Rejecting Belief in Permanence

1. Were someone subject to the ruler of the three worlds, himself not subject to an agent of death, to sleep relaxedly, what else could be more wrong than that?
2. One is born in order to die; one is dependent and liable to rebirth. It appears that death is obligatory and life is not.
3. You see the past as short and the future in the opposite way. You consider equals as if unequal! That clearly is like a cry of fear!
4. Because it is common to others also, you have no fear of death. Does the affliction (*bādhā*) of someone else cause [you] pain by way of envy?
5. Illness can be cured; old age can be treated. Consequently, you may not fear them. Because there is no cure for the final punishment, clearly you must fear it more!
6. Death is common to all [of us], like cattle about to be slaughtered. Also, when you see others die, why do you not fear the Lord of Death?

1. Candrakīrti (D f. 32a-b, P f. 35a) suggests two interpretations of the three worlds: the *kāma*, *rūpa* and *ārūpya* worlds and the worlds of *nāgas*, humans and gods. On the *kāmadhātu*, *rūpadhātu*, and *ārūpyadhātu* see É. Lamotte, *Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien*, Louvain, 1958, pp. 34-36. The *kāmadhātu*, in particular, is associated with Māra, the Lord of Death ('*chi bdag* = *maccurāja*, *mṛtyu/mṛtyupati*). See J. Boyd, *Satan and Māra*, Leiden, 1975, pp. 111-113.
2. Cf. *Samyutta*, I, p. 97: *sabbe sattā marissantī | maraṇantiṃ hi jīvitaṃ ||* and *Uv.*, I, 22d, 23d, 34d; and *Dhp.* X, 3.
3. Because the length of one's life cannot be determined, it is impossible to know whether or not the time that has passed is short or long in relation to the time that has yet to pass. Since neither past nor future can be judged long or short, they should be seen as equals.
- 4-5. Additional reasons to fear death: the nature of death is to cause pain, but unlike the pain of illness, which medicine can treat, death has no cure.
6. The analogy comes from *Aṅguttara*, IV, p. 138. Cf. SN, 580.

7. | dus la ñes pa med pa'i phyir | bdag rtag sñam du sems na ni |
| nam žig dus na 'chi bdag gis | khyod la gnod pa byed par 'gyur |
8. | ma 'oñs pa yi don lta žiñ | gson pa zad pa ma yin na |
| bdag ñid 'tshoñ la bdag ñid ni | byams ldan mkhas pa su žig smra |
9. | bdag ñid gta' mar bžag byas te | sdig las ci yi phyir na byed |
| ñes par khyod ni mkhas rnams ltar | bdag la 'dod chags bral bar
zad |
10. | su la'añ gson pa žes bya ba | sems kyi skad cig las gžan med |
| skye bos de ñes mi rig pa | des na bdag ñid šes pa dkon |
11. | khyod riñ gson pa la dga' žiñ | rgan ñid la khyod mi dga' na |
| e ma khyod spyod skye bo ni | 'dra la dam pa lta bur 'gyur |
12. | khyod rañ 'chi la mya ñan na | bu sogs rnams phyir ci ste yin |
| rañ ñid spyo bya smra po ni | ci lta bur na smad mi 'gyur |
13. | gañ tshe 'ga' žig ma bcol bar | rañ ñid bur gyur de yi tshe |
| ma dris ñid du de 'gro ba | rigs par mi 'gyur ma yin no |

7a ñes DNP : des C; b na CD : nas NP

8d byams ldan mkhas pa NP : rnam dpyod ldan žes CD

11d 'gyur NP : sñañ CD

13d rigs CD : rig NP

7. If you think, 'I am eternal', because the time [of your death] is uncertain, [then you forget that] at some time the Lord of Death will harm you any moment.
8. If you look towards future advantages (*artha*), though [your] life is not exhausted, what wise person would say that you are kind [to yourself] when you put your life at stake!
9. Having placed yourself in pawn, why do you commit evil (*pāpa*) actions? Of course, like the wise, you are completely without attachment to yourself!
10. What one calls the life of someone is nothing other than a moment of consciousness (*vijñāna*). An [ordinary] person, of course, is ignorant of this; consequently, self-knowledge is rare.
11. You like long life but you dislike old age. Alas! Your conduct would seem good [only] to a person like [you]!
12. Why do you mourn because of [your] son, and so forth, when you should be distressed over your own [imminent] death? Isn't the mourner, himself under attack, to be criticized?
13. It is not wrong when someone – without being requested – voluntarily has become [your] son [and] then – without asking [your permission] – dies.

7. Though the time of death is uncertain, it will come. Death, as SN, 575 points out, is the natural property of living beings (*maraṇam, evaṃdhammā hi pāṇino*). Even those who live for 100 years die in the end (*Samyutta*, V, p. 217; *Uv.*, I, 30; *G. Dh.*, X, 5; SN, 589, 804).
8. Or, following the CD variant reading in d, 'What person would call one intelligent'?
9. Āryadeva suggests ironically that people who do evil without fear of the consequences must have abandoned all attachment to themselves.
10. Cf. *Mahāniddesa*, p. 42: *jīvitam attabhāvo ca sukhadukkhā ca kevalā | ekacittasamayuttā lahuso vattate khaṇo ||*.
11. Only foolish people (*byis pa'i skye bo, bālajana*) approve of the conduct of someone who delights in long life but fails to see the signs of aging, but others, Candrakīrti comments (P f. 42a, D f. 39a), develop no attachment (*mñon par zen pa, abhiniveśa*) for their personal continuity (*rgyud, samtāna*).
- 12-16. The topic is here the inappropriateness of grief over another's death. The *Piyajā-tisutta*, *Majjhima*, II, pp. 106-112, may be the inspiration for vv. 12-16. Cf. also *Thig.*, 127-130. Theri Paṭācārā's statement in 129a (*ayācito tato 'gacchi ananuññāto ito gato*) resembles the argument of v. 13.

14. | gti mug phyir na bu yi ni | rnam pa rtog pa med pa zad |
 | 'di yi 'gro bar spro ba ñid | rga bas ston par byed par 'gyur |
15. | ji ltar pha la bu sdug pa | de ltar de la skye ma yin |
 | 'jig rten 'di ni 'og tu 'gro | de phyir mtho ris kyañ rñed dka' |
16. | gañ tshe rjes su mi mthun pa | 'ga' yañ sdug ces bya yod min |
 | de tshe chags pa tshoñ dañ ni | 'dra ba 'ba' zig skye bar zad |
17. | bral bas bskyed pa'i sdug bsñal ni | mi rnams sñiñ las myur ldog ste |
 | chags la'añ sdug bsñal bral ba yis | mtshon pa'i mi brtan pa ñid
 ltos |
18. | gnod pas gzir bar byas zin kyañ | yon tan med sñam śes bzin du |
 | khyod bdag ñid la phyi 'chos 'gyur | de yañ bdag la mi rigs so |
19. | sdug bsñal rnam par 'ged lta bu | 'jig rten 'di ni yoñs su 'khyam |
 | sdug bsñal gyur pa'i skye bo la | sdug bsñal 'ged pas ci zig bya |
20. | gañ gi 'du ba dga' yin de'i | 'bral ba ci ltar dga' ma yin |
 | 'du ba dañ ni 'bral ba dag | lhan cig rgyu bar snañ min nam |
21. | 'das la thog ma yod min la | ma 'oñs tha ma yod min na |
 | cis na khyod kyis 'du mthoñ žiñ | riñ por gyur kyañ 'bral ba min |
22. śatruvad yānti te kālā niyamena kṣaṇādayaḥ |
 sarvathā tena te rāgaḥ śatrubhūteṣu teṣu mā ||
 | skad cig la sogs dus de rnams | ñes par dgra dañ 'drar 'gyur te |
 | des na dgrar gyur de dag la | rnam kun khyod 'dod chags mi bya |

14b pa NP : par CD; d rga NP : rgas CD

16a tshe CDN : che P; d tshoñ NP : 'tshoñ CD

18a bar NP : ba CD; c phyi 'chos CD : phyi chos NP

19a bu NP : bur CD; b yoñs su CDN : yoñsu P

20a gi CDP : gis N; dga' CDP : gañ N

21b yod CDN : yon P; d 'bral NP : bral CD

14. It is because of ignorance (*moha*) that you did not notice [your son's general appearance (*ākāra*). Growing older indicates precisely that he is going to die.
15. A son does not love [his father] in the same way a father loves him. [Because of attachment] the people of this world sink lower; because of this, even heaven is difficult to reach [– much more so liberation]!
16. When there is disagreement, there is nothing called love. Affection is produced, then, merely like trade!
17. The pain produced by separation is removed quickly from people's hearts. See the impermanence of love, which is shown by [this quick] removal of pain!
18. When you have injured yourself, well aware that [beating your breast and so forth] is in vain, it is hypocritical of you. Moreover, it is unreasonable of you!
19. As suffering increases, the people of this world revolve [in the cycle of birth and death]. What is the use of [your] increasing suffering among people who suffer already?
20. If one likes being together [with others], why does one not like separation? Doesn't experience show that union and separation go together?
21. The past has no beginning and the future has no end. Why are you concerned about being together and not about separation, even though it is long?
22. Time, beginning with a moment (*kṣaṇa*), certainly passes by like an enemy. Consequently, you should never have attachment (*rāga*) for what is, in fact, an enemy.

17. If the bond of affection were strong and permanent, the pain that results from being separated from a loved one should never be alleviated, which is contradicted by experience.
- 18-19. Compliance with society's mourning customs, beating one's breast, and so forth, is criticized as hypocritical and ineffective.
- 20-21. Union entails separation and, as Candrakīrti explains (D f. 43a, P f. 46b), since for an ignorant person *saṃsāra* has neither a beginning nor an end (cf. *Samyutta*, II, p. 178; PP, p. 218), the lengthy separation of friends in the past will be so again in the future.
22. Time is an enemy because its passing only brings death closer. Cf. *Samyutta*, I, p. 109: *nāccayanti ahoratā | jīvitam n-uparujjhati ||* and Uv., I, 18.

23. viprayogabhayād gehān na nirgaccha(s)i (durmate) |
 + + + nāma kartavyaṃ kuryād daṇḍena ko budhaḥ ||
 | blo ṇan bral ba'i jigs pa yis | khyim nas ṇes par mi 'byuñ na |
 | mkhas pa su žig ṇes par ni | bya dgos chad pas byed par 'gyur |
24. | khyod 'di byas nas gsal bar ni | nags su 'gro bya sñam sems na |
 | gañ žig byas kyañ gtañ bya ba | de byas yon tan ci žig yod |
25. niyamād vidyate yasya martyo 'ham iti bhāvanā |
 tasya saṅgaparityāgān mṛtyor api (bhayaṃ ku)taḥ ||
 | bdag ni 'chi 'o sñam sems pa | gañ la ṇes par yod gyur pa |
 | de ni chags pa yoñs btañ phyir | 'chi bdag la yañ ga la 'jigs |
- rnaḥ 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las rtag pa 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs pa ste rab tu byed pa
 dañ pa'o ||

II. *bDe bar 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste* |

1. | lus ni dgra ltar mthoñ mod kyi | de lta na yañ de bsruñ bya |
 | khrims ldan yun riñ 'tsho ba ni | de las bsod nams chen po byed |
2. | mi rnams sdug bsñal lus ñid las | skye žiñ bde ba gžan las na |
 | sdug bsñal kun gyi snod gyur pa | khog pa la khyod ci ste gus |
3. | gañ tshe bde ba sdug bsñal ltar | śas cher mi la mi 'byuñ na |
 | de ltar sdug bsñal chen po de | chuñ ño sñam du sems byed dam |
4. | 'jig rten bde la mñon phyogs śiñ | bde gyur dag kyañ rñed dka' ste |
 | des na skye bo 'jig 'di la | sdug bsñal rjes su sñegs pa 'dra |
5. | sdug bsñal 'dod pas rñed 'gyur gyi | 'dod pas bde ba ga la yin |
 | khyod cis dkon pa la gus śiñ | mod la ci ste khyod mi 'jigs |
6. | bde bar gyur pa'i lus po ni | sdug bsñal snod du 'gyur ba ste |
 | lus la gus dañ dgra la gus | de dag gñis ni mtshuñs par snañ |

23b nirgacchasi : nirgacchami HPS; durmate, HPS reconstruction; c ṇes CDP : ṇas N
 25b ṇes CDP : ṇas N; d bhayaṃ ku, HPS reconstruction

1b de lta CDN : da lta P; bsruñ bya CD : yañ bsruñ NP

6b snod DNP : sñed C; 'gyur ba ste DTPT : gyur te des NP : 'gyur ba de CD; c lus
 DNP : las C

23. Fool! From fear of separation, you do not leave home. What wise person would do what necessarily has to be done by [The Lord of Death's] rod?
24. Although you think, 'After I have done this [namely, fulfilled a householder's duties], I certainly will go to the forest', what is the value of having done something that once done should be rejected anyhow?
25. How can he who by necessity reflects, 'I am going to die', fear the Lord of Death, since he has completely forsaken [all] attachment (*saṅga*)?

II. Showing the Method for Rejecting Belief in Pleasure

1. Although the body may be regarded as an enemy, nevertheless, it must be cared for. A virtuous person who lives for a long time makes much merit (*puṇya*) from it.
 2. When people's pain is produced from the body and pleasure from something else, why do you value the body, which is the vessel for all pain?
 3. When pleasure does not predominate for people, as pain does, do you consider much pain to be minute?
 4. People are inclined towards pleasure, but those who are happy are difficult to find. Consequently, it seems that a person in this [condition of] destruction pursues pain.
 5. You can have pain at will, but how can you have pleasure at will? Why do you value what is scarce, and why do you not fear what is plentiful?
 6. A body that experiences pleasure [soon] becomes a vessel for pain. These two – valuing the body and valuing an enemy – are seen to be the same!
- 23-24. Rejection of the householders's life in favor of going forth into homelessness (*agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbaj-*). Cf. *Āṅguttara*, II, p. 108; SN, 405-407.
25. See the *Maraṇasatisutta*, *Āṅguttara*, III, pp. 303-306. One version of this text is quoted in *Traité*, III, pp. 1424-1425.

1. Candrakīrti (D f. 45a-b, P f. 48a-b) explains that the body should be seen as an enemy because of its susceptibility to illness, nevertheless, a person who takes good care of the body will live long enough to accumulate much merit. Cf. RĀ V, 88-90.
- 2-7. Āryadeva identifies the body as a locus for pain and emphasizes the predominance of pain over pleasure. Cf. *Traité*, III, pp. 1156, 1158 (ref.), 1264. Candrakīrti

7. śarīraṃ sucireṇāpi sukhasya svaṃ na jāyate |
 pareṇābhibhavo nāma svabhāvasya na yujyate ||
 | lus ni śin tu 'gor bas kyañ | bde ba'i bdag tu mi 'gyur te |
 | rañ bzin gzan gyis zil gnon ces | bya ba rigs pa ma yin no |
8. agryāṇaṃ mānaṣaṃ duḥkhaṃ itareṣāṃ śarīrajaṃ |
 duḥkhaḍvayena loko 'yam ahany ahani hanyate ||
 | mchog la yid kyi sdug bsñal te | tha mal rnams la lus skyes so |
 | sdug bsñal gñis kyis 'jig rten 'di | ñin re ñin re 'joms par byed |
9. kalpanāyāḥ sukhaṃ vaśyaṃ vaśyā duḥkhasya kalpanā |
 ato 'sti kiñ cit sarvatra na duḥkhād balavattaram ||
 | bde ba rtog pa'i dbaṅ gyur ciñ | rtog pa sdug bsñal dbaṅ gyur pa |
 | de phyir kun na sdug bsñal las | śin tu stobs ldan ci yañ med |
10. kālo yathā yathā yāti duḥkhavṛddhis tathā tathā |
 tasmāt ka(l)avarasyāsyā paravad dṛśyate sukhaṃ ||
 | ji ltar ji ltar dus 'gro ba | de ltar de ltar sdug bsñal 'phel |
 | de phyir bde ba lus 'di yi | gzan po lta bur snañ bar 'gyur |
11. vyādhayo 'nye ca dṛśyante yāvanto duḥkhaḥetavaḥ |
 tāvanto na tu dṛśyante narāṇāṃ sukhahetavaḥ ||
 | sdug bsñal gyi ni rgyu mañ po | nad rnams dañ gzan snañ gyur pa |
 | de sñed du ni mi rnams la | bde ba'i rgyu dag snañ ma yin |
12. sukhasya varddhamānasya yathā dṛṣṭo viparyayaḥ |
 duḥkhasya varddhamānasya tathā nāsti viparyayaḥ ||
 | 'phel bzin pa yi bde ba la | ji ltar bzlog pa mthoñ 'gyur ba |
 | de ltar sdug bsñal 'phel bzin la | bzlog pa yod pa ma yin no |

8b mal NP : ma CD

9b vaśyā : vaśyād HPS

10c kalevarasyāsyā : kaḍavarasyāsyā HPS

11c sñed CDP : ñid N

12a la NP : las CD; b 'gyur ba NP : gyur pa CD; c la NP : las CD

7. Even over a very long period of time, the body does not become the master of pleasure. It is unreasonable to say that its own-nature (*svabhāva*) [that is, pain] is overcome by something else.
8. For the elite pain is mental (*mānasa*); for others, it is physical. Day by day, both types of pain afflict this world.
9. Pleasure is under the control of conception (*kalpanā*). The conception [of pleasure] is under the control of pain. Consequently, there is nothing at all that has greater power than pain.
10. Pain increases as time passes. Consequently, pleasure is experienced as something foreign to the body.
11. The causes of people's pleasure are not experienced to the same extent as are illnesses and other causes of pain.
12. While pleasure, when it increases, is seen to change [into pain], pain does not likewise change [into pleasure] when it increases.

comments (D f.47a, P f.50b) that despite the pursuit of pleasure *duḥkha* follows one like a shadow.

8. Harivarman's **Tattva/Satyasiddhiśāstra* (T.1646, XXXII,110a) quotes this verse. *Samyutta*, IV, pp. 206-207; and *Dīgha*, II, p. 306 distinguish between physical (*kāyika*) and mental (*cetasika*) pain and pleasure. Cf. RĀ, III, 22-24, IV, 46; and *Traité*, III, p. 1440.
9. Cf. RĀ, IV, 47b: *saṃjñāmayam mānasam tu kevalam kalpanākṛtam*. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 457) comments on the superior power of *duḥkha*: *na hy asti kā cit kalpanā yā duḥkhasyopaghātāsāmarthyam uparundhyād ity ataḥ sukhavan na duḥkham kalpanāvaśyam || yat tu khalv idam iṣṭaviśayabhogasukham yā ca sukhodayānukūla kalpanā tadubhayam api duḥkham upajātam upahanti | tathā hīndriyārtham upabhūñjāno 'py ayam anyatamena duḥkhenābhībhṛtaḥ saha kalpanayā tat sarvaṃ sukhāṃ apahāya duḥkham eva pratisamvi(t)te na sukhāṃ || tad evaṃ sukhakalpanāyā duḥkha vidheyatvād duḥkham eva balavattaram na sukhāṃ |*
- 10-18. Āryadeva cites the internal and external causes and conditions which establish the body as source of pain. The body, as indicated in v.16, is composed of the four elements: *kāyo rūpī catu(m)mahābhūtika*. See PED s.v. *kāya* (ref.) and Y. Karundasa, *Analysis of Matter*, Colombo, 1967, pp. 16-35.

13. | rkyen dan lhan cig bde ba la | bzlog pa mthon gi sdug bsñal la |
| rkyen rnams ñid dan lhan cig tu | bzlog pa yod pa ma yin no |
14. | khyod 'chi bzin la dus son zin | 'gro ba dan ni 'gror 'gyur na |
| 'chi bzin pa ni bde 'gyur zes | rnam pa kun tu'añ rigs ma yin |
15. | lus can rnams la bkres sogs kyis | gnod pa rtag tu yod 'gyur na |
| gnod bzin pa ni bde 'o zes | rnam pa kun tu'añ rigs ma yin |
16. | nus pa med pas 'byun kun la | tshogs pa zes bya skye 'gyur te |
| 'gal ba rnams la bde' o zes | rnam pa kun tu mi rigs so |
17. | grañ sogs rnams la phyir 'chos pa | rtag tu yod pa ma yin na |
| brlag bzin pa ni bde'o zes | rnam pa kun tu'añ rigs ma yin |
18. | 'bad rtsol med par spyod pa zes | bya 'ga' sa steñ yod min na |
| las byed bde ba yin no zes | rnam pa kun tu'añ mi rigs so |
19. | 'di dan gzan du bdag ñid ni | rtag tu sdig las bsruñ bar bya |
| ñan 'gro yod na bde ba zes | rnam pa kun tu rigs ma yin |
20. | bzon pa sogs la mi rnams kyi | bde ba rtag tu yod min te |
| dan por gañ la rtsom med pa | de la mthar 'phel ga la yod |
21. | gser gyi snod du skyug pa na | ji ltar 'ga' zig dgar 'gyur ba |
| de bzin sdug bsñal phyir 'chos te | bde 'o sñam du sems par byed |

13a la NP : las CD; b mthon gi CD: mthon ba NP

14d tu'añ NP : tu CD

15a kyis NP : kyi CD; b 'gyur NP : gyur CD; d tu'añ NP : tu CD

17a 'chos pa CD : 'tsho ba NP; d tu'añ NP : tu CD

18a rtsol NP : stsol CD; b 'ga' NP : 'ga'añ CD; steñ NP : steñs CD

19b sdig DNP : bdud C

20a bzon NP : gzon CD

21a na NP : la CD; b dgar CD : dga' NP; c 'chos te : 'chos de NP : bcos pa CD : bcos te

Dṭṭṭ

13. One sees the change of pleasure [into pain] simultaneously with [the changing of] its conditions (*pratyaya*), but there is no change of pain [into pleasure] simultaneously with [the changing of] its conditions.
14. When you are in the process of dying, time has passed, is passing, and will pass. It is entirely unreasonable to say that dying is pleasant!
15. Hunger, and so forth, constantly torment embodied beings. It is entirely unreasonable to say that being tormented is pleasant!
16. Since each element (*bhūta*) lacks the power, [the body] arises [only] as a combination [of them]. It is entirely unreasonable to say that pleasure exists in these conflicting [elements].
17. Since there is no permanent remedy for the cold, and so forth, it is entirely unreasonable to say that the process of being ravaged [by cold, heat, and so forth] is pleasant!
18. There is nothing on earth called activity that does not involve exertion. It is entirely unreasonable to say that working is pleasant!
19. One should protect oneself constantly from evil in this world and in the next. It is entirely unreasonable to say that having a bad rebirth (*durgati*) is pleasant!
20. The pleasure that people have in riding, and so forth, is not permanent. How can there be an increase [of pain] in the end when one does not engage in [riding, etc.] in the first place?
21. In the same way that some are pleased when vomiting into a golden vessel, some think that relieving pain is pleasant!

22

19. On the suffering caused by bad rebirths see *Majjhima*, III, pp. 165-169; SL, 77-96; and RĀ, I, 14-18.
20. This example occurs in a verse quoted in *Traité*, III, p. 1445.
21. The definition of pleasure as a lessening of pain occurs also in RĀ, IV, 47-48, 62ab; the example of the golden vessel is found also in SL, 60.

22. | rtsom pas skyes pa ldog 'gyur na | sdug bsñal rtsom la'añ bde ci yod |
 | de phyir thub pas skye 'jig dag | sdug bsñal yin zes gsuñs pa
 sñam |

23. | so so'i skye bos sdug bsñal ni | bde bas gyogs ltar mi mthoñ na |
 | gañ gis sdug bsñal sgrib 'gyur ba | bde ba zes bya ci yañ med |

24. | khyod sdug chags bral med do zes | so so'i skye bo bstan bya des |
 | ñes par de bžin gšegs rnams kyis | gti mug kun gyi tha mar gsuñs |

25. anityasya dhruvā pīḍā pīḍā yasya na tat sukhāṃ |
 tasmād anityaṃ yat sarvaṃ duḥkhaṃ tad iti jāyate ||
 | mi rtag pa la ñes par gnod | gañ la gnod yod de bde min |
 | de phyir mi rtag gañ yin pa | thams cad sdug bsñal zes byar 'gyur |

rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las bde bar 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste rab tu
 byed pa gñis pa'o ||

III. *gTsañ bar 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste* |

1. | yun ni śin tu riñ pos kyañ | yul la mur thug yod min te |
 | sman pa ñan ltar khyod lus la | ñal ba 'bras bu med pa 'byuñ |
2. | bsten par byed pa 'ga' žig la | sa sred ldog pa med ji bžin |
 | bsten bžin pa yi mi rnams la | 'dod re 'phel ba'añ de bžin no |
3. | bud med kun la 'khrig pa la | tha dad cuñ zad yod min žin |
 | gzugs gžan gyi yañ loñs spyod na | khyod la mo mchog gis ci byed |
4. | gañ la gañ yid oñ 'gyur ba | de ni de yis 'tshenš par rlom |
 | khyi sogs rnams la'añ thun moñ pas | blo gros ñan pa khyod ci
 chags |

22a rtsom NP : brtsams CD; b la'añ NP : pa'añ CD

1c lus NP : yul CD

2c bsten CD : bstan NP; d ba'añ CD : ba NP

4a 'gyur ba CD : gyur pa NP; b 'tshenš DNP : 'tshems C

22. Were the arising [of much pain] to cease by beginning [a little pain], even so, what pleasure is there in beginning pain? Therefore, consider what the Sage said: 'Arising and ceasing are suffering'.
23. An ordinary person (*prthagjana*) does not recognize that pain is camouflaged by pleasure. [In other words] there is no pleasure at all that can overshadow pain.
24. An ordinary person should be instructed: 'You are not free of attachment to pleasure'. Consequently, the Tathāgatas said that ignorance (*moha*) is worst of all.
25. What is impermanent has constant pain; what has pain is not pleasant. Therefore, all that is impermanent is called suffering.

III. Showing the Method for Rejecting Belief in Purity

1. Even over a very long period of time, there is no end to [the craving for] objects. [Your] exertion in regard to [indulging] your body will have no effect, like a bad physician[']s exertion].
2. Just as the craving (*trṣṇā*) for dirt cannot be stopped in a certain [earthworm] that is addicted, the desire for sensual pleasure also increases in people who are addicted.
3. There is not the slightest difference found in sexual intercourse among all women. As beauty is enjoyable for someone else also, what use is the best woman to you?
4. Whoever loves her imagines that he is satisfied by her. Fool! Why are you attracted, since you share this even with dogs, and so forth.

22. See *Samyutta*, II, p. 17: *dukkham eva uppajjamānam uppajjati dukkham nirujjhamānam nirujjhati ...*

24. May (1959), p. 181, n. 586, discusses the relation between *moha* and *avidyā*.

25. Quoted in PP, pp. 460, 560. Cf. *Aṅguttara*, V, p.187: *yad aniccaṃ taṃ dukkham*.

1. Or, following the variant reading in c, the exertion will be ineffective "with respect to objects". Cf. *Uv.*, II, 13-14, 17; and *Dhp.*, XIV, 8.
2. The comparison of men who indulge in sensual pleasure to worms who eat filth occurs also in the *Udayanavatsarājaparipṛcchā*, quoted in the *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, p. 81: *āsāvadasaṃjñīno grddhā mūḍhassthāne yathā krimiḥ*. Cf. *Lalitavistara*, XIII, 73, XV, 40.
- 3-7. Rejection of attachment to women. Both the attraction and the qualities that inspired it are impermanent. Cf. *Traité*, II, pp. 732-733; BV, 20.

5. | khyod la yan lag kun mdzes mo | gañ der sñar kun thun moñ na |
| de rñed khyod la ño mtshar ltar | ji ltar yañ ni 'gyur ba min |
6. | yon tan ldan pa sdug pa dañ | bzlog pa la ni bzlog mthoñ na |
| rnam par gnas med sña ma 'am | cig śos las ni gañ žig bden |
7. | blun po'i 'dod chags yon tan dañ | ldan pa 'ba' žig la mi skye |
| rgyu med pa las 'jug rnams kyi | ldog pa rgyu las ga la žig |
8. | ji srid gžan śes ma gyur pa | de srid de ni khyod la 'dug |
| nad ñan dañ mtshuñs bud med ni | rtag tu rkyen las bsruñ bar
bya |
9. | dar mar rañ gis byas pa gañ | de ni rgan po mi 'dod na |
| ji lta bur na grol ba rnams | de la śin tu gduñ mi 'gyur |
10. | ma chags pa la bde med ciñ | de yañ blun min la med na |
| gañ yid rtag tu phyir phyogs pa | de yi bde ba ci 'dra žig |
11. | khyod la gus bžin rtag par ni | mo dañ lhan cig phrad pa med |
| 'di ña'i gžan gyi ma yin žes | yoñs 'dzin 'di ko ci žig yin |
12. | gal te 'dod chags bde yin na | bud med dag gis dgos med 'gyur |
| bde ba dor bya žes bya bar | ji ltar yañ ni mi mthoñ ño |
13. | bud med lhan cig sbyor ba na'añ | bde ba gžan las skye 'gyur na |
| de rgyu mdza' mo ñid yin žes | blun po min pa su žig 'dzin |

5a khyod NP : khyed CD; lag DNP : lags C; b der CNP : de D; c rñed CDP : sñed N,
khyod DNP : khyed C

6b na NP : nas CD

7c las CD : la NP; d yin NP : žig CD

8a śes CD : bśes NP; gyur pa NP : gyur na CD; b khyod la 'dug NP : khyo la sdug CD

9b po NP : por CD

11c ña'i NP : ña CD; gyi DNP : gyis C; d ko CD : go NP

12d mi NP : ma CD

13a sbyor ba na'añ NP : sbyor na yañ CD

5. The woman whose every limb is beautiful to you previously was common to all. It is not at all surprising if you obtain her!
 6. When one experiences love for a woman endowed with virtuous qualities and the reverse for the opposite, as there is no constancy [with regard to these qualities], which – former or latter – is true?
 7. A fool's desire does not arise solely for a woman endowed with virtuous qualities. How can people who act without reason be stopped by reason?
 8. She is yours as long as she does not know anyone else. A woman must be protected constantly from the occurrence [of someone else], as if from a bad illness.
 9. An old man does not desire what he did as a young man. Don't those who are liberated greatly regret that [sensual pleasure]?
 10. Someone who lacks attachment has no pleasure [in sexual intercourse], and a sensible person does not have it. What kind of pleasure is there for someone who constantly turns the mind away [from desire]?
 11. You cannot have sexual intercourse constantly [day and night] in accordance with your fondness [for sensual pleasure]. To say 'She is mine; she is not someone else's' – what is the use of this possessiveness?
 12. If desire [in itself] were pleasure, women would be unnecessary. In no way is [true] pleasure seen as something that should be rejected.
 13. Even in sexual intercourse with a woman, pleasure arises from something else [namely, imagination]. What sensible person would maintain that the cause is just a female companion?
-
8. Or, following the CD variant reading in a, 'loves a husband'. *Vinaya*, III, p. 139; *Majjhima*, I, p. 286; II, p. 46; *Aṅguttara*, V, p. 264; and *Traité*, II, pp. 799-800 all list the protectors of women, fathers, and so forth. Cf. *Manusmṛti*, IX, 2-16.
 - 9.-13. Attachment to women produces pain, not pleasure. Cf. the Buddha's comments on sexual jealousy in *Majjhima*, II, pp. 223-224. Candrakīrti (D f.69b, P ff.74b-75a) explains that the pleasure that seems to occur in sexual intercourse arises not from union with women but from false conceptions (*kun tu rtoḡ pa, saṃkalpa*). All pleasure, as v.12 suggests, is not rejected. *Aṅguttara*, I, pp. 80-81, distinguishes between defiled and undefiled pleasure (*sāsavaṇ ca sukhāṃ anāsavaṇ ca sukhāṃ*), and *Samyutta*, IV, pp. 235-237, describes three types of *sukha*: 1. *sāmisā*, derived from the *pañca kāmāgūṇa*; 2. *nirāmisā*, derived from the cultivation of *jhāna*; and 3. *nirāmisā nirāmisatara*, derived from the destruction of the *āsava*.

14. A leper, while scratching, does not see the danger of desire, because he is blinded by passion. Those who are free of passion see impassioned people as possessed of pain, like the leper.
15. Whatever happens in a famine to the protectorless who are pained by hunger [for example, humiliation] – that is the course for all impassioned men when united with women.
16. Because of pride, some develop attachment even to a privy! Some show attachment to certain women, and some show jealousy.
17. It is reasonable that confusion (*moha*) and anger should occur toward something that is impure, but it is entirely unreasonable that desire should occur [towards something impure]!
18. If, except for human beings, one criticizes an impure vessel, why doesn't one consider criticizing that [human body] in which impurities occur?
19. What intelligent person says that that [a human body], on which one sees the destruction of all pure things [once they come into contact with it], is pure?
20. Someone who was inside a filthy enclosure [namely, the womb] and could not live apart from it, [like] and unclean worm [feeding on filth], develops pride only out of ignorance.
21. No method [such as washing] will purify the body inside. You may make an effort [to purify] the inside, but in this way you won't purify the outside.

14. The example of the leper occurs in *Majjhima*, I, pp. 506-508; SL, 26; and RĀ, II, 69.
15. Or, following the CD variant reading in d, "sentient beings". Cf. *Udayanavatsarāja-paripṛcchā*, quoted in *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, p. 82, on the abuse that men must suffer because of their passion for women. See also D. Paul's translation and discussion of this text in *Women in Buddhism*, Berkeley, 1979, pp. 25-59.
- 16-17. Women are seen as the basis for the production of the *kleśas*. Candrakīrti (D f.71a, P f.76b), using the analogy between women's bodies and filth, explains that if someone stepped in filth at night *moha* might have occurred because the darkness obscured it, *dveṣa* might have occurred because of the bad smell, but *rāga* should never have occurred!
18. RĀ, II, 61-62 pose the same question.
19. Cf. Uv., XXVII, 22 and RĀ, II, 62. Contact with the body makes flower garlands and other pure things impure.
20. *Traité*, III, p. 1151 and *Laṅkāvatāra*, X, 160 describe the impurities connected with gestation and birth.
21. Cf. Uv., XIII, 6cd: *abhyantaram te gahanam bāhyakam parimārjasi*; Dhṛp., XXVI, 12; and *Traité*, III, pp. 1154-1155.

22. | gal te mdze can bžin de ltar | gcin can kun la mtshuñs min na |
| mdze can ji bžin gcin can de | de ltar mi kun gyis spoñ 'gyur |

23. pratināsikayā tuṣṭiḥ syād dhīnāṅgasya kasya cit |
rāgo 'śucipratīkāre puṣpādāv iṣyate tathā ||
| yan lag ṇams pa 'ga' žig ni | sna yi tshab mas dgar 'gyur ltar |
| mi gtsaṅ phyir 'chos me tog la | sogs pa 'dod chags de bžin 'dod |

24. śuci nāma na tad yuktaṃ vairāgyaṃ yatra jāyate |
na ca so 'sti kva cid bhāvo niyamād rāgakāraṇam ||
| gaṅ du 'dod chags bral skye ba | de gtsaṅ žes byar mi rigs la |
| ṇes par 'dod chags rgyur gyur pa'i | dños de gaṅ na'aṅ yod ma yin |

25. anityam aśubhaṃ duḥkham anātmeti catuṣṭayam |
ekasminn eva sarvāṇi sambhavanti samāsataḥ ||
| mdor na mi rtag mi gtsaṅ daṅ | sdug bñal ba daṅ bdag med ces |
| bya ba bži po thams cad ni | gcig ñid la ni srid par 'gyur |

rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las gtsaṅ bar 'dzin pa spaṅ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste rab tu
byed pa gsum pa'o ||

23b dgrar NP : dga' C : dag D; d pa CD : las NP

24d na NP : na'aṅ CD

22. If containing urine were not the same for all, as in the case of the leper[’s skin lesions], all people would avoid someone containing urine just as [they avoid] a leper.
23. Someone who lacks a part [of the body] may be satisfied with a substitute for a nose. Similarly, a desire for flowers, and so forth, is considered a remedy for [the body’s] impurity.
24. It is unreasonable to call that [human body] – in which detachment (*vairāgya*) may develop – pure. There is no thing that is necessarily the cause of desire.
25. In brief, the tetrad ‘impermanent, impure, suffering, and selfless (*anātman*)’ exists in one and the same [human body].

22. Although lepers are a common sight, they can be avoided, unlike people whose impurities are inside the body.
23. W. O’Flaherty, *Women, Androgynes and Other Mythical Beasts*, Chicago, 1980, p. 84, notes that a women’s nose is cut off as a punishment for making sexual advances, and in quarrels arousing sexual jealousy the opponent’s nose is cut as a ‘symbolic castration’.
24. The cultivation of the *navāsubhasamjñā*, which refer to stages in decomposition of a corpse, will curtail attachment to the body; see *Traité*, III, p. 1311 (ref.). R. Gombrich, ‘Temporary Ordination in Sri Lanka’, *IJBS* 7/2 (1984), p. 50, says that monks now visit the morgue for this purpose. *RĀ*, II, 51 also mentions the body as a cause of detachment.
25. Cf. *SL*, 48. Here the four *smṛtyupasthāna* provide the basis for the destruction of the four *viparyāsa*. Cultivation of the *kāyasmrtyupasthāna* destroys the error of impurity and reveals also that the body is impermanent, painful, and selfless; cf. *Traité*, III, pp. 1151-1162, 1321.

IV. *bDag tu 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste* |

1. ahaṃ mameti vā darpaḥ sataḥ kasya bhaved bhaved |
yasmāt sarve 'pi sāmānyā viśayāḥ sarvadehinām ||
| bdag gam bdag gi sñam dregs pa | srid par dam pa su la 'gyur |
| gañ phyir lus can thams cad la | yul rnams thams cad mtshuñs phyir ro |
2. gaṇadāsasya te darpaḥ śaḍbhāgena bhṛtasya kaḥ |
jāyate 'dhikṛte kāryam āyattaṃ yatra tatra vā ||
| tshogs bran drug chas bstabs gyur pa | khyod kyi dregs pa ci zig yin |
| gañ nam de ru bya ba ni | dbaṅ du byas la rag las 'gyur |
3. | ji ltar gso bya 'thob thob pa | rje bo gtoñ por sems de bzin |
| rje bo sbyin bya byin byas nas | bdag ni gtoñ ba po sñam rlom |
4. | gzan rnams kyis ni sdug bsñal gnas | khyod la phyin ci log tu dran |
| gzan gyi las kyis 'tsho khyod kyi | dga' ba gañ gis bskyed par 'gyur |
5. | 'jig rten gyi ni bsrūn po dañ | bsrūn byar sa bdag snañ gyur na |
| ci ste gcig gis dregs yod ciñ | ci ste gzan gyis dregs bral min |
6. | rigs kun nañ nas rañ las la | dga' bas 'tsho rnams rñed pa dka' |
| gal te khyod la mi dger 'gyur | des na khyod la 'gro bzañ dkon |

2a chas bstabs NP : chos stabs CD

3b por CD : bar NP

4a ni CD : na NP

5d gyis PT : gyi CDNP DT

6c dger CDNP : dgar PTDT

IV. Showing the Method for Rejecting Egotism

1. What wise person would have pride in thinking, “I” and “mine”, since all objects [in the cycle of] existence (*bhava*) are common to all embodied beings?
2. Supported by one-sixth [of the harvest, and so forth] of the subject masses, what pride do you have? On every occasion [your] work depends upon [your] being appointed [by the people].
3. Just as the subjects, after they have received what he has received [from them], think of the king as the donor, similarly, after he has given what should be given, the king proudly thinks, ‘I am the donor’.
4. Others [namely, the wise] consider you, on the contrary, to be in a painful position. What produces pleasure for you, living on the labor of others?
5. The king is the protector of the people, but it seems that the king must be protected [by them]. Why be proud because of one and not the other?
6. It is difficult to find among all the castes (*jāti*) those who are pleased with their own work. If you incur [one-sixth of their] demerit (*apunya*), it will be hard for you to have a good rebirth (*sugati*).

1. RĀ, V, 10 defines *asmimāna* as belief in an ‘I’ based upon the five *skandhas*; see also CDP s.v. *asmimāna*.
2. *Manusmṛti*, VII, 130-132, sanctions the king’s collection of one sixth of the harvest.
3. In *Samyutta*, I, p. 99 the Buddha advises King Pasenadi on donations; cf. RĀ, III, 38-63.
- 4-5. On the king’s duty as protector see *Manusmṛti* VII, 2-3,35,88,142, 144; VIII, 172, 303-309; IX, 253; and X, 80. But without the protective support of his subjects, a king’s reign would be short (*Manusmṛti*, VII, 174-175).
6. According to the *Manusmṛti* (VII, 24,25,41,46; VIII, 172), the king must know and oversee the duties appropriate to each caste. The merit which his subjects accumulate from the proper performance of their duties will also increase his lifespan and wealth (VII, 136), but a king who fails to supervise properly his subjects will likewise share in their demerit: *sarvato dharmaṣaḍbhāgo rājño bhavati rakṣitaḥ | adharmād api ṣaḍbhāgo bhavaty asya hy arakṣitaḥ ||* (VIII, 304).

7. | gžan gyis skul te byed pa gañ | de ni sa steñ blun žes bya |
| khyod dañ mtshuñs pa'i gžan dbañ gžan | 'ga' yañ yod pa ma yin no |
8. | bsruñ ba na la rag las žes | 'jig rten las ni gla len žiñ |
| rañ ñid kyis kyañ sdig byed na | de mtshuñs brtse med su žig yod |
9. | skye bo sdig to byed rnams la | gal te brtse ba bya min na |
| byis pa so so'i skye bo ni | thams cad bsruñ byar mi 'gyur ro |
10. | bdag ñid dga' ba bskyed pa yi | rgyu ni gañ du yod mi 'gyur |
| luñ la sogs pa'i rgyu rnams kyis | bsod nams min pa'añ 'jig yod
min |
11. | yañ dag bsruñ byed ces bya ba | gal te sa bdag chos yin na |
| ñon moñs bzo mkhan rnams la yañ | ci ste chos su 'gyur ma yin |
12. | 'jig rten sa bdag rag las kyi | sa bdag de ni smad de dper |
| dam pas 'jig rten kun gyi ma | srid pa yi ni sred pa bžin |
13. | blun min rgyal srid mi thob la | blun la brtse ba yod min na |
| bsruñ po yin yañ mi yi bdag | brtse ba med la chos mi gnas |
14. | r̥ṣiṇām ceṣṭitaṃ sarvaṃ kurvīta na vicakṣaṇaḥ |
| hīnamadhyaviśiṣṭatvaṃ yasmāt teṣv api vidyate ||
| drañ sroñ rnams kyi spyod pa kun | mkhas pas byed pa ma yin te |
| gañ gi phyir na de dag la | dman 'briñ khyad 'phags yod phyir ro |

7a skul NP : bskul CD; b steñ NP : steñs CD

8b las NP : la CD; c byed DNP : spyod C

10a bskyed NP : skyed CD; b yod NP : med CD; c kyis CD : kyi NP; d pa'añ CD : pa NP

11a bsruñ NP : sruñ CD; b bzo DTPṬ : gzo CDNP

12d sred NP : srid CD

13d la CD : par NP

7. One who acts [only] after being exhorted by others is called the [greatest] fool on earth! There is no one else equal to you in being dependent upon others.
8. He thinks, 'Protection depends upon me', and receives wages from the people; and he himself commits evil. Who equals him in lacking mercy (*krpā*)?
9. If people who do evil are not the object of [your] mercy, then all foolish ordinary people will not be the object of [your] protection.
10. Where do we not find reasons for making ourselves happy? Reasons, such as scriptural authority (*āgama*), however, do not destroy demerit.
11. If this so called protection is a valid norm for the king, then why isn't it a valid norm for those who create afflictions [for example, blacksmiths who make weapons for wages]?
12. The people depend upon the king, but the king is denounced. Similarly, a wise person [denounces] the craving for existence (*bhavatrṣṇā*), the mother of all people.
13. A wise man does not obtain a kingdom; and since a fool has no mercy, even though he is a protector, a merciless king has no *dharma*.
14. A clear-sighted person should not undertake every act of the sages, since inferior, middling, and superior types are found even among them.

7-14. *Manusmṛti* (VIII, 386, IX, 253) authorizes the king to use force in punishing criminals in order to ensure the protection of his subjects, but Uv., V, 19; Dhṛ., X, 1-4; and RĀ, IV, 30-37 all advise against the harsh use of force. RĀ, IV, 30-32, advises the king to be compassionate towards criminals.

Candrakīrti (D f.79a, P f.85a-b) explains that by beating and executing criminals the king himself engages in evil actions (*sdig, pāpa*); moreover (D f.80a-b, P ff.86b-87a), these evil actions of the king and those of fishermen and butchers are equally demeritorious (*bsod nams min, apunya*) and liable to result in a bad rebirth, despite the arguments that these actions are proper for people of their caste.

On *bhavatrṣṇā* see PED s.v. *bhavatanḥā* and Uv., XII, 1, XXXII, 44-47. The depiction of *trṣṇā* as a mother occurs also in *Laṅkāvatāra*, III, 3: *trṣṇā hi mātā ity uktā*.

15. putravat pālito lokāḥ purataḥ pārthivaiḥ śubhaiḥ |
 mrgāraṇyikṛtāḥ so 'dya kalidharmasamāśritaiḥ ||
 | snar gyi sa bdag dge rnams kyis | 'jig rten bu ltar bskyaṅs pa de |
 | rtsod dus chos la brten rnams kyis | deñ sañ ri d(w)ags dgon par byas |
16. chidraprahāriṇaḥ pāpaṃ yadi rājño na vidyate |
 anyeṣāṃ api caurāṇāṃ tat prāg eva na vidyate ||
 | glags su snun pa'i rgyal po la | gal te sdig pa yod min na |
 | rkun po gzan rnams la yañ de | dañ po ñid du yod ma yin |
17. sarvasvasya parityāgo madyādiṣu na pūjitah |
 ātmano 'pi parityāgaḥ kiṃ manye pūjito raṇe ||
 | chañ sogs dag la bdog pa kun | yoṅs gtoñ mchod pa ma yin na |
 | gyul ñor bdag kyañ yoṅs gtoñ ba | mchod pa sñam du sems sam ci |
18. | rgyal po 'jig rten mgon khyod la | mgon 'ga' yod pa ma yin na |
 | mgon ñid de yis bdag ñid ni | ma btañ su zig dga' bar 'gyur |
19. | rgyal po śi bar gyur pa la'añ | grags pas yon tan 'ga' mi 'byuñ |
 | khyod yon med dañ khyi 'tshed la | grags pa chen po ci ste med |
20. | gañ tshe kun gyi dbaṅ phyug ñid | bsod nams kyis bskyed de yi
 tshe |
 | 'di ni dbaṅ phyug rten min zes | brjod par rñed pa ma yin no |
21. | 'tsho ba'i thabs so cog la yañ | 'jig rten na ni rigs zes bsñad |
 | des na sems can thams cad la | rigs las dbye ba yod ma yin |

15a kyis CD : kyi NP; b ltar CD : rnams NP; c kyis CD : kyi NP; d dwags : dags CDNP

16a snun NP : bsun CD

17b mchod DNP : chad C; d ba CD : bas NP

18b 'ga' CD : dga' NP; c yis CD : yi NP, ni CD : na NP

20d par NP : pa CD

21d rigs las DNP : rig yod C

15. Previously, society (*loka*) was protected like a son by virtuous kings. Now it is made into a hunting ground by those who rely on the law of an age of discord (*kalidharma*).
16. If a king who attacks [his enemies'] vulnerable points has incurred no evil, that is even more the case for others, such as thieves!
17. Giving up all of one's possessions for liquor, and so forth, is not respectable. I wonder why giving oneself up in battle should be considered respectable.
18. O king, you are the lord of the people, yet you have no lord. Who would be happy to be a master unable to master himself?
19. There is nothing of value to be had from notoriety, even for a king who has died. Without virtues will you and an outcaste (*śvapaca*) not have great notoriety?
20. Since merit produces sovereignty over all, it cannot be said that this [person, regardless of his caste] is not the [proper] recipient (*āśraya*) of sovereignty.
21. All methods of livelihood among the people are called caste. Consequently, no [innate] distinction due to caste is found among all living beings.

15. The reign of the *dhammarāja* is described in *Majjhima*, II, pp. 74-83; *Aṅguttara*, I, pp. 109-110; *Dīgha*, III, pp. 59-77. S. J. Tambiah, *World Conqueror, World Renouncer*, Cambridge, Mass., 1976, pp. 9-18, 32-53, discusses the development of the *dhammarāja* concept in early Buddhist literature.
16. *Manusmṛti*, VII, 86 sanctions the king's attacks on his enemies' weaknesses.
17. The *Bhagavad Gītā*, II, 31-37 and *Manusmṛti*, VII, 89, indicate that heaven is the reward for *kṣatriyas* who die in battle, but Uv., XXIII, 3; Dhṛp., VIII, 4; and SL 24 all describe the man who conquers his enemies in battle as less worthy of respect than the man who conquers himself.
18. See Dhṛp., XII, 2-4 on the importance of becoming the lord of oneself (*attano nātho*) before ruling others. Dhṛp., XIII, 12 notes that better than earthly sovereignty is *sotāpatti*.
19. A king achieves only notoriety from his evil actions, just as a *śvapaca* achieves notoriety from cooking dogs. *Manusmṛti*, X, 19 identifies a *śvapaca* as the child of a *kṣatri* father (the son of a *śūdra* father and a *kṣatriya* mother) and an *ugra* mother (the daughter of a *kṣatriya* father and a *śūdra* mother). *Śvapacas* and *caṇḍalas* live outside villages, keep dogs and asses, and wear the clothing of the dead (X, 51-56).
20. See RĀ, IV, 43 on virtuous behavior (*dharma*) as the cause of sovereignty.
21. Candrakīrti (D ff. 86b-87a, P f. 94a-b) summarizes the *Aggañña Sutta*, *Dīgha*, III, pp. 85-97, on the origins of the four classes. See Tambiah (1976), pp. 10-15 for a structural analysis of this myth.

22. | 'das dus śin tu riñ ba dañ | mi mo rnams yid gyo ba ste |
| de phyir rgyal rigs žes bya ba | rigs las 'ga' yañ yod ma yin |
23. + + + + + + + + + + + + + (ka)rmañā |
vipro 'pi karmañā śūdraḥ kena manye na jāyate ||
| gal te las kyis dmañs rigs kyañ | rgyal rigs žes byar 'gyur na ni |
| las kyis dmañs kyañ bram zer ni | gañ gis 'gyur ba min par sems |
24. pāpasyaśvavyavad rājan saṃvibhāgo na vidyate |
vidvān nāma parasyārthe kaḥ kuryād āyatīvadham ||
| rgyal po sdig la dbaṅ phyug ltar | 'ged pa yod pa ma yin na |
| gžan gyi don du mkhas pa ni | su žig phyi mar 'joms par byed |
25. dṛṣṭvā samān viśiṣṭāṃś ca parāṃś chaktisamanvitān |
aiśvaryaśanito mānaḥ satāṃ hṛdi na tiṣṭhati ||
| dbaṅ phyug gis bskyed na rgyal ni | mñam dañ khyad par 'phags pa yi |
| pha rol nus ldan blta bya ste | dam pa'i sñiñ la mi gnas so |
- rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las bdag tu 'dzin pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste rab tu
byed pa bži'o ||

V. *Byaṅ chub sems dpa' spyod pa bstan pa ste* |

1. na ceṣṭā kila buddhānām asti kā cid akāraṇā |
niḥśvāso 'pi hitāyaiva prāṇinām saṃpravartate ||
| sañs rgyas rnams kyis gyo ba ni | rgyu med 'ga' yañ yod min te |
| dbugs kyañ sems can rnams la ni | sman slad kho nar yañ dag 'byuñ |
2. | 'jig rten kun la 'chi bdag sgra | ji ltar 'jigs pa bskyed 'gyur ba |
| de bžin kun mkhyen sgra 'di ni | 'chi bdag la yañ 'jigs pa bskyed |

22c de'i NP : de CD

24a po CD : po'i NP; b 'ged NP : 'geñ CD

1b 'ga' CD : dga' NP

2a sgra CD : smra NP; b skyed CD : skye NP; c sgra CD : smra NP

22. Since the past is far gone and women's minds are fickle, there is no one [certain of direct descent] from the class called royal class (*kṣatriya*).
23. If even a person of the lower classes (*sūdra*) becomes a member of the royal class through his actions, I wonder why a person of the lower classes does not become a brahmin priest (*vipra*) also through his actions.
24. O, king, you cannot share evil as [you share your] sovereignty. Indeed, what intelligent person would destroy [his own] future for the sake of someone else?
25. After they have seen others who are endowed with equal or superior power, the pride produced by sovereignty will not remain in wise men's hearts.

V. Showing the Acts of a Bodhisattva

1. It is said that there is no act of the Buddhas that lacks a reason. Even their breathing arises only for the sake of living beings.
 2. Just as the phrase 'Lord of Death' terrifies all people, the phrase 'All-Knowing One' (*sarvajña*) terrifies even the Lord of Death!
-
22. A king cannot be certain that his father was a *kṣatriya*, since his mother may have been unfaithful with men of other classes, and the sons of mixed unions (see *Manusmṛti*, X, 1-11) are not *kṣatriyas*.
 23. *Manusmṛti*, IV, 61 speaks of *sūdra* kings but in IV, 99 forbids *sūdras* to recite the Vedas.
 24. The individual must bear the results of his own evil actions; cf. Uv., XXVII, 11ab: *ātmanā hi kṛte pāpe tv ātmanā kliṣyate sadā*; Dhṛ., XII, 9-10; and SL, 30.
 25. RĀ, V, 6-12, discusses seven types of *māna*.
-
1. Candrakīrti (D f.89b, P f.97a) explains that as the Buddha's breath passes over the hells it brings a cooling rain to ease the suffering of those in hell. These beings rejoice at the sight of a Buddha and their trust (*dad pa, śraddhā*) in him diminishes their past non-virtuous karma and enables them to accumulate virtuous karma.
 2. Candrakīrti (D f.90b, P ff.98b-99a) comments that the Tathāgata's name frightens the Lord of Death because all people who hear it escape his realm.

3. The Sage has power over what should be done and what should not be done, and what should be said and what should not be said. Therefore, what reason is there for saying that the All-Knowing One is not omniscient?
4. Since, if one does not understand the intention, the merit, and so forth, in such [actions] as going is not perceived, one must realize that mind is the chief (*mūla*) of all actions.
5. Because of the bodhisattvas' intention [of benefiting others], everything – whether virtuous or non-virtuous [when done by non-bodhisattvas] – incurs only good, since their minds are under control.
6. Far superior to the merit that would make all people on earth become universal monarchs (*cakravartin*) is [the merit of] a bodhisattva's initial intention (*citta*).

3. The Buddha's refusal to respond to the fourteen indeterminate points (*caturdaśavyākṛtavastūni*) led to charges that he was not omniscient. On these fourteen points see *Traité*, I, p. 154 (ref.), III, pp. 1682-1683. RĀ, I, 74 takes the position that the Buddha did not respond because his questioners were incapable of understanding his profound teaching: *sarvajña iti sarvajño budhais tenaiva gamyate | yenaitad dharmagambhīryaṃ novācābhāṣane jane ||*. K. N. Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*, London, 1963, pp. 470-476; Murti (1960), pp. 36-65; D. Kalupahana, *Buddhist Philosophy*, Honolulu, 1976, pp. 40-41, 80, 153-161; and R. Robinson, 'Some methodological approaches to the unexplained points', *PEW* 22 (1972), pp. 309-323, discuss alternative explanations.
4. Cf. RĀ, IV, 73ab: *manaḥpūrvamgamā dharmā manaḥśreṣṭhā iti śruteḥ* |; Uv., X-XXI, 24ab: *manaḥpūrvamgamā dharmā manaḥśreṣṭhā manojavāḥ* |; and Dhṛ., V, 2ab.
5. The Sanskrit verse is quoted in *Subhāṣitasamgraha*, *Muséon*, IV, p. 44; *Tattvasiddhi*, Baroda ms. f.190 (CL).
6. RĀ, II, 77-95 enumerates the meritorious actions that result in the 32 marks of a *cakravartin*; all this merit, according to III, 1, cannot produce a single one of the Buddha's marks. Cf. BS, 36-39.

7. | rin chen rañ bžin mchog rten ni | 'jig rten (s)ñed mtho 'gas byas
pa |
| de bas sems can gcig 'dul po | mchog tu bkrabs par brjod pa yin |
8. | de la phan 'dod bla ma yis | slob ma la ni sri źu bya |
| gañ phyir des phan mi śes pa | de phyir slob ma źes bya'o |
9. | khro yañ 'byuñ pos bzuñ pa la | sman pa 'khrug pa min pa ltar |
| thub pa ñon moñs dgrar gzigs kyi | ñon moñs dañ 'brel gañ zag
min |
10. yad yad yasya priyaṃ pūrvaṃ tat tat tasya samācāret |
na hi pratihataḥ pātraṃ saddharmasya kathāṃ cana ||
| gañ žig gañ gañ la dga' ba | de yi de de sñar spyad bya |
| ñams par gyur pa dam chos kyi | snod ni cis kyañ ma yin no |
11. glāne putre viśeṣeṇa mātārtā jāyate yathā |
asatsu bodhisattvānāṃ viśeṣeṇa dayā tathā ||
| ji ltar ma ni khyad par du | nad thebs bu la gduñ 'gyur ba |
| de bžin byañ chub sems dpa'i brtse | dam pa min la khyad par du'o |
12. kasya cij jāyate śiṣyaḥ kasya cij jāyate guruḥ |
vinayaty abudhān sattvān nānopāyair upāyavit ||
| la la'i slob mar 'gyur ba ste | la la yi ni bla mar 'gyur |
| thabs rig sna tshogs thabs kyi ni | ma rtogs sems can rtogs par byed |
13. | ji ltar sman pa mkhas gyur pas | nad pa sgrub med dkon de.bžin |
| byañ chub sems dpa' stobs rñed nas | gdul bya ma yin śin tu
dkon |

7. Someone may build a *stūpa* made of jewels as high as the universe. It is said that better than that is [the merit of] someone who trains a single living being [to produce the intention of enlightenment].
8. The teacher who wants to benefit a student must pay attention to him. Since he [the student] does not understand the benefit, he is called a student.
9. Just as a physician is not disturbed by someone who is possessed by a demon, even though he [the patient] is angry [at the physician], the Sage sees the affliction (*kleśa*) as the enemy, not the person who has the affliction.
10. At first he [the teacher] should go along with whatever is dear to him [the student], for someone who is frustrated is never a good recipient (*pātra*) of the true teaching.
11. Just as mothers especially feel pain for sick children, the bodhisattvas' sympathy arises especially for those who are not wise.
12. A student emerges for a certain [teacher]; a teacher emerges for a certain [student]. A person who knows the methods (*upāyavid*) instructs ignorant living beings by various methods.
13. Just as it is rare for a skilled physician not to cure patients, it is very rare for a bodhisattva who has acquired the power [for training] not to have [students] to be trained (*vaineṇya*).

7. Or, following the CD variant reading in c, 'make someone produce the intention'. Cf. BS, 12, 41-42 on the merit attained by converting others to the Mahāyāna. The *Aṣṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā*, pp. 62-70, states that the merit of someone who studies and promulgates the *prajñāpāramitā* far exceeds that of people who build jeweled *stūpas* over the Buddha's relics.

8-13. Bodhisattvas must use both skilful means and compassion in diagnosing and treating their students' afflictions. Cf. BS, 10-11, 16-17. On bodhisattva physicians see Mark Tatz, tr., *Buddhism and Healing*, Demiéville's article "Byo" from *Hōbōgin*, Lanham, MD, 1985, pp. 43-50. The Sanskrit of v.10 is given in PP, p. 370, and of vv. 10-12 in *Subhāṣitasamgraha*, p. 385 (CL).

14. | byañ chub sems dpa'i yul du ni | gal te 'ga' žig ma bskul bar |
 | ñan soñ 'gro bar 'gyur na de | blo ldan gžan gyis smad byar 'gyur |
15. | gañ žig ñen pa gžan dag la | sñiñ brtse legs žes mi 'dod pa |
 | de rjes brtse bas mgon med pa | dag la ji ltar sbyin pa gtoñ |
16. | 'gro la phan phyir gañ žig la | 'jig rten srid du gnas yod pa |
 | de la sor gnas dag phuñ na | sdañ la bsam thag ci žig yod |
17. | gañ la skye ba thams cad du | mñon šes lña char yañ yod pa |
 | de yi dman par dman lta'i dños | 'di ni šin tu bya dka' ba'o |
18. | thabs kyis kun tshe bsod nams gañ | šin tu yun riñ bsags pa de |
 | thams cad mkhyen pa'i gžal bya yañ | min žes de bžin gšegs pas
 gsuñs |

14b bar NP : bas CD; d gyis NP : gyi CD

16b srid CDN : sred P; d thag CD : dag NP

14. If someone within a bodhisattva's realm, without being inspired, were to go to a bad rebirth, then other intelligent people would blame that [bodhisattva].
15. How can someone who does not acknowledge that sympathy (*krpā*) for others who are oppressed is good give gifts because of pity (*anukampā*) to the protectorless?
16. If those who are indifferent (*madhyastha*) towards a certain [bodhisattva] – who remains as long as the world exists, for the purpose of benefiting beings – incur misfortune, how much more so those who are angry [at him]!
17. If a certain [bodhisattva] who has all five superknowledges (*abhijñā*) in all births and in an inferior [birth] has an existence that seems inferior [namely, a dog] – this is very difficult to do (*duṣkara*).
18. The Tathāgata said that the merit which has accumulated for a very long time by [skill in] method is always immeasurable, even for the omniscient.

16. *Samyutta*, I, p. 149 says that someone who becomes angry at an *ariya* will be reborn in hell; cf. *Uv.*, VIII, 5; *SN*, 660; and *BS*, 127.
17. See *Traité*, I, pp. 328-333 (ref.) and IV, pp. 1809-1827 (ref.) on the five *abhijñā*. Candrakīrti (D f.101a-b, P f.100a-b) summarizes the *Kukkura Jātaka* (Fausbøll, I, pp. 175-178). While the Pāli version attributes the bodhisattva's birth as a dog to the maturation of past karma, Candrakīrti suggests that the rebirth was intentional: *byañ chub sems dpa' 'ga' 'zig tu khyi rnam la ma 'oñs pa'i gnod pa dag rig byas pas khyi'i skyes gnas su 'zus zo* || Cf. *BS*, 80 on the voluntary rebirth of bodhisattvas.
18. Cf. *RĀ*, III, 1-9 on the immeasurable merit that produces the marks of a Buddha.

19. | 'chi dañ chos dañ srid pa gžan | sbyin pa'i sgra yis gsal byed pa |
 | de phyir byañ chub sems dpa' la | sbyin pa'i sgra ni rtag tu sñan |
20. | 'dir byin pa yi sbyin pa las | 'bras bu chen po 'byuñ 'gyur žes |
 | len dañ yoñs su gtoñ ba ni | tshoñ spogs bžin du smad par 'gyur |
21. | gañ la sñar byas sdig pa yañ | yod ñid yod pa ma yin pa |
 | dge ba'i las can de la ni | bsgrub min žes bya yod ma yin |
22. | rlabs chen yid can de la ni | 'di na'añ gnod pa yod min te |
 | des na de la srid pa dañ | mya ñan 'das la khyad par med |

19. [When analyzed] the word giving indicates (*vyañj-*) death, the teaching (*dharma*), and other existences. Therefore, the word giving continually pleases a bodhisattva.
20. If it is said that in a given case a great result will occur from giving a gift, then receiving and giving will be criticized as similar to profiting through trade.
21. Although a certain [bodhisattva] previously did evil, that [evil] has no real existence. One cannot say that this [bodhisattva], who possesses good karma, is unsuccessful [in benefiting others].
22. There is no harm, even in this world, for a certain [bodhisattva] who has a powerful mind. Consequently, there is no difference between [the cycle of] existence and *nirvāṇa* for him.

19. Candrakīrti (D f.103b, P f.113b) explains the etymological derivation of the word *dāna*. He derives it first from the root *do* 'to cut' and comments that this alludes to death; consequently, the word *dāna* pleases bodhisattvas because it accords with disgust (*skyo*, *udvega*) for the cycle of birth and death. He derives *dāna* also from the root *dā* 'to give' and notes that the three types of *dāna* include all six perfections: *āmiṣadāna* is associated with generosity; *abhayaḍāna*, with moral conduct and patience; and *dharmadāna*, with meditation and insight; all three are associated with vigor, and in this way the word *dāna* pleases bodhisattvas because it communicates the teaching. *Dāna* may also be derived from the roots *de* 'to guard' and *da* 'to purify'. Candrakīrti explains that in this life one must guard one's body, speech, and mind and purify them since other births are brought about in accordance with one's desires. Because the word *dāna* alludes to other births it pleases bodhisattvas.

See also *Traité*, II, pp. 698-700, 750-769, and V, p. 2388 on the three types of *dāna* and their relation to the other perfections.

20. *Dīgha*, III, pp. 258-259 and *Āṅguttara*, IV, pp. 236-238, list the eight bases for giving and the eight rebirths that result from giving gifts. Cf. **Śataka*, 169c (*Śataśāstra*, p. 13) and MĀ, I, 11 on the analogy between the expectation of reward and trade in the marketplace.
21. Candrakīrti (D f.103b, P f.113b) quotes SL, 43 to explain that just as an ounce of salt does not affect the taste of the Ganges, a small amount of bad karma cannot counteract the great power of vast good roots.
22. RĀ, III, 21-26 suggests that the bodhisattvas' collections of merit and knowledge (*puṇyajñānasambhāra*) enable them to remain in the world free of physical and mental pain. Cf. RĀ, I, 64; YŚ, 5; and MK, XXV, 19-20 on the relation between *samsāra* and *nirvāṇa*.

23. | gañ la kun tshe sems dbaṅ ni | ñid las skye ba yod gyur pa |
 | de ko rgyu cis 'jig rten ni | kun gyi mña' bdag 'gyur ma yin |
24. | phul 'gro las ches phul 'gro ba | 'ga' žig 'jig rten 'dir yaṅ snaṅ |
 | des na bsam mi khyab mthu yaṅ | ñes par yod ces rtogs par gyis |
25. | blun la śin tu zab chos la | skrag pa skye ba ji ltar ba |
 | de bžin gžan la śin tu ni | rmad byuṅ chos la skrag pa skye |

rnaḥ 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las byaṅ chub sems dpa' i spyod pa bstan pa ste rab tu
 byed pa lña pa'o ||

VI. *Ñon moṅs spaṅ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste* |

1. | bde bas 'dod chags 'phel 'gyur žiṅ | sdug pas khro ba 'phel 'gyur na |
 | cis bde dka' thub can min žiṅ | sdug pa dka' thub can cis yin |
2. | 'dod chags las ni sdud pa ste | khro ba'i las ni rtsod pa'o |
 | 'byuṅ ba kun la rluṅ bžin du | gti mug las ni gsos 'debs pa'o |

25c gžan NP : žan CD

2d pa'o NP : so CD

23. Why shouldn't a certain [bodhisattva], who always is born precisely because of his control over mind, become a ruler of the entire world?
24. Even in this world, some superior beings appear greater than [other] superior beings. Therefore, you should know that [the Tathāgata's] inconceivable power certainly exists.
25. Just as fools fear the very profound teaching, others fear the teaching of marvels (*adbhutadharma*).

VI. Showing the Method for Rejecting the Afflictions

1. Desire increases because of pleasure, and hatred increases because of pain. Why isn't [a person under the influence of] pleasure an ascetic (*tapasvin*) and why is [a person under the influence of] hatred an ascetic?
2. The action of desire is accumulation; the action of hatred is discord. The action of confusion sustains [both], just as air sustains all the elements.

23. The *Daśabhūmikasūtra*, pp. 21-22, reports that a bodhisattva on the first stage of the path usually becomes a powerful king who protects the *dharma*. RĀ, V, 41-60, in tracing the bodhisattva's career through the stages of the path, depicts him as an increasingly more powerful and influential king in the divine worlds.
24. Candrakīrti (D f.105a-b, P f.116a) says that from the best of causes, namely, the bodhisattva's deeds, comes the best of results, namely, the Tathāgatas, a subject he treats in greater detail in MĀ, pp. 3-6.
25. On *gambhīradharma* see *Traité*, I, pp. 337-338 (ref.). Cf. RĀ, I, 39-40, 76-77, 79. The *adbhutadharma* is one of the nine divisions of the Buddha's discourse; see CPD s.v. *abbhutadhamma* (ref.).

1. Asceticism will reduce desire, but will only increase hatred. The Buddha describes his own painful experiences as a *tapassin* in *Majjhima*, I, pp. 77-81.
2. Air acts as a cohesive force in sustaining the other three elements, similarly, *moha* or *avidyā* sustains the other two *kleśas*. Candrakīrti, PP, p. 370, identifies *avidyā* as the basis of the other two *kleśas*.

3. | ma phrad pa las 'dod chags ni | sdug bsñal (d)puñ med las khro
| yoñs mi śes las gti mug ste | de dag gis de dag mi rtogs |
4. | ji ltar bad kan la mkhris dañ | lhan cig phrad pa med par mthoñ |
| de bzin khro la 'dod chags dañ | lhan cig phrad pa med par mthoñ |
5. | 'dod chags bran bzin bkol bya ste | gañ phyir mi phañs de'i sman
| khro la rje bo bzin lta ste | de'i sman phañs pa yin phyir ro |
6. | dañ por gti mug yañ dag 'byuñ | bar du khro ba 'byuñ 'gyur zin |
| physis ni 'dod chags 'byuñ ba ste | ñin la rim pa gsum du'o |
7. | 'dod chags mdza' min mdza' 'dra ba | des de la khyod mi 'jigs te |
| mi phan mdza' bo khyad par du | skyes bus spañ bar bya min nam |
8. | 'dod chags rgyu las skye 'gyur zin | rkyen las kyañ ni skye ba ste |
| 'dod chags rkyen las skye ba gañ | de ni sgrub sla cig śos min |
9. | khro ba brtan zin ñes par ni | mi dge ñes chen byed pa ste |
| de ltar rnam kun dbye śes pas | ñon moñs rnams mthar byed par
| 'gyur |

3a phrad pa las CD : 'phrad pa la NP; b dpuñ : spuñs CDNP; d rtogs CD : rtog NP

4d pa DNP : par C

5d de'i CD : de NP

6b 'gyur CD : gyur NP

9a brtan CD : bstan NP; b de ltar CDP, da ltar N; d rnams NP : rnam CD

3. Desire is pain on account of separation [from the desired object]. Hatred is pain on account of a lack of power. Confusion is pain on account of a lack of understanding. Because of these [three afflictions] these [pains] are not understood [and abandoned].
4. Just as one sees that there is no connection between phlegm and bile, one sees that there is no connection between desire and hatred.
5. [A student under the influence of] desire should be treated like a servant, since harshness is its antidote. [A student under the influence of] hatred should be treated like a king, since kindness is its antidote.
6. At first, confusion arises; next, hatred arises; and in the end, desire arises. Gradually throughout the day all three arise.
7. Desire – which is an enemy – appears as a friend. Consequently, you may not fear it. But shouldn't people especially abandon a harmful friend?
8. Desire arises from [internal] causes and [external] conditions. The desire that arises from [external] conditions is easy to suppress; the other is not.
9. Certainly, much demerit is created while anger remains strong. Thus when the difference in kind in each case is understood, the afflictions will cease.

3. CDPN all read *spuñs*, but the commentaries of Red mda' ba, rGyal tshab, gZan dga', and mDo sñags all read *dpuñ*. The Sanskrit original likely read *bala*, which has the dual sense of army and power, a double meaning which is not conveyed by the Tibetan *dpuñ*.
- 4-5. The treatment for those afflicted by *rāga* or *dveṣa* differs, just as in the cases of illnesses caused by phlegm and bile. On the relation of the three *doṣas* to the three *kleśas* see Tatz (1985), pp. 69-71.
6. Candrakīrti (D f.111b, P f.123a-b) explains that early in the morning, while people are still sleepy, *moha* predominates; at midday, because of the pain of hunger and thirst, *dveṣa* develops; and at night, after one relaxes, *rāga* is aroused.
7. *Āṅguttara*, IV, p. 145, lists *rāga* as one of enemies which the *arahant* slays.
- 8-9. Candrakīrti (D f.111b, P f.123a-b) distinguishes between the *rāga* caused by habitual inclination (*bag chags, anuśaya*) inherited from past births and that brought about by a specific external condition, for example, an evil friend. The same distinctions apply to *dveṣa*. Cf. *Traité*, IV, p. 1783.

10. | lus la lus dbaṅ ji bzin du | gti mug kun la gnas 'gyur te |
| de phyir ṅon moṅs thams cad kyaṅ | gti mug bcom pas bcom par
'gyur |
11. | rten ciṅ 'brel par 'byuṅ ba ni | mthoṅ na gti mug 'byuṅ mi 'gyur |
| de phyir 'bad pa kun gyis 'dir | gtaṃ de kho na bṣṅad par bya |
12. | rtag tu sa 'dzin sogs dga' la | gtoṅ bo za po gtsaṅ žiṅ 'gyur |
| de 'dra la sogs mtshan ṅid rnam | 'dod chags can gyi mi la sṅaṅ |
13. | saṅs rgyas rnam kyis chags can la | zas daṅ chos gso gtsug lag
khaṅ |
| dge legs spaṅs pa thams cad daṅ | rtag tu bla ma'i thad gnas gsuṅs |
14. | nus med la khros bdag ṅid la | mdog mi sdug pa 'ba' žig byed |
| nus pa gaṅ la'aṅ brtse med pa | de ni tha chad ces byar brjod |
15. | yid du mi 'oṅ ba yi sgra | sṅar byas sdig mthar byed par brjod |
| rmoṅs ṣiṅ dam pa ma yin pa | bdag ṅid rnam par dag mi 'dod |
16. | sṅan pa yid du mi 'oṅ ba'aṅ | ṅo bo ṅid kyis gnod mi byed |
| de phyir rnam rtog las byuṅ ba | gžan las yin no sṅam du rlom |
17. | ji ltar gse ba po la ni | chad par bya ba mṅon brjod pa |
| de bzin sṅan par smra po la | mchod par bya bar cis mi 'gyur |
18. | khyod kyis smad bya ma smras kyaṅ | gal te gžan kyis ses na ni |
| smra po la khro mi rigs na | yaṅ dag min smra la ci smos |

10b 'gyur NP : gyur CD

11c pa NP : pas CD; d na DNP : nar C

13c spaṅs pa CD : yaṅs ba NP

14c pa CD : la NP

15a ba yi CDP : ba'i N

16a ba'aṅ NP : ba CD

17d bar NP : ba CD

10. In the same way as the tactile sense faculty (*kāyendriya*) resides in the body, confusion resides in all [afflictions]. Therefore, when confusion is conquered, all the afflictions will be conquered.
11. Were interdependent origination (*pratītyasamutpāda*) understood, confusion would not occur. Therefore, with every effort, one should proclaim the very teaching in this system.
12. One sees in a person who has desire characteristics such as these: fondness for kings, and so forth, profligacy, gluttony, and fastidiousness [in dress].
13. The Buddhas told those who have desire: 'Fine food, clothing, and dwellings are all things to be abandoned; and you ought to remain constantly in the presence of a teacher'.
14. It is said that he who has no power [to harm others] only makes himself look bad by anger; but he who has power and has no mercy is far worse!
15. It is said that [hearing] harsh words brings evil done earlier to an end. Only a confused and foolish person does not want to purge his sins.
16. What is unpleasant to hear does not inflict harm by virtue of its own-nature. Therefore, one [falsely] assumes that what [harm] has arisen from [one's own] imagination (*vikalpa*) is due to something else.
17. Just as it is said that an abusive person should be punished, why shouldn't someone who speaks kindly be honored?
18. Even though you do not mention [your own] faults, if someone else knows [about them], it is wrong to be angry at that person who speaks [about them]. How much more so if he lies!

10. The *kāyendriya* resides in the entire body (*sabbasarīrabhāpaka*); see Karunadasa (1976), p. 157 (ref.).
11. Cf. *Kāśyapaparivarta* (ed. Staël-Holstein), p. 137: *mohasya pratītyasamutpāda-pratyavekṣaṇā cikitsā*, and MK, XXVI, 11 and PP, p. 559.
- 12-13. Discussion of the characteristics of a person influenced by *rāga* and the appropriate countermeasures. *Aṅguttara*, III, pp. 219-220 lists the ascetic practices (*dhutāṅga*) that counteract *rāga*.
- 14-20. Discussion of *dveṣa*. Harsh words and other abuse result from the maturation of karma and, therefore, anger is the wrong response; cf. RĀ, III, 71. Dhṛp., XXIII, 1 advises that abuse (*atīvākya*) should be endured since most people are ill-natured (*dussīla*).

19. | dman las mi sñan zes bya ba | ñes par 'byuñ ba ma yin te |
 | de phyir dman byuñ mi sñan pa | yan gar ñuñ zad lta bur snañ |
20. | gžan gnod byas pas bdag la ni | yon tan cuñ zad kyañ med na |
 | khyod khro yon tan med pa la | gus pa žen pa rkyañ par zad |
21. | gal te bzod pas 'bad med par | bsod nams chen po thob 'gyur na |
 | gañ žig de la gegs byed pa | de mtshuñs blun po su žig yod |
22. | khro ba zes bya khyad par du | stobs ldan dag la skye mi 'gyur |
 | des na gžan 'joms khro ba la | ci nas khyod gus gyur ta re |
23. | gañ žig khro gnas la bzod pa | de la bsgom pa skye bar 'gyur |
 | yon tan gnas la 'jigs šes pa | khyod kyi blun pa 'ba' žig yin |
24. | su žig khyad bsad mthar byas nas | 'jig rten pha rol 'gro ba yod |
 | de phyir bdag ni sdig pa bas | brñas pa legs so sñam du sems |
25. | gañ gis rnam šes gnas la sogs | yañ dag tu ni rnam šes pa |
 | de yod na ni ñon moñs rnams | nam yañ blo gros la mi gnas |

rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya la las ñon moñs spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste rab tu byed pa
 drug pa'o ||

20d pa DNP : par C

22c gžan CDNP : žan DTPT

23c šes NP : zes CD

24c ni D : ñid CNP

25b tu CD : du NP, ni DTPT : na CDNP

19. There is no escaping so-called censure from an inferior person. Therefore, you should view the censure that comes from an inferior person as just an isolated, trifling matter.
20. You won't have even the slightest benefit from harming others. Your admiration for an angry person who has no good qualities is just an attraction [to him].
21. If great merit were obtained effortlessly by patience (*kṣānti*), and if someone were to create an impediment to that, what fool would be equal to him?
22. Anger, in particular, is not generated towards those who have power. Therefore, why do you admire someone whose anger oppresses others?
23. You should cultivate patience towards someone who is angry. It is just foolish of you to fear a situation [suitable] for [accumulating] virtuous qualities.
24. Who puts an end to all abuse before he goes on to the next world? Therefore, one ought to consider that [enduring] scorn is better than [accumulating] evil.
25. When one understands correctly the duration, and so forth, of consciousness (*viññāna*), the afflictions never remain in the mind.

21. *Traité*, II, p. 865, states that the bodhisattva who exercises patience towards beings obtains an immeasurable quantity of merit (*apramāṇapunya*).
22. Or, following the variant reading in d, 'the weak'.
23. Candrakīrti (D f.118b, P f.131b) comments that the cultivation of *maitrī* instead of *dveṣa* produces eight *guṇa*: gods and humans will be kind and offer protection, much pleasure will arise, no harm will come from weapons or poison, wealth increases effortlessly, and rebirth will occur in the heaven of Brahmā; cf. RĀ, III, 84-85.
24. Uv., XXIX, 45 notes the ubiquity of criticism: *nindanti tūṣṇim āśinaṃ nindanti bahubhāṣiṇaṃ | alpabhāṣaṃ ca nindanti nāsti lokeṣv aninditaḥ ||*; cf. DhP. XVII, 7, which describes this statement as *porāṇaṃ etaṃ, atula, n'etaṃ ajjatanāṃ iva*. Cf. *Samyutta*, I, p. 162 (= Thag. 442); Uv., XX, 18 on the value of not retaliating in kind to someone who speaks harshly.
25. See CŚ, XV on these three marks.

VII. *Mi ñid kyis 'dod pa loñs spyod la žen pa spañ ba'i thabs bstan pa ste* |

1. | sdug bsñal rgya mtsho 'di la mtha' | rnam pa kun tu yod min na |
| byis khyod 'dir ni byiñ ba la | 'jigs pa cis na skye mi 'gyur |
2. | lañ tsho rgyab tu byuñ gyur nas | slar yañ mdun du 'byuñ bar 'gyur |
| gnas kyañ 'jig rten 'di la ni | 'gros kyi 'gran pa lta bur mñon |
3. | srid par khyod la rañ 'dod kyis | 'gro ba gźar yañ yod min na |
| gźan gyi dbañ dañ 'jigs med par | blo dañ ldan pa su žig 'gyur |
4. | ma 'oñs tha ma yod min žiñ | kun tshe'añ so so'i skye bo ste |
| khyod 'das ji ltar de bžin du | de yañ mi 'gyur de ltar byos |
5. | ñan po mñan bya 'chad po rnam | 'byuñ ba šin tu rñed dka' ste |
| des na mdor na 'khor ba ni | mtha' med ma yin mtha' bcas min |
6. | phal mo che na mi rnam ni | dam pa ma yin phyogs yoñs 'dzin |
| des na so so'i skye bo rnam | phal cher ñes par ñan 'gror 'gro |

2b du CDP, Bhatt. : tu N; 'byuñ CD : byuñ NP, Bhatt.; d kyi 'gran DTPT, Bhatt. : kyi
'dren NP : kyis 'gram CD

3a kyis CD, Bhatt. : kyi NP; b gźar CD : gźan NP, Bhatt.; d pa NP, Bhatt. : par CD

4a tha ma CDNP : thams cad Bhatt.; d P repeats 'gyur de

6a phal mo cher ni NP, Bhatt. : phal mo cher na CD; c so so'i CD, Bhatt. : so so NP

VII. How to reject Attachment to the Sensual Pleasures People Desire

1. Fool! If there is no end at all to this ocean of suffering, why are you, who are caught up in it, not afraid?
2. After youth has fallen behind, it will again come to the front. Even [youth's apparent steady] position (*avasthā*) in this world is clearly to be compared to a competitive race [among the rivals, youth, old age, and death].
3. In [the cycle of] existence you can never be reborn according to your own will-power. What intelligent person, being under another's control, is still not afraid?
4. The future has no end; and as you were always an ordinary person (*prthagjana*) in the past, you should act in such a way that this does not occur again.
5. It is very difficult to find occurring [simultaneously] a listener, instruction worth hearing (*śrotavya*), and a teacher. Consequently, in brief, the cycle of birth and death neither has nor has not an end.
6. People mostly hold the wrong positions. Consequently, most ordinary people certainly proceed to a bad rebirth.

1-4. Reasons why people should fear *saṃsāra*; cf. CŚ, VIII, 12 and SL, 65-103, which develops this theme in detail.

5. *Āṅguttara*, I, p. 266, says that the occurrence of the following three: the Tathāgatha, a teacher of *dharma* and *vinaya*, and a person who is grateful (*kataññu*) and mindful, are rare to obtain. Cf. Dhṛ., XIV,4 on the rarity of birth as a human being and the opportunity to hear the Buddhas preach the *dharma*: *kiccho manussapaṭilābho kicchaṃ maccāna jīvitaṃ | kicchaṃ saddhammasavaṇaṃ kiccho buddhānaṃ uppādo ||* and RĀ, II, 41 ab: *durlabhāḥ pathyavaktāraḥ śrotāras tv atidurlabhāḥ | Candrakīrti* (D f.123a, P f. 136b) explains that when the Three Jewels exist, one cannot say that the cycle of birth and death has no end, but when they do not exist, one cannot say that it has an end.
6. In *Majjhima*, I, p. 389, the Buddha names hell and animal rebirth as the destiny of someone who holds the wrong view: *Micchādiṭṭhissa kho ahaṃ Seniya dvinnaṃ gaṇiṇaṃ aññataraṃ gatiṃ vadāmi : nirayaṃ vā tiracchānayaṇiṃ vā.*

7. | sa steñ sdig pa'i rnam smin ni | co 'dri kho na yin par mthoñ |
| des na srid pa gsod gnas dañ | mtshuñs par dam pa rnams la snañ |
8. | rnam śes gnas pa med pa las | gal te smyon pa 'gyur na ni |
| srid gnas smyon pa ma yin źes | mkhas pa su źig smra bar 'gyur |
9. hīyamānāṃ rujaṃ dṛṣṭvā gamanād(er) viparyaye |
sarakarmakṣaye tena karoti matimān matim ||
| 'gro la sogs pa'i sdug bsñal dag | bzlog la űams pa mthoñ gyur te |
| des na las kun zad pa la | blo gros ldan pas blo bskyed do |
10. yadaikasyāpi kāryasya dṛśyate nādikāraṇam |
tadā kasya bhayaṃ na syād dṛṣṭvaikasyāpi vistaram ||
| gañ tshe 'bras bu gcig gi yañ | thog ma'i rgyu ni snañ min pa |
| de tshe gcig la yañ rgyas par | mthoñ nas gañ la 'jigs mi 'byuñ |
11. siddhiḥ sarvasya kāryasya niyamena na jāyate |
niyamena kṛtasyāntaḥ kiṃ tadarthaṃ vihanyase ||
| 'bras bu thams cad űes par ni | 'grub par 'gyur ba ma yin źiñ |
| grub la űes par mthar 'gyur na | de yi don du ci ste 'joms |
12. yatnataḥ kriyate karma kṛtaṃ naśyaty ayatnataḥ |
virāgo 'sti na te kaś cid evaṃ saty api karmaṇi ||
| las ni 'bad pas byed 'gyur źiñ | byas zin 'bad pa med par 'jig |
| de ltar gyur kyañ khyod la go | las la chags bral 'ga' yod min |
13. atītasya sukhaṃ nāsti nāpy aprāptasya vidyate |
vartamāno 'pi yāty eva śramo 'yaṃ kasya nāma te ||
| 'das la bde ba yod min źiñ | ma 'oñs pa la'añ yod min la |
| da ltar byuñ ba'añ 'gro űid de | khyod kyi űal 'di gañ phyir yin |

7a steñ NP, Bhatt. : steñs CD; c gsod gnas CDN, Bhatt. : bsod nams P

8b 'gyur CDNP : gyur Bhatt.

9a gamanāder Bhatt. : gamanādaḥ HPS dag CD, Bhatt. : las NP; d pas CD : pa NP,
Bhatt.; blo bskyed do CDNP : blo ba skyed Bhatt.

10a gi CDP, Bhatt. : gis N

11d vihanyase HPS: vihanyate Bhatt.

12b 'jig DNP, Bhatt. : 'jigs C; go NP, Bhatt. : ko CD; d min CDNP : med Bhatt.

13c da ltar NP, Bhatt. : da CD; d nal CD, Bhatt. : las NP

7. One experiences that the maturation (*vipāka*) of evil on earth is only injurious (*vihethaka*). Consequently, the wise see [the cycle of] existence as similar to a place of execution.
8. If someone were insane because of an unstable mind, what intelligent person would say that someone who remains in [the cycle of] existence is not insane?
9. After seeing pain (*ruja*) diminished upon the cessation of such [actions] as going, consequently, an intelligent person directs [his] mind towards the exhaustion of all karma.
10. When the initial cause (*ādikāraṇa*) of even one effect is not seen, who would not be frightened after seeing the extent of even one [effect]?
11. There is not necessarily a completion (*siddhi*) of every effect, but there is necessarily an end to [every completed] result. Why do you exert yourself in vain on that account?
12. Action is undertaken with effort; the result (*krta*) is destroyed effortlessly. Even though this is true, you haven't any aversion to action!
13. There is no pleasure in the past, and there is none in the future. This present also passes by [right now]. What, then, is this exertion of yours [directed against]?

7-8. *Majjhima*, III, pp. 202-206 discusses short lifespans, mental and physical illness, and poverty, and so forth, as the maturation of evil.

9. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 468) associates all karma with pain: *yathā gamanādijanitā rujaś caṅkramaṇādirivarjaneṣu pūrvāvedhaparikṣayād anupūrvam kṣīyante tathā sarveṇa sarvarujaḥ sarvakarmopacchedaiḥ* | On the term *pūrvāvedha* see BHSD s.v. *āvedha*.

10. Since many factors cooperate in producing an effect, it is impossible to identify any one factor as the cause. The effect of an action involves not only the nature of the action itself, but also the nature of the individual committing the act and the circumstances under which it occurred; consequently, an identical action will lead one person to hell and another to heaven (see *Majjhima*, III, pp. 209-215; *Aṅguttara*, I, pp. 248-252).

11-12. Āryadeva emphasizes that all *kārya* are destroyed effortlessly.

13-14. Rejection of the argument that good karma results in pleasure. Cf. SL, 69-75, 98-101 on the suffering of the gods.

14. svargo nirayatulyo 'pi viduṣāṃ syād bhayaṃkaraḥ |
 sarvathā durlabhas teṣāṃ bhavo yo na bhayaṃkaraḥ ||
 | mkhas pa rnam la mtho ris kyañ | dmyal dañ mtshuñs par 'jigs
 bskyed 'gyur |
 | rnam pa kun tu de rnam la | srid gañ 'jigs pa mi bskyed dkon |
15. saṃsāraduḥkhaṃ jānīyād yadi bālo 'pi sarvaśaḥ |
 gacched atyantato nāśaṃ saha cittena tatkṣaṇam ||
 | gal te byis pa'añ rnam kun tu | 'khor ba'i sdug bsñal śes gyur na |
 | skad cig de la sems dañ ni | lhan cig gtan du 'jig par 'gyur |
16. amānī durlabhaḥ (sattvo) mānī nāsti ghrṇānviṭaḥ |
 uktaḥ sudurlabhas tena jyotirjyotiḥparāyaṇaḥ ||
 | sems can rlom pa can min dkon | rlom can sñiñ rje ldan pa med |
 | des na snañ nas snañ bar ni | 'gro ba śin tu rñed dkar gsuñs |
17. nivṛtt(a)viśayasyeha viśayaḥ kila labhyate |
 kenāpi hetunā dharmo viparīto 'pi sa smṛtaḥ ||
 | 'di na yul log gyur pa la | yul ni dmigs par grags gyur te |
 | phyin ci log tu gyur pa'i chos | rgyu ci žig gis yañ dag 'dod |

14b dmyal dañ mtshuñs par NP : dmyal ba mtshuñs CD, Bhatt.; bskyed Bhatt. : skyed
 CD : d bskyed NP : skyed CD : bskyid Bhatt.

15d du NP, Bhatt. : tu CD

16a sattvo Bhatt. : śakto HPS; c snañ DNP : gnas C, ni CDNP : ba Bhatt.

17a nivṛtta Bhatt. : nivṛtti HPS, log CD : logs NP, Bhatt.

13. There is no pleasure in the past, and there is none in the future. This present also passes by [right now]. What, then, is this exertion of yours [directed against]?
14. Even heaven would frighten the wise in the same way as hell. Rare is the existence that does not frighten them in every respect.
15. If even a fool were to understand completely the pain of the cycle of birth and death, then, simultaneously with that thought, he would be destroyed completely.
16. A [human] being who is not proud is rare; no proud person is compassionate. Consequently, it is said that one going towards light from light is very rare.
17. It is said that someone who has turned away from sense objects (*viṣaya*) in this world acquires [the pleasures of divine] sense objects. For some reason, this erroneous teaching is upheld.

15. The implication seems to be that the fool is unable to endure the truth about *duḥkha*, which would liberate him from *saṃsāra*. Cf. Dhṛ., V,13, which suggests that knowledge only harms a fool: *yāvad eva anathāya ṇattam bālassa jāyati | hanti bālassa sukkaṃsaṃ muddham assa vipātayam*. || Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 470) indicates that the *ārya*, sustained by the strength of his intention to benefit beings, is able to endure the pain of *saṃsāra*, but that the ordinary person, because of his belief in a real personality (*satkāyadrṣṭi*), is not: *kr̥tajñātāmahākaraṇābhyāṃ tu sattvopakārābhiprāyadhairiā(dhīṣṭhiā) saṃsārāduḥkham āryāṇaṃ na tathodvegakāraṇaṃ iti na teṣāṃ atyantato nāsaḥ śakyah sambhāvayitum | prthagjanas tu satkāyadrṣṭyanugamāt pratipakṣabhāvanāvaikalpāt paramāṇuṣo niyataṃ viśīryeta yadi sarvathā saṃsārāduḥkham jānīyāt |*
16. Cf. SL, 19. The fourfold classification of people as proceeding from light to light (*jotijotiparāyana*), from light to darkness (*tamojotiparāyana*), from darkness to light (*jotitamaparāyana*), and from darkness to darkness (*tamotamaparāyana*) occurs in *Aṅguttara*, II, p. 85 and *Samyutta*, I, p. 93, which explain that an intemperate and miserly poor person who has no faith will be reborn in hell, thus proceeding from darkness to darkness, that is, from one bad rebirth to another; a generous poor person who has faith will be reborn in heaven, thus proceeding from darkness to light, that is, from a bad rebirth to a good one; an intemperate and miserly rich person who has no faith will proceed from light to darkness; and a generous rich person who has faith will proceed from light to light. This classification is explained also in the *Puggalapaññatti*, p. 51ff.
17. *Majjhima*, I, pp. 388-389, also defines as a wrong view the notion that moral conduct, and so forth, should be undertaken in order to become a god.

18. puṇyasya phalam aiśvaryaṃ tac ca rakṣyaṃ sadānyataḥ |
 kathaṃ nāma tad ātmīyaṃ yad rakṣyaṃ sarvadānyataḥ ||
 | bsod nams 'bras bu phyug pa ste | de gžan las yoṅs bsruṅ bya na |
 | rtag tu gžan las bsruṅ bya gaṅ | de ni ji ltar bdag gir 'gyur |
19. yā yā lokasthitis tām tām dharmāḥ samanuvartate |
 dharmād api tato loko balavān iva dṛśyate ||
 | 'jig rten tshul lugs gaṅ daṅ gaṅ | de daṅ de la chos rjes 'jug |
 | de yi phyir na chos pas kyaṅ | 'jig rten stobs ldan lta bur snaṅ |
20. viśayaś ca śubhaneṣṭo viśayaḥ sa ca kutsitaḥ |
 śreyān yasya parityāgo niṣpannenāpi tena kim ||
 | yul ni dge bas yid 'oṅ na | yul de'aṅ ṅan par brtsi ba yin |
 | gaṅ žig btaṅ ba śis 'gyur ba | de grub pa yis ci žig dgos |
21. kāryaṃ nāsty (ājñayā) yasya tasya dharmo nirarthakaḥ |
 + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + ||
 | gaṅ la bka' luṅ dgos med pa | de la chos don med par 'gyur |
 | gaṅ yaṅ bka' luṅ don gñer ṅid | de ni skye naṅ blun žes bya |
22. | ma 'oṅs pa yi 'bras mthoṅ nas | chos 'dod chags pas khyod chags
 na |
 | ma 'oṅs mtha' ṅid mthoṅ gyur nas | 'jigs pa med dam ci žig byed |
23. | gla pa lta bu bsod nams ni | rnam kun rñan pa daṅ mtshuṅs 'gyur |
 | gaṅ dag dge ba'aṅ mi 'dod pa | de dag mi dge ji ltar byed |

18a phyug CD, Bhatt.: phyugs NP; b yoṅs NP, Bhatt.: ye CD

19c na CDP : ni N, Bhatt.; pas CDP : las Bhatt.

20a bas CD, Bhatt.: ba NP; c bas śis 'gyur ba NP : ba śis gyur pa CD : ba legs 'gyur ba Bhatt.; d yis CD : yi NP

21a ājñayā Bhatt.: anupā HPS

22c nas NP, Bhatt.: na CD; d dam CDP : de Bhatt.

23a gla pa lta bu NP : gla pa lta bu'i CD : gla pa'i lta bu Bhatt.; b mtshuṅs 'gyur CD : mtshuṅs pa NP, Bhatt.; c ba'aṅ mi 'dod CD: ba gaṅ 'dod N : ba'aṅ 'dod P : ba mi 'dod Bhatt.

18. Sovereignty is the result of merit, but it must be protected constantly from others. How, then, is something that must be protected constantly from others really one's own?
19. The *dharma* conforms to whatever is the established custom in society. Therefore it appears as if society is more powerful even than the *dharma*!
20. A desired sense object [is acquired] by virtue (*śubhena*), yet that sense object is denounced [by those whose seek liberation]. Also, why achieve what it is better to reject?
21. The *dharma* is useless for someone who has no need for power, and people call someone who [always] seeks power a fool.
22. If you become attached to the teaching after seeing the future result, why are you not afraid after seeing an end to the future [result]?
23. Merit is in all respects like a worker's wages. How could those who do not even desire what is virtuous do what is not virtuous?

18. Cf. Dhṛ., V,3.

19. Cf. *Bhagavad Gītā*, III, 21 (CL).

20. The performance of virtuous actions results in the enjoyment of sensual pleasures both in this world and in the next (cf. MK, XVII, 11) , but Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 472) points out that sense objects are best rejected since they are impermanent, impure, nonsubstantial, and conducive not to cessation (*nivṛtti*) but to the arising of the afflictions and to carelessness (*pramāda*).

21. Cf. CŚ, IV,7,13.

22-23. Criticism of those who engage in virtuous actions with the intention of enjoying the future effects of the merit generated by such actions. The wise, Candrakīrti says (D f.130b, P f.145b), are not attached to meritorious actions because they recognize such actions as a cause of rebirth in *saṃsāra*.

24. | gañ gis 'gro ba 'khrul 'khor gyi | tshogs 'dra sgyu ma'i skyes bu
ltar |
| mthon bar gyur pa de dag ches | gsal bar go 'phañ dam par 'gro |

25. | gañ dag la ni 'khor ba na | yul rnams kyis kyañ dga' med pa |
| de dag la 'dir rnam kun tu | dga' ba 'thad pa ma yin ñid |

rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las mi ñid kyis 'dod pa loñs spyod la žen pa spañ ba'i
thabs bstan pa ste rab tu byed pa bdun pa'o ||

VIII. *Slob ma spyod pa bstan pa ste* |

1. | ji ltar mi mthun mi rnams la | mdza' ba yun riñ mi gnas pa |
| de bžin kun la skyon šes la | 'dod chags yun riñ mi gnas so |

2. tatraiva rajyate kaś cit kaś cit tatraiva duṣyati |
kaś cin muhyati tatraiva tasmāt kā(m)o nirarthakaḥ ||
| la la de ñid la chags te | la la de ñid la sdañ žiñ |
| la la de ñid la rmoñs pa | de phyr 'dod pa don med pa'o |

3. vinā kalpanayāstitvaṃ rāgādīnāṃ na vidyate |
bhūtārthaḥ kalpanā ceti ko grahīṣyati buddhimān ||
| rtog pa med par 'dod chags la | sogs la yod ñid yod min na |
| yañ dag don dañ rtog pa žes | blo dañ ldan pa su žig 'dzin |

4. kasya cit kena cit sārdhaṃ bandho nāma na vidyate |
pareṇa saha ba(n)dhasya viprayogo na yujyate ||
| 'ga' la'añ gañ dañ lhan cig tu | bciñs pa žes bya yod min te |
| gžan dañ lhan cig bciñs pa la | bral bar rigs pa ma yin no |

24a gyi DNP, Bhatt.: gyis C

25c 'dir CD, Bhatt.: dañ NP

2d kāmō Bhatt.: kāyo HPS : rāgo Vaidya

3a rtog pa DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: rtog par C; c dañ CD, Bhatt.: de NP, Vaidya

4c bandhasya Bhatt.: baddhasya HPS, Vaidya

24. Those who see the living world (*jagad*) as resembling a collection of machines (*yantra*) and as like illusory beings (*māyāpuruṣa*) quite clearly attain the highest level (*param padam*).
25. It is altogether impossible for those who are not pleased even with [divine] sense objects in the cycle of birth and death to have pleasure in this world (*iha*).

VIII. The Conduct of the Student

1. Just as friendship between people who disagree does not last long, desire does not last long when the fault in all [things] is understood.
2. Some are attracted to it; some hate it; and some are confused by it. Therefore, desire is without a [real] object (*nirarthaka*).
3. The existence of desire, and so forth, is not found apart from conceptual constructs (*kalpanā*). What intelligent person would believe in a real object (*bhūtārtha*) and a conceptual construct?
4. The so-called bond between one person and another is not found, [since] the severance of a [real] bond with someone else is impossible.

24. *Laṅkāvatāra*, II, 154, similarly speaks of one being liberated by seeing the world (*jagat*) as resembling machines and illusory beings (*māyāvetālayantrābham*).
25. Cf. Uv., II, 18 and Dhp., XIV, 9 on the *śrāvaka*'s rejection of divine pleasures.

1. Candrakīrti (D f. 132b, P f. 148a) comments that friendship is a superimposition (*lhaḡ par sgro biags, adhyāropa*) by the mind only upon agreeable people.
- 2-3. Hopkins (1983), p. 627 quotes v.3. A real object would produce the same response in all observers, but neither the object of desire nor desire itself are established by virtue of their own nature (*svabhāva*). Desire, according to Uv, II, 2ab, arises from *saṃkalpa*: *kāma jānāmi te mūlaṃ saṃkalpāt kāma jāyase* | (quoted in PP., pp. 350, 451); MK, XXIII, 1, likewise attributes the arising of all three afflictions to the same source. Cf. ŚS, 59-61; BV, 19-20.
4. A real bond would exist by its own-nature and thus could not be severed, unlike the bond of affection; see CŚ, I, 17.

5. asmin dharme 'lpapūṇyasya saṁdeho 'pi na jāyate |
 bhavaḥ saṁdehamātreṇa jāyate jarjarikṛtaḥ ||
 | bsod nams chuñ ṇu chos 'di la | the tshom za bar yañ mi 'gyur |
 | the tshom za ba tsam žig gis | srid pa hrul por byas par 'gyur |
6. (ā mokṣād yasya) dharmasya vṛddhim evoktavān munih |
 tatra bhaktir na yasyāsti suvyaktaṁ buddhimān na saḥ ||
 | chos gañ žig la thub pa yis | thar pa'i bar du 'phel ba ñid |
 | gsuñs der gañ la gus med pa | de ni gsal bar blo ldan min |
7. nāsūnyaṁ śūnyavad dṛṣṭaṁ nirvāṇaṁ me bhavaty iti |
 mithyādṛṣṭer na nirvāṇaṁ varṇayanti tathāgatāḥ ||
 | bdag ni mya ñan 'da' 'gyur žes | stoñ min stoñ ltar mthoñ min te |
 | log ltas mya ñan mi 'da' bar | de bzin gšegs pa rnams gsuñ ño |
8. laukikī deśanā yatra pravṛttis tatra varṇyate |
 paramārthakathā yatra nivṛttis tatra varṇyate ||
 | gañ las 'jig rten bstan 'byuñ ba | de las 'jug pa gsuñs pa ste |
 | gañ las don dam bsñad 'byuñ ba | de las ldog pa gsuñs pa'o |
9. kiṁ kariṣyāmy asat sarvam iti te jāyate bhayaṁ |
 vidyate yadi kartavyaṁ nāyaṁ dharmo nivartakaḥ ||
 | kun yod ma yin ci bya žes | khyod la 'jigs pa skye 'gyur grañ |
 | gal te bya ba yod na ni | chos 'di zlog byed mi 'gyur te |
10. svapakṣe vidyate rāgaḥ parapakṣas tu te 'priyaḥ |
 na gamiṣyasi nirvāṇaṁ na śivaṁ dvandvacāriṇaḥ ||
 | khyod la rañ phyogs chags yod ciñ | gžan gyi phyogs la mi dga' na |
 | mya ñan 'das par mi 'gro ste | gñis spyod ži bar yoñs mi 'gyur |

5a chuñ ṇu CDNP : chuñ du Vaidya, Bhatt.: c 'hrul por CDNP, Bhatt.: 'hrul bor
 Vaidya

6a ā mokṣād yasya Vaidya, Bhatt.: ātmā hy ādyasya HPS, yis DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: yi C

7b stoñ min CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: stoñ ñid NP

8a 'byuñ CDN, Bhatt.: byuñ P, Vaidya

9b grañ CDNP, Vaidya: gañ Bhatt.: d zlog DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: bzlog C

10b dga' CDNP. Bhatt.: dka' Vaidya

5. Someone of little merit is not [even] skeptical of this teaching. By mere skeptical analysis (*saṃdeha*), [the cycle of] existence is shattered.
 6. The Sage said that someone who has no respect (*bhakti*) for a teaching which increases [its benefits] until liberation quite clearly is not intelligent!
 7. What is not empty (*aśūnya*) is not [to be] regarded as empty (*śūnya*) in order that 'nirvāṇa may be mine'. The Tathāgatas proclaim that *nirvāṇa* is not [to be attained] because of an erroneous view.
 8. Activity (*pravṛtti*) is proclaimed where there is teaching that is related to the world (*laukikī deśanā*). Withdrawal from activity (*nivṛtti*) is proclaimed where there is the ultimate teaching (*paramārthakathā*).
 9. You are frightened, thinking, 'What will I do? Everything is non-existent'. If there is something that must be done, this teaching is not conducive to withdrawal from activity.
 10. You are partial to your own thesis and dislike someone else's thesis. You will not attain *nirvāṇa* [in this way]; there is no tranquillity (*śiva*) for someone who engages in quarreling.
-
5. Quoted in Hopkins (1983), p. 33; see also Lindtner (1982), p. 270, n. 236. Āryadeva suggests that even skepticism, by focusing attention upon emptiness, can lead to the destruction of *saṃsāra*. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 474) says that the unwise are attached to a wrong view of things and so fear emptiness; and since their mental continua lack the good roots which bring about liberation through this teaching of emptiness, they fail to critically examine it: *anādisaṃsārābhyastaviparyāśadarśano hy avidvān pratibimbopameṣu padārtheṣv idam asatyābhiniviṣṭaḥ svabhāvaśūnyatopadeśaṃ prapātaṃ iva manyate | śūnyatāvimuktihetukūśala(mūla)rahitacittasaṃtānatvāt tathāvidhasya hi matasyāsmin śūnyatādharme kim evaṃ naivam iti saṃdeho 'pi na jāyate 'nyatra viparītanīścayāt |*
 6. Cf. the Buddha's teachings on respect (*gaurava*, *adhimukti*) for the *dharma* in the *Rāṣṭrapālāpariprcchā*, p. 59.
 7. Quoted in MĀ, p. 119; A. Wayman, *Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real*, New York, 1978, p. 269. Cf. MK, XVI, 9.
 8. This division of *dharmaśāstra* corresponds to the two truths. – Cf. Moh, p. 266.
 9. Quoted by Buddhapaṇḍita, *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Lindtner), p. 197.
 10. Āryadeva emphasizes here the soteriological consequences of attachment to positions; cf. YS, 46-59. L. Gómez discusses similar views which occur in the *Aṭṭhaka-vagga* section of the SN, 'Proto-Mādhyamika in the Pāli canon', PEW 26 (1978), pp. 140-155.

11. akurvāṇasya nirvāṇaṃ kurvāṇasya punarbhavaḥ |
 niścintena sukhaṃ prāptuṃ nirvāṇaṃ tena netaraḥ ||
 | byed med mya ṇan 'da' 'gyur žiñ | byed pas yañ srid 'gyur te des |
 | bsam khral med pas mya ṇan las | 'das pa thob sla cig šos min |
12. udvego yasya nāstīha bhaktis tasya kutaḥ śive |
 nirgamaś ca bhavād asmāt svagṛhād iva duṣkaraḥ ||
 | gañ la 'dir skyo yod min pa | de la ži gus ga la yod |
 | rañ khyim las bžin srid pa ni | 'di nas 'byuñ ba'añ bya bar dka' |
13. duḥkhābhībhūtā dṛśyante ke cin maraṇakāṅkṣiṇaḥ |
 te tadā kevalaṃ mohān na gacchanti paraṃ padam ||
 | la la sdug bsñal zil mnan žiñ | 'chi bar 'dod pa dag snañ ste |
 | de tshe de dag gti mug phyir | go 'phañ dam par mi 'gror zad |
14. | sbyin pa dman pa la gsuñs šin | 'briñ la tshul khriṃs gsuñs pa ste |
 | mchog la ži ba gsuñs gyur pa | des na rtag tu mchog tu byos |
15. vāraṇaṃ prāg apuṇyasya madhye vāraṇaṃ ātmanaḥ |
 sarvasya vāraṇaṃ paścād yo jānīte sa buddhimān ||
 | bsod nams min pa dañ por bzlog | bar du bdag ni bzlog pa dañ |
 | phyi nas lta ba kun bzlog pa | gañ gis šes de mkhas pa yin |
16. bhāvasyaikaṣya yo draṣṭā draṣṭā sarvasya sa smṛtaḥ |
 ekasya śūnyatā yaiva saiva sarvasya śūnyatā ||
 | dños po gcig gi lta po gañ | de ni kun gyi lta por bśad |
 | gcig gi stoñ ñid gañ yin pa | de ñid kun gyi stoñ pa ñid |

11c khral CD : bral NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

12a skyo CDNP, Bhatt.: skye Vaidya

13a žiñ Bhatt.: ciñ CDNP, Vaidya; d 'gror CDNP, Vaidya: 'gro Bhatt.: zad CDNP, Bhatt.: zañ Vaidya

14a sbyin CDNP, Bhatt.: spyin Vaidya; c gyur pa CDNP, Bhatt.: gyur ba Vaidya

15a bzlog CD : zlog NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: b bzlog CD : zlog CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: c ba CD : ži NP : žig DTPT : ni Vaidya, Bhatt.

16a lta po gañ CDNP, Bhatt.: lta bo yañ Vaidya; b lta por CDNP, Bhatt.: lta bor Vaidya; d stoñ pa ñid CDNP, Bhatt.: stoñ ñid do Vaidya

11. *Nirvāṇa* is for someone who is inactive; rebirth is for someone who is active. Consequently, *nirvāṇa* is easy to attain when one is free of concern (*niścintena*); the opposite is not.
12. How can someone who has no fear (*udvega*) of this world have respect for tranquillity? To leave this [cycle of] existence is as difficult as leaving one's own home.
13. Tormented by pain, some are seen to long for death. These, then, entirely because of confusion, do not attain the highest level.
14. Giving is recommended to people of low ability; moral conduct, to people of middling ability; and tranquillity, to people of high ability. Therefore, always act as a person of high ability.
15. He who understands, first, the rejection of demerit; next, the rejection of the self; and finally, the rejection of all [things], is wise.
16. It is said that he who sees one thing sees all [things]. The emptiness of one is precisely the emptiness of all.

11. The distinction *akurvāṇa/kuṛvāṇa* corresponds also to the twofold *dharmadeśanā* in CŚ, VIII, 8 and XII, 9.
12. Quoted in Hopkins (1983), p. 291. Cf. CŚ, VII, 1.
13. The alleviation of physical pain as a reason for suicide is discussed by Martin G. Wiltshire, 'The "Suicide" Problem in the Pāli Canon', *JIABS* 6/2 (1983), pp. 132-135.
14. Cf. **Sāta* 169, b-c (*Sātaśāstra*, pp. 12-13); YŚ, 55; RĀ, IV, 94-96. See also the explanations of the gradual teaching (*anupubbikathā*) in *Dīgha*, I, pp. 109-110 and *Majjhima*, I, p. 376.
15. Quoted in PP, p. 359; Ruegg (1971), p. 7. Here *sarva* refers to the aggregates, the sense bases, and the elements; cf. YŚ, 30, 33 and Lindtner (1982), p. 111, n. 30.
16. Quoted in PP, p. 128; Murti (1960), pp. 139-140; Wayman (1978), p. 366. Bhaṭṭa-charya (1931), p. 19, notes that two Jaina works, the *Syādvādamāñjarī* and Guṇaratna's commentary on the *Śaḍdarśanasamuccaya*, quote a similar verse.

17. | chos chags de bzin gsegs nams kyis | mtho ris 'dod pa nams la
| thar pa 'dod nams la de ñid | smad 'gyur gzan du smos ci dgos | gsuñs |
18. śūnyatā puṇyakāmena vaktavyā naiva sarvadā |
nanu prayuktam asthāne jāyate viṣam auśadham ||
| bsod nams 'dod pas stoñ pa ñid | kun tshe brjod par bya min te |
| gnas ma yin par sbyar ba'i sman | dug tu 'gyur ba ma yin nam |
19. nānyayā bhāṣayā mlecchaḥ śakyo grāhayitum yathā |
na laukikam ṛte lokaḥ śakyo grāhayitum tathā ||
| ji ltar kla klo skad gzan gyis | gzuñ bar mi nus de bzin du |
| 'jig rten pa yi ma gtogs par | 'jig rten gzuñ bar nus ma yin |
20. sad asat sadasac ceti nobhayaṃ ceti kathyate |
nanu vyādhivaśāt pathyam auśadhaṃ nāma jāyate ||
| yod dañ med dañ yod med dañ | gñis ka min zes kyañ bstan te |
| nad kyi dbaṅ gis thams cad kyañ | sman zes bya bar 'gyur min nam |
21. samyag dṛṣṭe paraṃ sthānaṃ kiñ cid dṛṣṭe śubhā gatiḥ |
tasmād adhyātmacintāyāṃ kāryā nityaṃ matir budhaiḥ ||
| yañ dag mthoñ na gnas mchog la | cuñ zad mthoñ na bzañ 'gro ste |
| de phyir nañ bdag bsam pa la | mkhas pas rtag tu blo gros bskyed |

17. The Tathāgatas recommend attachment to virtuous behavior (*dharma*) to those who desire heaven. They do not recommend that same [attachment] to those who seek liberation. How much more so [attachment] to something else!
 18. Someone who desires merit should not speak about emptiness at all times. Doesn't medicine that is unsuitably applied become poison?
 19. Just as it is impossible to make a barbarian understand in a foreign language, it is impossible to make people of this world understand [the truth] without reference to worldly things.
 20. Existence, non-existence, [both] existence and non-existence, and neither [existence nor non-existence] are taught. Surely, isn't it in accordance with the illness that the medicine becomes salutary?
 21. When one has perceived [the truth] correctly, the highest level [is attained]; when one has perceived a little [of the truth], a good rebirth [is attained]. Therefore, intelligent people constantly direct the mind towards inner contemplation (*adhyātmacintā*).
-
17. Candrakīrti (D f.140a, P ff.156b-157a) describes the Buddha's talk of attachment to the teaching as skilful means (*thabs, upāya*), appropriate for those who seek to accumulate merit and attain a good rebirth and are incapable of meditation (*bsgom pa, bhāvanā*) but not appropriate for those who seek liberation since it will bind them to the cycle of birth and death; they should abandon good practices (*chos rnams, dharmāḥ*) like a raft (probably a reference to the example of the raft in *Majjhima*, I, p. 135: *Kullūpamaṃ vo bhikkhave ājānantehi dhammā pi vo pahātabbā, pag eva adhammā*).
 18. The Sanskrit is found in the *Subhāṣitasamgraha*, *Muséon*, IV, p. 385 (CL).
According to the *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, p. 67, teaching about emptiness to those who are not prepared to receive it is a great evil (*mūlāpatti*).
 19. Quoted in PP, p. 370; MĀ, p. 121; and Hopkins (1983), p. 837. Lindtner (1982), p. 279, notes that the *Samayasāra* of the Jaina philosopher Kundakunda contains a similar verse. Cf. MK, XIV, 10 on the function of the two truths.
 20. Quoted in PP, p. 372. LVP emends *pathyam* to *sarvam* on the basis of the Tibetan text, as does Ruegg (1971), p. 7; but Lindtner (1981), p. 216, n. 85, points out that Buddhapālita's and Avalokitavrata's quotations of this verse support the reading *pathyam*. *Laṅkāvatāra*, II, 123 and III, 115-116, say that the Buddha teaches beings in accordance with their abilities, just as a physician prescribes medicine in accordance with the illness.
 21. *Aṅguttara*, IV, p. 299 reports that when the Buddha was asked for a concise statement of his teaching, he replied that a monk should inwardly make his mind stable and well-composed: *ajjhataṃ me cittaṃ thitaṃ bhavissati susaṇṭitaṃ*. In *Majjhima*, III, p. 111, the Buddha explains that a monk should steady, calm, make one-

22. iha yady api tattvajño nirvāṇaṃ nādhigacchati |
 prāpnoty ayatnato 'vaśyaṃ punarjanmani karmavat ||
 | de ñid śes pas gal te 'dir | mya ñan 'das pa ma thob kyañ |
 | skye ba phyi mar 'bad med par | ñes par thob 'gyur las bzin no |
23. sarvakāryeṣu niṣpattiś cintyamānā sudurlabhā |
 na ca nāstiha nirvāṇaṃ yuktā muktāś ca durlabhāḥ ||
 | bsam bzin pa na bya ba ni | kun la grub pa śin tu dkon |
 | 'di na'añ myaṅ 'das med min gyi | sbyor dañ grol rnamś rñed par dka' |
24. śrutvā śārīranairguṇyaṃ kṣaṇaṃ rāgo na tiṣṭhati |
 prāptas tenaiva mārgeṇa sarvasyāpi nanu kṣayaḥ ||
 | lus la yon tan med thos nas | 'dod chags yun riñ mi gnas te |
 | lam de ñid kyis thams cad kyañ | zad par 'gyur ba ma yin nam |
25. yathā bijasya dṛṣṭo 'nto na cādis tasya vidyate |
 tathā kāraṇavaikalyāḥ janmano 'pi na sambhavaḥ ||
 | ji ltar sa bon mtha' mthoñ zin | de la thog ma yod min ltar |
 | de bzin rgyu ni ma tshañ phyir | skye ba'añ 'byuñ bar mi 'gyur ro |
- mal 'byor spyod pa bzi brgya pa las slob ma spyod pa ste rab tu byed pa brgyad pa'o ||

23a bzin pa na bya na ni CNP, Vaidya : bzin pa ni bya ba ni D : bzin pa na bya ni Bhatt.;
 c myaṅ 'das med min gyi CD : mya ñan 'das med min NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.; d sbyor
 CDNP, Bhatt.: spyor Vaidya

24a thos CD, Vaidya, Bhatt. : thob NP; b kṣaṇam HPS, Bhatt.: ciram Vaidya

25a mtha' CDNP, Bhatt.: mthar Vaidya; c tshañ CDNP, Bhatt.: tshad Vaidya

22. Even if someone who understands the truth does not attain *nirvāṇa* in this life, inevitably he will attain it without effort in the next life, in accordance with karma.
23. The intentional (*cintyamāna*) accomplishment of all deeds is very rare. It is not the case that *nirvāṇa* is absent in this world, but those who are suitably disciplined (*yukta*) and liberated are rare.
24. After hearing that the body lacks good qualities, desire does not remain for a moment. Doesn't one, in this very way, exhaust everything?
25. Just as the end of a seed is seen – and its beginning is not – birth also does not arise once its cause is incomplete.

pointed, and concentrate his mind by rejecting sense pleasures and bad mental states and enter progressively the four trance states (*jhāna*). In this way he concentrates his mind just on what is inward. SN, 174, states that those whose reflection is inward (*ajjhatacintī*) cross over the flood. See CPD s.v. *ajjhatam* for further references. *Bhāvanā*, according to Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 477) is the instruction given to the most intelligent people; cf. CŚ, VIII, 14; MK, XXVI, 12, and CS, I, 26.

22. Quoted in MĀ, p. 2.
23. In using the expression *yuktā muktās ca*, Āryadeva may have had in mind the fourfold classification of persons in *Aṅguttara*, II, p. 135, as both *yuttapaṭibhāna* and *muttapaṭibhāna*, *muttapaṭibhāna* but not *yuttapaṭibhāna*, *yuttapaṭibhāna* but not *muttapaṭibhāna*, and neither. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 479) explains that because of the absence of correct attention (*yoniso manasikāra*) people who are suitably disciplined and liberated are rare.
24. Mindfulness of the body is the first of the four *smṛtyupasthāna*. Lamotte, *Traité*, IV, pp. 2047-2048, n. 3, indicates that these four *smṛtyupasthāna*, according to *Aṅguttara*, I, p. 296, constitute the middle path.
25. Cf. CŚ, XIV, 25. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 480) explains that just as the end of the seed is seen when fire destroys it, similarly the seed of consciousness will not arise when its causes are incomplete: *yathā nāma cirakālapravṛttisāyasya hetuphalaparamparayā pravartamānasya bijasaṃtānasyānādimato 'nto dṛṣṭo 'gnidāhāt tathānādikālapravṛttasya paramparayā hetutah pravartamānasyānādimato 'pi vijñānabījaśanmanah kāraṇavaikalyāt punaḥ sambhavo nāsti | kleśāpekṣaṃ hi karma janmākṣeptum paryāp- tam |*

IX. *dÑos po rtag pa dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste* |

1. sarvaṃ kāryārtham utpannam tena nityaṃ na vidyate |
tasmān munim ṛte nāsti yathābhāvas tathāgataḥ ||
| thams cad 'bras bu'i don skye ba | des na rtag yod min de'i phyir |
| thub pa ma gtogs ji lta'i dños | de bžin gśegs pa yod ma yin |
2. apratītyāstitā nāsti kadā cit kasya cit kva cit |
na kadā cit kva cit kaś cid vidyate tena śāśvataḥ ||
| gañ žig gañ na nam du yañ | ma brten par ni yod ñid med |
| des na nam yañ gañ žig tu | rtag pa 'ga' yañ yod ma yin |
3. (na vinā hetunā bhāvo) hetumān nāsti śāśvataḥ |
tenākāraṇataḥ siddhiḥ siddhir nety āha tattvavit ||
| rgyu med par ni dños po med | rgyu ldan rtag pa yod min pa |
| des na rgyu med las grub ni | de ñid mkhyen pas grub min gsuñs |
4. anityaṃ kṛtakam dṛṣṭvā śāśvato 'kṛtako yadi |
kṛtakasyāstitām dṛṣṭvā nāsti tenāstu śāśvataḥ ||
| mi rtag byas par mthoñ gyur nas | ma byas gal te rtag na ni |
| byas la yod pa ñid mthoñ nas | rtag pa yod ñid min par 'gyur |
5. ākāśādīni kalpyante nityānīti pṛthagjanaiḥ |
laukikenāpi teṣv arthān na paśyanti vicakṣaṇāḥ ||
| mkha' la sogs rnams rtag go ces | so so'i skye bo dag gis rtog |
| mkhas pa rnams kyis de dag la | 'jig rten pas kyañ don mi mthoñ |
6. pradeśīni na sarvasmin pradeśo nāma vartate |
tasmāt suvyaktam anyo 'pi pradeśo 'sti pradeśīni ||
| phyogs žes bya ba phyogs can ni | kun la gnas pa ma yin te |
| de'i phyir phyogs can la phyogs ni | gžan yañ śin tu gsal bar yod |

2a-b Bhatt. reverses the order of these two pādas; c tu NP, Bhatt.: tu'añ CD : du Vaidya

3a na vinā hetunā bhāvo Vaidya, Bhatt.: hiyate nityatvaṃ yasmāt HPS; b yod min pa CDNP, Vaidya : yod ma yin Bhatt.

4c la CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: pa NP; d nāsti tenāstu HPS, Bhatt.: nāstitaivāstu Vaidya

5a žes CD : ces NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.; b rtog CD, Bhatt.: rtogs NP, Vaidya; d mi NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ma CD

6c de'i NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: de CD

IX. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of Permanent Things.

1. Everything that has arisen is an effect; consequently, nothing is permanent. Therefore, except the Sage, there is no Tathāgata in a real sense (*yathābhāva*).
2. There is no independent existence for anything at any time anywhere. Consequently, there is nothing permanent at any time anywhere.
3. There is no thing without a cause. Whatever has a cause is not permanent. Consequently, the Knower of Truth said that establishment in the absence of a cause is not [true] establishment.
4. If, after one observes that the created is impermanent, [one concludes that] the uncreated is permanent, then, after one observes that [only] the created exists, one must admit that the permanent does not exist!
5. Ordinary people conceive space and so forth, to be permanent. Clear-sighted people do not perceive [real] objects among these, even on a worldly level (*laukikena*).
6. What is called directional part (*pradeśa*) is not present in the entire thing that possesses directional parts. Therefore, clearly, there is another directional part in the thing that possesses directional parts.

- 1-4. Refutation of permanent things on the basis that experience shows that no existent things are independent of causes. PP, pp. 397, 505 quotes v. 2, which is discussed with v. 4 in Murti (1960), pp. 196-197. Cf. **Śataka*, 179b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 73-74); CŚ, XIV, 1.
5. Refutation of *ākāśa*. *Ākāśa* and the two other unconditioned *dharma*s, *pratisaṃkhyānirodha* and *apratisaṃkhyānirodha*, are discussed in AK, I, 5-6 (*Kośa*, I, pp. 8-10); *Le Traité de la Descente dans la Profonde Loi (Abhidharmāvatāraśāstra)*, tr., M. van Velthem, Louvain-la-Neuve, 1977, pp. 74-78; and May (1959), p. 140, n. 398 (ref.).
6. Cf. **Śataka*, 179b (*Śataśāstra*, p. 74). May (1980), p. 230, n. 59, identifies this as an attack on the Jaina *pradeśa* theory; see also Murti (1960), pp. 197-198.

7. yasmin bhāve pravṛttiś ca nivṛttiś copalabhyate |

+++++ ||

| gañ žig yod na dños po la | 'jug dañ ldog pa'añ dmigs par 'gyur |
| de ni gžan gyi dbaň 'gyur te | des na 'bras bur yaň 'gyur ro |

8. | 'bras bu med par rgyu la ni | rgyu ñid yod pa ma yin te |

| de yi phyir na rgyu rnams kun | 'bras bu ñid du thal bar 'gyur |

9. kāraṇaṃ vikṛtiṃ gacchaj jāyate 'nyasya kāraṇaṃ |

+++++ ||

| rgyu ni rnam par 'gyur ba na | gžan gyi rgyu ru 'gyur ba ste |
| gañ la rnam par 'gyur yod pa | de ni rtag ces byar yod min |

10. | rtag pa gañ gi rgyu yin pa'i | dños de ma byuň ba las skye |

| raň ñid 'byuň bar gyur de la | rgyu ni log par 'gyur ba ste |

11. | dños po rtag pa las skyes pa | ci lta bur na mi rtag 'gyur |

| nam yaň rgyu daň 'bras bu gñis | mtshan ñid mi mthun mthoň ma
yin |

12. | gañ gi phyogs 'ga' rgyu yin žiň | phyogs 'ga' rgyu ma yin des na |

| de ni sna tshogs 'gyur na go | sna tshogs rtag par mi rigs so |

13. | rgyu yi zlum po gañ yin pa | de ni 'bras bu la yod min |

| des na bdag ñid kun sbyor ba | rdul phran rnams la mi 'thad do |

14. | rdul phran gcig gi gnas gañ yin | de ni gžan gyi yaň mi 'dod |

| de phyir rgyu daň 'bras bu gñis | boň tshod mñam par 'dod ma yin |

7c 'gyur CD, Bhatt.: gyur NP, Vaidya

10b de CDN, Bhatt.: med P, Vaidya; c 'byuň CDNP, Vaidya: byuň Bhatt.; d log CD,
Bhatt.: ldog NP, Vaidya

11b ci DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ji C

12c go NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ko CD; d mi rigs so CD, Bhatt.: ga la rigs NP, Vaidya

13a yi CD, Bhatt.: ni NP, Vaidya; c sbyor CDNP, Bhatt.: spyor Vaidya

14a gañ CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: khaň NP; b gyi yaň CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gyir yaň NP; d
boň CDNP, Bhatt.: bod Vaidya

7. That [time] in which activity and inactivity are perceived in a thing depends upon something else and, consequently, is also an effect.
8. A cause that lacks an effect does not have the property of being a cause. Therefore, it follows that all causes are nothing but effects!
9. A cause, while undergoing change, becomes the cause of something else. Whatever undergoes change is not called permanent.
10. That thing whose cause is a permanent [thing] is produced after having been non-existent (*abhūtvā*). A cause for such a thing that has come into existence by itself serves no purpose.
11. How will a thing that is produced from something permanent become impermanent? Both cause and effect are never seen to have dissimilar characteristics.
12. An [atom] that has some part which is a cause and some part which is not a cause would be, consequently, a manifold (*citra*) [atom]. It is not possible for a manifold thing to be permanent.
13. The spherical dimension (*pārimaṇḍalya*) of the cause is not present in the effect. Therefore, it is not possible that atoms are in contact in their entirety.
14. It is not possible for the locus of one atom to be also that of another. Therefore, one cannot hold that both cause and effect are equal in dimension.

7. Refutation of permanent time. On *kālavāda* see May (1959), p. 123, n. 320 (ref.).
8. The existence of the effect makes it possible to term something a cause; on this mutual establishment of cause and effect see also MK, XX, 22; VV, 49; ŚS, 6 and May (1959), p. 90, n. 190 (ref.).
9. Nothing that undergoes change can be permanent (Āryadeva uses this argument against the permanent self in X, 4); discussed by Murti (1960), p. 197.
10. On *abhūtvā bhāva* see May (1981), p. 87, n. 46 (ref.).
11. Discussed in Murti (1960), p. 199.
- 12-19. Refutation of permanent atoms. Cf. **Śataka*, 180a-b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 78-80); BV, 18; *Traité*, II, pp. 728-730, and May (1959), p. 54, n. 15 (ref.) On the Vaiśeṣika terms *pārimaṇḍalya* and *parimāṇa* see K. Potter, *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies*, II, Princeton, 1977, index s.v. size. Murti (1960), pp. 200-201 discusses vv. 12, 17-18. The Sarvāstivāda is the target of v. 19. May (1981), p. 63, n. 45, says: 'Āryadeva se fonde ici sur la solidarité – voire, pour certains, l'identité – de deux propriétés essentielles de la matière (*rūpa*): l'impénétrabilité (*praighāta*, "résistance, contre-choc") et la frangibilité (*rūpaṇa*). Tout ce qui est impénétrable est susceptible de se briser, donc impermanent par nature, même si, pour une durée plus ou moins longue, la brisure ne se réalise pas dans les faits'.

15. | gañ la śar gyi phyogs yod pa | de la śar gyi cha yañ yod |
 | gañ gi rdul la phyogs yod pa | des rdul rdul phran min par bsñad |
16. | mdun gyis len ciñ rgyab kyis ni | gtoñ bar 'gyur na de dag gñis |
 | gañ la yod pa ma yin pa | de ni 'gro por yañ mi 'gyur |
17. | gañ la dañ po yod min žiñ | gañ žig la dkyil yod min la |
 | gañ la tha ma yod min pa | mñon med de ni gañ gis mthoñ |
18. | 'bras bu yis ni rgyu bśig pa | des na rgyu ni rtag ma yin |
 | yañ na gañ na rgyu yod pa | de na 'bras bu yod ma yin |
19. | thogs ldan dños po rtag pa ni | gañ du'añ snañ ba ma yin te |
 | des na nam yañ sañs rgyas rnam | rdul phran rtag pa ñid mi
 gsuñs |
20. | 'chiñ dañ bciñs dañ thabs las gžan | thar pa gal te yod na ni |
 | de las ci yañ mi skye ste | des na de thar žes mi brjod |
21. | mya ñan 'das la phuñ po rnam | yod min gañ žag srid ma yin |
 | gañ du mya ñan 'das gyur pa | ma mthoñ der myañ 'das gañ žig |
22. | srid dañ bral la thar pa'i tshe | śes yod yon tan ci žig yod |
 | śes med pa yi yod pa yañ | gsal bar yod pa min dañ mtshuñs |

15c gi CDNP, Vaidya : gis Bhatt.; d des rdul rdul phran min par bsñad CDNP, Bhatt.:
 des na rdul rdul phran min bsñad Vaidya

16a žiñ Bhatt.: ciñ DNP : tsin C : cid Vaidya; b 'gyur Bhatt.: gyur CDNP, Vaidya; d 'gro
 por yañ CDNP, Bhatt.: 'gro bor añ Vaidya

18a yis CD, Bhatt.: yi NP, Vaidya; bśig CDNP, Vaidya : bžig Bhatt.; d yod ma yin CD,
 Vaidya, Bhatt.: rgyu yod pa NP

19b snañ ba CDNP, Bhatt.: snañ pa Vaidya; d gsuñs CDP, Vaidya : gsuñ N, Bhatt.

20a bciñs CDNP, Vaidya : bciñ Bhatt.; c las CD, Bhatt.: la NP, Vaidya; yañ CD : 'añ
 NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

21c gyur pa CDNP, Bhatt.: gyur ba Vaidya; d myañ DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: snañ C

22a srid CDNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: sred DṬPT; thar pa'i CDNP, Bhatt.: thar ba'i Vaidya;
 d dañ CD, Bhatt.: de NP, Vaidya

15. Whatever has an eastern direction has an eastern part. Therefore, one who [thinks] that an atom has directional parts [must] admit that the atom is [really] no atom.
 16. In forward motion, the back is left behind. An [atom] that lacks these two [motions] is not something that moves.
 17. How is something that has no front, middle, or rear, and is invisible perceived?
 18. The effect either destroys the cause and, consequently, the cause is not permanent, or the effect is not present where the cause is.
 19. A permanent thing that has resistance (*sapratigha*) is never seen anywhere. Consequently, the Buddhas never said that an atom is permanent.
 20. If liberation were different from bondage, the one bound, and the method [of liberation] (*upāya*), then it could not arise from there. and, consequently, it could not be called liberation [from them].
 21. In *nirvāṇa* the aggregates do not exist and the individual (*pudgala*) is not possible. Insofar as one cannot see the extinguished (*nir-vṛta*) [substratum], then what *nirvāṇa* is there?
 22. At the time of liberation, what value is there in [positing] consciousness (*caitanya*) for someone free from existence (*vibhava*)? Also, an unconscious existence clearly is analogous to non-existence!
20. Cf. **Śataka*, 180b-c (*Śataśāstra*, pp.80-81); MK, XVI. Tucci (1925), p. 528, n. 2 cites *Laṅkāvatāra*, II, 70: *bandhyabandhananirmuktā upāyaḥ ca vivarjitāḥ | tīrthyā mokṣaṃ vikalpenti na ca mokṣo hi vidyate ||*, as does La Vallée Poussin, 'Le Nirvāṇa d'après Āryadeva', MCB, I (1931-1932), p. 130, with the variant readings *nirmuktam* and *vivarjitam*; see also May (1982), p. 63, n. 36. Both Tucci, pp. 528-529, nr. 2, and LVP, pp. 131-132, translate portions of Dharmapāla's commentary on this verse.
 21. Āryadeva here refers to *nirupādhiśeṣanirvāṇa* in which the aggregates are not present (on *upādhi* see May [1982], p. 68, n. 62). See the excerpts from Dharmapāla's commentary translated by Tucci (1925), p. 529-530, n. 1, and by LVP (1931-2), p. 133-134. Cf. **Śataka*, 180c-181a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 81-82); YŚ, 9; RĀ, I, 41; and *Laṅkāvatāra*, X, 281ab.
 - 22-23. Refutation of the Sāṃkhya belief that the *puruṣa* is conscious or potentially conscious at the time of liberation; see *Sāṃkhyakārikā* 19, 64-66. See Dharmapāla's commentary on v. 22, Tucci (1925), pp. 531, n. 1 and on v. 23, p. 532, n. 1. The Chinese text of v. 23 translates instead of *mokṣa* the term *nirupādhiśeṣanirvāṇa*, as does Dharmapāla's commentary.

23. | thar pa bdag gcig yod na ni | śes yod sa bon srid pa yod |
| de med na ni srid pa la | bsam pa'añ yod pa ma yin no |
24. | sdug bsñal las thar mi rnam la | gžan ni yod pa min par ñes |
| de phyir rnam pa kun tu'añ bdag | zad pa legs žes bya bar brjod |
25. varam laukikam evedam paramārtho na sarvathā |
laukike vidyate kiñ cit paramārthe na vidyate ||
| 'jig rten pa 'di ñid bla yi | don dam rnam kun ma yin te |
| 'jig rten pa la cuñ zad yod | dam pa'i don la yod ma yin |
- rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las dños po rtag pa dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab tu
byed pa dgu pa'o ||

X. bDag dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste |

1. antarātmā yadā na strī na pumān na napuṃsakam |
tadā kevalam ajñānād bhāvas te 'haṃ pumān iti ||
| gañ tshe nañ bdag bud med min | skyes min ma niñ ma yin pa |
| de tshe mi śes 'ba' žig las | khyod bdag pho'o sñam, du sems |
2. yadā sarveṣu bhūteṣu nāsti strīpuṃnapuṃsakam |
tadā kiṃ nāma tāny eva prāpya strīpuṃnapuṃsakam ||
| gañ tshe 'byuñ ba thams cad la | pho mo ma niñ yod min pa |
| de tshe ci ste de dag ñid | brten nas pho mo ma niñ yin |
3. yas tavātmā mamānātmā tenātmāniyamān na saḥ |
nanv anityeṣu bhāveṣu kalpanā nāma jāyate ||
| khyod kyi bdag gañ ña'i bdag min | des de bdag min ma ñes phyir |
| dños po mi rtag pa rnam la | rtog pa skye bar 'gyur min nam |

23a thar pa NP, Bhatt.: thar par CD : thar ba Vaidya; gcig CD : cig NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.;
b yod sa bon CDNP, Bhatt.: yonś po na Vaidya; d yin no CD, Bhatt.: yin NP,
Vaidya

24b ni NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: la CD

1a nañ Vaidya, Bhatt.: na CDNP; d pho'o CDNP, Vaidya : pho yo Bhatt.

2d brten nas CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: bsten nas NP

3b bdag CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: dag NP; tenātmāniyamān : tenātmā niyamān HPS, Vaidya, Bhatt.; c bhāveṣu Vaidya, Bhatt.: abhāveṣu HPS

23. Were a self to exist in liberation, consciousness would be the seed. Were it not to exist, there would not be even a thought about existence (*bhava*).
24. Certainly, there is nothing else for those who are liberated from suffering. Therefore, it is said that it is best to get rid of the self.
25. This worldly perspective is, in fact, better [initially]; the ultimate never is [better initially]. Something is found on the worldly level; nothing is found on the ultimate level.

X. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Self

1. Since the internal self is neither female, male nor neuter, it is only from ignorance that your conviction (*bhāva*) is 'I am male'.
 2. Since there is neither female, male, nor neuter in any of the elements, how, dependent upon them alone, can there be female, male, or neuter?
 3. Your self is not my self, consequently, because it is not fixed (*aniyama*), the self does not [truly] exist. Certainly, a conception [of a self] can be based [only] on impermanent things.
 4. The self (*pums*), like the body, undergoes change from one birth to another. Consequently, it is not possible [for you to claim] that [self] is different from the body and permanent.
-
24. Tucci (1925), p. 533, n. 1, says that Dharmapāla's commentary indicates that the Vaiśeṣikas are refuted in this verse.
 25. On the worldly level such things as the aggregates, sense bases, and elements exist. Cf. YŚ, 33; *Laṅkāvatāra*, X, 120 and 429ab: *bhāvā vidyanti saṃvṛtyā paramārthe na bhāvakāḥ* |.
-
1. According to Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 485) the heterodox philosophers (*tīrthika*) describe the *antarātman* as dwelling in the body, consisting of the collection of the six faculties (*indriya*), the instigator of actions, the experiencer of the results of actions, and the substratum for the *ahaṃkāra*.
 2. Tucci (1925), p. 534, n. 1, identifies this verse as a refutation of the Lokāyata.
 3. Quoted in PP, p. 199, and *Traité*, II, p. 737, n. 1; also discussed in Murti (1960), p. 204.
 4. If the self creates karma and experiencer the result, it should change when reborn, as the body does. See *Nyāyasūtra*, III. 2, 60. 66 and the *Bhāṣya* on these for the Nyāya position on the operations of karma and the relationship between the body and the self.

4. dehavad vikṛtiṃ yāti pumāñ janmani janmani |
 dehā(t) tenānyatā tasya nityatā ca na yujyate ||
 | skye dañ skye bar skyes bu ni | lus bzin rnam par 'gyur bar 'gyur |
 | khyod kyi de la lus las gzan | ñid dañ rtag ñid mi rigs so |
5. | reg dañ mi ldan dños po la | bskul ba zes bya mi skye ste |
 | de phyir lus kyi gyo ba la | srog ni byed pa por mi 'gyur |
6. | mi 'tshe ba dañ bdag rtag pa | 'di la rgyu ni ci yod sñam |
 | rnam pa kun tu śiñ srin las | rdo rje bsruñ byar mi 'gyur ro |
7. | skye ba dran pa yod pa'i phyir | gal te khyod kyi bdag rtag na |
 | sñon byas pa yi rma mthoñ nas | khyod kyi lus ko cis mi rtag |
8. | sems pa can dañ ldan bdag kyañ | gal te śes po ñid yin na |
 | de yis sems pa can sems pa | min žiñ skyes bu'añ rtag mi 'gyur |
9. | bde ba la sogs dañ ldan srog | bde sogs bzin du sna tshogs mthoñ |
 | de phyir bde la sogs bzin te | rtag pa ñid du'añ mi ruñ ño |

4c dehāt tenānyatā reconstructed according to the Chinese: ku li shen : dehāntenāyatā
 HPS, Vaidya : dehāt tavānyatā Bhatt.; CL suggests dehāt te nānyatā.

5a la NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: las CD; b bskul CDNP, Bhatt.: bsgul Vaidya; d srog DNP,
 Vaidya, Bhatt.: bdag C

6c tu NP, Vaidya, Bhatt. : tu'añ CD

7d lus ko CD : bdag go NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

8c yis CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: yi NP; d žiñ CD, Bhatt.: zes NP, Vaidya; bu'añ CDNP : bu
 Vaidya, Bhatt.

9c bde la sogs bzin te NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: bde ba la sogs bzin CD

5. What is called propulsion does not arise from an intangible thing. Therefore the self (*jīva*) is not the agent of the body's movement.
6. One wonders what the reason is for [advocating at the same time] non-violence (*ahimsā*) and a permanent self. A diamond never has to be protected from a wood-worm!
7. If you [claim that] the self is permanent because of the memory of [its past] births, [we reply:] How can you [claim that] the body is impermanent when you see a scar previously incurred?
8. Even if the self when it is connected with [the quality] consciousness (*jñāna*) is the cognizer (*jñātr*), for that reason, the conscious [self] is not conscious [in and by itself]; and hence the self (*puruṣa*) is not permanent.
9. The self (*jīva*) that is connected with such [qualities] as pleasure (*sukha*) is seen to be as diverse as pleasure, and so forth. Therefore, it also is not permanent, like pleasure, and so forth.

5. Cf. **Śataka* 172a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 29-31), and Murti (1960). *Padārthadharmaśaṅgraha* (ed. D. J. Sarma, p. 199) says that just as an intelligent charioteer guides the chariot, so the body is guided in its actions by an intelligent agent, namely, the self. Candrakīrti (D ff. 160b-161a, P f. 180a-b) rejects this analogy by arguing that only tangible things propel others; and since the self is intangible it cannot be the cause of the body's actions.
6. A permanent *ātman* should not be subject to harm and thus there is no need to protect oneself from bad rebirths by performing virtuous actions. Cf. **Śataka*, 172b-c (*Śataśāstra*, p. 31); Tucci's annotation to his translation, p. 51, quotes *Nyāyasūtrabhāṣya*: *na jātu kaścin nityam himsitum arhati*.
7. The Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika argument assumes that the self is the substratum for the quality memory and that the self bears the impressions of past births from one life to the next and for this reason the self is permanent. Āryadeva's reply suggests that one might assume that the body bears the impressions of past scars from one life to the next and come to the absurd conclusion that the body is permanent! Cf. **Śataka*, 173a-b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 34-35). On the Nyāya arguments for the self's memory of past births see *Nyāyasūtra*, III. 1. 12-14, 18, 21 and III. 2. 40.
- 8-9. Refutation of the Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika thesis that the self is connected with such qualities as *jñāna* and *sukha*. Cf. **Śataka*, 171a-c (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 25-27). On the connection between self and these qualities see the *Bhāṣya* on *Nyāyasūtra*, I. 1, 10 and III. 2, 22-23.

10. karanam jāyate mithyā caitanyam śāśvataṃ yadi |
 + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + ||
 | gal te śes pa yod rtag na | byed pa log par 'gyur ba ste |
 | gal te me ni rtag 'gyur na | bud śiñ gis don yod mi 'gyur |
11. ā vināśāc calaṃ nāma dravyaṃ nāsti kriyā yathā |
 puruṣo 'sti na caitanyam iti tena na yujyate ||
 | rdzas ni bya ba ji bzin du | 'jig pa'i bar du gyo ba med |
 | des na skyes bu yod śes pa | yod pa med ces byar mi rigs |
12. cetanādhātur anyatra dṛśyate 'nyatra cetanā |
 dravatvam iva lohasya vikṛtiṃ yāty ataḥ pumān ||
 | gzan du śes pa yod pa'i kham | mthoñ žiñ gzan du śes yod de |
 | lcags kyi žu ñid bzin de'i phyir | skyes bu rnam par 'gyur bar 'gyur |
13. caitanyaṃ ca manomātre mahāṃś cākāśavat pumān |
 acaitanyaṃ tatas tasya svarūpam iva dṛśyate ||
 | śes yod yid tsam žig la ste | skyes bu nam mkha' bzin du che |
 | de phyir de yi ño bo ni | śes pa yod ñid min ltar mthoñ |
14. paras (tasyeti) kiṃ nāham ahaṃ sarvagato yadi |
 tenaivāvaraṇaṃ nāma na tasyaivopapadyate ||
 | gal te kun la bdag yod na | gzan gyis de cis ñar mi rtag |
 | de ñid kyis ni de ñid la | sgrib ces bya bar mi 'thad do |
15. yeṣāṃ guṇānāṃ kartṛtvam acaitanyaṃ ca sarvaśaḥ |
 teṣāṃ unmattakānāṃ ca na kiñ cid vidyate 'ntaram ||
 | gañ gi yon tan byed po dan | rnam kun śes yod ma yin pa |
 | de dag dan ni smyon pa la | khyad par ci yañ yod ma yin |

10d mi CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ma N

13c ni DNP, Bhatt.: ñid C : na Vaidya

14a tasyeti Vaidya : taveti HPS : tarketi Bhatt.; b rtag DNP, Vaidya : rtogs C, Bhatt.; c
 ni CD, Bhatt.: na NP, Vaidya

10. If consciousness (*caitanya*) is permanent, the instrument (*karaṇa*) serves no purpose. If fire is permanent, fuel is useless.
11. Certainly, there is no substance that is mobile until its destruction, as in the case [of motion as a result] of action (*kriyā*). Therefore, it is impossible that the self (*puruṣa*) exists and consciousness does not.
12. It seems that the element of consciousness (*cetanādhātu*) exists in one place and consciousness in another. Therefore, the self (*puruṣa*) undergoes change, like iron melting.
13. Were consciousness the size of the mental organ (*manas*) and the self vast, like space, it would seem as if that [self's] own-nature is unconscious.
14. If I am all-pervasive, why doesn't someone else think that I am he? Certainly, it is impossible for this [same thing] to be obstructed by that [namely, itself].
15. There is not any difference between insane people and those [Sāṃkhyas] for whom the qualities (*guṇa*) are always active and unconscious!

- 10-12. Refutation of the Sāṃkhya position that the *puruṣa* is conscious or potentially conscious. If the *puruṣa* is conscious in nature, then the instrument (*karaṇa*) is useless. *Tattvasaṃgraha*, VII, 305 uses the same argument as v. 10: *akṣyarthādya aphalaṃ tu syāc caitanyaṃ śāśvataṃ yadi | na bhaved indhanenārtho yadi syāc chāśvato 'nalah ||* If the *puruṣa* is potentially consciousness at one point and actually conscious at another, then it changes and thus is not permanent. Cf. **Śataka*, 170c-171a, 172b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 21-22, 31-33); Tucci, p. 48 of his notes, cites Chi-tsang's summary of Āryadeva's objections.
13. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 489) explains that the self, which is vast in size, should not become conscious from its connection with consciousness, which is minute in size, just as Ganges does not become salty when it comes into contact with a minute amount of salt. Cf. **Śataka*, 173b (*Śataśāstra*, p. 36). *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, VII. 1. 22-23 describe the *āīman* as *mahat* and the *manas* as *aṇu*.
14. Refutation of the Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika description of the self as all-pervasive. *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, III. 2. 9, 14, say that the term I indicates the self and that one's own self and not another's is indicated. Āryadeva argues that if the self is all-pervasive, then the term I should indicate both oneself and others. Moreover, both one's own self and another's should exist in the same place, and the differentiation of one from another's will be impossible. The same argument occurs in *Taittī*, II, p. 738.
- 15-16. Refutation of the Sāṃkhya belief that the activity of the three unconscious *guṇas* constructs the world, but that the conscious *puruṣa* experiences the results of action (see *Sāṃkhyakārikā*, XI-XX, XXVII). Cf. the use of the term *gṛhakāraka/ gahakāraka* in Uv., XXXI, 6-7; Dhp., XI, 8-9.

16. kartuṃ nāma vijānanti gṛhādīn sarvathā guṇāḥ |
 bhoktuṃ ca na vijānanti kim ayuktam ataḥ param ||
 | yon tan rnams kyis rnam kun tu | khyim la sogs dag byed śes kyi |
 | za ba rnam par mi śes pa | 'di las mi rigs gzan ci yod |
17. kriyāvān chāśvato nāsti nāsti sarvagate kriyā |
 niṣkriyo nāstitātulyo nairātmyaṃ kiṃ na te priyam ||
 | bya ba dañ ldan rtag pa med | kun tu soñ la bya ba med |
 | bya ba med pa med dañ mtshuñs | bdag med la khyod cis mi dga' |
18. | la lar kun tu soñ bar mthoñ | la lar skyes bu lus tsam žig |
 | la lar rdul tsam žig mthoñ ste | śes rab can gyis med par mthoñ |
19. | rtag la gnod pa ga la yod | gnod med thar pa ga la yod |
 | des na gañ gi bdag rtag pa | de yi thar pa mi rigs so |
20. | gal te bdag ces bya yod na | bdag med sñam pa mi rigs śiñ |
 | de ñid rig pa ñes pa las | mya ñan 'das 'gyur žes bya'añ brdzun |
21. | gal te grol ba yod ñid na | de ni sñar yañ med pa ñid |
 | mi ldan pa la gañ mthoñ ba | de ni rañ bžin žes byar bsad |

16a kyis CD, Bhatt.: kyi NP, Vaidya

17d dga' CDNP, Bhatt.: dka' Vaidya

18c rdul tsam žig mthoñ CD, Bhatt.: skyes bu rdul tsam žig P (N repeats c) : mthoñ ste
 rdul tsam žig Vaidya; d med par CDNP, Vaidya : med ces Bhatt.

19a yod CDNP, Bhatt.: žig Vaidya; d yi NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: la CD; thar pa CDNP,
 Bhatt.: thar ba Vaidya

20c rig CD, Bhatt.: rigs NP, Vaidya; d 'gyur CNP, Bhatt.: gyur D, Vaidya

21a yod CD : med NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

16. The qualities at all times [are assumed to] know how to construct houses, and so forth, but they do not know how to experience [the results]. Is there anything more unreasonable than this?
17. What possesses action is not permanent; action is not present in what is all-pervasive; and a lack of action is equivalent to a lack of existence. Why doesn't selflessness (*nairātmya*) please you?
18. Some see that [self] as ubiquitous; some see it as the size of a person's body; and some see it as minute in size. Someone endowed with insight (*prajñā*) sees it as non-existent.
19. How can what is permanent be harmed? Why should there be liberation [for one who is] not being harmed? Consequently, liberation is absurd for someone for whom the self is permanent.
20. If the so-called I exists, then either it is wrong to think, 'I do not exist', or it is false to think that a knower of the truth (*tattvavid*) [about the self] certainly attains *nirvāṇa*.
21. If the liberated [self] exists, it was not [like that] earlier. It is explained that what is seen as not connected [and dependent on anything else] is called own-nature.

17. Refutation of the Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika relationship between action and the self (see *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, V. 1. 1-6). Quoted in PP, p. 116; discussed by Murti (1960), p. 204.
18. M. Honda, 'Ārya Deva's Critique Against Sāṃkhya', IBK (1974), p. 488, notes that Dharmapāla quotes this verse in the *Ch'eng Wei Shih Lun* and that one of the commentators identifies these views, respectively, with '1) Sāṃkhya, Vaiśeṣika, 2) Āhrikyā tīrthika, and 3) Pāśupata etc.'. Cf. the Upaniṣadic speculations on the size of the self in *Traité*, II, p. 744, n. 2.
19. A permanent self cannot experience the pain that motivates people to seek liberation from *saṃsāra*.
20. Buddhapālita's *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Lindtner), p. 192, has a variant reading of cd: *yañ na de ñid rtoḡ pa 'am | mya ñan 'da' ba ñes rdzun 'gyur* | Based on the variant reading *rigs* in NP, CL suggests for c 'by ascertaining the principle of truth (*tattvanayaviniscaya*)'. The Chinese translation: *chih chen shih che* seems based on *tattvavid*; see Tucci (1925), p. 537, n. 1. Cf. *Tattvasaṃgraha*, XXVI, 374: *na yuktaṃ nāham ity evaṃ yady ahaṃ nāma vidyate | niyamāt tattvavid yāti nirvāṇaṃ iti vā mṛṣā* ||.
21. Cf. the definition of *svabhāva* in MK, XV, 2cd: *akṛtrimaḥ svabhāvo hi nirāpekṣaḥ paratra ca* ||

22. | gal te mi rtag chad na ni | da duñ rtswa sogs ci ste yod |
 | 'di ni gal te bden 'gyur na | su la'añ gti mug kyañ mi 'byuñ |
23. | bdag ni yod par gyur na'añ gzugs | gžan las 'byuñ bar snañ gyur la |
 | gžan las gnas par snañ gyur žiñ | gžan las rnam par 'jig par snañ |
24. | ji ltar sa bon byas pa las | myu gu byas pa skye 'gyur ba |
 | de bžin mi rtag thams cad ni | mi rtag dag las 'byuñ bar 'gyur |
25. yasmāt pravartate bhāvas tenocchedo na jāyate |
 yasmān nivartate bhāvas tena nityo na jāyate ||
 | gañ phyir dños po 'jug 'gyur ba | des na chad par mi 'gyur ži |
 | gañ phyir dños po ldog 'gyur ba | des na rtag par mi 'gyur ro |

nal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las bdag dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab tu byed pa
 bcu pa'o ||

XI. *Dus dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste* |

1. | ma 'oñs bum la da ltar ba'i | bum yod ma yin 'das pa med |
 | gañ phyir de gñis ma 'oñs pa | de phyir ma 'oñs yod ma yin |
2. | gal te žig pa ma 'oñs pa'i | ño bor ma 'oñs la yod na |
 | ma 'oñs bdag ñid du yod gañ | de ni ji ltar 'das par 'gyur |
3. | gañ gi phyir na ma 'oñs dños | ma 'oñs bdag tu gnas 'gyur ba |
 | de yi phyir na da ltar bar | 'gyur te ma 'oñs ñid mi srid |
4. | ma 'oñs pa yod 'das pa yod | da ltar ba yod ci žig med |
 | gañ gi dus kun yod ñid pa | de yi mi rtag ñid gañ las |

22a na ni CDNP, Vaidya : yin na Bhatt.; c rtswa CDNP : rtsha Vaidya : rtsa Bhatt.; d
 'byuñ CDNP, Bhatt.: 'gyur Vaidya

23d rnam par 'jig par CD, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'jigs pa snañ gyur NP

1a bum la CDNP, Bhatt.: bum pa Vaidya

2b ño bor CDNP, Vaidya: ño bo Bhatt.; d ji NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ci CD

3b tu CDNP, Bhatt.: du Vaidya

4d gañ las CD : ga las NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

22. If impermanent things were annihilated, how would grass, and so forth, still exist? If this were true, even confusion would no longer arise in anyone!
23. Even if the self were to exist, its visible form (*rūpa*) [namely, the body] is seen to originate on account of something else and to continue and cease on account of something else.
24. Just as a created seed produces a created sprout, all impermanent things arise from [other] impermanent things.
25. Since a thing continues, annihilation does not occur; since a thing ceases, consequently, permanence does not occur.

XI. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of Permanent Time

1. The present pot does not exist in the future pot, [nor does] the past [pot] exist [in the future one]. Since these two must [first] be future, the future does not exist.
2. If the past exists in the future as the nature of the future, how can that which has the future as its nature be [something] past?
3. Since [you claim that] a future thing remains future in nature, [we reply:] It is impossible for it to remain future when it [actually] becomes present.
4. [You claim that] the future exists; the past exists; and the present exists. [We reply:] What does not exist? How can something that exists at all times be impermanent?

22-25. Refutation of eternalism and annihilationism. Cf. **Śataka*, 178a (*Śataśāstra*, p. 65); MK, XVIII, 8; ŚS, 21-22; and May (1959), p. 213, n. 720 (ref.). Buddhapālita's *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Lindtner), p. 199, quotes v. 25.

- 1-5. On the mutual dependence of the three times see also **Śataka*, 179c-180a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 76-77); ŚS, 29; MK, XIX, 1-4 and PP, pp. 382-385. P. Williams, 'Buddhadeva and Temporality', JIP 4 (1977), pp. 280-281, believes that Nāgārjuna's refutation of time attacks Buddhadeva. Āryadeva refutes a similar position in v. 1; vv. 2-3 may refute Ghoṣaka's position that when a thing passes through time it becomes conjoined with the mark 'past' (*atītalakṣaṇayukta*) and is then considered 'past', even though it is not separated completely from the marks of the present and future. The Chinese translation of v. 4, with its discussion of causal function (*kāri-trā*), may refer to Vasumitra's position. On these Ābhidharmikas' views see LVP, 'Documents d'Abhidharma – La Controverse du Temps', MCB 5 (1936-37), pp. 22-24; AKV, pp. 805-818 (*Kośa*, IV, pp. 50-54); *Abhidharmadīpa*, pp. 259-261; and *Tattvasamgraha*, pp. 613-617.

5. | 'das pa las ni 'das gyur pa | ci yi phyir na 'das par 'gyur |
| 'das pa las ni ma 'das pa | ci yi phyir na 'das par 'gyur |
6. | gal te ma 'oñs skyes yod na | ji ltar da ltar bar mi 'gyur |
| ci ste de la skyes med na | ma 'oñs rtag par 'gyur ram ci |
7. vināpi janmanā bhaṅgād anityo yady anāgataḥ |
atītasya na bhaṅgo 'sti sa nityaḥ kiṃ na kalpyate ||
| skye ba med kyañ 'jig pa las | gal te ma 'oñs mi rtag na |
| 'das la 'jig pa yod min te | de ni rtag par cis mi rtog |
8. anityo vartamāno 'yam atītaś ca na jāyate |
tābhyām anyā tṛtīyāpi gatis tasya na vidyate ||
| 'das pa dañ ni da ltar ba | 'di ni mi rtag 'gyur min la |
| de dag las gzan rnam pa ni | gsum pa'añ de la yod ma yin |
9. yaḥ paścāj jāyate bhāvaḥ sa pūrvaṃ vidyate yadi |
na mithyā jāyate pakṣas teṣāṃ niyatīvādinām ||
| dños po gañ žig phyis skye ba | de ni gal te sñar yod na |
| de yi phyir na phyā smra ba | rnams kyi phyogs ni log mi 'gyur |
10. sambhavaḥ kriyate yasya prāk so 'stīti na yujyate |
sato yadi bhavej janma jātasyāpi bhaved bhavaḥ ||
| gañ žig 'byuñ bar byed pa de | sñar yod ces byar mi rigs te |
| gal te yod pa skye 'gyur na | skyes zin pa yañ 'byuñ bar 'gyur |
11. dr̥śyate 'nāgato bhāvaḥ kenābhāvo na dr̥śyate |
vidyate 'nāgataṃ yasya dūraṃ tasya na vidyate ||
| ma 'oñs pa yi dños mthon na | dños po med pa cis mi mthon |
| gañ la ma 'oñs yod 'gyur ba | de la riñ ba yod ma yin |

5a gyur pa CDNP : 'gyur ba Bhatt.: gyur ba Vaidya

6b ji ltar CDNP : ci ltar Vaidya, Bhatt.: da ltar CDNP : da lta Bhatt.: de ltar Vaidya; c
skyes NP, Vaidya, Bhatt. : skye CD

7c la CD, Bhatt.: pa NP, Vaidya

8a ba DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: bar C

9c phyā NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: phywa CD; d kyi CD, Bhatt.: kyi NP, Vaidya; teṣāṃ
HPS, Vaidya : tasmān Bhatt.

10a de NP, Vaidya, Bhatt. : ste CD

11c 'gyur ba CD, Bhatt.: gyur pa NP : gyur ba Vaidya

5. When the past has passed from the past, how can it [still] pass? When the past has not passed from the past, how can it pass?
6. If the future [pot] is produced, doesn't it become present? Alternatively, if it is not produced, isn't the future permanent?
7. If, even without production, the future is considered impermanent because of its [subsequent] destruction (*bhaṅga*), there being no destruction of the past, why is it not considered permanent?
8. This present and the past are not impermanent. Apart from these two, there is no possibility for that [future thing to be impermanent].
9. If that thing which is produced afterwards exists before, the Fatalists' (*niyativādin*) thesis is not false!
10. It is not possible to say that something whose coming into existence (*sambhava*) is produced exists previously. If there were the production of an [already] existent thing, there would be the coming into existence of what has [already] been produced previously.
11. If a future thing is preceived, why isn't a non-existent thing perceived? The future cannot be remote for someone for whom it exists.

6. Cf. *Kathāvatthu*, p. 125: *Anāgataṃ hutvā paccuppannaṃ hotīti? Āmantā taññeva anāgataṃ taṃ paccuppannaṃ ti?*

7-8. Cf. the discussion of impermanence in relation to *sthiti* (vv. 20-24) and *utpāda* and *bhaṅga* (XV, 10-13).

9. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 491) characterizes the *niyativāda* position as belief in a fixed, uncaused own-nature that is not affected by human effort (*pratiniyatasvabhāvaṃ nirhetukaṃ puruṣakāraśūnyam*). The positions of various *niyativādins* are discussed in A. L. Basham, *History and Doctrines of the Ājīvikas*, London, 1951, pp. 224-225; Jayatilleke (1963), pp. 142-152; and D. Kalupahana, *Causality*, Honolulu, 1975, pp. 32-41.

10. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 492) comments that if something could be produced which already exists, there would be no end to its arising; he quotes this verse and v. 12 again (p. 511) in a discussion of *satkāryavāda* in his commentary to XIV, 21. Honda (1974), p. 498, also indicates that both verses concern the Sāṃkhya concept of *satkāryavāda*.

11. According to Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 492), the opponent holds that yogins' *prañidhijñāna* has future things as its object (*ālambana*). Cf. AK, VII, 37a-b: Part of Candrakīrti's commentary is quoted by LVP, *Kośa*, V, p. 89, n. 1, along with his translation of the *Vibhāṣa*'s view on this topic.

12. dharmo yady akrto 'py asti niyamo jāyate vṛthā |
 atha svalpo 'pi kartavyaḥ satkāryasya na sambhavaḥ ||
 | gal te byas pa med kyañ chos | yod na ñes sdom don med 'gyur |
 | ci ste cuñ zad byed na yañ | 'bras bu yod pa mi srid do |
13. anitye sati satkāryaṃ kathaṃ nāma + + + + |
 + + + + + + + + + + + + + + ||
 | mi rtag yin na ci ltar bur | 'bras bu yod ces bya bar 'gyur |
 | gañ la thog ma mtha' yod pa | de ni 'jig rten mi rtag brjod |
14. | bsgrim pa med par thar 'gyur te | grol la ma 'oñs yod ma yin |
 | de ltar yin na chags med par | 'dod chags kyañ ni 'byuñ bar 'gyur |
15. stambhādīnām alaṃkāro grhasyārthe nirarthakaḥ |
 satkāryam eva yasyeṣṭaṃ yasyāsatkāryam eva ca ||
 | 'bras bu yod ñid gañ 'dod dañ | 'bras bu med ñid gañ 'dod la |
 | khyim gyi don du ka ba la | sogs pa'i rgyan ni don med 'gyur |
16. | dños rnam s yoñs su 'gyur ba yañ | yid kyis kyañ ni 'dzin mi 'gyur |
 | de lta na yañ da ltar ba | yod par mi mkhas rnam s kyis rtog |
17. | gnas med dños po ga la žig | mi rtag pas gnas ga la yod |
 | gal te dañ po gnas gyur na | tha mar rñiñ par mi 'gyur ro |

12a akrto HPS, Vaidya : akrtaḥ Bhatt.; b vṛthā HPS, Bhatt.: vṛt Vaidya

13a ci lta bur Bhatt.: ji lta bur D : ci ltar bur CNP, Vaidya

14a bsgrim CDNP, Vaidya: sgrim Bhatt., thar NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: thal CD

16d par DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: pa C

17a žig CDNP, Vaidya : yod Bhatt.; rñiñ par : sñiñ por NP, Vaidya : rñiñs par Bhatt.

12. If virtuous behavior is [already actual], even though it has not been undertaken, self-restraint (*niyama*) is useless. Alternatively, if there is anything that must be done, however slight, there is no possibility of a pre-existent effect (*satkārya*).
13. If the impermanent exists, how, indeed, will there be a pre-existent effect? People call whatever has a beginning and an end impermanent.
14. Were there liberation without effort, then, for the [already] liberated person it [namely, liberation] would not arise in the future. If this were so, passion (*rāga*) also would arise [effortlessly] without an impassioned person!
15. The adornment of pillars, and so forth, for a house is useless for someone who maintains that the effect is pre-existent, as well as for someone who maintains that the effect is non-existent [before its production].
16. Although [you claim that] things are transformed (*pariṇam-*), [we reply:] Not even the mind (*manas*) will perceive them. Nonetheless, fools imagine that the present exists.
17. How could there be a thing that has no duration (*sthiti*)? If it is impermanent, how could it continue to exist? If it were to continue first, it would not become old in the end.

12. If the potential for meritorious behavior were innate in people, there would be no need for active cultivation of the virtues, generosity, and so forth; but since external conditions, for example, virtuous friends (*kalyāṇamitra*), bring about such behaviour it should not be considered potentially existent.
13. Refutation of *satkārya* on the basis that a thing that exists both before and after its production must be permanent. Belief in permanent things is incompatible with the common experience of things having a beginning and an end.
14. The position that the future effect is not at all related to the cause must also be refuted. Cf. the analysis of passion and the impassioned person in MK, VI.
15. Refutation of both *satkāryavāda* and *asatkāryavāda*. Āryadeva argues that according to the *satkāryavādin* the pillars (=effect) already adorn the house; but according to the *asatkāryavādin* the pillars never adorn the house because the effect is not related to the cause.
16. Refutation of the Sāṃkhya concept of time. The potential and actual states of a thing are called present and future, for example, the potential curds become actual when the milk undergoes change. But this transformation of milk into curds is not perceived.
17. Quoted by Buddhapālita, *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Walleser), p. 92. Cf. RĀ, I, 68.

18. vijānāti na vijñānam ekam arthadvayaṃ yathā |
 ekam arthaṃ vijānāti na vijñānavayaṃ tathā ||
 | ji ltar rnam śes gcig gis ni | don gñis rnam par mi śes pa |
 | de bžin rnam śes gñis kyis ni | don gcig rnam par mi śes so |
19. | gal te dus la gnas yod na | gnas pa dus su mi 'gyur ro |
 | ci ste gnas med na gnas pa | med par mtha' yañ yod ma yin |
20. | gal te mi rtag dños gžan na | dños po mi rtag par mi 'gyur |
 | gcig na mi rtag ñid gañ yin | de ñid dños po ga la gnas |
21. | mi rtag ñid gar stobs chuñ der | gnas pa stobs chuñ ma yin na |
 | phyi nas de dag ñes par go | bzlog par ci yis mthoñ bar 'gyur |
22. | gal te mi rtag stobs chuñ min | dños po kun la yod pa ni |
 | kun la gnas pa med pa 'am | yañ na thams cad mi rtag min |
23. | gal te rtag tu mi rtag ñid | yod na rtag tu gnas yod min |
 | yañ na rtag par gyur zin nas | phyi nas mi rtag par 'gyur ro |
24. | gal te gnas pa mi rtag dañ | lhan cig dños po la yod na |
 | mi rtag log par 'gyur ba'am | yañ na gnas pa brdzun par 'gyur |
25. | mthoñ žiñ dños po mi snañ žiñ | slar yañ sems skye min des na |
 | dran pa žes bya log pa yi | don la log pa kho na 'byuñ |

rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las dus dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab tu byed pa
 bcu gcig pa'o ||

- 18c rnam śes gñis kyis ni CDP, Vaidya : rnam par śes gñis kyis Bhatt.
 20b dños po Bhatt. : dños te CDP, Vaidya
 21a gar CNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gañ D; der CD, Bhatt.: des NP, Vaidya
 22a min CDP, Bhatt.: yin Vaidya; c 'am CD : dañ NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.
 24c ba'am CDP, Bhatt.: pa'am Vaidya
 25b skye CD, Bhatt.: kyi NP, Vaidya; c yi CD, Bhatt.: yis NP, Vaidya

18. Just as one cognition (*vijñāna*) does not apprehend two objects (*artha*), similarly, two cognitions do not apprehend one object.
19. If duration exists in time, duration is not time. Alternatively, if there is no duration, without duration, nothing ends.
20. If impermanence were different from the thing, the thing would not be impermanent. If they were one, that thing would be just impermanent. How, then, could it continue to exist?
21. In that case when impermanence is instable, if duration were stable, how would these two later be seen to reverse [their positions]?
22. If impermanence were not instable, it would be [inherent] in all things. Either duration is not in everything or, alternatively, everything is not impermanent.
23. If impermanence exists permanently, duration cannot exist permanently. Alternatively, [a thing] becomes impermanent after it has been permanent.
24. If a thing continues to exist and is impermanent at the same time, either it is false that it is impermanent or it is false that it continues to exist.
25. A thing that has been seen does not reappear. Moreover, the cognition [of it] does not recur. The so-called memory, having a false object, is, in fact, false.

18. Both the cognition and the object exist just for one moment. Sanskrit found in the *Dvādaśāraṃ Nayacakram*, pp. 73, 82 (CL).
19. On the locus-located relation as part of the fivefold examination see May (1959), p. 183, n. 597 and Ruegg (1981), p. 40.
- 20-24. The marked thing and the mark cannot be established as identical or different; two incompatible marks cannot be possessed by the same thing at the same time, nor is it possible to establish how one mark succeeds the other. Cf. CŚ, XIV, 6-7; AK, II, 46ab and *Bhāṣya*, pp. 264-266 (*Kośa*, I, pp. 232-234). LVP, *Kośa*, I, p. 234, n. 1, identifies the simultaneous operation of *sthiti* and *vināśa* as a *Sāṃmitiya* thesis. Buddhapālita, *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Walliser), p. 92, quotes vv. 23-24.
25. Memory is false because both the object cognized and the cognition are past and will not arise again. Candrakīrti (D f. 183a, P f. 206a) explains the term false as meaning without a nature of its own and dependently arisen: *log pa źes bya ba ni ran bźin med pa dañ | rten ciñ 'brel par 'byuñ ba źes ba dañ | don gźan ma yin pa ste | dños po med pa'i don ni log pa'i don ma yin no ||*.

XII. *lTa ba dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste* |

1. | gzur gnas blo ldan don gñer ba'i | ñan po snod ces bya bar bśad |
| smra po yon tan rnam gžan du | mi 'gyur ñan po la yañ min |
2. | srid dañ srid thabs ži ba yi | thabs dañ de bžin ži gsuñs te |
| 'jig rten yoñs su mi śes gañ | de ni thub pa'i lta bur mñon |
3. | thams cad btañ bas mya ñan las | 'da' bar ya mtshan can kun 'dod |
| kun sun 'byin la de dag ni | mi dgar 'gyur ba rgyu ci žig |
4. kiṃ kariṣyati sa tyāgaṃ tyāgopāyaṃ na veti yaḥ |
śivam anyatra nāstīti nūnaṃ tenoktavān munih ||
| gañ žig gtoñ thabs mi śes de | ci žig gtoñ bar byed par 'gyur |
| des na ñes par thub pa yis | gžan du ži ba med ces gsuñs |
5. buddhokteṣu parokṣeṣu jāyate yasya saṃśayaḥ |
ihaiva pratyayas tena kartavyaḥ śūnyatām prati ||
| sañs rgyas kyis gsuñs lkog gyur la | gañ žig the tshom skye 'gyur ba |
| de yis stoñ pa ñid bsten te | 'di ñid kho nar yid ces bya |

1c po CD, Bhatt.: por NP, Vaidya; rnam CD, Bhatt.: rnam NP, Vaidya; d ñan po la yañ CDNP, Vaidya : ñan pa po la'añ Bhatt.

2d de ni CDNP, Bhatt.: de na Vaidya

3d dgar CDNP, Bhatt.: dka' Vaidya

5a lkog CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: sgrog N; c yis CD, Bhatt.: yi NP, Vaidya

XII. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of Speculative Views

1. It is said that a student who is impartial, intelligent, and industrious is called a fit recipient [for the teaching]. The virtues of a teacher do not change, nor do those of a student.
2. The Buddha spoke about [the cycle of] existence and the method for [abandoning the cycle of] existence. Similarly, he spoke about tranquillity and the method for [cultivating] tranquillity. People perceive whatever they fail to understand as if that were [the fault] of the Sage.
3. All hypocritical philosophers (*pāsaṇḍa*) maintain that *nirvāṇa* is attained by renouncing everything. What is the reason for their displeasure when everything is refuted [by us]?
4. How will someone who does not know the [right] method for renunciation practise renunciation? Consequently, the Sage said that there is no tranquillity in any other system.
5. Whoever doubts what the Buddha said about imperceptible things (*parokṣa*) must have confidence (*pratyaya*), concerning emptiness, in just this system.

1. Candrakīrti (D ff. 183b-184a, P ff. 206-207a) comments that the teacher's qualities include the ability to speak impartially, clearly, without error or anger, the ability to discern a student's intention, and the possession of a mind free of self-interest (*zañ ziñ med, nirāmiṣa*). Cf. SN, 450 on *vācā subhāsītā*; *Traité*, III, p. 1506 on the Buddha's ability to discern the aspirations of beings (the fifth of the *daśabala*).
2. Reference to the four noble truths.
- 3-4. Candrakīrti (D f. 184b, P f. 208a) considers the *pāsaṇḍa* to include Sāṃkhya and Vaiśeṣika adherents; these philosophers agree that the elimination of all defilement (*kun nas ñon moñs, saṃkleṣa*) leads to liberation but they disagree on the method of renunciation, which for Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 494) comprises an understanding of emptiness (*sarvadharmasvabhāvasūnyatālakṣaṇam sarvatyāgopāyaṃ paramārthasatyam*).
5. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 494) says that *anumāna* can end doubt about things that are inaccessible to *pratyakṣa*; *upapatti* proves emptiness, even though not all people can understand its subtle meaning; and those who believe the Buddha's word on emptiness will accept his word on things that are not directly perceptible. See also Tsoñ kha pa's discussion of this verse in *Tantra in Tibet*, tr. J. Hopkins, London, 1977, pp. 31-33.

6. loko 'yaṃ yena dūrḍṣto mūḍha eva paratra saḥ |
 vañcitās te bhaviṣyanti suciraṃ ye 'nuyānti tam ||
 | gaṇ gis 'jig rten 'di mthoñ dka' | de ni gzan la blun pa ñid |
 | gaṇ dag de rjes 'gro de dag | śin tu yun riñ bslus par 'gyur |
7. svayaṃ ye yānti nirvāṇaṃ te kurvanti suduṣkaram |
 gantuṃ notsahate netuḥ prṣṭhato 'py asato manaḥ ||
 | mya ñan 'das par rañ 'gro gaṇ | de ni śin tu bya dka' byed |
 | 'dren pa'i slad bzin dam pa ni | ma yin yid 'gro spro ma yin |
8. trāso nārabhyate 'drṣṭe drṣṭe 'paiti sa sarvaśaḥ |
 niyamaṇaiva kiñcijjñe tena trāso vidhīyate ||
 | ma mthoñ skrag pa mi rtsom ste | mthoñ na rnam kun de ldog 'gyur |
 | des na ñes par cuñ zad cig | śes la skrag pa bsgrub par bya |
9. ekāntenaiva bālānāṃ dharme 'bhyāsaḥ pravartake |
 dharmān nivartakāt teṣāṃ anabhyāsatayā bhayaṃ ||
 | byis rnams ñes pa kho nar ni | 'jug byed chos la goms pa ste |
 | de dag goms pa med pa yis | ldog byed chos la 'jigs par 'gyur |
10. vighnaṃ tattvasya yaḥ kuryād vṛto mohena kena cid |
 kalyāṇādhigatis tasya nāsti mokṣe tu kā kathā ||
 | gaṇ zig gti mug 'ga' zig gis | bsgribs śin de ñid gegs byed pa |
 | de la dge legs 'gro ba yañ | med na thar pa smos ci dgos |
11. śīlād api varaṃ sraṃso na tu drṣṭeḥ kathaṃ cana |
 śīlena gamyate svargo drṣṭyā yāti paraṃ padam ||
 | tshul khrims las ni ñams bla yi | lta las cis kyañ ma yin te |
 | tshul khrims kyis ni mtho ris 'gro | lta bas go 'phañ mchog tu 'gyur |

6b la CD, Bhatt.: ma NP, Vaidya; blun pa CDNP, Bhatt.: blun ba Vaidya; d riñ C, Bhatt.: riñs DNP, Vaidya

7b dka' CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'ga' N; c 'dren pa'i slad bzin CDNP, Vaidya : 'dren slad bzin du'añ Bhatt.

8a pa CDNP, Vaidya : par Bhatt.; d bsgrub NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: brjod CD

9c yis DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: yi C

10a 'ga' NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'ba' CD; d smos ci dgos NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ga la yod CD

11b yin te CDNP, Vaidya : yin no Bhatt.; d mchog tu CDNP : mchog du Vaidya : mchog thob Bhatt.

6. Someone who has perceived this world with difficulty is, in fact, confused about the other world. Those who follow him for a very long time will be misled.
7. Those who attain *nirvāṇa* by themselves accomplish what is very difficult to do. Even when an unwise person follows a guide, his mind is unable to proceed [to *nirvāṇa*].
8. When something is not understood, fear does not begin. When something is understood, fear completely vanishes. Consequently, fear is formed only in someone who knows a little [about the profound teaching].
9. Fools repeatedly practice a teaching that involves activity in a one-sided way. They fear a teaching that involves withdrawal from activity because they lack repeated practice [of it].
10. When there is no good rebirth (*kalyāṇādhigati*) for someone who, influenced by confusion, would create an impediment to the truth, why speak of liberation?
11. Regression even from moral conduct is preferable, but regression from the [right] view is never preferable. Heaven is attained by means of moral conduct; one reaches the highest level by means of the [right] view.

- 6-10. Fear and ignorance are the reasons that people fail to follow the Buddha's profound dharma. Cf. CŚ, VIII, 9; RĀ, I, 39-42, 76-79.
11. *Majjhima*, II, p. 72, distinguishes between the impure (*sāsava*) and the pure (*anāsava*) right view. The impure right view, in opposition to the false view, advocates belief in the workings of karma and merit and will lead one to heaven (cf. RĀ, I, 43-44). The pure right view advocates the cultivation of the noble path and *paññā* and will lead one to *nibbāna* (cf. RĀ, I, 45). See also Lamotte, *Traité*, V, p. 2346, n. 1, on this twofold *samyagdr̥ṣṭi*. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 496) explains that regression from moral conduct, in accord with the severity of the regression, will result in rebirth as a *preta*, an animal, or in hell, but even the least severe regression from the philosophy of selflessness will be far worse for 100,000 *asaṃkheya* eons!

12. ahaṃkāro 'sataḥ śreyān na tu nairātmyadarśanam |
 apāyam eva yāty ekaḥ śivam eva tu netaraḥ ||
 | ḍam pa min la bdag 'dzin mchog | bdag med ston pa ma yin te |
 | gcig ni ṇan 'gro ṇid 'gro la | tha mal ma yin ṇi ṇid du'o |
13. advitīyaṃ śivadvāraṃ kuḍṛṣṭināṃ bhayaṃkaram |
 viṣayaḥ sarvabuddhānāṃ iti nairātmyam ucyate ||
 | ṇi sgo gñis pa med pa daṅ | lta ba ṇan rnams 'jigs byed ciṅ |
 | saṅs rgyas kun gyi yul 'gyur la | bdag med ces ni bya bar brjod |
14. asya dharmasya nāmno 'pi bhayaṃ utpadyate 'sataḥ |
 balavān nāma ko ḍṛṣṭaḥ parasya na bhayaṃkaraḥ ||
 | chos 'di yi ni min las kyaṅ | dam pa min pa 'jigs pa skye |
 | gzan la 'jigs pa mi bskyed pa'i | stobs ldan zes bya gaṅ ṇig mthoṅ |
15. vādasya kṛtaśo dharmo nāyam uktas tathāgataiḥ |
 + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + ||
 | chos 'di de bzin gsegs rnams kyis | rtsod pa'i ched du ma gsuṅs te |
 | de lta'an 'dis ni gzan smra rnams | bsregs te me yis bud ṇiṅ bzin |
16. | chos 'di gaṅ gis ṇes gyur pa | de ni gzan la mi dga' ste |
 | des na bdag la chos 'di ni | 'jig pa'i sgo daṅ 'dra bar snaṅ |
17. | de ṇid du bdag med sṇam du | de ltar gaṅ la dgoṅs gnas pa |
 | de ni yod pas ga la dga' | med pas 'jigs par ga la 'gyur |

12b ston pa CDNP for mthoṅ ba? CL ; c la CD : ba NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

13b 'jigs NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'jig CD; c la CDNP : ba Vaidya, Bhatt.

14c gzan P, Vaidya, Bhatt.: zan CDN; bskyed NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: skyed CD

15a vādasya kṛtaśo HPS : vivādasya kṛte Vaidya : vādasya hi Bhatt.: kyis CD, Bhatt.:
 kyi NP, Vaidya; b gsuṅs te CDNP, Vaidya : gsuṅs so Bhatt.: c 'dis CD, Bhatt.: 'di
 NP, Vaidya; d bsregs NP, Bhatt. : sregs CD :gsregs Vaidya; yis CD, Bhatt.: yi NP,
 Vaidya

16a gyur pa CDNP, Bhatt.: gyur ba Vaidya; b dga' CDNP, Bhatt.: dka' Vaidya; d 'jig
 NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'jigs CD

17c ga CD, Bhatt.: gaṅ NP, Vaidya; dga CDNP, Bhatt. : dka' Vaidya

12. For an unwise person, the apprehension of ego (*ahaṃkāra*) is better than the theory of selflessness. One [person] goes, in fact, to a bad rebirth (*apāya*), but the superior one (*netara*) goes, in fact, to tranquillity.
13. Selflessness is called 'the door to tranquillity of which there is no second', 'terrifying to those with wrong views', and 'the sphere of all the Buddhas'.
14. Even the name of this teaching terrifies unwise people. Indeed, what powerful [teaching] is seen that does not frighten others?
15. The Tathāgatas did not proclaim this teaching for the sake of argumentation. Nevertheless, it destroys other theses, just as fire destroys fuel.
16. An opponent (*para*) dislikes anyone who has understood this teaching. Consequently, this teaching seems to me like the door to destruction [of opponents' wrong views]!
17. Why should someone who thinks of selflessness as the truth delight in existence? Why should he fear non-existence?

12. Emphasis on adapting the teaching to the abilities of students; for some the teaching of a self is better than the teaching of selflessness. Candrakīrti (D ff. 189b-190a, P f. 214a) explains that the teaching that a self exists can lead a person to reject bad conduct and achieve a good rebirth out of a concern for his own welfare; but the teaching of selflessness, if misunderstood and rejected, will lead a person to a bad rebirth. He quotes from the *Ratnakūṭa* to support his position that belief in a person (*gaṇ zag, pudgala*) is better for some than the teaching of emptiness; cf. *Kāśyapaparivarta*, p. 97 (ed. Staël-Holstein) and the quotation of a similar *Ratnakūṭa* passage in PP, pp. 248-249. See also the treatment of this topic in RĀ, II, 19-25 and *Traité*, III, p. 1684.
- 13-14. Quoted in *Traité*, I, p. 69; discussed by Lamotte, *Traité*, IV, p. xiv. Candrakīrti (HPS, pp. 497-498) explains why selflessness, rather than the other two doors to liberation (*vimokṣamukha*), is called *advitīyaṃ śivadvāram*: *yady api śūnyatānimitāprāṇihitamukhyāni trīṇi vimokṣamukhāni | tathāpi nairātmyadarśanam eva pradhānam | viditanairātmyasya hi bhāveṣu parikṣaṇasaṅghasya na kva cit kā cit prārthanā kuto vā nimittopalambha ity advitīyaṃ śivadvāram etan nairātmyam* |; cf. *Traité*, III, pp. 1230-1231.
- 15-17. The Buddha taught selflessness as a door to liberation but for those who reject this teaching it becomes the door to destruction! Cf. MK, XXVII, 30; CS, I, 23, II, 54.

18. | don min sa bon gyur pa yi | mu stegs can mañ mthoñ nas ni |
| chos 'dod pa yi skye bo la | su žig sñiñ brtse skye mi 'gyur |
19. | šā kya gos med bram ze ste | gsum rnams kyi yañ chos yid dañ |
| mig dañ rna ba yis 'dzin pa | de phyir thub pa'i gžuñ lugs phra |
20. | ji ltar bram ze rnams la chos | phal cher phyi 'chos brjod pa ltar |
| de bžin gcer bu rnams la chos | phal cher blun pa brjod pa yin |
21. | ji ltar rig pa blañs pa las | bram ze gus pa skye ba ltar |
| de bžin ñon moñs blañs pa las | gcer bu pa la brtse bar 'gyur |
22. | sdug bsñal las kyi rnam smin phyir | ji ltar chos su mi 'gyur ba |
| de bžin skye ba las kyi ni | rnam smin yin phyir chos ma yin |
23. dharmam samāsato 'himsām varṇayanti tathāgatāḥ |
sūnyatām eva nirvāṇam kevalam tad ihobhayam ||
| chos ni mdor na mi 'tshe bar | de bžin gšegs pa rnams kyi gsuñs |
| stoñ ñid mya ñan 'das pa ste | 'dir ni de gñis 'ba' žig go |
24. | rañ phyogs 'jig rten thams cad la | skyes sa bžin du sdug 'gyur na |
| de yi ldog par byed pa'i rgyu | khyod la gañ gis sdug par 'gyur |
25. | rigs pa'i don ni gžan las kyañ | blo ldan legs pa 'dod pa blañ |
| ñi ma sa steñ mig ldan la | kun gyi spyi thun ma yin nam |

rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las lta ba dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab tu byed pa
bcu gñis pa'o ||

- 19b gsum rnams kyi yañ Vaidya, Bhatt.: gsum rnam kyi'añ NP : gsum po rnams kyi CD;
de CDNP, Vaidya : de'i Bhatt., phra Bhatt.: smra CDNP, Vaidya
- 21a rig NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: rigs CD; b ze NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: zer CD
- 23a 'tshe CDNP, Bhatt.: 'tshi Vaidya; c pa ste CD : par ste NP, Vaidya : par te Bhatt.; d
ni CDNP, Bhatt.: na Vaidya
- 24d sdug par Bhatt. : sdug pa CD : sdug bsñal NP, Vaidya
- 25c steñ NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: steñs CD

18. After seeing that the heterodox philosophers (*tīrthika*) – who are the seeds of misfortune – are many, who wouldn't take pity on people who long for the teaching?
19. The teaching of the three – Śākyamuni, the naked ascetic (*nagnaka*), and the brahmin priests (*vipra*) – is apprehended [respectively] with the mind, the eyes, and the ears. Therefore, the Sage's teaching is [most] subtle.
20. Just as the brahmins' teaching is said to be mostly an outward show, similarly the naked ascetics' teaching is said to be mostly stupidity!
21. Just as the brahmins are respected for their acquisition of knowledge, similarly, the naked ascetics are pitied for their acquisition of afflictions.
22. Just as the pain [experienced by the naked ascetic] is not a valid norm because it is the maturation of karma, similarly [brahmin] birth is not a valid norm because it is the maturation of karma.
23. In brief, the Tathāgatas explain non-violence as virtuous behavior and *nirvāṇa* as, in fact, emptiness. Here [in our system] there are only these two.
24. All people love their own thesis, just as they love their own birth-place. Yet why should a reason that defeats it distress you?
25. An intelligent person who desires good fortune accepts things that are appropriate, even from opponents. Isn't the sun common to everyone on earth who has eyes?

- 18-22. Comparison of the teachings of the Buddha, the *brahmaṇa* and the *nagnaka*. Candrakīrti (D f. 193a-b, P f. 218a-b) explains that since the ears apprehend the *brahmaṇa*'s recitation of the scriptures, the eyes apprehend how the *nagnakas* torment their bodies, and the mind apprehends the Buddha's teaching of things' lack of own-nature, his teaching is the subtlest. Moreover, since the *brahmaṇa* recites *mantras* and performs sacrifices for wealth and fame, his teaching is just an outward show. The *nagnaka*'s painful practices merely stupefy the mind! Cf. the discussion of the *brahmaṇa* and the *nagnaka* in Uv., XXXIII.
23. Summation of the Buddha's teachings: the practice of *ahiṃsā* is for the ordinary person who seeks a good rebirth, and the philosophy of emptiness is for the *drya* who seeks liberation from *samsāra*. Quoted in PP, p. 351; Buddhapālita's *Mūla-madhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Lindtner) p. 193; Wayman (1978), p. 454.
- 24-25. Criticism of partiality to one's own thesis; cf. CS, VIII, 10.

XIII. *dBañ po dañ don dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste* |

1. sarva eva ghaṭo 'dṛṣṭo rūpe dṛṣṭe hi jāyate |
brūyāt kas tattvavin nāma ghaṭaḥ pratyakṣa ity api ||
| gzugs mthoñ tshe na bum pa ni | thams cad kho na mthoñ mi 'gyur |
| bum pa mñon sum zes bya ba'añ | de ñid rig pa su žig smra |
2. etenaiva vicāreṇa sugandhi madhuraṃ mṛdu |
pratiṣedhayitavyāni sarvāṇy uttamabuddhinā ||
| rnam par dpyad pa 'di ñid kyis | blo mchog ldan pas dri žim dañ |
| mñar dañ 'jam pa thams cad dag | so sor dgag par bya ba yin |
3. | gal te gzugs mthoñ ba yis de | thams cad mthoñ bar 'gyur na ni |
| ma mthoñ ba yis gzugs mthoñ ba | mthoñ ba min par cis mi 'gyur |
4. | gzugs ni 'ba' žig kho na la | mñon sum ñid ni yod ma yin |
| gañ phyir de la pha rol gyi | cha dañ tshu rol dbus yod phyir |
5. | rdul la cha śas yod med ces | dpyad pa der yañ 'jug par 'gyur |
| de phyir bsgrub par bya ba yis | bsgrub bya 'grub par mi 'thad do |
6. | kun kyañ yan lag tu gyur nas | slar yañ yan lag can du 'gyur |
| de phyir yi ge brjod pa yañ | 'di na yod pa ma yin no |

1b mi CDNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ma N

2a dpyad CDNP, Bhatt.: dbyad Vaidya

3c yis CD : yi NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.

4a 'ba' CDNP, Bhatt.: 'ga' Vaidya; b yod CDNP, Vaidya : srid Bhatt.

5b dpyad CDNP, Bhatt.: dbyad Vaidya; de CDNP, Vaidya : de'i Bhatt.; bsgrub CDNP, Bhatt.: bsgrug Vaidya; d par CDN, Vaidya, Bhatt.: pa N

6c de CDNP, Vaidya : de'i Bhatt.; d na NP, Bhatt.: la CD : ni Vaidya

XIII. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Sense Faculties and Their Objects

1. When only the color (*rūpa*) is perceived, the pot as a whole, of course, is not perceived. Indeed, what person who knows the truth would say that a pot is directly perceptible (*pratyakṣa*)?
2. With this very same reasoning, the most intelligent people should refute everything – for example, the fragrant, the sweet, and the soft.
3. If the entire [pot] were perceived by [only] perceiving the color, then, from the non-perception of [the other components of the pot] shouldn't it follow that the perceived color is, in fact, not perceived?
4. There is no direct perception of the entire visible form (*rūpa*), since it has outer, inner, and middle parts.
5. The investigation of whether or not an atom has parts also occurs in the system [of our opponents]. Therefore, it is not logically possible to establish that [atom] to be established (*sādhya*) by means of [an atom] that remains to be established.
6. If, in every case, that [thing] which is a part (*avayava*), is a whole (*avayavin*) besides, then, in this case, a statement [consisting of] syllables (*akṣara*) does not exist.

1-4. Refutation of the direct perception of the entire object; each sense faculty perceives part of the object, not the whole. PP, p. 71 quotes vv. 1-2. Cf. **Śataka*, 176b-c (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 54-55).

5-6. Refutation of the independent existence of parts and wholes. The *rūpa* can be broken down into its constituent atomic parts, but these *aṇu/paramāṇu* also have parts, and since the atom must itself be proven, it cannot establish anything else. See K. Bhattacharya's discussion of v. 5 and the logical fallacy *sādhyaśama* in *The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna*, Delhi 1978, p. 22, n. 3. Just as the *aṇu/paramāṇu* is the smallest unit of *rūpa*, the *akṣara* is the smallest unit of *nāman* (see AK, III, 85c-d). If a thing can be both part and whole, the syllable as a whole should convey all the sense of a statement. Cf. **Vyavahārasiddhi*, 1.

7. | gal te mdog las dbyibs gžan na | ji lta bur na dbyibs 'dzin gyur |
| 'on te gžan min na lus kyis | mdog kyañ ci ste 'dzin mi 'gyur |
8. | gzugs ni lta žig ma gtogs par | gzugs kyi rgyu ni mi snañ ño |
| gal te de ltar 'gyur na ni | gñi ga yañ ni mig ñid kyis |
| 'dzin par ci yi phyir mi 'gyur |
9. | sa ni brtan žes bya bar mthoñ | de yañ lus kyis 'dzin par 'gyur |
| des na reg pa 'ba' žig ni | sa'o žes ni bya bar brjod |
10. | blta bya skyes pas bum pa ni | 'di la yon tan 'gar mi 'gyur |
| des na blta bya ñid skye ltar | yod pa'i ño bo'añ yod ma yin |
11. | mig ni 'byuñ 'gyur rna de bžin | mig gis mthoñ gi gžan gyis min |
| des na ñes par las rnam smin | thub pas bsam mi khyab par gsuñs |
12. | rkyen ma tshañ phyir šes pa ni | lta ba'i šña rol yod ma yin |
| 'on te phyis na šes don med | gsum pa byed pa don med 'gyur |
13. pašyec cakšuś cirād dūre gatimad yadi tad bhavet |
 atyabhyāše ca dūre ca rūpaṃ vyaktaṃ na tac ca kim ||
| mig de 'gros dañ ldan 'gyur na | thag riñ yun riñ gis mthoñ 'gyur |
| ha cañ ñe dañ ches riñ du | gzugs de gsal bar ci ste min |

7c na CDNP, Vaidya : la Bhatt.; d 'dzin mi 'gyur CDNP : mi 'dzin 'gyur Vaidya, Bhatt.

8a lta CD, Bhatt.: blta NP, Vaidya

9a brtan CD, Bhatt.: bstan NP, Vaidya; c reg CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: rag D; ni CDNP, Vaidya : 'di Bhatt.

10b 'gar CDNP : 'ga' Vaidya, Bhatt.

11a 'gyur NP, Vaidya : gyur CD, Bhatt.; rna Vaidya, Bhatt.: sna CDNP; b gi CD, Bhatt.: gis NP, Vaidya

12a rkyen ma tshañ CDNP, Bhatt.: rgyen ma tshad Vaidya; b lta CD, Bhatt.: blta NP, Vaidya

13a 'gyur NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gyur CD; d bar CDNP, Vaidya : ba Bhatt.

7. If the shape (*saṁsthāna*) is different from the color, how is the shape apprehended? Alternatively, if it is not different, wouldn't the body[*'s* sense of touch] also apprehend color?
8. The cause of visible form [the elements, earth, and so forth] is not seen at all apart from the perception (*darśana*) of the visible form. If it were the case [that cause and effect are inseparable], why wouldn't the eye apprehend them both?
9. One experiences that earth is hard (*kāṭhinya*) and the body[*'s* sense of touch] apprehends it. Therefore one must say that earth is merely touch[able].
10. There is no quality in this pot here having the genus (*jāti*) perceptibility. Therefore, there is no such truly existent thing as [the genus] perceptibility.
11. The eye is derived matter (*bhautika*); so is the ear. The eye sees, but another [sense faculty] does not. Consequently, the Sage said that the maturation of karma is inconceivable.
12. Because the conditions are incomplete, cognition (*jñāna*) does not exist before perception (*darśana*). Or else, afterwards, the cognition has no object. A third construction [namely, the simultaneity of perception and cognition] is useless.
13. If the eye were possessed of motion, it would perceive [visible form] in the distance [only] after a long period of time; but isn't visible form manifest both up close and in the distance?

- 7-8. *Rūpa* is twofold; the *cakṣurindriya* apprehends the color and the *kāyendriya* apprehends the shape. Cf. ŚS, 50; AK, I, 10: *rūpaṁ dvidhā varṇaḥ saṁsthānaṁ ca*; and Lindtner (1982), p. 57, n. 50 (ref.).
9. Karunadasa (1967), pp. 17-18, discusses *kāṭhinya* as a mark of earth; see also May (1959), p. 91, n. 197 (ref.).
10. According to *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, IV. 1. 6-12, the quality *rūpa* is a necessary condition for the perceptibility of any object.
11. On the thesis '*cakṣuḥ paśyati*' see AK, I, 42 and *Abhidharmadīpa*, I, 44, along with their respective commentaries. Candrakīrti (D ff. 201a-202a, P ff. 228a-229a) explains that the thesis 'the eye is established by its own-nature' can be refuted, but it is not possible to refute the nature of that sense faculty's maturation, since the maturation of karma is inconceivable; cf. Wayman (1978), p. 219-220. The *Milinda-pañha*, p. 189, describes the maturation of karma as *acintiya*.
12. The Chinese translation gives simultaneity as the third possibility; cf. **Śataka*, 175c (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 50-51).
- 13-15. Refutation of various theories on how the eye and its object come into contact. Cf. **Śataka*, 175c-176a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 51-52). J. Sinha, *Indian Psychology*, v.1,

14. gatena na guṇaḥ kaś cid rūpaṃ dṛṣṭvākṣi yāti cet |
 draṣṭavyaṃ niyamaneṣṭam iti vā jāyate vṛthā ||
 | gal te gzugs mthoñ mig 'gro na | soñ bas yon tan 'ga' yañ med |
 | yañ na blta byar 'dod pa ni | ñes śes bya ba brdzun par 'gyur |

15. gr̥hñiyād agataṃ cakṣuḥ paśyēt sarvaṃ idaṃ jagat |
 yasya nāsti gatis tasya nāsti dūraṃ na cāvṛtam ||
 | mig ma soñ bar 'dzin na ni | 'gro ba 'di kun mthoñ 'gyur te |
 | gañ la 'gro ba yod min pa | de la riñ med bsgrib pa'añ med |

16. svabhāvaḥ sarvabhāvānāṃ pūrvam ātmani dṛśyate |
 grahaṇaṃ cakṣuṣaḥ kena cakṣuṣaiva na jāyate ||
 | dños po kun gyi rañ bzin ni | dañ por bdag la snañ 'gyur na |
 | mig ni mig ñid kyis 'dzin par | ci yi phyir na 'gyur ma yin |

17. cakṣuṣo 'sti na vijñānaṃ vijñānasya na darśanam |
 ubhayaṃ nāsti rūpasya tai rūpaṃ dṛśyate katham ||
 | mig la rnam śes yod min žiñ | rnam śes la yañ lta med la |
 | gñi ga gzugs la yod min na | de dag gis gzugs ji ltar mthoñ |

18. na vaktā jāyate kena śabdo yāti bruvan yadi |
 atha yāty abruvaṃs tasmin pratyayaḥ kena jāyate ||
 | gal te smra žiñ sgra 'gro na | gañ gis smra ba por mi 'gyur |
 | 'on te mi smra bar 'gro na'añ | gañ gis de la śes pa skye |

19. prāptaś ced gr̥hyate śabdas tasyādih̐ kena gr̥hyate |
 na caiti kevalaḥ śabdo gr̥hyate kevalaḥ katham ||
 | gal te phrad de sgra 'dzin na | sgra yi dañ po gañ gis 'dzin |
 | sgra ni rkyañ par mi 'on na | reñ bu ji ltar 'dzin par 'gyur |

14a mthoñ CD, Vaidya, Bhatt. : mañ NP; d brdzun Bhatt. : rdzun CD : brjod NP,
 Vaidya

15d riñ CDNP, Bhatt.: 'di Vaidya

17b rnam śes la yañ CDNP, Vaidya : rnam par śes pa Bhatt.; lta CD, Bhatt.: blta NP,
 Vaidya; d ji CD, Bhatt.: ci NP, Vaidya

18d kena jāyate HPS, Bhatt.: jāyate katham Vaidya; skye Bhatt.: bskyed NP, Vaidya :
 skyed CD

19b yi DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: yis C; c rkyañ par CDNP : rgyad par Vaidya : rkyañ ba'añ
 Bhatt.; d reñ CDNP, Vaidya : riñ Bhatt.

14. If it is said that the eye moves after it has perceived the visible form, there would be no point in its having moved. Alternatively, [if the eye moves without having perceived anything,] it is false to maintain that [the visible form] is necessarily perceptible (*draṣṭavya*).
15. Were the eye to apprehend without moving [towards its object], it should perceive this entire world! For that [eye] which does not move, there is neither close nor far.
16. [You claim that] the own-nature of all things must first be seen in the things themselves. [We reply:] Why doesn't the eye apprehend itself?
17. The eye does not possess consciousness; consciousness does not possess perception, and visible form does not possess either one. How can they perceive visible form?
18. If the sound making the noise reaches [the ear] why isn't it [considered] the speaker? Alternatively, if the sound, without making a noise reaches [the ear], how can any confidence be placed in it?
19. If the sound is apprehended after it has reached [the ear], how is its beginning apprehended? If the sound does not come as a whole, why is it apprehended as a whole?

Calcutta 1958, pp. 21-23, summarizes the Buddhist arguments against the Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika thesis that the eye is *prāpyakārin*; on this contact between the eye and its object see also Potter (1977), pp. 161-162. AK, I, 43cd states the opposing Buddhist position: *aprāptīrthāny akṣīmanāḥ śrotrāṇi trayam anyathā*.

- 16-17. The eye does not perceive objects independently by virtue of its own-nature nor does it perceive them in cooperation with anything else. Cf. **Śataka*, 176a (*Śataśāstra*, p. 52); MK, III; and ŚS, 52-57. Buddhapālita's *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Walleser), p. 55 and Wayman (1978), p. 332, quote v. 16.
- 18-20. Refutation of various theories on the ear's apprehension of sound. On the different theories of auditory cognition see Karunadasa (1967), pp. 52-54 (ref.).

20. yāvan na śrūyate śabdas tāvac chabdo na jāyate |
 āśabdasyāpi śabdatvam ante tac ca na yujyate ||
 | ji srid sgra thos ma gyur pa | de yi bar du sgrar mi 'gyur |
 | sgra med pa yañ mthar sgra ñid | 'gyur na de ni mi rigs so |
21. viyuktam indriyaiś cittam kiṃ gatvāpi kariṣyati |
 evaṃ satiha jīvo 'yam amanaskaḥ sadā na kim ||
 | dbaṅ po rnams dañ bral sems kyis | soñ ste 'aṅ ci žig byed par 'gyur |
 | de lta yin dañ srog 'di ni | rtag tu yid med ci ste min |
22. manasā grhyate yo 'rthaḥ pūrvadr̥ṣṭo marīcivat |
 sarvadharmavyavasthāsu sa saṃjñāskandhasaṃjñakaḥ ||
 | sñar mthoṅ ba yi don gañ žig | yid kyis smig rgyu ltar 'dzin pa |
 | de ni chos kun rnam gžag la | 'du śes phuñ po žes bya'o |
23. cakṣuḥ pratītya rūpaṃ ca māvāvaj jāyate manaḥ |
 vidyate yasya sadbhāvaḥ sā māyeti na yujyate ||
 | mig dañ gzugs la brten nas yid | sgyu ma bžin du skye bar 'gyur |
 | gañ la yod pa ñid yod de | sgyu ma žes byar mi rigs so |
24. yadā na kiñ cid āścaryaṃ viduṣāṃ vidyate bhuvi |
 indriyāṇāṃ gatāv evaṃ tadā ko nāma vismayaḥ ||
 | gañ tshe mkhas la sa steñ na | ño mtshar min pa 'ga' med pa |
 | de tshe dbaṅ rtogs de 'dra la | ya mtshan śes bya ci žig yod |
25. alātacakraṇirmāṇasvapnamāyāmbucandrakaiḥ |
 dhūmikāntaḥpratiśrutkāmarīcyabhraiḥ samo bhavaḥ ||
 | mgal me'i 'khor lo sprul pa dañ | rmi lam sgyu ma chu zla dañ |
 | khug sna nañ gi brag ca dañ | smig rgyu sprin dañ srid pa mtshuñs |
 rnal 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las dbaṅ po dañ don dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab
 tu byed pa bcu gsum pa'o ||
- 20a gyur pa CDP, Bhatt.: gyur po N : gyur ba Vaidya
 21a dañ CD, Bhatt. : kyañ NP, Vaidya; kyis CD, Bhatt.: kyi NP, Vaidya; c lta CDNP,
 Vaidya: ltar Bhatt.
 22c gžag CDNP, Vaidya : bžag Bhatt.
 23d sā Bhatt.: sa HPS, Vaidya
 24a la NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: pa CD; steñ NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: steñs CD; b min pa 'ga' CD
 : can min can NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.
 25b chu CDN, Vaidya, Bhatt.: chuñ P; d srid pa mthuñs CDNP, Vaidya : mtshuñ srid pa
 Bhatt.

20. As long as sound is not heard, it cannot be [classified as] sound. Finally, it is impossible for non-sound to be sound.
21. Deprived of the sense faculties, what will the mind (*citta*) do, even after it has gone [to the object]? This being the case, why [when the mind is out there] won't this self (*jīva*) here be left without a mind (*amanaska*) every time?
22. The object apprehended by the mind is, in fact, seen earlier [and is thus] like a mirage. In regard to the determination of phenomena (*dharma*) this is what is termed 'the aggregate of apperception' (*saṃjñāskandha*).
23. The mind arises in dependence upon the eye and visible form, like an illusion. It is not possible to call that which has real existence (*sadbhāva*) an illusion.
24. When, to the wise, nothing on earth is astonishing, then, indeed, what is amazing in the movement of the sense faculties?
25. [The cycle of] ~~the~~ existence is the same as a firebrand's circle, a magical creation, a dream, an illusion, the moon [reflected] in water, vapor, an echo, a mirage, and a cloud.

21. Perception also is not a result of the mind's contact with the object; cf. **Śataka*, 176a-b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 52-53) and May (1959), p. 78, n. 130 (ref.).
- 22-23. Allusion to *Samyutta*, III, p. 142: *Marīcikūpamā saññā* || ... *Māyūpamañ ca viññāṇaṃ dipitādiccabandhuna* ||. Cf. ŚS, 56 and Lindtner (1982), p. 260.
25. The same descriptive images for *bhava/saṃsāra* occur in RĀ, I, 36; YŚ, 17, and CS, II, 4; see also *Traité*, I, pp. 357-360, nn. 1-6 (ref.). The verse is quoted in PP, pp. 173, 552, in Murti (1960), p. 177, by Lamotte in *Traité*, I, p. 359, n. 4 and in *La Somme du Grand Véhicule d'Asaṅga*, Louvain 1958, p. 22*.

XIV. *mThar 'dzin pa dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste* |

1. āyattam yasya bhāvasya bhaven nānyasya kutra cit |
sidhyet tasyāstitā nāma kva cit sa ca na vidyate ||
| dños po gañ žig gžan 'ga' la'añ | rag las par ni mi 'gyur na |
| de yi bdag ñid 'grub 'gyur na | de ni gañ na'añ yod ma yin |
2. rūpam eva ghaṭo naikyam ghaṭo nānyo 'sti rūpavān |
na vidyate ghaṭe rūpam na rūpe vidyate ghaṭaḥ ||
| gzugs ñid bum žes gcig ma yin | gzugs ldan bum gžan yod min la |
| bum pa la gzugs yod min žiñ | gzugs la bum pa yod ma yin |
3. vailakṣaṇyam dvayor dṛṣṭvā bhāvād anyo ghaṭo yadi |
ghaṭād anyo na bhāvo 'pi kim evam na bhaviṣyati ||
| gñis mtshan mi mthun mthoñ nas ni | gal te dños las bum gžan na |
| ma yin de ltar dños po yañ | bum pa las gžan cis mi 'gyur |
4. eko yadi ghaṭo neṣṭo ghaṭo 'py eko na jāyate |
na cāyam samayor yogas tenāpy eko na jāyate ||
| gal te gcig bum mi 'dod na | bum pa'añ gcig tu mi 'gyur ro |
| ldan 'di mthuñs pa'añ ma yin pa | des kyañ gcig tu mi 'gyur ro |
5. yāvad dravyam yadā rūpam tadā rūpam mahan na kim |
samayo jāyate vācyaḥ prativādy aparo yadi ||
| gañ tshe rdzas ci tsam gzugs na | de tshe gzugs chen ci ste min |
| gal te phyir rgol gžan min na | gžuñ lugs bsñad par bya bar 'gyur |

1b kutra cit HPS, Bhatt.: kasya cit Vaidya, las CDNP, Bhatt.: lus Vaidya, ni CDNP,
Vaidya : žig Bhatt.; c de yi CDNP, Vaidya : de'i Bhatt.; d na'añ CDNP, Vaidya :
la'añ Bhatt.

2b la CDNP: na Vaidya : pa Bhatt.

3c ghaṭād anyo na bhāvo 'pi HPS, Vaidya : na bhāvo 'pi ghaṭād anyo Bhatt.

4b tu NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: bu CD

XIV. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of Belief in Extreme Views

1. Were a thing in no way dependent upon another, its existence certainly would be established, but such a thing does not exist anywhere.
2. That there is identity (*aikya*) – namely, the color itself being the pot – is not so, nor is the pot that possesses the color different [from the color]. The color does not exist in the pot, and the pot does not exist in the color.
3. If, after perceiving a difference in mark (*vailakṣaṇya*) between the two, [you claim that] the pot is different from existence (*bhāva*), [we reply:] No. How will it not follow, then, that existence [i.e. color] also must be different from the pot?
4. If it is not maintained [by you] that the pot is one [by nature], the pot cannot become one. Again this is not a connection (*yoga*) between similar things, and for this reason also that [pot] is not one.
5. When the color is as large as the substance, isn't the color large? [Your own] doctrine (*samaya*) can [only] be asserted as long as the opponent does not belong to another system (*apara*).

1. All things exist in dependence upon others; cf. above IX, 2 and MK, XXIV, 19; quoted in PP, pp. 397, 505; and Hopkins (1983), p. 660.
2. The pot and its *rūpa* are neither identical nor different; nor does the locus-located relation apply since their difference cannot be established. On this fourfold analysis see Ruegg (1981), p. 41, n. 99 and May (1959), p. 183, n. 599 (ref.).
3. Cf. **Śataka*, 174c-175a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 45-46). *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, I. 2. 4, speaks of existence as a universal because it recurs (*bhāvo 'nūvṛtter eva hetuvāt sāmānyam eva*); see also *Padārthadharmaśaṅgraha*, p. 29: *tatra paraṃ sattā mahāviśayatvāt sa cānūvṛttihetuvād viśeṣaḥ te khalu vyāvṛttihetuvād viśeṣa eva*. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 505) refers to this tenet in explaining the difference in mark: *ghaṭādidravayānām anupravṛttīlakṣaṇatvāt sāmāny(ām) bhāvaḥ | vyāvṛttīlakṣaṇatvāc ca ghaṭo viśeṣalakṣaṇa iti |*.
4. Since the pot is a substance and number (*saṃkhyā*) is a quality (*Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, I. 1. 4-5), the two are dissimilar and so there can be no real connection between them; cf. **Śataka*, 174c-175a (*Śataśāstra*, p. 45).
5. The quality size (*parimāṇa*) is perceptible because it inheres in substances that possess color (*Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, 4.1. 11), but to claim that color itself possesses size contradicts the tenet that qualities cannot possess other qualities (*Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, I. 1. 16).

6. lakṣaṇenāpi lakṣyasya yatra siddhir na vidyate |
 samkhyādivyatiṛeṇa tatra bhāvo na vidyate ||
 | mtshan ŋid kyis kyaṇ mtshan gzi ni | gaṇ du grub pa yod min pa |
 | der ni graṇs sogs tha dad par | dños po yod pa ma yin no |
7. ghaṭasya na bhavaty aikyam aprthaktvād dhi lakṣaṇaiḥ |
 ekaikasmin ghaṭābhāve bahutvaṃ nopapadyate ||
 | mtshan ŋid rnams daṇ so so ni | min phyir bum pa gcig ma yin |
 | re re'i bum pa med na ni | maṇ ŋid 'thad par mi 'gyur ro |
8. na hy asparśavato nāma yogaḥ sparśavatā saha |
 rūpādīnām ato yogaḥ sarvathāpi na yujyate ||
 | reg ldan reg daṇ mi ldan daṇ | lhan cig sbyor ba zes bya med |
 | de phyir gzugs sogs rnams sbyor ba | rnam pa kun tu rigs ma yin |
9. ghaṭasyāvayavo rūpaṃ tena tāvan na tad ghaṭaḥ |
 yasmād avayavī nāsti tena nāvayavo 'pi tat ||
 | gzugs ni bum pa'i yan lag ste | des na re zig de bñm min |
 | gaṇ phyir yan lag can med pa | des na yan lag kyaṇ yod min |
10. sarveṣāṃ api rūpānāṃ rūpatvam avilakṣaṇam |
 ekasya ghaṭasadbhāvo nānyeṣāṃ kiṃ n(u) kāraṇam ||
 | gzugs rnams kun la'aṇ gzugs ŋid ni | mtshan ŋid mi mthun ma yin na |
 | gcig la bum pa yod 'gyur žiṇ | gzan dag la min rgyu ci žig |
11. rūpam anyad rasādibhyo na ghaṭād iti te matam |
 svayaṃ yas tair vinā nāsti (sa nānyo) rūpataḥ katham ||
 | ro sogs dag las gzugs gzan žiṇ | bum las min zes khyod 'dod na |
 | de rnams ma gtogs raṇ med gaṇ | de gzugs las gzan ji ltar min |

6c der DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: de C

7a bhavaty HPS, Vaidya: bhaved Bhatt.

8b sbyor CDNP, Bhatt.: spyor Vaidya; c sogs rnams sbyor ba CD, Bhatt.: rnams sbyor
 ba ni NP, rnams spyor ba ni Vaidya

9d yod CDNP, Bhatt.: yon Vaidya

10a la'aṇ Bhatt.: la CDNP, Vaidya; b mi CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ni N, yin na CDNP,
 Vaidya : yin no Bhatt.; kiṃ nu Bhatt.: kiṃ na HPS, Vaidya

11c ma gtogs NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: med par CD; d sa nānyo Bhatt.: so 'nanyo HPS,
 Vaidya; ji CDN, Bhatt.: ci P, Vaidya

6. Moreover, [in a system] in which there is no establishment of the marked thing by means of the mark, there is no existence [of that marked thing] apart from [its marks] – number, and so forth.
7. Unity (*aikya*) cannot exist for the pot because, of course, it cannot be separated from its marks; nor is a plurality [of pots] possible since the pot is absent in each [mark].
8. There is, of course, no connection between a tangible thing and an intangible thing. Therefore, the [pot's] connection with color, and so forth, is not possible.
9. The color is a part of the pot and, therefore, cannot be the pot [as a whole]. Since the whole does not exist, that [color] cannot be a part either.
10. All *rūpas* [color, odor, and so forth,] have the [same] indistinguishable (*avilakṣaṇa*) property of being *rūpa*. Why, then, does the actual pot-state (*ghaṭasadbhāva*) apply [only] to one [*rūpa*] and not to the others?
11. Your opinion is that color is different from taste, and so forth, but not from the pot. Since that [pot] cannot exist by itself without them [namely, taste, and so forth], must it not be different from color?

6. On the inability of the mark to establish the marked thing see also MK, V, 4; ŚS, 27; CS, I, 11.
7. If the pot and its marks are inseparable, they cannot be identical since the use of the term identity implies that some distinction can be made between the two things said to be identical. Also, since the pot and its marks cannot be distinguished, one cannot be the locus of the other. Cf. **Śataka*, 174a-b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 41-42); RĀ, I, 71; and ŚS, 7. On the use of *hi* as a technical term see Lindtner (1982), p. 26.
- 8-11. Refutation of pot as a union of its constituent *rūpas*, color, smell, and so forth. Cf. **Śataka*, 175b-c, 176c-177a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 48-49, 57). Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 508) on the use of *rūpa* in v.10: *sarveṣāṃ rūpānām iti rūpaskandhasaṃgrhātavād rūpagandhādayo rūpāṇīty ucyante* |.

12. ghaṭasya kāraṇaṃ nāsti svayaṃ kāryaṃ na jāyate |
 rūpādibhyaḥ pṛthak kaś cid ghaṭas tasmān na vidyate ||
 | bum pa la ni rgyu yod min | rañ ñid 'bras bur mi 'gyur te |
 | de phyir gzugs sogs las gžan du | bum pa 'ga' yañ yod ma yin |
13. ghaṭaḥ kāraṇataḥ siddhaḥ siddhaṃ kāraṇaṃ anyataḥ |
 siddhir yasya svato nāsti tad anyaj janayet katham ||
 | bum pa rgyu las grub 'gyur žiñ | rgyu ni gžan las grub gyur na |
 | gañ la rañ las grub med pa | de yis gžan po ji ltar bskyed |
14. samavāye 'pi rūpasya gandhatvaṃ nopapadyate |
 samūhasyaikatā tena ghaṭasyeva na yujyate ||
 | 'phrod pa 'dus par gyur kyañ gzugs | dri ñid du ni mi 'thad de |
 | des na bum pa bžin tshogs pa | gcig ñid du ni mi rigs so |
15. rūpādivyatiṛeṇa yathā kumbho na vidyate |
 vāyvādivyatiṛeṇa tathā rūpaṃ na vidyate ||
 | ji ltar gzugs sogs ma gtogs par | bum pa yod pa ma yin pa |
 | de bžin rluñ la sogs pa ni | ma gtogs gzugs kyañ yod ma yin |
16. agnir eva bhavaty uṣṇaṃ anuṣṇaṃ dahyate katham |
 nāsti tenendhanaṃ nāma tad rte 'gnir na vidyate ||
 | tsha ba med ñid du 'gyur te | tsha ba min pa ji ltar bsreg |
 | des na bud šin žes bya ba | yod min de med me yod min |

12c de CDNP: de'i Bhatt.

13a grub CD : 'grub NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.; b grub gyur NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: grub 'gyur CD; d bskyed NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: skyed CD

14b de DNP, Bhatt.: do C, Vaidya

16b bsreg CDNP, Bhatt.: bsgreg Vaidya

12. [If you say] that the pot has no cause, [we reply:] It cannot arise by itself as an effect. For that reason, no pot exists apart from color, and so forth.
13. [If, alternatively, you assume that] the pot is established by a cause, [we reply:] That cause must be established by another [cause, and so forth]. How could some [cause] that has not been established by itself produce something else?
14. Even [if you assume that they exist] in union (*samavāya*), it is not possible that color possesses odor. Therefore, the unity (*ekatā*) of a conglomerate thing is impossible, as in the case of a pot.
15. Just as the pot is not found to exist apart from color, and so forth, similarly, the color is not found to exist apart from [the elements] air, and so forth.
16. A thing that is hot (*uṣṇa*) is, in fact, fire. How could a thing that is not hot [namely, fuel] burn? Therefore, the so-called fuel does not exist, and without it fire is not found to exist.

- 12-13. The pot is neither established independently of a cause, namely, by itself, nor is it established in dependence upon a cause other than itself. The pot, being an effect, exists in dependence upon a cause; but the cause, the potsherds, as Candrakīrti points out (HPS, p.508), also exist in dependence upon a cause, namely, clay fragments. Something that has yet to be established (*sādhya*) cannot establish anything else (cf. IX, 5cd above). PP, p. 89 and Buddhapālita's *Mūlamadhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Walleser), pp. 31-32, quote v. 13 with the variant reading *paṭaḥ / snam bu*.
14. Refutation of unity between the composite entity (*samūha*) pot and its constituent parts, color, smell, and so forth. This verse and v. 24 below do not use the term *samavāya* to refer to the Vaiśeṣika tenet of inherence; cf. the use of *samavāya* in *Laṅkāvatāra*, III, 88cd: *samavāyād vinirmukto buddhyā bhāvo na gṛhyate | tasmāc chūnyam anuṭpannam niḥsvabhāvam vadāmy aham ||* and in PP, p. 561. On the use of term *samavāya* in the Vaiśeṣika system see May, p. 268, n. 970 (ref.) and Potter (1977) index, s.v. inherence.
15. The pot is dependent upon its color, and so forth, in the same way that the color, and so forth, being *upādāyanūpa*, is dependent upon the four *mahābhūtas*; see Karunadāsa (1967), pp. 30-33. PP, p. 71, quotes this verse.
- 16-18. Interdependence of fire and fuel (the other 3 *mahābhūtas*); cf. **Śataka*, 176c-177a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 57-58); MK, X; and RĀ, I, 83-90. Wayman (1978), pp. 31, 231, quotes vv. 16 and 18, respectively. In 16a Buddhapālita (ed. Walleser, p. 56) seems to have read *dahaty for bhavaty*. See *Vaiśeṣikasūtra*, II. 2. 4.

17. abhibhūto 'pi yady uṣṇaḥ so 'py agniḥ kiṃ na jāyate |
 athānuṣṇ(e) paro 'py agnau bhāvo 'stīti na yujyate ||
 | gal te zil mnan tsha ba yañ | de yañ ci ste mer mi 'gyur |
 | 'on te mi tsha na dños gzan | me la yod ces byar mi ruñ |
18. indhanaṃ yady aṇor nāsti tenāsty agnir anindhanaḥ |
 aṇur ekātmako nāsti syāt tasyāpīndhanaṃ yadi ||
 | gal te rdul la śiñ med na | des na śiñ med me yod de |
 | gal te de la'añ śiñ yod na | gcig gi bdag can rdul yod min |
19. tasya tasyaikatā nāsti yo yo bhāvaḥ parīkṣyate |
 na santi tenāneke 'pi yenaiko 'pi na vidyate ||
 | dños po gañ gañ yoñs brtag pa | de dañ de la gcig ñid med |
 | gañ gis gcig kyañ yod min pa | des na du ma dag kyañ med |
20. bhāvās (yatra) na santy anye tatraiko 'stīti cen matam |
 tritvaṃ yenāsti sarvatra tenaikatvaṃ na vidyate ||
 | gal te gañ la dños de rnams | med der gcig yod ces 'dod na |
 | gañ gis kun la gsum ñid yod | des na gcig ñid yod ma yin |
21. sad asat sadasac ceti sadasan neti ca kramaḥ |
 eṣa prayojyo vidvadbhir ekatvādiṣu nityaśaḥ ||
 | yod dañ med dañ yod med dañ | yod med min zes bya ba'i tshul |
 | 'di ni mkhas pas gcig ñid sogs | dag la rtag tu sbyar bar bya |
22. | ji ltar rgyun la lta ñes na | rtag pa yod ces byar 'gyur na |
 | de bzin tshogs la lta ñes na | dños po yod ces bya bar 'gyur |

17c athānuṣṇe paro CL : athānuṣṇaparo HPS : athānuṣṇaḥ paro Vaidya, Bhatt.; mi
 CDNP, Vaidya : ma Bhatt.

18b de NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: do CD

19a brtag NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: btags CD

20a yatra CL : trāyo Vaidya, Bhatt.; gañ la dños de rnams NP : gañ na dños de rnams
 CD : gsum dños de gzan rnams Vaidya, Bhatt.

21d sbyar CDNP, Bhatt.: spyar Vaidya

22a lta DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: blta C; b byar 'gyur na NP, Vaidya : byar 'gyur ba CD :
 bya bar 'gyur Bhatt.

17. If that [fuel] which is overpowered, however, becomes hot, why doesn't it become fire? Alternatively, if it does not become hot, it is impossible [for you to claim that] there is another thing inside fire [that is not hot and not dependent on fire].
18. If the atom [of fire] does not possess fuel, fire exists without fuel. Alternatively, if it were to possess fuel, the atom would not be one in nature.
19. Each thing that is examined lacks unity; and since a thing that is one [in nature] does not exist, things that are plural [in nature] also do not exist.
20. If you think that there is one where there are no other things, then, since threeness exists universally, oneness does not exist.
21. 'Existence, non-existence, [both] existence and non-existence, and neither existence nor non-existence' – this is the progressive method that intelligent people should apply constantly in regard to unity, and so forth.
22. Just as one might say that a permanent thing exists if the continuum (*saṃtāna*) is perceived wrongly, similarly, one might say that a thing exists if the combination of causes and conditions (*hetupratyayasāmagrī*) is perceived wrongly.

19. The same analysis of *eka/aneka* occurs in ŚS, 7 and RĀ I, 71.
20. Refutation of the Sāṃkhya tenet of the three *guṇas* as the constituents of *mūla-prakṛti*. *Śataka*, III-IV, however, and Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 510) refer to *dravyatva*, *ekatva* and *sattva*. May also refers to *dravya*, *guṇa* and *karma*.
21. Discussed by Ruegg (1977), p. 9.
22. Candrakīrti (D f.200a, P f. 249a) compares the *saṃtāna* to the flame of a lamp; cf. PP, p. 588 on MK, XXVII, 22 and *Milindapañha*, p. 40.

23. | gañ la brten nas 'byuñ yod pa | de ni rañ dbaṅ mi 'gyur ro |
 | 'di kun rañ dbaṅ med pa ste | des na bdag ni yod ma yin |
24. | 'bras bu med par dños po ni | kun la 'du ba yod ma yin |
 | 'bras bu'i don du 'du ba gañ | de ni 'phags la ma 'dus pa'o |
25. | srid pa'i sa bon rnam śes te | yul rnam de yi spyod yul lo |
 | yul la bdag med mthoñ na ni | srid pa'i sa bon 'gag par 'gyur |

rnaḥ 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las mtha 'dzin pa dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab tu
 byed pa bcu bži pa'o ||

XV. *'Dus byas kyi don dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste |*

1. | tha mar med pa skye bar 'gyur | des na med pa ga la skye |
 | yod pa gdod nas skye 'gyur ba | des na yod pa ga la skye |
2. | 'bras bu yis ni rgyu bśig pa | des na med pa skye mi 'gyur |
 | grub pa las sgrub yod ma yin | de phyir yod pa'añ mi skye'o |

23b ni CDNP, Bhatt.: na Vaidya
 24d la CDNP, Vaidya : pa Bhatt.
 25c na CDP, Bhatt.: nas D, Vaidya

1c gdod nas CD : 'dod nas NP, Vaidya : gdod mar Bhatt.; c skye CD, Bhatt.: skyes
 NP, Vaidya

2c la grub Bhatt.: las grub NP : las sgrub CD; d pa'añ NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: pa CD

23. What has arisen in dependence is not independent (*svatantra*). This [the aggregates, and so forth,] all lacks independent reality; consequently, self[-nature] does not exist.
24. A thing cannot at all be a union without [at the same time] being an effect. That union which exists in the form of an effect is not [a really existent] union according to the saints (*ārya*).
25. Consciousness is the seed of [the cycle of] existence. Sense objects are the sphere of its activity. Were selflessness perceived in all sense objects, the seed of [the cycle of] existence would cease.

XV. Showing the Realization of the Refutation of Conditioned Things

1. [If you claim that] the non-existent will arise in the end, [we reply:] From what will the non-existent arise? [If you claim that] the existent arises in the beginning, [we reply:] From what will the existent arise?
2. The effect destroys the cause; for this reason, the non-existent does not arise. There is no establishment of something that is [already] established; for this reason, the existent also does not arise.

23. Cf. YŚ, 19. On *sarva* as referring to *sarve dharmāḥ* see Lindtner (1982), p. 143, n. 7 (ref.). Quoted in Wayman (1978) pp. 270, 377 and in Hopkins (1983), p. 632.
24. Since cause and effect are interdependent, the union, being an effect, does not exist by virtue of its own-nature (*svabhāvataḥ*) and is, therefore, not truly existent.
25. On *vijñānabīja* see *Traité*, III, p. 1151, n. 3 (ref.). Quoted in Buddhapālita's *Mūla-madhyamakavṛtti* (ed. Lindtner), p. 195; in Wayman (1978), pp. 264, 394; and in Hopkins (1983), pp. 30, 556.

- 1-2. Refutation of *satkārya/asatkārya*; cf. XI, 15 above and **Śataka*, 178c-179a (*Śata-sāstra*, pp. 70-71); MK, VII, 20; and ŚS, 4.

3. | de tshe skye ba yod min źiñ | gźan tshe skye ba yod ma yin |
| de tshe gźan tshe mi skye na | nam źig skye ba yod par 'gyur |
4. | de la de yi dños po ru | ji ltar skye ba yod min ltar |
| de bźin gźan gyi dños por yañ | de la skye ba yod ma yin |
5. | thog ma bar dañ tha ma rnams | skye ba'i sña rol srid ma yin |
| gñis gñis dag ni med pa ru | ji ltar re re rtsom par 'gyur |
6. | gźan gyi dños po med par ni | bdag gi dños po 'byuñ ba med |
| de yi phyir na bdag gźan ni | gñis ka las 'byuñ yod ma yin |
7. | sñon dañ phyis dañ cig car źes | brjod pa ñid du mi nus pa |
| de phyir skye dañ bum pa la | cig car 'byuñ ba yod ma yin |
8. | sñar skyes pa yi phyir na ni | sñar skyes rñiñ par mi 'gyur źiñ |
| phyi nas kun tu skyes pa yañ | phyi nas skyes par mi 'gyur ro |
9. | da ltar ba yi dños po ni | de ñid las 'byuñ ma yin źiñ |
| ma 'oñs las 'byuñ yod min la | 'das pa las kyañ yod ma yin |

5d ji CDNP, Bhatt.: ci Vaidya

6d gñis ka las 'byuñ NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gñis las 'byuñ ba CD

7a źes CNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ces D; de CDNP, Vaidya: de'i Bhatt.

8b rñiñ DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: rñiñs C

3. At that time [when it has already originated], there is no origination (*utpāda*) and at another time [when it has not], there is no origination. If there is no origination at that time or at another time, when will origination exist?
4. Just as that [thing] does not arise in that [very] form [which it already has], similarly, that [same] thing does not arise in another form.
5. Beginning, middle, and end are not possible before [a conditioned thing's] origination. When any two do not occur, how will any one occur?
6. Self-nature does not occur without other-nature. Therefore, there is no coming into existence from these two: self and another.
7. It is not possible to speak of before, afterwards, or simultaneity. Therefore, the [marked thing] pot and [the mark] origination do not occur at the same time.
8. Because it has [already] arisen before, something that has [already] arisen before does not become old. On the other hand, something that will have arisen later does not become [old either], inasmuch as it will have arisen later.
9. A present thing does not occur on account of this very present. It does not occur on account of the future nor does it occur on account of the past.

3. There is no origination either of a thing that has an already established nature or of a thing that has no such nature. Candrakīrti (D f.222b, P f.253a) comments: *gañ gi tshe myu gu 'di bdag gi dños po rñed pa yin pa de'i tshe ni grub pa'i ño bo yin pa'i phyir 'di la skye ba mi srid do || gañ gi tshe 'di ma grub pa'i ño bo yin pa'i dus der yañ 'di skye ba mi rigs te | ma grub pa ni med pa ñid kyis rten med pa'i skye ba'i bya ba ma 'byuñ gñan gyi tshe skye ba mi srid do ||* cf. Dharmapāla's commentary in Tucci (1925), p. 558, n. 1.
4. A thing that has its own nature (milk, for example) cannot change and become something that has a different nature (curds); cf. MK, XIII, 4-6, XV, 4-5.
- 5-7. Interdependent nature of the three marks; cf. **Sataka*, 178b-c (*Śataśāstra*, pp.67-68); MK, VII, 2; RĀ, I, 65, 69-70. On the interdependence of *svabhāva/parabhāva* see also MK, I, 1, 3, XV, 1-4 and CS, II, 11.
8. Again refutation of the possibility of change; cf. MK, XIII, 5.
9. The present thing does not come into existence by itself, since cause and effect do not exist simultaneously, nor does it come into existence from a non-existent cause, namely, past and future.

10. | skyes pa la ni 'on ba dan | de bzin 'gags la 'gro ba med |
 | de lta yin na ci lta bur | srid pas sgyu ma 'dra ma yin |
11. utpādashitibhaṅgānām yugapan nāsti sambhavaḥ |
 kramaśaḥ sambhavo nāsti sambhavo vidyate kadā ||
 | skye dan gnas dan 'jig pa rnams | cig car 'byun ba yod min zin |
 | rim kyis 'byun ba'an yod min na | nam zig 'byun ba yod par 'gyur |
12. | skye ba la sogs thams cad la | slar yan thams cad 'byun ba ste |
 | de phyir 'jig pa skye 'dra zin | gnas pa 'jig dan 'dra bar snañ |
13. | mtshan las mtshan gzi gzan ze na | mtshan gzi mi rtag nid gan las |
 | yan na bzi ga'an yod pa yi | no bor gsal bar yod ma yin |
14. na bhāvāḥ jāyate bhāvo bhāvo 'bhāvān na jāyate |
 nābhāvāḥ jāyate 'bhāvo 'bhāvo bhāvān na jāyate ||
 | dnos po dnos las mi skye ste | dnos po dnos med las mi skye |
 | dnos med dnos med mi skye ste | dnos med dnos las mi skye 'o |
15. | dnos po dnos por mi 'gyur te | dnos med dnos por mi 'gyur ro |
 | dnos med dnos med mi 'gyur te | dnos po dnos med mi 'gyur ro |

10b 'gags DP, Bhatt. : 'gag CN, Vaidya; ci NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ji CD

11b cig car CD, Bhatt.: cig char NP, Vaidya

12a skye ba la sogs NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: skye la sogs pa CD; c de phyir CDNP, Vaidya :
 de las Bhatt.

13a mtshan las mtshan gzi CD, Bhatt. : mtshan dan mtshuns med NP, Vaidya; b gan las
 CD : ga las NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.; c bzi CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gzi N; ga'an yod pa yi
 CDNP, Vaidya : ga yan yod pa'i Bhatt.

14a las DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: la C

10. What has arisen has no coming; similarly, what has ceased has no going. If this is so, then isn't [the cycle of] existence like an illusion?
11. Origination, duration, and destruction do not occur simultaneously nor do they occur sequentially. When is there [their] occurrence?
12. For each [mark], beginning with origination, each [of the three marks] will again occur. Consequently, destruction appears like origination and duration appears like destruction.
13. If the marked thing is different from the mark, how is the marked thing impermanent? Alternatively, [if they are identical,] clearly these four [namely, the three marks and the marked thing] have no real existence.
14. An existent thing does not arise from an existent thing. An existent thing does not arise from a non-existent thing. A non-existent thing does not arise from a non-existent thing. A non-existent thing does not arise from an existent thing.
15. An existent thing does not become existent. A non-existent thing does not become existent. A non-existent thing does not become non-existent. An existent thing does not become non-existent.

10. Cf. RĀ, II, 13ab: *tathā māyopamo loko naiti yāti na kutra cit* |; quoted in Wayman (1978), p. 213.
11. Discussed by Murti (1960), p. 192; cf. **Śataka*, 178b-c (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 67-68).
12. Refutation of the thesis that each *lakṣaṇa* has a secondary mark (*anulakṣaṇa*); discussed by Murti (1960), p. 193. See also **Śataka*, 168c, 178b-c (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 7, 68) and May, p. 107, n. 259 (ref.), on the infinite regress of *lakṣaṇa*.
13. The four (the 3 *lakṣaṇa* and the *lakṣya*) are neither identical nor different.
- 14-15. Refutation of the origination of *bhāva/abhāva* from causes either like or unlike themselves. MK, XXI, 21 = v. 14. Candrakīrti (D f.226a-b, P f.257a-b) comments that an already existent sprout does not arise from the transformation of an existent seed nor does the sprout arise from a seed destroyed by fire. A non-existent entity, for example, a barren woman's son, never arises. Cf. **Śataka*, 179a-b (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 71-72).

16. jāyamānārdhajātātṽāj jāyamāno na jāyate |
 atha vā jāyamānatvaṃ sarvasyaiva prasajyate ||
 | skye bžin pa ni phyed skyes phyir | skyes bžin pa ni skye mi 'gyur |
 | yañ na thams cad skye bžin pa | ñid ni yin par thal bar 'gyur |
17. | skye bžin pa yi bdag ñid du | bya ba skye bžin par mi 'gyur |
 | skye bžin pa yi bdag ñid du | mi bya'añ skye bžin par mi 'gyur |
18. + + + + + + + + + + + + + + bhavaḥ |
 jāyamāno na tasyāsti syāt tasyāpy antaraṃ yataḥ ||
 | gañ gi gñis po bar med par | srid pa yod pa ma yin pa |
 | de la skye bžin pa med de | gañ phyir de la'añ bar yod phyir |
19. jāyamānanirodhena jāta utpadyate yataḥ |
 tato 'nyasyāpi sadbhāvo jāyamānasya dṛśyate ||
 | gañ gi phyir na skye bžin pa | 'gags pas skyes pa skye 'gyur ba |
 | de yi phyir na skye bžin pa | gžan yañ yod pa'i ño bor snañ |
20. jāto yadā tadā nāsti jāyamānasya sambhavaḥ |
 jāta utpadyate kasmāj jāyamāno yadā tadā ||
 | gañ tshe skyes pa de yi tshe | skye bžin pa la srid pa med |
 | gañ tshe skyes pa skye bžin na | de tshe ci phyir skye bar 'gyur |
21. ajāto jāta ity eva jāyamānaḥ kutaḥ kila |
 bhedābhāvād (ghaṭo 'bhāvas) tadā kiṃ na vikalpyate ||
 | skye bžin pa ni ma skyes pa | kho na skye'o žes par grags |
 | khyad par med phyir de yi tshe | bum pa med par cis mi rtog |
22. aniṣpanno 'py ajātāt tu jāyamāno bahiṣkṛtaḥ |
 tathāpi jāyate 'jāto yato jātād bahiṣkṛtaḥ ||
 | skye bžin pa ni ma rdzogs kyañ | ma skyes pa las phyi rol gyur |
 | de lta'añ gañ phyir skyes pa las | phyi rol gyur phyir ma skyes skye |

16a ni CDNP, Bhatt.: yi Vaidya; phyed NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: byed C

18c pa NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: po CD

19b pas CD, Bhatt.: pa NP, Vaidya

21a eva Vaidya, Bhatt.: evam HPS; b kutaḥ HPS, Vaidya : kṛtaḥ Bhatt.; 'o žes par grags NP, Vaidya: žes bya bar grag CD : žes byas par grags Bhatt.; c ghaṭo 'bhāvas Vaidya, Bhatt.: ghaṭābhāvas HPS; d par CDNP, Vaidya : pa Bhatt.

22b gyur DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'gyur C; d skye CNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: te D

16. Something in the process of arising (*jāyamāna*) does not arise, since something in the process of arising is [only] half-arisen. Alternatively, [if the past or future is maintained to be in the process of arising,] it would follow that everything, in fact, is in the process of arising.
17. Activity (*kriyā*) is not the process of arising in that [thing] which has the nature of being in the process of arising. On the other hand, non-activity is not the process of arising in that [thing] which has the nature of being in the process of arising.
18. There is no [such thing as the] process of arising for someone who does not accept the two [past and future] without a [present] intermediate state (*antara*), since even this [present process of arising] would also have an intermediate state.
19. [You claim:] Since what has arisen (*jāta*) comes forth from the cessation of the process of arising, the real existence of something else also which is in the process of arising is seen.
20. [We reply:] When what has arisen exists, there is no [further] occurrence of the process of arising. Once what is in the process of arising has arisen, from what can it come forth [again]?
21. How can one say that the process of arising is the unarisen having arisen? Because there is no difference, why not imagine that a non-existent [pot] is a pot?
22. [You claim:] Although the process of arising has not been completed, it must be excluded from what has not arisen. [We reply:] Nevertheless, it must be the unarisen that arises, since it [the process of arising] is excluded from what has arisen.

16. Quoted in PP, p. 80; cf. **Śataka*, 169a (*Śataśāstra*, p. 8).

17-24. The refutation of the origination of a thing in relation to the completed past (*jāta*), the uncomplete future (*ajāta*), or an intermediate state presently in the process of completion (*utpadyamāna*) is based upon the method Nāgārjuna uses to refute movement in MK, II.

23. nāsīt prāg jāyamāno 'pi paścāc ca kila vidyate |
 tenāpi jāyate 'jāto nābhūto nāma jāyate ||
 | skye bzin pa snar ma byuñ yañ | phyi nas yod pa min par grag |
 | des kyañ ma skyes pa skye ste | ma byuñ zes bya skye ma yin |

24. jāyate 'stīti niṣpanno nāstīty akṛta ucyate |
 jāyamāno yadābhāvas tadā ko nāma sa smṛtaḥ ||
 | rdzogs pa yod ces byar 'gyur la | ma byas pa ni med ces brjod |
 | gañ gi tshe na skye bzin pa | med pa de tshe gañ der brjod |

25. kāraṇavyatirekeṇa yadā kāryaṃ na vidyate |
 pravṛttiś ca nivṛttiś ca tadā naivopapadyate ||
 | gañ tshe rgyu ni ma gtogs par | 'bras bu yod pa ma yin pa |
 | de yi tshe na 'jug pa dañ | ldog pa 'thad pa ñid mi 'gyur |

rnañ 'byor spyod pa bži brgya pa las 'dus byas kyi don dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa ste rab
 tu byed pa bco lña pa'o ||

XVI. *sLob dpon slob ma rnam par gtan la dbab pa bstan pa ste* |

1. kena cid hetunā śūnyam aśūnyam iva dṛśyate |
 tasya prakaraṇaiḥ sarvaiḥ pratiśedho vidhīyate ||
 | rgyu 'ga' žig gis stoñ pa yañ | stoñ pa min pa lta bur snañ |
 | rab tu byed pa thams cad kyis | de ni so sor 'gog par byed |

2. yadā vaktāsti vācyaṃ ca na śūnya(m iti yujyate) |
 + + + + + + + + + + + + + + ||
 | gañ tshe smra po brjod bya na'añ | stoñ pa zes byar mi ruñ ño |
 | gañ žig brten nas kun 'byuñ ba | de ni gsum la'añ yod ma yin |

3. | gal te stoñ pa'i ñes pa yis | stoñ pa ma yin 'grub 'gyur na |
 | mi stoñ ñes pas stoñ pa ñid | ci ste 'grub par 'gyur ma yin |

23b min NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: yin CD

24c yadābhāvas : yadā bhāvas HPS, Vaidya : yadā nāsti Bhatt.

1c kyis CD, Bhatt. : kyi NP, Vaidya; d de DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: 'di C; so sor CDNP,
 Vaidya: sor sor Bhatt.

2b iti yujyate Bhatt.: nāma yujyate Vaidya; c žig CDNP, Bhatt.: gis Vaidya

23. [You claim:] Even though the process of arising did not exist before, it is said [by us] to exist afterwards; and for this reason, we say that the unarisen arises. [We reply:] What is non-existent (*abhūta*) surely does not arise.
24. About the completed it is said, 'It exists'; about the uncompleted it is said, 'It does not exist'. When the process of arising is non-existent, what, indeed, is it said to be?
25. When there is no effect apart from a cause, both activity and inactivity are impossible.

XVI. Showing the Discussion between the Teacher and his Student

1. For some reason, what is empty is seen as if it were not empty. All the [preceding] chapters refute that.
2. Objection: Since the disputant, his subject and [his assertions] exist, it is not logical to say that [everything] is empty. Reply: That [own-nature] on which they arise in dependence does not exist in any of these three.
3. If [you think that things] can be established as not empty because it is an error (*doṣa*) that they are empty, why should they not be established as empty because it is an error that they are not empty?

25. Since cause and effect have no independent existence, *pravṛtti* (glossed as *kāryas-yotpāda* by Candrakīrti, HPS, p. 513) has no substratum (*nirāśraya*).

1. Candrakīrti (HPS, p. 514) explains that belief in a self leads people to view the world as if it were not empty: *ahaṃkāramamakārasnehaviparyasto hi loko 'nitya eva vastuni kṣaṇabhaṅgadarśanāt saṃskāramātrapravāhasya samyagarthān avasāyāc chūnyatādarśanavibandhabhūtām nityatām avadhārya pratyavatiṣṭhamāno jagad aśūnyam eva pratipannaḥ* |.
2. Because the disputant, his subject matter and his assertions are mutually dependent, all three are *asvabhāva*; cf. VV, 22. Cf. *Bhāṣya* to *Nyāyasūtra*, I. 1.1.
- 3-5. If, as the opponent (or the student assuming his role, as the chapter title suggests) claims, the refutation of the *parapakṣa* entails the affirmation of the *svapakṣa*, the Mādhyamikas' refutation of *aśūnya* should establish *śūnya*. Nevertheless, *śūnyatā* is not a real *pakṣa* nor are any of the theses – identity, difference, or indeterminability – of the Mādhyamikas' opponents. Cf. **Śataka*, 180a-181a (*Śataśāstra*, pp. 82-83); MK, XXIV, 13; VV, 18-19, 68.

4. | gžan gyi phyogs ni bzlog pa dañ | rañ gi phyogs ni bsgrub pa ste |
| gal te sun 'byin byed phyogs gcig | dga' na sgrub byed la cis min |
5. | gal te yons su brtags pa na | med gañ de phyogs mi 'gyur na |
| des na gcig ñid la sogs gsum | kun kyañ phyogs ma yin par 'gyur |
6. | gañ du mñon sum gyis bum der | stoñ pa'i gtan tshigs don med
| 'gyur |
| 'di na gžan lugs las byuñ ba'i | gtan tshigs yod min gžan du yod |
7. | mi stoñ med par stoñ pa ni | gañ las 'byuñ ba ñid du 'gyur |
| ji lta bur na cig šos ni | med par gñen po 'byuñ bar 'gyur |
8. | gal te phyogs ñid du 'gyur na | phyogs med phyogs kyi ño bo
| 'gyur |
| de ltar phyogs med ñid med na | gañ žig mi mthun phyogs su
| 'gyur |
9. | gal te dños po yod min na | me ni tsha bar ji ltar 'gyur |
| tsha ba me yañ yod min žes | goñ ñid du ni bzlog par byas |
10. | dños po mthoñ nas dños po ni | med pa žes bya bzlog 'gyur na |
| de ltar phyogs ni bži char la | ñes pa spañs pa gañ žig mthoñ |

4a gyi DNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gyis C; c gcig C, Bhatt.: cig DNP, Vaidya; d dga' CD,
Bhatt.: gañ NP, Vaidya

6c gžan lugs Bhatt.: gžan lug NP, Vaidya : gžuñ lugs CD

7b 'byuñ CD, Bhatt.: byuñ NP, Vaidya; d po CDNP, Bhatt.: bo Vaidya

9b ji CNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: ci D; d goñ CDNP, Bhatt.: gañ Vaidya

4. Objection: The refutation of the opponent's thesis (*parapakṣa*) also has established one's own thesis (*svapakṣa*). If you approve of a refutative (*dūṣaṇa*) thesis, why don't you approve of a probative (*sadhāna*) [thesis]?
5. Reply: If that which does not exist when critically examined cannot be a thesis, the three [speculative theories], beginning with identity (*ekatvādi*), cannot be theses at all.
6. Objection: [In a system] in which a pot is directly perceptible, the argument that it is empty serves no purpose. Reply: Here [in our system], an argument (*hetu*) that comes from our opponent[']s system] is not [valid]; it is [valid only] in the opponent[']s system].
7. Objection: How can something empty occur without something non-empty? How can a counterthesis (*pratipakṣa*) occur without something else opposed to it (*itara*)?
8. Reply: If [anything] could be a thesis, a non-thesis (*apakṣa*) would have the appearance of a thesis (*pakṣarūpa*). Since there is no non-thesis, what could be a counterthesis (*vipakṣa*)?
9. Objection: If a thing does not exist, how can fire be hot? Reply: The refutation that not even fire is hot is stated above.
10. If, after perceiving an existent thing (*bhāva*), that [very] thing is refuted as non-existent (*abhāva*), what thesis is experienced once the error in [all] four positions is rejected?

6. Cf. VV, 30 on the refutation of *pratyakṣa*. Arguments based on beliefs held by one's own school are ineffective against an opponent; cf. XIV, 5 cd above.
- 7-8. Since *sūnyatā* is not a *pakṣa*, there is no *pratipakṣa*; cf. **Śataka*, 181b (*Śataśāstra*, p. 85); MK, XIII, 7; RĀ, I, 72; II, 4.
9. The refutation of heat and fire occurs above, XIV, 16-17. The Chinese translation adds that these two are *saṃvṛti* (su), not *paramārtha* (chen).
10. The four positions are those of the *catuskoṭi*. In this verse and v.25 below each position is rejected; cf. CS, III, 23.

11. | rdul phran la yañ yod pa'i dños | gañ du med der ji ltar 'byuñ |
| sañs rgyas rnams la med ñid kyañ | de ñid phyir na ma 'brel ba'o |
12. | gal te kun la gñis min na | gžan gañ žig la yod dños yod |
| gal te khyod la'añ de rigs na | brgal ba gžan po ci ste byed |
13. | dños po kun gyi dños med la | rnam par dbye ba mi rigs te |
| rdzas rnams kun la gañ mthoñ ba | de ni rnam dbyer mi 'gyur ro |
14. | med phyir gžan gyi phyogs la lan | brjod pa min par grags na ni |
| gtan tshigs kyis bzlog rañ phyogs kyañ | ci yi phyir na sgrub mi
'gyur |
15. | sun 'byin byed pa'i gtan tshigs rñed | sla žes 'jig rten brjod na yañ |
| gžan gyi phyogs la skyon brjod pa | ñid du ci yi phyir mi nus |

11d ba'o CDP, Bhatt.: pa'o Vaidya

12d brgal ba CDP, Bhatt.: brgyal pa Vaidya

14b min DNP, Vaidya : med Bhatt.

15b sla CD, Bhatt.: bla NP : Vaidya omits sla/bla; brjod na yañ CDP : na brjod na Vaidya, Bhatt.

11. [In a system] in which there is no real existence even in an atom, how can that [real existence] occur? For the Buddhas, even non-existence [which depends upon existence], for that reason, is not implied (*apratibaddha*).
12. If non-duality (*advaya*) exists in all [things], what other thing could possess real existence? If this [doctrine of non-duality] is acceptable even to you, how can [you] the opponent criticize [us]?
13. When all things are non-existent, it is not logically possible to make distinctions [among them]. That [non-existence] which is seen in all substances (*dravya*) cannot distinguish [them].
14. If [our opponent] says that we cannot refute an opponent's thesis because [according to us] there is no [thesis], [we reply:] How can your own thesis be established since [you try to] refute [us] with arguments?
15. When people say that it is easy [for us] to find arguments that refute [others], [we ask:] Why is it not possible [for them] to state the error in [their] opponent's [namely, our] thesis?

11-13. Refutation of the true existence of things; even atoms, the subtlest things, cannot be characterized as *sadbhāva*. All things are *advaya* and thus there are no real dualistic distinctions such as *sat/asa*. Candrakīrti (D f. 234b, P f. 268a) comments that, based upon a non-affirming negation (*prasajyapratishedha*), the lack of own-nature is the one nature of all things; and a nature that is perceived in all substances cannot serve to differentiate them: *rgyu dañ rkyen las skyes pa'i phyir rañ bžin byas pa can ñid du thal ba'i phyir dños po rñams kyi rañ bžin gañ yin pa de ni rgyu med pa can kho na yin la rgyu med pa la yañ yod pa ñid mi srid pas med par dgag pa la bñen nas dños po med pa kho na rañ bžin yin te dños po ma yin pa'i phyir rò || de' i phyir rañ bžin 'di thams cad la dbyer med pa'i ño bo yin pa'i phyir dños po thams cad rañ bžin gyis ma skyes par rañ gi ño bo gcig pa ste | 'di lta ste dños po med pa'i rañ bžin gyi ño bo || ... rdzas thams cad la gañ žig mñhoñ ba yañ rdzas tha dad par rñam par bžag par mi nus ||* He then quotes CS, XIII, 16. Cf. **Śāntaka*, 181b-c (*Satasāstra*, p. 86); MK, XV, 6-7.

- 14-15. The opponent claims that the Mādhyamikas' refutation of the *parapakṣa* cannot be sustained, since refutation presupposes the existence of a real object to be refuted. Āryadeva responds that the opponent's affirmation of the *svapakṣa* cannot be sustained either, since its establishment depends upon the refutation of emptiness, which the opponent must now presuppose as a real object to be refuted.

16. | yod ces bya ba tsam žig gis | gal te de ñid dños yod na |
 | med ces bya ba tsam žig gis | med par yañ ni cis mi 'gyur |
17. | gañ phyir yod bdog ces miñ btags | de phyir med par mi 'gyur na |
 | gañ phyir yod ces miñ byas pa | de phyir yod par mi 'gyur ro |
18. | gal te thams cad 'jig rten pas | brjod pas 'jig rten pa yod na |
 | dños gañ de ñid du yod pa | de ni 'jig rten par cis 'gyur |
19. | gal te dños kun med pa'i phyir | med pa ñid du 'gyur na ni |
 | de lta yin dañ phyogs rnam kun | dños po med par mi rigs so |
20. | dños po med phyir dños med la | srid pa yod par mi 'gyur ro |
 | dños po med par dños po ni | med par gañ las 'grub par 'gyur |
21. | stoñ pa gtan tshigs las 'gyur ba | de phyir stoñ par mi 'gyur na |
 | dam bca' gtan tshigs las gžan ni | ma yin des na gtan tshigs med |

17a miñ btags CD, Bhatt.: mi gtags NP, Vaidya; c miñ D, Bhatt. : mi NP, Vaidya : min C

19b 'gyur CD, Bhatt.: gyur NP, Vaidya; c lta CDNP, Vaidya : lta Bhatt.

20d gañ las CDNP, Vaidya : ga la Bhatt.

21a 'gyur CDP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: gyur pa N

16. If a thing really exists simply because [an opponent] says that it exists, why isn't it non-existent simply because [we] say that it does not exist?
 17. Objection: Since we use the term 'existing', [it exists or refers to something existent]; therefore, it is not the case that [everything] does not exist. Reply: Since the term 'existing' is created [and thus dependent] it does not [really] exist.
 18. If everything, because it is expressed in worldly [language], exists [only] on a worldly [level], how can a thing that really exists [ever] exist on a worldly [level]?
 19. Objection: If [you claim that] all things are, in fact, non-existent because they do not [really] exist, then, if this is so, it is not logical that *all* theses [including yours] are non-existent!
 20. Reply: Because there is no existent thing (*bhāva*), it is not possible that there is a non-existent thing (*abhāva*) either. How could a non-existent thing be established without [the negation of] an existent thing?
 21. Objection: Emptiness is [established] by means of [your] arguments; therefore, [your arguments] cannot be empty. Reply: The thesis is not different from the argument [that is, both are empty]; therefore, the argument does not [really] exist.
- 16-18. The use of ordinary language (*vyavahāra*) cannot prove that the things referred to really exist. The names that characterize things, for example, existent, non-existent, are mutually dependent and therefore empty. Cf. VV, 9-10, 58-59; ŚS, 1-2.
- 19-20. The opponent argues that the Mādhyamikas' refutation of all things is a nihilist position (*nāstika*). Candrakīrti (D f.236a-b, P f.270a) explains that such an interpretation is unjustified: *gal te bdag dños po bkag pa las yod pa ñid dan 'gal ba ñid khas len par 'gyur na ni de'i tshe bdag gis smra ba thams cad sel ba bsgrubs par mi 'gyur te med pa ñid du smra ba sin tu tha chad pa khas blañs pa'i phyir ro* | The negation again is of the *prasajyapratishedha* variety. Āryadeva's reply emphasizes the interdependent establishment of *bhāva/abhāva*; cf. **Śataka*, 181b-c (*Śataśāstra*, p. 86); MK, XV, 5.
- 21-22. The opponent contends that the Mādhyamikas' use of arguments (*hetu*) and examples (*dṛṣṭānta*) in debate implies that not all things are empty. Āryadeva replies that both the *pratijñā* and the *hetu* are similarly empty and the *hetu*, being *sādhyaśama*, is not a real *hetu* and therefore cannot establish anything. Nevertheless, some examples are more appropriate than others. Candrakīrti (D f. 237a, P f.271a) says that if the *dṛṣṭānta* is related to the *hetu*, then since the *hetu* has already been refuted, there is no need to refute the *dṛṣṭānta* separately. Alternatively, if the *dṛṣṭānta* is not related to the *hetu*, it cannot establish the *pratijñā*, just as the *dṛṣṭānta* of a black crow is irrelevant in establishing that the self is black. Cf. VV, 1, 3, 21, 24-28.

22. | gañ phyir stoñ pa'i dpe yod pa | des na stoñ par mi 'gyur na |
 | bya rog ji ltar de bzin du | bdag kyañ nag ces brjod nus sam |
23. | gal te rañ bzin gyis dños yod | stoñ mthoñ yon tan ci žig yod |
 | rtog pas mthoñ ba 'chiñ ba ste | de ni 'di ru dgag par bya |
24. | gcig yod gcig med ces bya ba | de ñid min 'jig rten pa'añ min |
 | des na 'di yod 'di ces med | brjod pa ñid du nus ma yin |
25. sad asat sadasac ceti yasya pakṣo na vidyate |
 upālabhaś cireṇāpi tasya vaktum na śakyate ||
 | yod dañ med dañ yod med ces | gañ la phyogs ni yod min pa |
 | de la yun ni riñ po na'añ | klan ka brjod par nus ma yin |
- slob dpon slob ma rnam par gtan la dbab pa bstan pa ste rab tu byed pa bcu drug pa'o ||

22b des na CDNP, Vaidya : de ni Bhatt.; c ltar Bhatt.: lta CDNP, Vaidya

23c rtog CD, Bhatt.: rtogs NP, Vaidya; d dgag CDNP, Vaidya: 'gag Bhatt.

24b de ñid NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: de CD; pa'añ NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: pa yañ CD; c ces
 CDNP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: cis DT

25d klan NP, Vaidya, Bhatt.: glan CD

22. Objection: Since there are examples of empty [things which you use], the examples are not empty. Reply: [There are good and bad examples, in a relative sense;] for example, it is hardly possible to say that the self is black, like a crow!
23. If everything exists by its own-nature, what would be the benefit of perceiving the emptiness [of things]? When one perceives [things] through conceptual constructions, there is bondage. That [bondage] must be stopped here [in our system].
24. To say, 'One [thing] exists, another does not' – this is neither [valid] on the ultimate level nor on the worldly level. Consequently, one certainly cannot say, 'That [thing] exists, but this does not exist.'
25. No criticism can be leveled against someone who does not hold a thesis, be it [about] existence, non-existence, or [both] existence and non-existence, even if [you try] for a long time!

23. Quoted in Wayman (1978), p. 268. Cf. **Śataka*, 181c (*Śataśāstra*, p. 87). Candrakīrti (D f.237b, P f. 271a) points out that instruction on emptiness is given in order to teach about truth: *ston pa ñid ñe bar bstan pa ni de kho na ñid bstan par bya ba'i phyir yin la* | On the soteriological purpose of emptiness see F. Streng, *Emptiness – A Study in Religious Meaning*, Nashville, 1967, pp. 155-180 *passim*.
24. The predication of existence to one thing and non-existence to another is not in accord with either ultimate truth or ordinary usage, as Candrakīrti (D f.238a-b, P f.272b) explains: *gañ gi tshe 'jig rten pa'i dños po bśad par 'dod pa de'i tshe phyi nañ gi don gyi dbye bas phuñ po lha char yañ 'jig rten pa'i rtog pa tshad mar byas te khas blañ bar bya la* | *gañ gi tshe 'jig rten las 'das pa'i de kho na ñid rnam par bśad par 'dod pa de'i tshe ni phags pa'i ye śes la bltos nas phuñ po lha char yañ rañ bñin gyis ston par bśad par bya'o* || Cf. **Śataka*, 181c-182a (*Śataśāstra*, p. 88) and MK, XXIV, 8-10.
25. Quoted in PP, p. 16, in Wayman (1978), pp. 289, 300-301 and in Hopkins (1983), p. 585; cf. VV, 29.

Concordance *Catuhṣataka* – *Catuhṣatakaṭīkā* (Derge and Peking editions)

| CŚ | CŚT-D | CŚT-P | CŚ | CŚT-D | CŚT-P |
|------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| I,1 | 32a2 | 34b8 | 20 | 54a4 | 58a6 |
| 2 | 33a7 | 36a6 | 21 | 54b2 | 58b5 |
| 3 | 34a3 | 37a2 | 22 | 54b7 | 59a3 |
| 4 | 34b7 | 37b6 | 23 | 55a7 | 59b4 |
| 5 | 35b1 | 38a7 | 24 | 56a2 | 60a7 |
| 6 | 36a2 | 39a1 | 25 | 56b3 | 60b5 |
| 7 | 36b2 | 39b1 | | | |
| 8 | 36b7 | 39b7 | III,1 | 62b7 | 67b6 |
| 9 | 37a6 | 40a7 | 2 | 63a6 | 68a5 |
| 10 | 38a2 | 41a2 | 3 | 63b7 | 68b7 |
| 11 | 38b6 | 41b6 | 4 | 64b5 | 69b6 |
| 12 | 39a4 | 42a4 | 5 | 65a3 | 70a5 |
| 13 | 39b3 | 42b3 | 6 | 65b1 | 70b2 |
| 14 | 40a2 | 43a2 | 7 | 66a1 | 71a3 |
| 15 | 40a5 | 43a7 | 8 | 66b1 | 71b3 |
| 16 | 40b5 | 43b7 | 9 | 67a2 | 72a7 |
| 17 | 41a3 | 44a5 | 10 | 67b2 | 72b6 |
| 18 | 41b3 | 44b5 | 11 | 68a6 | 73b3 |
| 19 | 42a2 | 45a5 | 12 | 69a1 | 74a6 |
| 20 | 42b4 | 45b7 | 13 | 69a7 | 74b5 |
| 21 | 43a4 | 46a8 | 14 | 69b7 | 75a6 |
| 22 | 43b4 | 46b8 | 15 | 70a7 | 75b6 |
| 23 | 44a3 | 47a8 | 16 | 70b6 | 76a6 |
| 24 | 44b1 | 47b6 | 17 | 71a4 | 76b4 |
| 25 | 44b6 | 48a5 | 18 | 71b3 | 77a4 |
| | | | 19 | 72a1 | 77b2 |
| II,1 | 45a5 | 48b3 | 20 | 72a7 | 77b8 |
| 2 | 45b6 | 49a5 | 21 | 72b7 | 78b1 |
| 3 | 46a7 | 49b8 | 22 | 73b1 | 79a4 |
| 4 | 47a1 | 50b1 | 23 | 74a5 | 80a2 |
| 5 | 47a6 | 50b8 | 24 | 74b3 | 80b2 |
| 6 | 47b6 | 51b1 | 25 | 75a6 | 81a6 |
| 7 | 48a4 | 51b7 | | | |
| 8 | 48b3 | 52a5 | IV,1 | 76a1 | 81b8 |
| 9 | 49a4 | 52b8 | 2 | 76b2 | 82b2 |
| 10 | 49b7 | 53b4 | 3 | 77a2 | 83a4 |
| 11 | 50a5 | 54a2 | 4 | 77a7 | 83b2 |
| 12 | 50b4 | 54b1 | 5 | 77b5 | 84a1 |
| 13 | 51a1 | 54b7 | 6 | 78a4 | 84a8 |
| 14 | 51a6 | 55a5 | 7 | 78b4 | 84b8 |
| 15 | 51b7 | 55b6 | 8 | 79a2 | 85a6 |
| 16 | 52a4 | 56a3 | 9 | 79b3 | 85b8 |
| 17 | 53a1 | 57a1 | 10 | 80a2 | 86a8 |
| 18 | 53a7 | 57b1 | 11 | 80b7 | 87b1 |
| 19 | 53b6 | 57b8 | 12 | 81a5 | 87b7 |

| | | | | | |
|------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|
| 13 | 81b4 | 88a7 | 8 | 111b3 | 123a4 |
| 14 | 82a7 | 89a4 | 9 | 112a5 | 123b8 |
| 15 | 83a6 | 90a5 | 10 | 112b6 | 124b4 |
| 16 | 83b5 | 90b5 | 11 | 113a5 | 125a4 |
| 17 | 84a5 | 91a6 | 12 | 113b4 | 125b4 |
| 18 | 85a5 | 92a8 | 13 | 114a2 | 126a3 |
| 19 | 85b4 | 92b8 | 14 | 114b4 | 126b7 |
| 20 | 86a4 | 93b2 | 15 | 115a2 | 127a5 |
| 21 | 86b1 | 93b7 | 16 | 115b1 | 127b5 |
| 22 | 87a4 | 94b5 | 17 | 115b7 | 128a6 |
| 23 | 87b7 | 95b1 | 18 | 116a5 | 128b5 |
| 24 | 88a5 | 95b8 | 19 | 116b3 | 129a3 |
| 25 | 88b6 | 96b3 | 20 | 117a4 | 129b6 |
| | | | 21 | 117b3 | 130a5 |
| V,1 | 89a7 | 97a5 | 22 | 118a1 | 130b5 |
| 2 | 90b4 | 98b7 | 23 | 118b2 | 131a8 |
| 3 | 91a6 | 99b2 | 24 | 119a4 | 132a4 |
| 4 | 92b5 | 101a5 | 25 | 119b3 | 132b4 |
| 5 | 93a6 | 101b7 | | | |
| 6 | 94b5 | 103b3 | VII,1 | 120a6 | 133b2 |
| 7 | 95b2 | 104b1 | 2 | 121a1 | 134a7 |
| 8 | 96a4 | 105a5 | 3 | 121a7 | 134b7 |
| 9 | 96b2 | 105b3 | 4 | 121b5 | 135a6 |
| 10 | 96b7 | 106a3 | 5 | 122b2 | 136a5 |
| 11 | 97b1 | 106b5 | 6 | 123a4 | 137a1 |
| 12 | 97b7 | 107a6 | 7 | 123b5 | 137b4 |
| 13 | 98a5 | 107b5 | 8 | 124a5 | 138a6 |
| 14 | 98b5 | 108a5 | 9 | 125a3 | 139a7 |
| 15 | 99a1 | 108b2 | 10 | 125b3 | 140a1 |
| 16 | 99b1 | 109a3 | 11 | 125b7 | 140a7 |
| 17 | 100b1 | 110a5 | 12 | 126a4 | 140b4 |
| 18 | 102a1 | 111b8 | 13 | 126b1 | 141a2 |
| 19 | 102a6 | 112a8 | 14 | 126b6 | 141b1 |
| 20 | 102b7 | 113a2 | 15 | 127a7 | 142a5 |
| 21 | 103a6 | 113b1 | 16 | 127b7 | 142b7 |
| 22 | 103b2 | 113b6 | 17 | 128a6 | 143a7 |
| 23 | 104a1 | 114a3 | 18 | 128b3 | 143b4 |
| 24 | 105a7 | 115b8 | 19 | 128b7 | 144a2 |
| 25 | 106a1 | 116b3 | 20 | 129a6 | 144b2 |
| | | | 21 | 129b7 | 145a6 |
| VI,1 | 107a6 | 118a4 | 22 | 130a7 | 145b7 |
| 2 | 108a3 | 119a3 | 23 | 130b5 | 146a3 |
| 3 | 109a3 | 120a6 | 24 | 131a4 | 146b6 |
| 4 | 109b4 | 120b8 | 25 | 131b4 | 147a7 |
| 5 | 110a1 | 121a5 | | | |
| 6 | 110a7 | 121b6 | VIII,1 | 132a4 | 147b8 |
| 7 | 111a2 | 122b2 | 2 | 132b6 | 148b5 |

| | | | | | |
|------|-------|-------|------|-------|-------|
| 3 | 133a5 | 149a4 | 24 | 157b3 | 176b6 |
| 4 | 133b5 | 149b5 | 25 | 158a2 | 177a6 |
| 5 | 134a5 | 150a5 | | | |
| 6 | 134b7 | 151a2 | X,1 | 159a2 | 178a8 |
| 7 | 135a5 | 151a8 | 2 | 159b1 | 178b7 |
| 8 | 136a1 | 152a5 | 3 | 160a2 | 179b2 |
| 9 | 136a7 | 152b5 | 4 | 160b4 | 180a6 |
| 10 | 136b4 | 153a2 | 5 | 161a2 | 180b4 |
| 11 | 137a5 | 153b4 | 6 | 161b5 | 181a8 |
| 12 | 137b2 | 154a2 | 7 | 162a2 | 181b5 |
| 13 | 137b6 | 154a7 | 8 | 162b4 | 182b2 |
| 14 | 138b1 | 155a3 | 9 | 163a2 | 182b8 |
| 15 | 138b6 | 155b2 | 10 | 163a6 | 183a5 |
| 16 | 139a5 | 156a3 | 11 | 164a1 | 184a1 |
| 17 | 139b7 | 156b7 | 12 | 164b1 | 184b2 |
| 18 | 140b5 | 157b6 | 13 | 164b7 | 185a1 |
| 19 | 141a6 | 158b1 | 14 | 165b5 | 185a8 |
| 20 | 141b3 | 158b7 | 15 | 165b3 | 185b6 |
| 21 | 142b2 | 159b7 | 16 | 166a6 | 186b3 |
| 22 | 143a1 | 160a7 | 17 | 166b1 | 186b6 |
| 23 | 143a5 | 160b5 | 18 | 167b4 | 188a4 |
| 24 | 143b4 | 161a5 | 19 | 168a3 | 188b5 |
| 25 | 144a3 | 161b4 | 20 | 168a7 | 189a1 |
| | | | 21 | 168b4 | 189a6 |
| IX,1 | 145a5 | 163a1 | 22 | 169a3 | 189b7 |
| 2 | 147b4 | 165b3 | 23 | 169b3 | 190b1 |
| 3 | 148a3 | 166a5 | 24 | 170b1 | 191a8 |
| 4 | 148b2 | 166b6 | 25 | 170b5 | 191b6 |
| 5 | 148b4 | 167a1 | | | |
| 6 | 149a5 | 167b2 | XI,1 | 171b5 | 192b8 |
| 7 | 150a2 | 168a8 | 2 | 172b2 | 193b6 |
| 8 | 150b4 | 169a4 | 3 | 172b4 | 194a1 |
| 9 | 151a4 | 169b5 | 4 | 173a2 | 194a7 |
| 10 | 151b1 | 170a3 | 5 | 173a5 | 194b4 |
| 11 | 151b7 | 170b2 | 6 | 173b6 | 195a7 |
| 12 | 152a7 | 171a2 | 7 | 174a3 | 195b3 |
| 13 | 152b4 | 171a7 | 8 | 174a7 | 195b5 |
| 14 | 152b7 | 171b3 | 9 | 174b4 | 196a6 |
| 15 | 153a3 | 171b7 | 10 | 175a1 | 196b3 |
| 16 | 153a5 | 172a1 | 11 | 175a5 | 197a1 |
| 17 | 153b1 | 172a5 | 12 | 176b1 | 198a6 |
| 18 | 154a1 | 172b5 | 13 | 176b5 | 198b4 |
| 19 | 154a5 | 173a2 | 14 | 177a1 | 198b8 |
| 20 | 155a4 | 174a2 | 15 | 177b1 | 199b1 |
| 21 | 156b2 | 175a5 | 16 | 179a5 | 201b2 |
| 22 | 156b5 | 175b7 | 17 | 179b2 | 201b8 |
| 23 | 157a4 | 176a7 | 18 | 179b5 | 202a4 |

| | | | | | |
|--------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| 19 | 181a1 | 203b3 | 14 | 203a3 | 230a1 |
| 20 | 181a6 | 204a2 | 15 | 203a5 | 230a4 |
| 21 | 181b4 | 204a8 | 16 | 203b4 | 230b4 |
| 22 | 181b6 | 204b3 | 17 | 204a1 | 231a1 |
| 23 | 182a2 | 204b7 | 18 | 204a7 | 231b1 |
| 24 | 182a5 | 205a2 | 19 | 204b2 | 231b3 |
| 25 | 182b4 | 205b2 | 20 | 204b6 | 231b8 |
| | | | 21 | 205a5 | 232a6 |
| XII,1 | 183b2 | 206b2 | 22 | 205b5 | 233a1 |
| 2 | 184a6 | 207a8 | 23 | 206a3 | 233a8 |
| 3 | 184b6 | 208a2 | 24 | 207a5 | 234b5 |
| 4 | 186a5 | 209b4 | 25 | 207b3 | 235a4 |
| 5 | 186b4 | 210a3 | | | |
| 6 | 187a6 | 210b8 | XIV,1 | 209a3 | 236b7 |
| 7 | 187b7 | 211b3 | 2 | 209b1 | 237a7 |
| 8 | 188a3 | 211b7 | 3 | 210b3 | 238b5 |
| 9 | 188b4 | 212b2 | 4 | 211b1 | 239b4 |
| 10 | 189a3 | 213a2 | 5 | 212a3 | 240b2 |
| 11 | 189a6 | 213a7 | 6 | 212b4 | 241a5 |
| 12 | 190a1 | 214a3 | 7 | 213a6 | 241b8 |
| 13 | 190b1 | 214b5 | 8 | 213b2 | 242a4 |
| 14 | 191b1 | 215b8 | 9 | 213b6 | 242b1 |
| 15 | 191b5 | 216a6 | 10 | 214a3 | 242b8 |
| 16 | 192a2 | 216b3 | 11 | 214b2 | 243a7 |
| 17 | 192a7 | 217a3 | 12 | 214b4 | 243b3 |
| 18 | 192b5 | 217b1 | 13 | 214b7 | 243b6 |
| 19 | 193a5 | 218a2 | 14 | 215a4 | 244a4 |
| 20 | 193b3 | 218b2 | 15 | 215b1 | 244b1 |
| 21 | 193b7 | 218b8 | 16 | 215b4 | 244b4 |
| 22 | 194a3 | 219a3 | 17 | 216a1 | 245a3 |
| 23 | 194a4 | 219a5 | 18 | 216a5 | 245a8 |
| 24 | 194b5 | 219b8 | 19 | 216b1 | 245b4 |
| 25 | 195a1 | 220a3 | 20 | 216b6 | 246a3 |
| | | | 21 | 217a2 | 246a7 |
| XIII,1 | 195a7 | 220b4 | 22 | 220a2 | 249b7 |
| 2 | 198a5 | 224a3 | 23 | 220b6 | 250b6 |
| 3 | 198b2 | 224b1 | 24 | 221b1 | 251b3 |
| 4 | 198b7 | 224b8 | 25 | 221b4 | 251b8 |
| 5 | 199a3 | 225a4 | | | |
| 6 | 199a6 | 225a8 | XV,1 | 222a4 | 252b2 |
| 7 | 199b4 | 225b6 | 2 | 222b1 | 252b7 |
| 8 | 200a3 | 226a6 | 3 | 222b3 | 253a2 |
| 9 | 200a7 | 226b5 | 4 | 222b7 | 253a8 |
| 10 | 200b6 | 227a5 | 5 | 223a2 | 253b3 |
| 11 | 201b4 | 228a7 | 6 | 223a5 | 253b7 |
| 12 | 202a5 | 229a1 | 7 | 223b2 | 254a5 |
| 13 | 202b6 | 229b4 | 8 | 223b6 | 254b1 |

| | | | | | |
|-------|-------|-------|----|-------|-------|
| 9 | 224a4 | 254b8 | 5 | 232a3 | 264b6 |
| 10 | 224b2 | 255b7 | 6 | 232b1 | 265a2 |
| 11 | 225a5 | 256a5 | 7 | 232b5 | 265b3 |
| 12 | 225b1 | 256b1 | 8 | 233a5 | 266a7 |
| 13 | 225b5 | 256b7 | 9 | 233a7 | 266b2 |
| 14 | 226a4 | 257a7 | 10 | 233b2 | 266b4 |
| 15 | 226b3 | 257b7 | 11 | 233b6 | 267a2 |
| 16 | 227a2 | 258a8 | 12 | 234a4 | 267a8 |
| 17 | 227b1 | 258b7 | 13 | 234b3 | 267b8 |
| 18 | 227b4 | 259a5 | 14 | 235a3 | 268b3 |
| 19 | 228a2 | 259b3 | 15 | 235a5 | 268b6 |
| 20 | 228a4 | 259b4 | 16 | 235b2 | 269a3 |
| 21 | 228a6 | 260a1 | 17 | 235b5 | 269a7 |
| 22 | 228b1 | 260a5 | 18 | 236a4 | 269b7 |
| 23 | 228b4 | 260a8 | 19 | 236b1 | 270a5 |
| 24 | 228b6 | 260b4 | 20 | 236b2 | 270a6 |
| 25 | 229a2 | 260b7 | 21 | 236b5 | 270b3 |
| | | | 22 | 237a5 | 271a4 |
| XVI,1 | 230b3 | 262b8 | 23 | 237a7 | 271a8 |
| 2 | 231a4 | 263b3 | 24 | 238a6 | 272b1 |
| 3 | 231b4 | 264a5 | 25 | 238b4 | 272b8 |
| 4 | 231b6 | 264b1 | | | |

Sanskrit Index

| | |
|----------------------------|----------|
| akurvāṇasya nirvāṇam | VIII,11a |
| agnir eva bhavaty uṣṇam | XIV,16a |
| agryāṇām mānasam duḥkham | II,8a |
| acaitanyam ca sarvaśaḥ | X,15b |
| acaitanyam tatas tasya | X,13c |
| ajāto jāta ity eva | XV,21a |
| aṇur ekātmako nāsti | XIV,18c |
| anuṣṇam dahyate katham | XIV,16b |
| atītaś ca na jāyate | XI,8b |
| atītasya na bhaṅgo 'sti | XI,7c |
| atītasya sukham nāsti | VII,13a |
| ato 'sti kiñ cit sarvatra | II,9c |
| atyabhyāśe ca dūre ca | XIII,13c |
| atha yāty abruvaṃs tasmin | XIII,18c |
| atha vā jāyamānatvam | XV,16c |
| atha svalpo 'pi kartavyaḥ | XI,12c |
| athānuṣṇ(e) paro 'py agnau | XIV,17c |
| advitīyam śivadvāram | XII,13a |
| anabhyāsatayā bhayam | XII,9d |
| anātmēti catuṣṭayam | III,25b |
| anityam aśubham duḥkham | III,25a |
| anityam kṛtakam dṛṣṭvā | IX,4a |
| anityasya dhruvā piḍā | II,25a |
| anitye sati satkāryam | XI,13a |
| anityo yady anāgataḥ | XI,7b |
| anityo vartamāno 'yam | XI,8a |
| aniṣpanno 'py ajātāt tu | XV,22a |
| antarātmā yadā na strī | X,1a |
| ante tac ca na yuyjate | XIII,20d |
| anyeṣām api caurāṇām | IV,16c |
| apāyam eva yāty ekaḥ | XII,12c |
| apṛthaktvād dhi lakṣaṇaiḥ | XIV,7b |
| apratītyāstītā nāsti | IX,2a |
| abhibhūto 'pi yady uṣṇaḥ | XIV,17a |
| amanaskaḥ sadā na kim | XIII,21d |
| amānī durlabhaḥ (sattvo) | VII,16a |
| alātacakranirmāṇa | XIII,25a |
| aśabdasyāpi śabdatvam | XIII,20c |
| aśūnyam iva dṛśyate | XVI,1b |
| asatsu bodhisattvānām | V,11c |
| asti kā cid akāraṇā | V,1b |
| asmin dharme 'lpapuṇyasya | VIII,5a |
| asya dharmasya nāmno 'pi | XII,14a |
| ahany ahani hanyate | II,8d |

ahaṃkāro 'sataḥ śreyān
 ahaṃ mameti vā darpaḥ
 ahaṃ sarvagato yadi
 (ā mokṣād yasya) dharmasya
 ā vināśāc calaṃ nāma
 ākāśādini kalpyante
 ātmāno 'pi parityāgaḥ
 āyattaṃ yatra tatra vā
 āyattaṃ yasya bhāvasya
 itareṣāṃ śarīrajaṃ
 iti te jāyate bhayaṃ
 iti tena na yujyate
 iti nairātmyaṃ ucyate
 iti vā jāyate vṛthā
 indriyāṇāṃ gatāv evaṃ
 indhanaṃ yady aṇor nāsti
 iha yady api tattvajño
 ihaiva pratyayas tena
 uktaḥ sudurlabhas tena
 utpādasthitibhaṅgānāṃ
 udvego yasya nāstiha
 upālambhaś cireṇāpi
 ubhayaṃ nāsti rūpasya
 ṛṣiṇāṃ ceṣṭitaṃ sarvaṃ
 ekatvādiṣu nityaśaḥ
 ekam arthadvayaṃ yathā
 ekam arthaṃ vijānāti
 ekasminn eva sarvāṇi
 ekasya ghaṭasadbhāvo
 ekasya śūnyatā yaiva
 ekāntenaiva bālānāṃ
 eko yadi ghaṭo neṣṭo
 ekaikasmin ghaṭādbhāve
 etenaiva vicāreṇa
 evaṃ satiha jīvo 'yam
 evaṃ saty api karmaṇi
 eṣa prayojyo vidvadbhir
 aiśvaryaṇito mānaḥ
 auśadhaṃ nāma jāyate
 kathaṃ nāma tad ātmīyaṃ
 kadā cit kasya cit kva cit
 karaṇaṃ jāyate mithyā
 karoti matimān matim
 kartavyaḥ śūnyatāṃ prati
 kartuṃ nāma vijānanti
 kalidharmasamāśritaiḥ
 kalpanā nāma jāyate

XII,12a
 IV,1a
 X,14b
 VIII,6a
 X,11a
 IX,5a
 IV,17c
 IV,2d
 XIV,1a
 II,8b
 VIII,9b
 X,11d
 XII,13d
 XIII,14d
 XIII,24c
 XIV,18a
 VIII,22a
 XII,5c
 VII,16b
 XV,11a
 VIII,12a
 XVI,25c
 XIII,17c
 IV,14a
 XIV,21d
 XI,18d
 XI,18c
 III,25c
 XIV,10c
 VIII,16c
 XII,9a
 XIV,4a
 XIV,7c
 XIII,2a
 XIII,21c
 VII,12d
 XIV,21c
 IV,25c
 VIII,20d
 VII,18c
 IX,2b
 X,10a
 VII,9d
 XII,5d
 X,16a
 IV,15d
 X,3d

| | |
|-----------------------------|----------|
| kalpanāyāḥ sukhaṃ vaśyaṃ | II,9a |
| kalyāṇādhigatis tasya | XII,10c |
| kaś cit tattraiva duṣyati | VIII,2b |
| kaś ciñ muhyati tattraiva | VIII,2c |
| kasya cij jāyate guruḥ | V,12b |
| kasya cij jāyate śiṣyaḥ | V,12a |
| kasya cit kena cit sārddham | VIII,4a |
| kaḥ kuryād āyativadham | IV,24d |
| kāraṇaṃ vikṛtiṃ gacchaj | IX,9a |
| kāraṇavyatirekeṇa | XV,25a |
| kāryaṃ nāsty (ājñayā) yasya | VII,21a |
| kāryā nityaṃ matir budhaiḥ | VIII,21d |
| kālo yathā yathā yāti | II,10a |
| kiñ cid dṛṣṭe śubhā gatiḥ | VIII,21b |
| kim ayuktam ataḥ param | X,16d |
| kim evaṃ na bhaviṣyati | XIV,3d |
| kiṃ kariṣyati sa tyāgaṃ | XII,4a |
| kiṃ kariṣyāmy asat sarvaṃ | VIII,9a |
| kiṃ gatvāpi kariṣyati | XIII,21b |
| kiṃ tadarthaṃ vihanyase | VII,11d |
| kiṃ manye pūjito raṇe | IV,17d |
| kudṛṣṭināṃ bhayaṃkaram | XII,13b |
| kuryād daṇḍena ko budhaḥ | I,23d |
| kurvāṇasya punarbhavaḥ | VIII,11b |
| kurvīta na vicakṣaṇaḥ | IV,14b |
| kṛtaṃ naśyaty ayatnataḥ | VII,12b |
| kṛtakasyāstitvaṃ dṛṣtvā | IX,4c |
| ke cin maraṇakāṅkṣiṇaḥ | VIII,13b |
| kena cid hetunā śūnyam | XVI,1a |
| kena manye na jāyate | IV,23d |
| kenāpi hetunā dharmo | VII,17c |
| kenābhāvo na dṛśyate | XI,11b |
| kevalaṃ tad ihobhayam | XII,23d |
| ko grahiṣyati buddhimān | VIII,3d |
| kramaśaḥ sambhavo nāsti | XV,11c |
| kriyāvañ chāśvato nāsti | X,17a |
| kva cit sa ca na vidyate | XIV,1d |
| kṣaṇaṃ rāgo na tiṣṭhati | VIII,24b |
| gacched atyantato nāśam | VII,15c |
| gaṇadāsasya te darpaḥ | IV,2a |
| gatimad yadi tad bhavet | XIII,13b |
| gatis tasya na vidyate | XI,8d |
| gatena na guṇaḥ kaś cid | XIII,14a |
| gantum notsahate netuḥ | XII,7c |
| gandhatvaṃ nopapadyate | XIV,13a |
| gamanād(er) viparyaye | VII,9b |
| grhasyārthe nirarthakaḥ | XI,15b |

| | |
|----------------------------|----------|
| grhādīn sarvathā guṇāḥ | X,16b |
| grhṇīyād agataṃ cakṣuḥ | XIII,15a |
| grhyate kevalaḥ katham | XIII,19d |
| grahaṇaṃ cakṣuṣaḥ kena | XIII,16c |
| glāne putre viśeṣeṇa | V,11a |
| ghaṭas tasmān na vidyate | XIV,12d |
| ghaṭasya kāraṇaṃ nāsti | XIV,12a |
| ghaṭasya na bhavaty aikyam | XIV,7a |
| ghaṭasyāvayavo rūpaṃ | XIV,9a |
| ghaṭasyeva na yujyate | XIV,14d |
| ghaṭaḥ kāraṇataḥ siddhaḥ | XIV,13a |
| ghaṭaḥ pratyakṣa ity api | XIII,1d |
| ghaṭād anyo na bhāvo 'pi | XIV,3c |
| ghaṭo nānyo 'sti rūpavān | XIV,2b |
| ghaṭo 'py eko na jāyate | XIV,4b |
| cakṣuṣo 'sti na vijñānam | XIII,17a |
| cakṣuṣaiva na jāyate | XIII,16d |
| cakṣuḥ pratītya rūpaṃ ca | XIII,23a |
| cintyamānā sudurlabhā | VIII,23b |
| cetanādhātur anyatra | X,12a |
| caitanyaṃ ca manomātre | X,13a |
| caitanyaṃ śāśvataṃ yadi | X,10b |
| chidraprahāriṇaḥ pāpam | IV,16a |
| janmano 'pi na sambhavaḥ | VIII,25d |
| jāta utpadyate kasmāj | XV,20c |
| jāta utpadyate yataḥ | XV,19b |
| jātasyāpi bhaved bhavaḥ | XI,10d |
| jāto yadā tadā nāsti | XV,20a |
| jāyate jarjarikṛtaḥ | VIII,5d |
| jāyate 'dhikṛte kāryam | IV,2c |
| jāyate 'nyasya kāraṇam | IX,9b |
| jāyate yasya saṃśayaḥ | XII,5b |
| jāyate viṣam auśadham | VIII,18d |
| jāyate 'stīti niṣpanno | XV,24a |
| jāyamānanirodhena | XV,19a |
| jāyamānasya drśyate | XV,19d |
| jāyamānasya sambhavaḥ | XV,20b |
| jāyamānaḥ kutaḥ kila | XV,21b |
| jāyamānārdhajātātvaḥ | XV,16a |
| jāyamāno na jāyate | XV,16b |
| jāyamāno na tasyāsti | XV,18c |
| jāyamāno bahiṣkṛtaḥ | XV,22b |
| jāyamāno yadā tadā | XV,20d |
| jāyamāno yadābhāvas | XV,24c |
| vyotirjyotiḥparāyaṇaḥ | VII,16d |
| tac ca rakṣyaṃ sadānyataḥ | VII,18b |
| tat prāg eva na vidyate | IV,16d |

| | |
|---------------------------|----------|
| tat tat tasya samācaret | V,10b |
| tato 'nyasyāpi sadbhāvo | XV,19c |
| tatra bhaktir na yasyāsti | VIII,6c |
| tatra bhāvo na vidyate | XIV,6d |
| tatraiko 'stīti cen matam | XIV,20b |
| tatraiva rajyate kaś cit | VIII,2a |
| tathā kāraṇavaikalyā | VIII,25c |
| tathā nāsti viparyayaḥ | II,12d |
| tathāpi jāyate 'jāto | XV,22c |
| tathā rūpaṃ na vidyate | XIV,15d |
| tad anyaj janayet katham | XIV,13d |
| tad ṛte 'gnir na vidyate | XIV,16d |
| tadā kasya bhayaṃ na syād | VII,10c |
| tadā kiṃ na vikalpyate | XV,21d |
| tadā kevalam ajñānād | X,1c |
| tadā ko nāma vismayaḥ | XIII,24d |
| tadā ko nāma sa smṛtaḥ | XV,24d |
| tadā naivopapadyate | XV,25d |
| tadā rūpaṃ mahan na kim | XIV,5b |
| tasmāt ka(l)evarasyaśya | II,10c |
| tasmāt kā(m)o nirarthakaḥ | VIII,2d |
| tasmāt suvyaktam anyo 'pi | IX,6c |
| tasmād adhyātmacintāyām | VIII,21c |
| tasmād anityaṃ yat sarvam | II,25c |
| tasmān munim ṛte nāsti | IX,1c |
| tasya tasyaikatā nāsti | XIV,19a |
| tasya dharmo nirarthakaḥ | VII,21b |
| tasya prakaraṇaiḥ sarvaiḥ | XVI,1c |
| tasya vaktuṃ na śakyate | XVI,25d |
| tasya saṅgaparityāgān | I,25c |
| tasyādiḥ kena grhyate | XIII,19b |
| tābhyām anyā tṛtīyāpi | XI,8c |
| tāvac chabdo na jāyate | XIII,20b |
| tāvanto na tu dṛśyante | II,11c |
| te kurvanti suduḥkaram | XII,7b |
| te tadā kevalam mohān | VIII,13c |
| tena tāvan na tad ghaṭaḥ | XIV,9b |
| tena trāso vidhīyate | XII,8d |
| tena nāvayavo 'pi tat | XIV,9d |
| tena nityaṃ na vidyate | IX,1b |
| tena nityo na jāyate | X,25d |
| tenākāraṇataḥ siddhiḥ | IX,3d |
| tenātmānīyamān na saḥ | X,3d |
| tenāpi jāyate 'jāto | XV,23c |
| tenāpy eko na jāyate | XIV,4d |
| tenāsty agnir anindhanaḥ | XIV,18b |
| tenaikatvaṃ na vidyate | XIV,20d |

| | |
|-----------------------------|----------|
| tenaivāvaraṇaṃ nāma | X,14c |
| tenocchedo na jāyate | X,25b |
| teṣāṃ unmattakānāṃ ca | X,15c |
| teṣāṃ niyativādinām | XI,9d |
| teṣāṃ vaśyaṃ yato manaḥ | V,5d |
| tai rūpaṃ dṛśyate katham | XIII,17d |
| tyāgopāyaṃ na veti yaḥ | XII,4b |
| trāso nārabhyate 'dṛṣṭe | XII,8a |
| tritvaṃ yenāsti sarvatra | XIV,20c |
| duḥkhadvayena loko 'yam | II,8c |
| duḥkhaṃ tad iti jāyate | II,25d |
| duḥkhavṛddhis tathā tathā | II,10b |
| duḥkhasya varddhamānasya | II,12c |
| duḥkhābhībhūtā dṛśyante | VIII,13a |
| dūraṃ tasya na vidyate | XI,11d |
| dṛśyate 'nāgato bhāvaḥ | XI,11a |
| dṛśyate nādikāraṇam | VII,10b |
| dṛśyate 'nyatra cetanā | X,12b |
| dṛṣṭe 'paiti sa sarvaśaḥ | XII,8b |
| dṛṣṭyā yāti paraṃ padam | XII,11d |
| dṛṣṭvā samān viśiṣṭāṃś ca | IV,25a |
| dṛṣṭvaikasyāpi vistaram | VII,10d |
| dehavad vikṛtiṃ yāti | X,4a |
| dehā(t) tenānyatā tasya | X,4c |
| dravatvam iva lohasya | X,12c |
| dravyaṃ nāsti kriyā yathā | X,11b |
| draṣṭavyaṃ niyamenēṣṭam | XIII,14c |
| draṣṭā sarvasya sa smṛtaḥ | VIII,16b |
| dharmaṃ samāsato 'himsāṃ | XII,23a |
| dharmaḥ samanuvartate | VII,19b |
| dharmād api tato loko | VII,19c |
| dharmān nivartakāt teṣāṃ | XII,9c |
| dharme 'bhyāsaḥ pravartake | XII,9b |
| dharmo yady akrto 'py asti | XI,12a |
| dhūmikāntaḥpratiśrutkā | XIII,25c |
| na kadā cit kva cit kaś cid | IX,2c |
| na kiñ cit vidyate 'ntaram | X,15d |
| na gacchanti paraṃ padam | VIII,13d |
| na gamiṣyati nirvāṇaṃ | VIII,10c |
| na ghaṭād iti te matam | XIV,11b |
| na ca nāstiha nirvāṇam | VIII,23c |
| na ca so 'sti kva cid bhāvo | III,24c |
| na cādis tasya vidyate | VIII,25b |
| na cāyaṃ samayor yogas | XIV,4c |
| na ceṣṭā kila buddhānām | V,1a |
| na caiti kevalaḥ śabda | XIII,19c |
| na tasyaivopapadyate | X,14d |

| | |
|----------------------------|----------|
| na tu dṛṣṭeḥ katham cana | XII,11b |
| na tu nairātmyadarśanam | XII,12b |
| na duḥkhād balavattaram | II,9d |
| na nirgaccha(s)i (durmate) | I,23b |
| na paśyanti vicakṣaṇāḥ | IX,5d |
| na pumān na napuṃsakam | X,1b |
| na bhāvāḥ jāyate bhāvo | XV,14a |
| na mithyā jāyate pakṣas | XI,9c |
| na rūpe vidyate ghaṭaḥ | XIV,2d |
| na laukikam ṛte lokaḥ | VIII,19c |
| na vaktā jāyate kena | XIII,18a |
| na vijñānadvayaṃ tathā | XI,18d |
| na vidyate ghaṭe rūpam | XIV,2c |
| (na vinā hetunā bhāvo) | IX,3a |
| na śivaṃ dvandvacāriṇaḥ | VIII,10d |
| na śūnya(m iti yujyate) | XVI,2b |
| na santi tenāneke 'pi | XIV,19c |
| na hi pratihataḥ pātram | V,10c |
| na hy asparśavato nāma | XIV,8a |
| nanu prayuktam asthāne | VIII,18c |
| nanu vyādhivaśāt pathyam | VIII,20c |
| nanv anityeṣu bhāveṣu | X,3c |
| narāṇāṃ sukhahetavaḥ | II,11d |
| nānopāyair upāyavit | V,12d |
| nānyayā bhāṣayā mlecchaḥ | VIII,19a |
| nānyeṣāṃ kiṃ n(u) kāraṇam | XIV,10d |
| nābhāvāḥ jāyate 'bhāvo | XV,14c |
| nābhūto nāma jāyate | XV,23d |
| nāpy aprāptasya vidyate | VII,13b |
| nāyam uktas tathāgataiḥ | XII,15b |
| nāyaṃ dharmo nivartakaḥ | VIII,9d |
| nāśūnyaṃ śūnyavad dṛṣṭam | VIII,7a |
| nāśit prāḡ jāyamāno 'pi | XV,23a |
| nāsti tenāstu śāśvataḥ | IX,4d |
| nāsti tenendhanaṃ nāma | XIV,16c |
| nāsti dūram na cāvṛtam | XIII,15d |
| nāsti mokṣe tu kā kathā | XII,10d |
| nāsti sarvagata kriyā | X,17b |
| nāsti strīpūṇnapuṃsakam | X,2b |
| nāstīty akṛta ucyate | XV,24b |
| nityatā ca na yujyate | X,4d |
| nityānīti pṛthagjanaiḥ | IX,5b |
| niyamād rāgakāraṇam | III,24d |
| niyamād vidyate yasya | I,25a |
| niyamena kṛtasyāntaḥ | VII,11c |
| niyamena kṣaṇādayaḥ | I,22b |
| niyamena na jāyate | VII,11b |

niyamenaiṇa kiñcijjñe
 niyamo jāyate vṛthā
 nirgamaś ca bhavād asmāt
 nirvāṇaṃ tena netaraḥ
 nirvāṇaṃ nādhigacchati
 nirvāṇaṃ me bhavatv iti
 nivṛtt(a)viśayasyeḥa
 nivṛttis copalabhyate
 nivṛttis tatra varṇyate
 niścintena sukhāṃ. prāptum
 niṣkriyā nāstitātulyo
 niṣpannenāpi tena kim
 niḥśvaso 'pi hitāyaiva
 nūnaṃ tenoktavān muniḥ
 nairātmyaṃ kiṃ na te priyaṃ
 nobhayaṃ ceti kathyate
 parapakṣas tu te 'priyaḥ
 paramārthakathā yatra
 paramārthe na vidyate
 paramārtho na sarvathā
 paravad dṛśyate sukhāṃ
 paras (tasyeti) kiṃ nāhaṃ
 parasya na bhayaṃkaraḥ
 parāṃś chaktisamanvitān
 pareṇa saha ba(n)dhasya
 pareṇābhibhavo nāma
 paścāc ca kila vidyate
 paśyec cakṣuś cirād dūre
 paśyet sarvaṃ idaṃ jagat
 pāpasyaśīśvavyavad rājan
 pīḍā yasya na tat sukhāṃ
 puṇyasya phalaṃ aiśvaryaṃ
 putravat pālito lokaḥ
 punarjanmani karmavat
 pumāñ janmani janmani
 purataḥ pārthivaiḥ śubhaiḥ
 puruṣo 'sti na caitanyaṃ
 puṣpādāv iśyate tathā
 pūrvadṛṣṭo maricivat
 pūrvam ātmani dṛśyate
 prṣṭhato 'py asato manaḥ
 pratināśikayā tuṣṭiḥ
 prativādy aparō yadi
 pratiśedhayitavyāni
 pratiśedho vidhiyate
 pratyayaḥ kena jāyate
 pradeśini na sarvasmin

XII,8c
 XI,12b
 VIII,12c
 VIII,11d
 VIII,22b
 VIII,7b
 VII,17a
 IX,7b
 VIII,8d
 VIII,11c
 X,17c
 VII,20d
 V,1c
 XII,4d
 X,17d
 VIII,20b
 VIII,10b
 VIII,8c
 IX,25d
 IX,25b
 II,10d
 X,14a
 XII,14d
 IV,25b
 VIII,4c
 II,7c
 XV,23b
 XIII,13a
 XIII,15b
 IV,24a
 II,25b
 VII,18a
 IV,15a
 VIII,22d
 X,4b
 IV,15b
 X,11c
 III,23d
 XIII,22b
 XIII,16b
 XII,7d
 III,23a
 XIV,5d
 XIII,2c
 XVI,1d
 XIII,18d
 IX,6a

| | |
|------------------------------|----------|
| pradeśo nāma vartate | IX,6b |
| pradeśo 'sti pradeśini | IX,6d |
| pravṛttis ca nivṛttis ca | XV,25c |
| pravṛttis tatra varṇyate | VIII,8b |
| prāk so 'stīti na yujyate | XI,10b |
| prāpinām sampravartate | V,1d |
| prāptaś ced grhyate śabdas | XIII,19a |
| prāptas tenaiva mārgeṇa | VIII,24c |
| prāpnoty ayatnato 'vaśyaṃ | VIII,22c |
| prāpya śrīpūṇṇapūṣakam | X,2d |
| bandho nāma na vidyate | VIII,4b |
| balavān iva dṛśyate | VII,19d |
| balavān nāma ko dṛṣṭaḥ | XII,14c |
| bahutvaṃ nopapadyate | XIV,7d |
| buddhokteṣu parokṣeṣu | XII,5a |
| brūyāt kas tattvavin nāma | XIII,1c |
| bhaktis tasya kutah śive | VIII,12b |
| bhayaṃ utpadyate 'sataḥ | XII,14b |
| bhavaḥ saṃdehamātreṇa | VIII,5c |
| bhavaṇ nānyasya kutra cit | XIV,1b |
| bhavo yo na bhayaṃkaraḥ | VII,14d |
| bhāvas te 'haṃ pumān iti | X,1d |
| bhāvasyaikasya yo draṣṭā | VIII,16a |
| bhāvād anyo ghaṭo yadi | XIV,3b |
| bhāvās (yatra) na santy anye | XIV,20a |
| bhāvo 'bhāvān na jāyate | XV,14b |
| 'bhāvo bhāvān na jāyate | XV,14d |
| bhāvo 'stīti na yujyate | XIV,17d |
| bhūtārthaḥ kalpanā ceti | VIII,3c |
| bhedābhāvād (ghaṭo 'bhāvas) | XV,21c |
| bhoktuṃ ca na vijānanti | X,16c |
| madyādiṣu na pūjitaḥ | IV,17b |
| madhye vāraṇaṃ ātmanaḥ | VIII,15b |
| manasā grhyate yo 'rthaḥ | XIII,22a |
| 'maricyabhraiḥ samo bhavaḥ | XIII,25d |
| martyo 'haṃ iti bhāvanā | I,25b |
| mahāṃś cākāśavat pumān | X,13b |
| mātārtā jāyate yathā | V,11b |
| mānī nāsti ghrṇānvitaḥ | VII,16b |
| māyāvaj jāyate manaḥ | XIII,23b |
| mithyādrṣṭer na nirvāṇaṃ | VIII,7c |
| mūḍha eva paratra saḥ | XII,6b |
| mṛgāraṇyikṛtaḥ so 'dya | IV,15c |
| mṛtyor api (bhayaṃ ku)taḥ | I,25d |
| yato jātād bahiṣkṛtaḥ | XV,22d |
| yatnataḥ kriyate karma | VII,12a |
| yatra siddhir na vidyate | XIV,6b |

| | |
|-----------------------------|----------|
| yathā kumbho na vidyate | XIV,15b |
| yathā dṛṣṭo viparyayaḥ | II,12b |
| yathā bijasya dṛṣṭo 'nto | VIII,25a |
| yathābhāvas tathāgataḥ | IX,1d |
| yad yad yasya priyaṃ pūrvam | V,10a |
| yad rakṣyaṃ sarvadānyataḥ | VII,18d |
| yadā kāryaṃ na vidyate | XV,25b |
| yadā na kiñ cid āścaryam | XIII,24a |
| yadā vaktāsti vācyaṃ ca | XVI,2a |
| yadā sarveṣu bhūteṣu | X,2a |
| yadi bālo 'pi sarvaśaḥ | VII,15b |
| yadi rājño na vidyate | IV,16b |
| yadaikasyāpi kāryasya | VII,10a |
| yas tavātmā mamānātmā | X,3a |
| yasmāt teṣv api vidyate | IV,14d |
| yasmāt pravartate bhāvas | X,25a |
| yasmāt sarve 'pi sāmānyā | IV,1c |
| yasmād avayavi nāsti | XIV,9c |
| yasmān nivartate bhāvas | X,25c |
| yasmin bhāve pravṛttiś ca | IX,7a |
| yasya nāsti gatis tasya | XIII,15c |
| yasya pakṣo na vidyate | XVI,25b |
| yasyāsatkāryam eva ca | XI,15d |
| yaḥ paścāj jāyate bhāvaḥ | XI,9a |
| yā yā lokasthitis tām tām | VII,19a |
| yāvad dravyaṃ yadā rūpaṃ | XIV,5a |
| yāvan na śrūyate śabdā | XIII,20a |
| yāvanto duḥkhaheṭavaḥ | II,11b |
| yuktā muktāś ca durlabhāḥ | VIII,23d |
| yugapan nāsti sambhavaḥ | XV,11b |
| yenaiko 'pi na vidyate | XIV,19d |
| yeṣāṃ guṇānāṃ kartṛtvam | X,15a |
| yo jānīte sa buddhimān | VIII,15d |
| yo yo bhāvaḥ parikṣyate | XIV,19b |
| yogaḥ sparśavatā saha | XIV,8b |
| rāgādīnāṃ na vidyate | VIII,3b |
| rāgo 'śucipratīkāre | III,23c |
| rūpatvam avilakṣaṇam | XIV,10b |
| rūpam anyad rasādibhyo | XIV,11a |
| rūpam eva ghaṭo naikyam | XIV,2a |
| rūpaṃ dṛṣṭvākṣi yāti cet | XIII,14b |
| rūpaṃ vyaktaṃ na tac ca kim | XIII,13d |
| rūpādibhyaḥ prthak kaś cid | XIV,12c |
| rūpādivyatirekeṇa | XIV,15a |
| rūpādīnāṃ ato yogaḥ | XIV,8c |
| rūpe dṛṣṭe hi jāyate | XIII,1b |
| lakṣaṇenāpi lakṣyasya | XIV,6a |

| | |
|------------------------------|----------|
| loko 'yaṃ yena durdṛṣṭo | XII,6a |
| laukiki deśanā yatra | VIII,8a |
| laukike vidyate kiñ cit | IX,25c |
| laukikenāpi teṣv arthān | IX,5c |
| vaktavyā naiva sarvadā | VIII,18b |
| vañcitās te bhaviṣyanti | XII,6c |
| varam laukikam evedam | IX,25a |
| varṇayanti tathāgatāḥ | VIII,7d |
| varṇayanti tathāgatāḥ | XII,23b |
| vartamāno 'pi yāty eva | VII,13c |
| vaśyā duḥkhasya kalpanā | II,9b |
| vādasya kṛtaśo dharmo | XII,15a |
| vāyvādivyatiरेकेṇa | XIV,15c |
| vāraṇaṃ prāg apuṇyasya | VIII,15a |
| vikṛtiṃ yāty ataḥ pumān | X,12d |
| vighnaṃ tattvasya yaḥ kuryād | XII,10a |
| vijānāti na vijñānam | XI,18a |
| vijñānasya na darśanam | XIII,17b |
| viduṣāṃ vidyate bhuvi | XIII,24b |
| viduṣāṃ syād bhayaṃkaraḥ | VII,14b |
| vidyate tena śāśvataḥ | IX,2d |
| vidyate 'nāgataṃ yasya | XI,11c |
| vidyate yadi kartavyaṃ | VIII,9c |
| vidyate yasya sadbhāvaḥ | XIII,23c |
| vidvān nāma parasyārthe | IV,24c |
| vinaty abudhān sattvān | V,12c |
| vinā kalpanayāstitvaṃ | VIII,3a |
| vināpi janmanā bhaṅgād | XI,7a |
| viparīto 'pi sa smṛtaḥ | VII,17d |
| viprayogabhayād gehān | I,23a |
| viprayogo na yujyate | VIII,4d |
| vipro 'pi karmaṇā śūdraḥ | IV,23c |
| viyuktam indriyaiś cittam | XIII,21a |
| virāgo 'sti na te kaś cid | VII,12c |
| viśeṣeṇa dayā tathā | V,11d |
| viśayaś ca śubheneṣṭo | VII,20a |
| viśayaḥ kila labhyate | VII,17b |
| viśayaḥ sa ca kutsitaḥ | VII,20b |
| viśayaḥ sarvadehinām | IV,1d |
| viśayaḥ sarvabuddhānām | XII,13c |
| vṛto mohena kena cit | XII,10b |
| vṛddhim evoktavān munih | VIII,6b |
| vailakṣaṇyaṃ dvayor dṛṣtvā | XIV,3a |
| vairāgyaṃ yatra jāyate | III,24b |
| vyādhayo 'nye ca dṛśyante | II,11a |
| śakyo grāhayitum tathā | VIII,19d |
| śakyo grāhayitum yathā | VIII,19b |

| | |
|----------------------------|----------|
| śatrubhūteṣu teṣu mā | I,22d |
| śatruvad yānti te kālā | I,22a |
| śabdo yāti bruvan yadi | XIII,18a |
| śarīraṃ sucireṇāpi | II,7a |
| śāśvato 'kṛtako yadi | IX,4b |
| śivam anyatra nāstīti | XII,4c |
| śivam eva tu netaraḥ | XII,12d |
| śilād api varam śraṃso | XII,11a |
| śilena gamyate svargo | XII,11c |
| śuci nāma na tad yuktam | III,24a |
| śubhaṃ vā yadi vāśubhaṃ | V,5b |
| śūnyatā punyakāmena | VIII,18a |
| śūnyatām eva nirvāṇam | XII,23c |
| śramo 'yaṃ kasya nāma te | VII,13d |
| śrutvā śarīranairguṇyaṃ | VIII,24a |
| śreyān yasya parityāgo | VII,20c |
| śaḍbhāgena bhṛtasya kaḥ | IV,2b |
| (sa nānyo) rūpataḥ katham | XIV,11d |
| sa nityaḥ kiṃ na kalpyate | XI,7d |
| sa pūrvaṃ vidyate yadi | XI,9b |
| sa samjñāskandhasamjñakaḥ | XIII,22d |
| samvibhāgo na vidyate | IV,24b |
| samsāraduḥkhaṃ jāniyād | VII,15d |
| samkalpād bodhisattvānām | V,5a |
| samkhyādivyatirekeṇa | XIV,6c |
| sataḥ kasya bhaved bhave | IV,1b |
| satām hṛdi na tiṣṭhati | IV,25d |
| sato yadi bhaved janma | XI,10c |
| satkāryam eva yasyeṣṭam | XI,15c |
| satkāryasya na sambhavaḥ | XI,12d |
| sad asat sadasac ceti | VIII,20a |
| sad asat sadasac ceti | XIV,21a |
| sad asat sadasac ceti | XVI,25a |
| sadasan neti ca kramaḥ | XIV,21b |
| saddharmasya katham cana | V,10d |
| samdeho 'pi na jāyate | VIII,5b |
| samayo jāyate vācyaḥ | XIV,5c |
| samavāye 'pi rūpasya | XIV,14a |
| samūhasyaikatā tena | XIV,14c |
| sambhavanti samāsataḥ | III,25d |
| sambhavaḥ kriyate yasya | XI,10a |
| sambhavo vidyate kadā | XV,11d |
| samyag dṛṣṭe paraṃ sthānaṃ | VIII,21a |
| sarva eva ghaṭo 'dṛṣṭo | XIII,1a |
| sarvakarmakṣaye tena | VII,9c |
| sarvakāryeṣu niṣpattiś | VIII,23a |
| sarvathā tena te rāgaḥ | I,22c |

| | |
|-----------------------------|----------|
| sarvathā durlabhas teṣaṃ | VII,14c |
| sarvathāpi na yujyate | XIV,8d |
| sarvadharmavyavasthāsu | XIII,22a |
| sarvaṃ kāryārtham utpannam | IX,1a |
| sarvaṃ kalyāṇatām eti | V,5c |
| sarvasya vāraṇaṃ paścād | VIII,15 |
| sarvasyāpi nanu kṣayaḥ | VIII,24d |
| sarvasyaiva prasajyate | XV,16d |
| sarvaṇy uttamabuddhinā | XIII,2d |
| sarveṣāṃ api rūpānāṃ | XIV,10a |
| sarvasvasya parityāgo | IV,17a |
| saha cittena tatksaṇam | VII,15d |
| s(ā) māyeti na yujyate | XIII,23d |
| siddhaṃ kāraṇam anyataḥ | XIV,13b |
| siddhir nety āha tattvavīt | IX,3d |
| siddhir yasya svato nāsti | XIV,13c |
| siddhiḥ sarvasya kāryasya | VII,11a |
| sidhyet tasyāstitā nāma | XIV,1c |
| sukhasya varddhamānasya | II,12a |
| sukhasya svaṃ na jāyate | II,7b |
| sugandhi madhuraṃ mṛdu | XIII,2b |
| suciraṃ ye 'nuyānti tam | XII,6d |
| suviyaktaṃ buddhimān na saḥ | VIII,6d |
| saiva sarvasya śūnyatā | VIII,16d |
| so 'py agniḥ kiṃ na jāyate | XIV,17b |
| stambhādīnāṃ alaṃkāro | XI,15a |
| syāt tasyāpīndhanaṃ yadi | XIV,18d |
| syāt tasyāpy antaraṃ yataḥ | XV,18d |
| syād dhīnāṅgasya kasya cit | III,23b |
| svagṛhād iva duṣkaraḥ | VIII,12d |
| svapakṣe vidyate rāgaḥ | VIII,10a |
| ·svapnamāyāmbucandrakaiḥ | XIII,25b |
| svabhāvasya na yujyate | II,7d |
| svabhāvaḥ sarvabhāvānāṃ | XIII,16a |
| svayaṃ kāryaṃ na jāyate | XIV,12b |
| svayaṃ yas tair vinā nāsti | XIV,11c |
| svayaṃ ye yānti nirvāṇaṃ | XII,7a |
| svarūpaṃ iva dṛśyate | X,13d |
| svargo nirayatulyo 'pi | VII,14a |
| hinamadyaviśiṣṭatvam | IV,14c |
| hiyamānāṃ rujaṃ dṛṣtvā | VII,9a |
| hetumān nāsti śāśvataḥ | IX,3b |

Tibetan Index

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| kun kyañ phyogs ma yin par 'gyur | XVI,5d |
| kun kyañ yan lag tu gyur nas | XIII,6a |
| kun gyi mña' bdag 'gyur ma yin | V,23d |
| kun gyi spyi thun ma yin nam | XII,25d |
| kun tu soñ la bya ba med | X,17b |
| kun tshe brjod par bya min te | VIII,18b |
| kun tshe'añ so so'i skye bo ste | VII,4b |
| kun yod ma yin ci bya zes | VIII,9a |
| kun la grub pa śin tu dkon | VIII,23b |
| kun la 'du ba yod ma yin | XIV,24b |
| kun la gnas pa ma yin te | IX,6b |
| kun la gnas pa med pa'am | XI,22c |
| kun sun 'byin la de dag ni | XII,3c |
| klañ ka brjod pañ nus ma yin | XVI,25d |
| rkun po gzan rnams la yañ de | IV,16c |
| rkyañ dañ lhan cig bde ba la | II,13a |
| rkyañ rnams ñid dañ lhan cig tu | II,13c |
| rkyañ ma tshañ phyir śes pa ni | XIII,12a |
| rkyañ las kyañ ni skye ba ste | VI,8b |
| skad cig de la sems dañ ni | VII,15c |
| skad cig la sogs dus de rnams | I,22a |
| skye dañ skye bar skyes bu ni | X,4a |
| skye dañ gnas dañ 'jig pa rnams | XV,11a |
| skye ba dran pa yod pa'i phyir | X,7a |
| skye ba phyi mar 'bad med par | VIII,22c |
| skye ba med kyañ 'jig pa las | XI,7a |
| skye ba la sogs thams cad la | XV,12a |
| skye ba'añ 'byuñ bar mi 'gyur ro | VIII,25d |
| skye ba'i śña rol srid ma yin | XV,5b |
| skye bo sdig to byed rnams la | IV,9a |
| skye bos de ñes mi rig pa | I,10c |
| skye zin bde ba gzan las na | II,2b |
| skye bzin pa śnar ma byuñ yañ | XV,23a |
| skye bzin pa ni skye mi 'gyur | XV,16b |
| skye bzin pa ni phyed skyes phyir | XV,16a |
| skye bzin pa ni ma skyes pa | XV,21a |
| skye bzin pa ni ma rdzogs kyañ | XV,22a |
| skye bzin pa yi bdag ñid du | XV,17a |
| skye bzin pa yi bdag ñid du | XV,17d |
| skye bzin pa la srid pa med | XV,20b |
| skyes pa la ni 'oñ ba dañ | XV,10a |
| skyes bu nam mkha' bzin du che | X,13b |
| skyes bu rnam par 'gyur ba 'gyur | X,12d |
| skyes bus spañ bar bya min nam | VI,7d |
| skyes min ma niñ ma yin pa | X,1b |

| | |
|---------------------------------------|----------|
| skyes zin pa yañ 'byuñ bar 'gyur | XI,10d |
| skyes sa bžin du sdug 'gyur na | XII,24b |
| skrag pa skye ba ji ltar ba | V,25b |
| bskul ba žes bya mi skye ste | X,5b |
| khug sna nañ gi brag ca dañ | XIII,25c |
| kho na skye'o žes par grags | XV,21b |
| khog pa la khyod ci ste gus | II,2d |
| khyad par ci yañ yod ma yin | X,15d |
| khyad par med phyir de yi tshe | XV,21c |
| khyi sogs rnams la'añ thun moñ pas | III,4c |
| khyim gyi don du ka ba la | XI,15c |
| khyim nas nes par mi 'byuñ na | I,23b |
| khyim la sogs dag byed šes kyi | X,16b |
| khyod kyi ñal 'di gañ phyir yin | VII,13d |
| khyod kyi de la lus las gžan | X,4c |
| khyod kyi dregs pa ci žig yin | IV,2b |
| khyod kyi bdag gañ ña'i bdag min | X,3a |
| khyod kyi blun pa 'ba' žig yin | VI,23d |
| khyod kyi lus ko cis mi rtag | X,7d |
| khyod kyis 'das dus thuñ nu ltar | I,3a |
| khyod kyis smad bya ma smras kyañ | VI,18a |
| khyod khro yon tan med pa la | VI,20c |
| khyod cis dkon pa la gus šin | II,5c |
| khyod ches gsal bar de la 'jigs | I,5d |
| khyod 'chi bžin la dus soñ žin | II,14a |
| khyod mñan mi mñan ltar sems de | I,3c |
| khyod dañ mtshuñs pa'i gžan dbañ gžan | IV,7c |
| khyod bdag ñid la phyi 'chos 'gyur | I,18c |
| khyod bdag pho'o sñam du sems | X,1d |
| khyod 'das ji ltar de bžin du | VII,4c |
| khyod 'di byas nas gsal bar ni | I,24a |
| khyod sdug chags bral med do žes | II,24a |
| khyod ni nañ la 'bad byed pa | III,21c |
| khyod yon med dañ khyi 'tshed la | IV,19c |
| khyod rañ 'chi la mya ñan na | I,12a |
| khyod riñ gson pa la dga' žin | I,11a |
| khyod la gañ gis sdug par 'gyur | XII,24d |
| khyod la gus bžin rtag par ni | III,11a |
| khyod la 'chi bdag 'jigs cis med | I,6d |
| khyod la 'chi ba'i 'jigs med na | I,4b |
| khyod la 'jigs pa skye 'gyur grañ | VIII,9b |
| khyod la gnod pa byed par 'gyur | I,7d |
| khyod la phyin ci log tu dran | IV,4b |
| khyod la mo mchog gis ci byed | III,3d |
| khyod la yan lag kun mdzes mo | III,5a |
| khyod la rañ phyogs chags yod cin | VIII,10a |
| khirms ldan yun riñ 'tsho ba ni | II,1c |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| khro ba brtan zin nes par ni | VI,9a |
| khro ba zes bya khyad par du | VI,22a |
| khro ba'i las ni rtsod pa'o | VI,2b |
| khro yañ 'byuñ pos bzuñ pa la | V,9a |
| khro la rje bo bzin lta ste | VI,5c |
| mkha' la sogs rnams rtag go zes | IX,5a |
| mkhas pa rnams kyis de dag la | IX,5c |
| mkhas pa rnams la mtho ris kyañ | VII,14a |
| mkhas pa byed pa ma yin te | IV,14b |
| mkhas pa su zig smra bar 'gyur | VII,8d |
| mkhas pa su zig nes par ni | I,23c |
| mkhas pas rtag tu blo gros bskyed | VIII,21d |
| mkhas pas byed pa ma yin te | IV,14b |
| 'khor ba'i sdug bsñal ses gyur na | VII,15b |
| 'khor los sgyur ba ñid 'gyur ba | V,6c |
| gañ gi gñis po bar med par | XV,18a |
| gañ gi dus kun yod ñid pa | X,4c |
| gañ gi rdul la phyogs yod pa | IX,15c |
| gañ gi 'du ba dga' yin de'i | I,20a |
| gañ gi phyir na de dag la | IV,14c |
| gañ gi phyir na skye bzin pa | XV,19a |
| gañ gi phyir na ma 'oñs dños | XI,3a |
| gañ gi phyogs 'ga' rgyu yin zin | IX,12a |
| gañ gi tshe na skye bzin pa | XV,24c |
| gañ gi yon tan byed po ñaṅ | X,15a |
| gañ gis kun la gsum ñid yod | XIV,20c |
| gañ gis 'gyur ba min par sems | IV,23d |
| gañ gis 'gro ba 'khrul 'khor gyi | VII,24a |
| gañ gis gcig kyañ yod min pa | XIV,19c |
| gañ gis 'jig rten 'di mthon dka' | XII,6a |
| gañ gis de la ses pa skye | XIII,18d |
| gañ gis sdug bsñal sgrib 'gyur ba | II,23c |
| gañ gis rnam ses gnas la sogs | VI,25a |
| gañ gis smra ba por mi 'gyur | XIII,18b |
| gañ gis ses de mkhas pa yin | VIII,15d |
| gañ nam de ru bya ba ni | IV,2c |
| gañ dag dge ba'añ mi 'dod pa | VII,23c |
| gañ dag de rjes 'gro de dag | XII,6c |
| gañ dag la ni 'khor ba na | VII,25a |
| gañ du mñon sum gyis bum der | XVI,6a |
| gañ du 'dod chags bral skye ba | III,24a |
| gañ du grub pa yod min pa | XIV,6b |
| gañ du med der ji ltar 'byuñ | XVI,11b |
| gañ du mya nan 'das gyur pa | IX,21c |
| gañ du'añ snañ ba ma yin te | IX,19b |
| gañ der sñar kun thun moñ na | III,5b |
| gañ phyir dños po 'jug 'gyur ba | X,25a |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| gañ phyir dños po ldog 'gyur ba | X,25c |
| gañ phyir stoñ pa'i dpe yod pa | XVI,22a |
| gañ phyir de gñis ma 'oñs pa | X,1c |
| gañ phyir de la pha rol gyi | XIII,4c |
| gañ phyir de la'añ bar yod phyir | XV,18d |
| gañ phyir des phan mi šes pa | V,8c |
| gañ phyir mi phañs de'i sman phyir | VI,5b |
| gañ phyir yid de'i dbañ gyur phyir | V,5d |
| gañ phyir yod ces miñ byas pa | XVI,17c |
| gañ phyir yod bdog ces miñ btags | XVI,17a |
| gañ phyir lus can thams cad la | IV,1c |
| gañ phyir bsod nams la sogs pa | V,4b |
| gañ tshe kun gyi dbañ phyug ñid | IV,20a |
| gañ tshe skyes pa skye bžin na | XV,20c |
| gañ tshe skyes pa de yi tshe | XV,20a |
| gañ tshe mkhas la sa steñ na | XIII,24a |
| gañ tshe 'ga' žig ma bcol bar | I,13a |
| gañ tshe rgyu ni ma gtogs par | XV,25a |
| gañ tshe rjes su mi mthun pa | I,16a |
| gañ tshe nañ bdag bud med min | X,1a |
| gañ tshe bde ba sdug bsñal ltar | II,3a |
| gañ tshe 'byuñ ba thams cad la | X,2a |
| gañ tshe 'bras bu gcig gi yañ | VII,10a |
| gañ tshe smra po brjod bya na'añ | XVI,2a |
| gañ tshe rdzas ci tsam gzugs na | XIV,5a |
| gañ žig khro gnas la bzod pa | VI,23a |
| gañ žig gañ gañ la dga' ba | V,10a |
| gañ žig gañ na nam du yañ | IX,2a |
| gañ žig ñen pa gžan dag la | V,15a |
| gañ žig gti mug 'ga' žig gis | XII,10a |
| gañ žig gtoñ thabs mi šes de | XII,4a |
| gañ žig btañ ba šis 'gyur ba | VII,20c |
| gañ žig brten nas kun 'byuñ ba | XVI,2d |
| gañ žig the tshom skye 'gyur ba | XII,5b |
| gañ žig de la gegs byed pa | VI,21c |
| gañ žig byas kyañ gtañ bya ba | I,24c |
| gañ žig 'byuñ bar byed pa de | XI,10a |
| gañ žig mi mthun phyogs su 'gyur | XVI,8d |
| gañ žig yod na dños po la | IX,7a |
| gañ žig la dkyil yod min la | IX,17b |
| gañ žig bśañ khañ nañ 'dug ciñ | III,20a |
| gañ yañ bka' luñ don gñer ñid | VII,21c |
| gañ yid rtag tu phyir phyogs pa | III,10c |
| gañ la kun tshe sems dbañ ni | V,23a |
| gañ la bka' luñ dgos med pa | VII,21a |
| gañ la skye ba thams cad du | V,17a |
| gañ la gañ yid 'oñ 'gyur ba | III,4a |

| | |
|----------------------------------|----------|
| gañ la 'gro ba yod min pa | XIII,15c |
| gañ la ñes par yod gyur pa | I,25b |
| gañ la sñar byas sdig pa yañ | V,21a |
| gañ la 'jig rten gsum mña' bdag | I,1a |
| gañ la brten nas 'byuñ yod pa | XIV,23a |
| gañ la tha ma yod min pa | IX,17c |
| gañ la thog ma mtha' yod pa | XI,13c |
| gañ la dañ po yod min žin | IX,17a |
| gañ la 'dir skyo yod min pa | VIII,12a |
| gañ la gnod yod de bde min | II,25b |
| gañ la rnam par 'gyur yod pa | IX,9c |
| gañ la phyogs ni yod min pa | XVI,25b |
| gañ la ma 'oñs yod 'gyur ba | XI,11c |
| gañ la mi gtsaň 'byuñ 'gyur ba | III,18c |
| gañ la yod pa ñid yod de | XIII,23c |
| gañ la yod pa ma yin pa | IX,16c |
| gañ la rañ las grub med pa | XIV,13c |
| gañ la śar gyi phyogs yod pa | IX,15a |
| gañ las 'jig rten bstan 'byuñ ba | VIII,8a |
| gañ las don dam bśađ 'byuñ ba | VIII,8c |
| gañ las 'byuñ ba ñid du 'gyur | XVI,7b |
| gal te kun la gñis min na | XVI,12a |
| gal te kun la bdag yod na | X,14a |
| gal te khyod kyi bdag rtag na | X,17b |
| gal te khyod la mi dger 'gyur | IV,6c |
| gal te khyod la'añ de rigs na | XVI,12c |
| gal te gañ la dños de rnams | XIV,20a |
| gal te grol ba yod ñid na | X,21a |
| gal te 'ga' žig ma bskul bar | V,14b |
| gal te dños kun med pa'i phyir | XVI,19a |
| gal te dños po yod min na | XVI,9a |
| gal te dños las bum gžan na | XIV,3b |
| gal te gcig bum mi 'dod na | XIV,4a |
| gal te rtag tu mi rtag ñid | XI,23a |
| gal te stoñ pa'i ñes pa yis | XVI,3a |
| gal te thams cad 'jig rten pas | XVI,18a |
| gal te gcig bum mi 'dod na | XIV,4a |
| gal te rtag mi rtag ñid | XI,23a |
| gal te stoñ pa'i ñes pa yis | XVI,3a |
| gal te thams cad 'jig rten pas | XVI,18a |
| gal te dañ po gnas gyur na | XI,17b |
| gal te dus la gnas yod na | XI,19a |
| gal te de ñid dños yod na | XVI,16b |
| gal te de ltar 'gyur na ni | XIII,8c |
| gal te de la'añ śiñ yod na | XIV,18c |
| gal te bdag ces bya yod na | X,20a |
| gal te mdog las dbyibs gžan na | XIII,7a |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| gal te 'dod chags bde yin na | III,12a |
| gal te rdul la śin med na | XIV,18a |
| gal te sdig pa yod min na | IV,16b |
| gal te gnas pa mi rtag dañ | XI,24c |
| gal te phyir rgol gžan min na | XIV,5c |
| gal te phyogs ñid du 'gyur na | XVI,8b |
| gal te phrad de sgra 'dzin na | XIII,19a |
| gal te bya ba yod na ni | VIII,9c |
| gal te byas pa med kyañ chos | XI,12a |
| gal te byis pa'añ rnam kun tu | VII,15a |
| gal te ma 'oñs skyes yod na | XI,6a |
| gal te ma 'oñs mi rtag na | XI,7b |
| gal te mi rtag dños gžan na | XI,20a |
| gal te mi rtag chad na ni | X,22a |
| gal te mi rtag stobs chuñ min | XI,22a |
| gal te me ni rtag 'gyur na | X,10c |
| gal te smyon pa 'gyur na ni | VII,8b |
| gal te smra žin sgra 'gro na | XIII,18a |
| gal te brtse ba bya min na | IV,9b |
| gal te mdze can bžin de ltar | III,22a |
| gal te žig pa ma 'oñs pa'i | XI,2a |
| gal te gžan kyis śes na ni | VI,18b |
| gal te zil mnan tsha ba yañ | XIV,17a |
| gal te gzugs mthoñ ba yis de | XIII,3a |
| gal te gzugs mthoñ mig 'gro na | XIII,14a |
| gal te bzod pas 'bad med par | VI,21a |
| gal te yoñs su brtags pa na | XVI,5a |
| gal te yod pa skye 'gyur na | XI,10c |
| gal te rañ bžin gyis dños yod | XVI,23a |
| gal te las kyis dmañs rigs kyañ | IV,23a |
| gal te sun 'byin byed phyogs gcig | XVI,4c |
| gal te śes po ñid yin na | X,8b |
| gal te śes pa yod rtag na | X,10a |
| gal te sa bdag chos yin na | IV,11b |
| gus pa žen pa rkyañ par zad | VI,20d |
| go 'phañ dam par mi 'gror zad | VIII,13d |
| goñ ñid du ni bzlog par byas | XVI,9d |
| grags pa chen po ci ste med | IV,19d |
| grags pas yon tan 'ga' mi 'byuñ | IV,19b |
| grañ sogs rnams la phyir 'chos pa | II,17a |
| grub pa las sgrub yod ma yin | XV,2c |
| grub la ñes par mthar 'gyur na | VII,11c |
| grol la ma 'oñs yod ma yin | XI,14b |
| glags su snun pa'i rgyal po la | IV,16a |
| dga' na sgrub byed la cis min | XVI,4d |
| dga' ba gañ gis bskyed par 'gyur | IV,4d |
| dga' ba 'thad pa ma yin ñid | VII,25d |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| dga' bas 'tsho rnams rñed pa dka' | IV,6b |
| dge ba'am 'on te mi dge'an ruñ | V,5b |
| dge ba'i las can de la ni | V,21c |
| dge legs spañs pa thams cad dañ | VI,13c |
| mgal me'i 'khor lo sprul pa dañ | XIII,25a |
| mgon 'ga' yod pa ma yin na | IV,18b |
| mgon ñid de yis bdag ñid ni | IV,18c |
| mgon med de ni gañ gis mthoñ | IX,17d |
| mgon med bkres pas ñen rnams la | III,15a |
| 'gags pas skyes pa skye 'gyur ba | XV,19b |
| 'ga' zig 'ga' la phrag dog byed | III,16d |
| 'ga' zig 'jig rten 'dir yañ snañ | V,24b |
| 'ga' yañ sdug ces bya yod min | I,16b |
| 'ga' yañ yod pa ma yin no | IV,7d |
| 'ga' la'añ gañ dañ lhan cig tu | VIII,4a |
| 'gal ba rnams la bde'o zes | II,16c |
| 'ged pa yod pa ma yin na | IV,24b |
| 'gyur te ma 'oñs ñid mi srid | XI,3d |
| 'gyur na de ni mi rigs so | XIII,20d |
| 'grub par 'gyur ba ma yin zñi | VII,11b |
| 'gro ba dañ ni 'gror 'gyur na | II,14b |
| 'gro ba 'di kun mthoñ 'gyur te | XIII,15b |
| 'gro ba gžar yañ yod min na | VII,3b |
| 'gro ba śin tu rñed dkar gsuñs | VII,16d |
| 'gro la phan phyir gañ zig la | V,16a |
| 'gro la sogs pa'i sdug bñal dag | VII,9a |
| 'gros kyis 'gran pa lta bur mñon | VII,2d |
| rga bas ston par byed par 'gyur | I,14d |
| rgan ñid la khyod mi dga' na | I,11b |
| rgyal po 'jig rten mgon khyod la | IV,18a |
| rgyal po sdig la dbañ phyug ltar | IV,24a |
| rgyal po śi bar gyur pa la'añ | IV,19a |
| rgyal rigs zes byar 'gyur na ni | IV,23b |
| rgyu 'ga' zig gis stoñ pa yañ | XVI,1a |
| rgyu ci zig gis yañ dag 'dod | VII,17d |
| rgyu ñid yod pa ma yin te | IX,8b |
| rgyu ldan rtag pa yod min pa | IX,3b |
| rgyu ni gañ du yod mi 'gyur | IV,10b |
| rgyu ni rnam pa 'gyur ba na | IX,9a |
| rgyu ni gžan las grub gyur na | XIII,13b |
| rgyu ni log par 'gyur ba ste | IX,10d |
| rgyu med 'ga' yañ yod min te | V,1b |
| rgyu med pa las 'jug rnams kyi | III,7c |
| rgyu med par ni dños po med | IX,3a |
| rgyu yi zlum po gañ yin pa | IX,13a |
| sgo nas sdug bñal bskyed 'gyur ram | I,4d |
| sgyu ma zes byar mi rigs so | XIII,23d |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| sgyu ma bzin du skye bar 'gyur | XIII,23b |
| sgra ni rkyan par mi 'oñ na | XIII,19c |
| sgra med pa yan mthar sgra ñid | XIII,20c |
| sgra yi dan po gan gis 'dzin | XIII,19b |
| sgrib ces bya bar mi 'thad do | X,14d |
| brgal ba gzan po ci ste byed | XVI,12d |
| bsgribs sin de ñid gegs byed pa | XII,10b |
| bsgrim pa med par thar 'gyur te | XI,14a |
| bsgrub bya 'grub par mi 'thad do | XIII,5d |
| bsgrub min zes bya yod ma yin | V,21d |
| ñan 'gro yod na bde ba zes | II,19c |
| ñan soñ 'gro bar 'gyur na de | V,14c |
| ñal ba 'bras bu med pa 'byuñ | III,1d |
| ñes par khyod ni mkhas rnams ltar | I,9c |
| ñes par dgra dan 'drar 'gyur te | I,22b |
| ñes par thob 'gyur las bzin no | VIII,22d |
| ñes par de bzin gsegs rnams kysis | II,24c |
| ñes par 'dod chags rgyur gyur pa'i | III,24c |
| ñes par 'byuñ ba ma yin te | VI,19b |
| ñes par yod ces rtogs par gyis | V,24d |
| ñes ses bya ba brdzun par 'gyur | XIII,14d |
| ño bo ñid kysis gnod mi byed | VI,16b |
| ño bor ma 'oñs la yod na | XI,2b |
| ño bor gsal bar yod ma yin | XV,13d |
| ño mtshar min pa 'ga' med pa | XIII,24b |
| dños gan de ñid du yod pa | XVI,18c |
| dños de gan na'añ yod ma yin | III,24c |
| dños de ma byuñ ba las skye | IX,10b |
| dños rnams yoñs su 'gyur ba yan | XI,16a |
| dños po kun gyi dños med la | XVI,13a |
| dños po kun gyi ran bzin ni | XIII,16a |
| dños po kun la yod pa ni | XI,22b |
| dños po gan gan yoñs brtag pa | XIV,19a |
| dños po gan zig 'ga' la'añ | XIV,1a |
| dños po gan zig phyis skye ba | XI,9a |
| dños po dños por mi 'gyur te | XV,15a |
| dños po dños med mi 'gyur ro | XV,15d |
| dños po dños med las mi skye | XV,14b |
| dños po dños las mi skye ste | XV,14a |
| dños po gcig gi lta po gan | VIII,16a |
| dños po rtag pa la skyes pa | IX,11a |
| dños po mthoñ nas dños po ni | XVI,10a |
| dños po mi rtag pa rnams la | X,3c |
| dños po mi rtag par mi 'gyur | XI,20b |
| dños po med pa cis mi mthoñ | XI,11b |
| dños po med par dños po ni | XVI,20c |
| dños po med par mi rigs so | XVI,19d |

| | |
|-------------------------------------|----------|
| dños po med phyir dños med la | XVI,20a |
| dños po gtsañ ba thams cad kyi | III,19a |
| dños po yod ces bya bar 'gyur | XIV,22d |
| dños po yod pa ma yin no | XIV,6d |
| dños med dños por mi 'gyur ro | XV,15b |
| dños med dños med mi skye ste | XV,14c |
| dños med dños med mi 'gyur te | XV,15c |
| dños med dños las mi skye'o | XV,14d |
| mñar dañ 'jam pa thams cad dag | XIII,2c |
| mñon med de ni gañ gis mthoñ | IX,17d |
| mñon śes lña char yañ yod pa | V,17b |
| mñon sum ñid ni yod ma yin | XIII,4b |
| sñar skyes rñiñ par mi 'gyur źiñ | XV,8b |
| sñar skyes pa yi phyir na ni | XV,8a |
| sñar gyi sa bdag dge rnamś kyis | IV,15a |
| sñar mthoñ ba yi don gañ źig | XIII,22a |
| sñar byas sdig mthar byed par brjod | VI,15b |
| sñar yod ces byar mi rigs te | XI,10b |
| sñon dañ phyis dañ cig car źes | XV,7d |
| sñon byas pa yi rma mthoñ nas | X,7c |
| ci lta bur na mi rtag 'gyur | IX,11c |
| ci lta bur na smad mi 'gyur | I,12d |
| ci ste 'grub par 'gyur ma yin | XVI,3d |
| ci ste cuñ zad byed na yañ | XI,12c |
| ci ste gcig gis dregs yod ciñ | IV,5c |
| ci ste chos su 'gyur ma yin | IV,11d |
| ci ste de la skyes med na | XI,6c |
| ci ste gnas med na gnas pa | XI,19c |
| ci ste gźan gyis dregs bral min | IV,5d |
| ci źig gtoñ bar byed par 'gyur | XII,4b |
| ci yi phyir na 'gyur ma yin | XIII,16d |
| ci yi phyir na sgrub mi 'gyur | XVI,14d |
| ci yi phyir na 'das par 'gyur | XI,5b |
| ci yi phyir na 'das par 'gyur | XI,5d |
| cig car 'byuñ ba yod ma yin | XV,7d |
| cig car 'byuñ ba yod min źiñ | XV,11b |
| cig śos las ni gañ źig bden | III,6d |
| cis bde dka' thub can min źiñ | VI,1c |
| cis na khyod kyis 'du mthoñ źiñ | I,21c |
| cis nas khyod gus gyur ta re | VI,22d |
| cuñ zad mthoñ na bzañ 'gro ste | VIII,21b |
| co 'dri kho na yin par mthoñ | VII,7b |
| gcig gi stoñ ñid gañ yin pa | VIII,16c |
| gcig gi bdag can rdul yod min | XIV,18d |
| gcig ñid du ni mi rigs so | XIV,14d |
| gcig ñid la ni srid par 'gyur | III,25d |
| gcig na mi rtag ñid gañ yin | XI,20c |

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----------|
| gcig ni ñan 'gro ñid 'gro la | XII,12c |
| gcig yod gcig med ces bya ba | XVI,24a |
| gcig la gnod gañ de phrag dog | I,4c |
| gcig la bum pa yod 'gyur zñ | XIV,10c |
| gcin can kun la mtshuñs min na | III,22b |
| gcer bu pa la brtse bar 'gyur | XII,21d |
| bciñs pa zes bya yod min te | VII,4b |
| lcags kyi zu ñid bzin de'i phyir | X,12c |
| cha dañ tshul rol dbus yod phyir | XIII,4d |
| chags can kun gyi gyo ba yin | III,15d |
| chags can sdug bñal ldan pa snañ | III,14d |
| chags bral rnams la mdze po ltar | III,14c |
| chags la'añ sdug bñal bral ba yis | I,17c |
| chañ sogs dag la bdog pa kun | IV,17a |
| chad pa phyi ma bcor med pas | I,5c |
| chad par bya ba mñon brjod pa | VI,17b |
| chuñ ño sñam du sems byed dam | II,3d |
| chos gañ zig la thub pa yis | VIII,6a |
| chos chags de bzin gśegs rnams kysis | VIII,17a |
| chos 'di gañ gis śes gyur pa | XII,16a |
| chos 'di de bzin gśegs rnams kysis | XII,15a |
| chos 'di zlog byed mi 'gyur te | VIII,9d |
| chos 'di yi ni miñ las kyañ | XII,14a |
| chos 'dod chags pas khyod chags na | VII,22b |
| chos 'dod pa yi skye bo la | XII,18c |
| chos ni mdor na mi 'tshe bar | XII,23a |
| mchog tu bkrabs par brjod pa yin | V,7d |
| mchog la zi ba gsuñs gyur pa | VIII,14c |
| mchog la yid kyi sdug bñal te | II,8a |
| mchod pa sñam du sems sam ci | IV,17d |
| mchod par bya bar cis mi 'gyur | VI,17d |
| 'chi dañ chos dañ srid pa gžan | V,19a |
| 'chi bdag la yañ ga la 'jigs | I,25d |
| 'chi bdag la yañ 'jigs pa bskyed | V,2d |
| 'chi ba kun gyi thun moñ zñ | I,6b |
| 'chi ba bya ba ltar snañ ste | I,2c |
| 'chi bar 'dod pa dag snañ ste | VIII,13b |
| 'chi bar bya phyir skyes gyur ciñ | I,2a |
| 'chi bzin pa ni bde 'gyur zes | II,14c |
| 'chiñ dañ bciñs dañ thabs las gžan | IX,20a |
| ji lta bur na grol ba rnams | III,9c |
| ji lta bur na cig śos ni | XVI,7c |
| ji lta bur na dbyibs 'dzin 'gyur | XIII,7b |
| ji ltar kla klo skad gžan gyis | VIII,19a |
| ji ltar skye ba yod min ltar | XV,4b |
| ji ltar 'ga' zig dgar 'gyur ba | II,21b |
| ji ltar rgyun la lta ñes na | XIV,22a |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| ji ltar chos su mi 'gyur ba | XII,22b |
| ji ltar ji ltar dus 'gro ba | II,10a |
| ji ltar 'jigs pa bskyed 'gyur ba | V,2b |
| ji ltar da ltar bar mi 'gyur | XI,6b |
| ji ltar rnam śes gcig gis ni | XI,18a |
| ji ltar pha la bu sdug pa | I,15a |
| ji ltar bad kan la mkhris dan | VI,4a |
| ji ltar bram ze rnam la chos | XII,20a |
| ji ltar ma ni khyad par du | V,11a |
| ji ltar mi mthun mi rnam la | VIII,1a |
| ji ltar sman pa mkhas gyur pas | V,13a |
| ji ltar gzugs sogs ma gtogs par | XIV,15a |
| ji ltar bzlog pa mthoñ 'gyur ba | II,12b |
| ji ltar yañ ni 'gyur ba min | III,5d |
| ji ltar yañ ni ma mthoñ ño | III,12d |
| ji ltar rig pa blañs pa las | XII,21a |
| ji ltar re re rtsom pa 'gyur | XV,5d |
| ji ltar gśe ba po la ni | VI,17a |
| ji ltar sa bon mtha' mthoñ zñ | VIII,25a |
| ji ltar sa bon byas pa las | X,24a |
| ji ltar gso bya 'thob thob pa | IV,3a |
| ji srid sgra thos ma gyur pa | XIII,20a |
| ji srid gžan śes ma gyur pa | III,8a |
| 'jig rten kun la 'chi bdag sgra | V,2a |
| 'jig rten gyi ni bsrñ po dan | IV,5a |
| 'jig rten sñed mtho 'gas byas pa | V,7b |
| 'jig rten stobs ldan lta bur snañ | VII,19d |
| 'jig rten bde la mñon phyogs śñ | II,4a |
| 'jig rten 'di ni 'og tu 'gro | I,15c |
| 'jig rten 'di ni yoñs su 'khyam | I,19b |
| 'jig rten na ni rigs źes bsñad | IV,21b |
| 'jig rten pa 'di ñid bla yi | IX,25a |
| 'jig rten pa yi ma gtogs par | VIII,19c |
| 'jig rten pa la cuñ zad yod | IX,25c |
| 'jig rten pas kyañ don mi mthoñ | IX,5d |
| 'jig rten pha rol 'gro ba yod | VI,24b |
| 'jig rten bu ltar bskyañs pa de | IV,15b |
| 'jig rten tshul lugs gañ dan gañ | VII,19a |
| 'jig rten gžun bar nus ma yin | VIII,19d |
| 'jig rten yoñs su mi śes gañ | XII,2c |
| 'jig rten las ni gla len zñ | IV,8b |
| 'jig rten sa bdag rag las kyi | IV,12a |
| 'jig rten srid du gnas yod pa | V,16b |
| 'jig pa'i sgo dan 'dra bar snañ | XII,16d |
| 'jig pa'i bar du gyo ba med | X,11b |
| 'jigs pa cis na skye mi 'gyur | VII,1d |
| 'jigs pa med dam ci žig byed | VII,22d |

| | |
|--|----------|
| 'jug dañ ldog pa'añ dmigs par 'gyur | IX,7b |
| 'jug byed chos la goms pa ste | XII,9b |
| rje bo gtoñ por sems de bžin | IV,3b |
| rje bo sbyin bya byin byas nas | IV,3c |
| brjod pa ñid du nus ma yin | XVI,24d |
| brjod pa ñid du mi nus pa | XV,7b |
| brjod pa min par grags na ni | XVI,14b |
| brjod par rñed pa ma yin no | IV,20d |
| brjod pas 'jig rten pa yod na | XVI,18b |
| ñan po snod ces bya bar bśad | XII,1b |
| ñan po mñan bya 'chad po rnams | VII,5a |
| ñams par gyur pa dam chos kyi | V,10c |
| ñi ma sa steñ mig ldan la | XII,25c |
| ñid dañ rtag ñid mi rigs so | X,4d |
| ñid du ci yi phyir mi nus | XVI,15d |
| ñid ni yin par thal bar 'gyur | XV,16d |
| ñid las skye ba yod gyur pa | V,23b |
| ñin la rim pa gsum du'o | VI,6d |
| ñin re ñin re 'joms par byed | II,8d |
| ñes pa spañs pa gañ žig mthoñ | XVI,10d |
| ñon moñs dañ 'brel gañ zag min | V,9d |
| ñon moñs rnams mthar byed par 'gyur | VI,9d |
| ñon moñs bzo mkhan rnams la yañ | IV,11c |
| gñi ga gzugs la yod min na | XIII,17c |
| gñi ga yañ ni mig ñid kyi | XIII,8d |
| gñis ka min žes kyañ bstan te | VIII,20b |
| gñis ka las 'byuñ yod ma yin | XV,6d |
| gñis gñis dag ni med pa ru | XV,5c |
| gñis spyod ži bar yoñs mi 'gyur | VIII,10d |
| gñis mtshan mi mthun mthoñ nas ni | XIV,3a |
| mñan dañ khyad par 'phags pa yi | IV,25b |
| sñan pa yid du 'oñ ba'añ | VI,16a |
| sñiñ brtse legs žes mi 'dod pa | V,15b |
| brñas pa legs so sñam du sems | VI,24d |
| gtan tshigs kyis bzlog rañ phyogs kyañ | XVI,14c |
| gtan tshigs yod min gžan du yod | XVI,6d |
| gtam de kho na bśiad par bya | VI,6d |
| gti mug kun gyi tha mar gsuñs | II,24d |
| gti mug kun la gnas 'gyur te | VI,10b |
| gti mug bcom pas bcom par 'gyur | VI,6d |
| gti mug phyir na bu yi ni | I,14a |
| gti mug las ni gsos 'debs pa'o | VI,2d |
| gtoñ bar 'gyur na de dag gñis | IX,16b |
| gtoñ bo za po gtsañ žiñ 'gyur | VI,12b |
| rtag tu rkyen las bsruiñ bar bya | III,8d |
| rtag tu sdig las bsruiñ bar bya | II,19b |
| rtag tu bla ma'i thad gnas gsuñs | VI,13d |

| | |
|-------------------------------------|----------|
| rtag tu gžan las bsrūn bya gañ | VII,18c |
| rtag tu yid med ci ste min | XIII,21d |
| rtag tu yid pa ma yin na | II,17b |
| rtag tu sa 'dzin sogs dga' la | VI,12a |
| rtag pa gañ gi rgyu yin pa'i | IX,10a |
| rtag pa 'ga' yañ yod ma yin | IX,2d |
| rtag pa ñid du'añ mi ruñ ño | X,9d |
| rtag pa yod ces byar 'gyur ba | XIV,22b |
| rtag pa yod ñid min par 'gyur | IX,4d |
| rtag la gnod pa ga la yod | X,19a |
| rten ciñ 'brel par 'byuñ ba ni | VI,11a |
| rtog pa skye bar 'gyur min nam | X,3d |
| rtog pa sdug bsñal dbañ gyur pa | II,9b |
| rtog pa med par 'dod chags la | VIII,3a |
| rtog pas mthoñ ba 'chiñ ba ste | XVI,23c |
| lta ba ñan rnams 'jigs byed ciñ | XII,13b |
| lta ba'i sñā rol yod ma yin | XIII,12b |
| lta bas go 'phañ mchog tu 'gyur | XII,11d |
| lta las cis kyañ ma yin te | XII,11b |
| stoñ mthoñ yon tan ci žig yod | XVI,23b |
| stoñ ñid mya ñan 'das pa ste | XII,23c |
| stoñ pa gtan tshigs las 'gyur ba | XVI,21a |
| stoñ pa ma yin 'grub 'gyur na | XVI,3b |
| stoñ pa min pa lta bur snañ | XVI,1b |
| stoñ pa žes byar mi ruñ ño | XVI,2b |
| stoñ min stoñ ltar mthoñ min te | VIII,7b |
| stoñ pa'i gtan tshigs don med 'gyur | XVI,6b |
| stobs ldan dag la skye mi 'gyur | VI,22b |
| stobs ldan žes bya gañ žig mthoñ | XII,14d |
| brten nas pho mo ma niñ yin | X,2d |
| blta bya skyes pas bum pa ni | XIII,10a |
| bsten par byed pa 'ga' žig la | III,2a |
| bsten bžin pa yi mi rnams la | III,2c |
| tha dad cuñ zad yod min žiñ | III,3b |
| tha ma gañ du dmigs 'gyur ba | III,19b |
| tha mar rñiñ par mi 'gyur ro | XI,17d |
| tha mar med pa skye bar 'gyur | XV,1a |
| tha mal rnams la lus skyes so | II,8b |
| tha mal ma yin ži ñid du'o | XII,12d |
| thag riñ yun riñ gis mthoñ 'gyur | XIII,13b |
| thabs kyis kun tshe bsod nams gañ | V,8a |
| thabs gañ gis kyañ lus kyi ni | III,21a |
| thabs dañ de bžin ži gsuñs te | XII,2b |
| thabs rigs sna tshogs thabs kyis ni | V,12c |
| thams cad kho na mthoñ mi 'gyur | XIII,1b |
| thams cad mkhyen pa'i gžal bya yañ | V,18c |
| thams cad dge legs ñid 'gyur te | V,5c |

| | |
|-------------------------------------|----------|
| thams cad btañ bas mya ñan las | XII,3a |
| thams cad mthoñ bar 'gyur na ni | XIII,3b |
| thams cad sdug bsñal zes byar 'gyur | II,25d |
| thams cad 'bras bu'i don skye ba | IX,1a |
| thams cad bsrui byar mi 'gyur ro | IV,9d |
| thar pa gal te yod na ni | IX,20b |
| thar pa bdag gcig yod na ni | IX,23a |
| thar pa 'dod rnams la de ñid | VIII,17c |
| thar pa'i bar du 'phel ba ñid | VIII,6b |
| thub pa ñon moñs dgrar gzigs kyi | V,9c |
| thub pa ma gtogs ji lta'i dños | IX,1c |
| thub pas bsam mi khyab par gsuñs | XIII,11d |
| thub la mdzad dañ mdzad min dañ | V,3a |
| the tshom za ba tsam zig gis | VIII,5c |
| the tshom za bar yañ mi 'gyur | VIII,5b |
| thog ma bar dañ tha ma rnams | XV,5a |
| thog ma'i rgyu ni snañ min pa | VII,10b |
| thogs ldan dños po rtag pa ni | IX,19a |
| mtha' med ma yin mtha' bcas min | VII,5d |
| mtho ris 'dod pa rnams la gsuñs | VIII,17b |
| mthoñ na gti mug 'byuñ mi 'gyur | VI,11b |
| mthoñ na rnam kun de ldog 'gyur | XII,8b |
| mthoñ nas gañ la 'jigs mi 'byuñ | VII,10d |
| mthoñ ba min par cis mi 'gyur | XIII,3d |
| mthoñ bar gyur pa de dag ches | VII,24c |
| mthoñ zñ dños po mi snañ zñ | XI,25a |
| mthoñ zñ ma 'oñs gzan du na | I,3b |
| mthoñ zñ gzan du šes yod de | X,12b |
| da ltar ba yod ci zig med | XI,4b |
| da ltar ba yi dños po ni | XV,9a |
| da ltar byuñ ba'añ 'gro ñid de | VII,13c |
| da duñ rtswa sogs ci ste yod | X,22b |
| dag la ji ltar sbyin pa gtoñ | V,15d |
| dag la rtag tu sbyar bar bya | XIV,21d |
| dañ du med der ji ltar 'byuñ | XVI,11b |
| dañ po ñid du yod ma yin | IV,16d |
| dañ por gañ la rtsom med pa | II,20c |
| dañ por gti mug yañ dag 'byuñ | VI,6a |
| dañ por bdag la snañ 'gyur na | XIII,16b |
| dam bca' gtan tshigs las gzan ni | XVI,21c |
| dam pa ma yin phyogs yoñs 'dzin | VII,6b |
| dam pa min pa 'jigs pa skye | XII,14b |
| dam pa min la khyad par du'o | V,11d |
| dam pa min la bdag 'dzin mchog | XII,12a |
| dam pa'i sñiñ la mi gnas so | IV,25d |
| dam pa'i don la yod ma yin | IX,25d |
| dam pas 'jig rten kun gyi ma | IV,12c |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| dar mar rañ gis byas pa gañ | III,9a |
| dug tu 'gyur ba ma yin nam | VIII,18d |
| dus la ñes pa med pa'i phyir | I,7a |
| de ko rgyu cis 'jig rten ni | V,23c |
| de grub pa yis ci žig dgos | VII,20d |
| de rjes brtse bas mgon med pa | V,15c |
| de rgyu mdza' mo ñid yin žes | III,13c |
| de ñid kun gyi stoñ pa ñid | VIII,16d |
| de ñid kyis ni de ñid la | X,14c |
| de ñid mkhyen pas grub min gsuñs | IX,3d |
| de ñid dños te ga la gnas | XI,20d |
| de ñid du bdag med sñam du | XII,17a |
| de ñid phyir na ma 'brel ba'o | XVI,11d |
| de ñid min 'jig rten pa'añ min | XVI,24b |
| de ñid rig pa ñes pa las | X,20c |
| de ñid rig pa su žig smra | XIII,1d |
| de ñid las 'byuñ ma yin žiñ | XV,9b |
| de ñid šes pas gal te 'dir | VIII,22a |
| de rñed khyod la ño mtshar ltar | III,5c |
| de sñed du ni mi rnams la | II,11c |
| de lta na yañ da ltar ba | XI,16c |
| de lta na yañ de bsruñ bya | II,1b |
| de lta yin dañ srog 'di ni | XIII,21c |
| de lta yin dañ phyogs rnams kun | XVI,19c |
| de lta yin na ci ltar bur | XV,10c |
| de lta'añ gañ phyir skyes pa las | XV,22c |
| de lta'añ 'dis ni gžan smra rnams | XII,15c |
| de ltar gañ la dgoñs gnas pa | XII,17b |
| de ltar gyur kyañ khyod la go | VII,12c |
| de ltar de ltar sdug bsñal 'phel | II,10b |
| de ltar de la skye ma yin | I,15b |
| de ltar sdug bsñal chen po de | II,3c |
| de ltar sdug bsñal 'phel bžin la | II,12c |
| de ltar rnam kun dbye šes pas | VI,9c |
| de ltar phyogs ni bži char la | XVI,10c |
| de ltar phyogs med ñid med na | XVI,8c |
| de ltar phyi rol la ma yin | III,21d |
| de ltar mi kun gyis spoñ 'gyur | III,22d |
| de ltar yin na chags med par | XI,14c |
| de dag gis de dag mi rtogs | VI,3d |
| de dag gis gzugs ji ltar mthoñ | XIII,17d |
| de dag goms pa med pa yis | XII,9c |
| de dag gñis ni mthuñs par snañ | II,6d |
| de dag dañ ni smyon pa la | X,15c |
| de dag mi dge ji ltar byed | VII,23d |
| de dag la khyod mi 'jigs mod | I,5b |
| de dag la 'dir rnam kun tu | VII,25c |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| de dag las gžan rnam pa ni | XI,8c |
| de dag bsod nams las khyad 'phags | V,6d |
| de dañ de la gcig ñid med | XIV,19b |
| de dañ de la chos rjes 'jug | VII,19b |
| de 'dra la sogs mtshan ñid rnam | VI,12c |
| de na 'bras bu yod ma yin | IX,18d |
| de ni kun gyi lta por bśad | VIII,16b |
| de ni skye nañ blun žes bya | VII,21d |
| de ni gañ na'añ yod ma yin | XIV,1d |
| de ni gal te śnar yod na | XI,9b |
| de ni 'gro por yañ mi 'gyur | IX,16d |
| de ni rgan po mi 'dod na | III,9b |
| de ni sgrub sla cig śos min | VI,8d |
| de ni śnar yañ med pa ñid | X,21b |
| de ni chags pa yoñs btañ phyir | I,25c |
| de ni chos kun rnam gžag la | XIII,22c |
| de ni ji ltar bdag gir 'gyur | VII,18d |
| de ni ji ltar 'das par 'gyur | XI,2d |
| de ni 'jig rten par cis 'gyur | XVI,18d |
| de ni 'jig rten mi rtag brjod | XI,13d |
| de ni rtag ces byar yod min | IX,9d |
| de ni rtag par cis mi rtog | XI,7d |
| de ni tha chad ces byar brjod | VI,14d |
| de ni thub pa'i lta bur mñon | XII,2d |
| de ni de yis 'tšeñs par rlom | III,4b |
| de ni 'di ru dgag par bya | XVI,23d |
| de ni rnam dbyer mi 'gyur ro | XVI,13d |
| de ni sna tshogs 'gyur na go | IX,12c |
| de ni 'phags la ma 'dus pa'o | XIV,24d |
| de ni bud med phrad pa'i tshe | III,15c |
| de ni 'bras bu la yod min | IX,13b |
| de ni smad par cis mi sems | III,18d |
| de ni gžan gyi dbaň 'gyur te | IX,7c |
| de ni gžan gyi yañ mi 'dod | IX,14b |
| de ni gžan la blun pa ñid | XII,6b |
| de ni gžan la mi dga' ste | XII,16b |
| de ni yod pas ga la dga' | XII,17c |
| de ni rañ dbaň mi 'gyur ro | XIV,23b |
| de ni rañ bžin žes byar bśad | X,21d |
| de ni sa steñ blun žes bya | IV,7b |
| de ni śin tu bya dka' byed | XII,7b |
| de ni so sor 'gog par byed | XVI,1d |
| de ni gsal bar blo ldan min | VIII,6d |
| de ni gsum la'añ yod ma yin | XVI,2d |
| de rnam ma gtogs rañ med gañ | XIV,11c |
| de phyir kun na sdug bśnal las | II,9c |
| de phyir skye dañ bum pa la | XV,7c |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| de phyir rgyu dañ 'bras bu gñis | IX,14c |
| de phyir rgyal rigs zes bya ba | IV,22d |
| de phyir bsgrub par bya ba yis | XIII,5c |
| de phyir 'jig pa skye 'dra zin | XV,12c |
| de phyir ñon moñs thams cad kyañ | VI,10c |
| de phyir stoñ par mi 'gyur na | XVI,21b |
| de phyir thub pa'i gzuñ lugs phra | XII,19d |
| de phyir thub pas skye 'jig dag | II,22c |
| de phyir mtho ris kyañ rñed dka' | I,5d |
| de phyir de yi ño bo ni | X,13c |
| de phyir bdag ni sdig pa bas | VI,24c |
| de phyir bde ba lus 'di yi | II,10c |
| de phyir bde la sogs bzin te | X,9c |
| de phyir 'dod pa don med pa'o | VIII,2d |
| de phyir nañ bdag bsam pa la | VIII,21c |
| de phyir rnam rtog las byuñ ba | VI,16c |
| de phyir rnam pa kun tu'añ bdag | IX,24c |
| de phyir phyogs can la phyogs ni | IX,6c |
| de phyir byañ chub sems dpa' la | V,19c |
| de phyir 'bad pa kun gyis 'dir | VI,11c |
| de phyir ma 'oñs yod ma yin | XI,1d |
| de phyir mi rtag gañ yin pa | II,25c |
| de phyir med par mi 'gyur na | XVI,17b |
| de phyir dman byuñ mi sñan pa | VI,19c |
| de phyir gzugs sogs rnam sbyor ba | XIV,8c |
| de phyir gzugs sogs las gzan du | XIV,12c |
| de phyir yi ge brjod pa yañ | XIII,6c |
| de phyir yod pa'añ mi skye'o | XV,2d |
| de phyir yod par mi 'gyur ro | XVI,17d |
| de phyir lus kyi gyo ba la | X,5c |
| de phyir slob ma zes bya'o | V,8d |
| de bas sems can gcig 'dul po | V,7c |
| de byas yon tan ci zig yod | I,24d |
| de med na ni srid pa la | IX,23c |
| de med par ni mi gnas pa | III,20b |
| de gtsañ zes byar mi rigs la | III,24b |
| de tshe skye ba yod min zin | XV,3a |
| de tshe ci ste de dag ñid | X,2c |
| de tshe ci phyir skye bar 'gyur | XV,20d |
| de tshe gcig la yañ rgyas par | VII,10c |
| de tshe chags pa tshoñ dañ ni | I,16c |
| de tshe de dag gti mug phyir | VIII,13c |
| de tshe dbañ rtogs de 'dra la | XIII,24c |
| de tshe mi ses 'ba' zig las | X,1c |
| de tshe gzan tshe mi skye na | XV,3c |
| de tshe gzugs chen ci ste min | XIV,5b |
| de mtshuñs blun po su zig yod | VI,21d |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| de mtshuñs brtse med šu zig yod | IV,8d |
| de gžan las yoñs bsrñ bya na | VII,18b |
| de bžin kun mkhyen sgra 'di ni | V,2c |
| de bžin kun la skyon šes la | VIII,1c |
| de bžin skye ba las kyi ni | XII,22c |
| de bžin khro la 'dod chags dañ | VI,4c |
| de bžin rgyu ni ma tshañ phyir | VIII,25c |
| de bžin 'gags la 'gro ba med | XV,10b |
| de bžin gcer bu rnams la chos | XII,20c |
| de bžin ñon moñs blañs pa las | XII,21c |
| de bžin sñan par smra po la | VI,17c |
| de bžin sdug bsñal phyir 'chos te | II,21c |
| de bžin rnam šes gñis kyi ni | XI,18c |
| de bžin byañ chub sems dpa'i brtse | V,11c |
| de bžin mi rtag thams cad ni | X,24c |
| de bžin tshogs la lta ñes na | XIV,22c |
| de bžin gžan gyi dños por yañ | XV,4c |
| de bžin gžan la šin tu ni | V,25c |
| de bžin rluñ la sogs pa ni | XIV,15c |
| de bžin gšegs pa rnams kyiś gsuñs | XII,23b |
| de bžin gšegs pa rnams gsuñ ño | VIII,7d |
| de bžin gšegs pa yod ma yin | IX,1d |
| de gzugs las gžan ji ltar min | XIV,11d |
| de yañ ci ste mer mi 'gyur | XIV,17b |
| de yañ bdag la mi rigs so | I,18d |
| de yañ lus kyiś 'dzin par 'gyur | XIII,9b |
| de yañ blun min la med na | III,10b |
| de yañ mi 'gyur de ltar byos | VII,4d |
| de yi thar pa mi rigs so | X,19d |
| de yi de de sñar spyad bya | V,10b |
| de yi don du ci ste 'joms | VII,11d |
| de yi bdag ñid 'grub 'gyur na | XIV,1c |
| de yi bde ba ci 'dra žig | III,10d |
| de yi ldog par byed pa'i rgyu | XII,24c |
| de yi phyir na skye bžin pa | XV,19c |
| de yi phyir na rgyu rnams kun | IX,8c |
| de yi phyir na chos pas kyañ | VII,19c |
| de yi phyir na da ltar bar | XI,3c |
| de yi phyir na bdag gžan ni | XV,6c |
| de yi phyir na phya smra ba | XI,9c |
| de yi bar du sgrar mi 'gyur | XIII,20b |
| de yi mi rtag ñid gañ las | XI,4d |
| de yi dman par dman lta'i dños | V,17c |
| de yi tshe na 'jug pa dañ | XV,25c |
| de yis de de sñar dpyad bya | V,10b |
| de yis stoñ pa ñid bsten te | XII,5c |
| de yis gžan po ji ltar bskyed | XIV,13d |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| de yis sems pa can sems pa | X,8c |
| de yod na ni ñon moñs nams | VI,25c |
| de la skye ba yod ma yin | XV,4d |
| de la skye bzin pa med de | XV,18c |
| de la dge legs 'gro ba yañ | XII,10c |
| de la bsgom pa skye bar 'gyur | VI,23b |
| de la chos don med par 'gyur | VII,21b |
| de la thar pa mi rigs so | X,19d |
| de la thog ma yod min ltar | VIII,25b |
| de la mthar 'phel ga la yod | II,20d |
| de la de yi dños po ru | XV,4a |
| de la phan 'dod bla ma yis | V,8a |
| de la gtsaṅ ba yod do źes | III,19c |
| de la źi gus ga la yod | VIII,12b |
| de la yun ni riñ po na'añ | XVI,25c |
| de la riñ ba yod ma yin | XI,11d |
| de la riñ med bsgrub pa'añ med | XIII,15d |
| de la śar gyi cha yañ yod | IX,15b |
| de la śin tu gduñ mi 'gyur | III,9d |
| de la sor gnas dag phuñ na | V,16c |
| de las ci yañ mi skye ste | IX,20c |
| de las 'jug pa gsuñs pa ste | VIII,8b |
| de las ldog pa gsuñs pa'o | VIII,8d |
| de las ma ruñs gźan ci yod | I,1d |
| de las bsod nams chen po byed | II,1d |
| de srid de ni khyod la 'dug | III,8b |
| deñ sañ ri dwags dgon par byas | IV,15d |
| de'i sman phaṅs pa yin phyir ro | VI,5d |
| der ni grañs sogs tha dad par | XIV,6c |
| des kyañ gcig tu mi 'gyur ro | XIV,4d |
| des kyañ ma skyes pa skye ste | XV,23c |
| des de bdag min ma ñes phyir | X,3b |
| des de la khyod mi 'jigs te | VI,7b |
| des rdul rdul phran min par bśñad | IX,15d |
| des na kun mkhyen kun mkhyen ni | V,3c |
| des na skye bo 'jig 'di la | II,4c |
| des na skyes bu yod śes pa | X,11c |
| des na khyod la 'gro bzañ dkon | IV,6d |
| des na gañ gi bdag rtag pa | X,19c |
| des na dgrar gyur de dag la | I,22c |
| des na rgyu ni rtag ma yin | IX,18b |
| des na rgyu med las grub ni | IX,3c |
| des na ñes par cuñ zad cig | XII,8c |
| des na ñes par thub pa yis | XII,4c |
| des na ñes par las rnam smin | XI,11b |
| des na gcig ñid yod ma yin | XIV,20d |
| des na gcig ñid la sogs gsum | XVI,5c |

| | |
|----------------------------------|----------|
| des na chad par mi 'gyur zin | X,25b |
| des na rtag tu mchog tu byos | VIII,14d |
| des na rtag par mi 'gyur ro | X,25d |
| des na rtag yod min de'i phyir | IX,1b |
| des na stoñ par mi 'gyur na | XVI,22b |
| des na blta bya ñid skye ltar | XIII,10c |
| des na du ma dag kyañ med | XIV,19d |
| des na de thar zes mi brjod | IX,20d |
| des na de la srid pa dañ | V,22c |
| des na bdag ñid kun sbyor ba | IX,13c |
| des na bdag ñid ses pa dkon | I,10d |
| des na bdag ni yod ma yin | XIV,23d |
| des na bdag la chos 'di ni | XII,16c |
| des na mdor na 'khor ba ni | VII,5c |
| des na 'di yod 'di ces med | XVI,24c |
| des na nam yañ gañ zig tu | IX,2c |
| des na nam yañ sañs rgyas rnam | IX,19c |
| des na snañ nas snañ bar ni | VII,16c |
| des na bud śiñ zes bya ba | XIV,16c |
| des na bum pa bzin tshogs pa | XIV,14c |
| des na 'bras bu yañ 'gyur ro | IX,7d |
| des na med pa skye mi 'gyur | XV,2b |
| des na med pa ga la skye | XV,1b |
| des na gzan 'joms khro ba la | VI,22c |
| des na yan lag kyañ yod min | XIV,9d |
| des na yod pa ga la skye | XV,1d |
| des na re zig de bum min | XIV,9b |
| des na reg pa 'ba' zig ni | XIII,9c |
| des na las kun zad pa la | VII,9c |
| des na śiñ med me yod de | XIV,18b |
| des na sems can thams cad la | IV,21c |
| des na so so'i skye bo rnam | VII,6c |
| des na srid pa gsod gnas dañ | VII,7c |
| des na bsam mi khyab mthu yañ | V,24c |
| don gcig rnam par mi ses so | XI,18d |
| don gñis rnam par mi ses pa | XI,18b |
| don dam rnam kun ma yin te | IX,25b |
| don min sa bon gyur pa yi | XII,18a |
| don la log pa kho na 'byuñ | XI,25d |
| drañ sroñ rnam kyis spyod pa kun | IV,14a |
| dran pa zes bya log pa yi | XI,25c |
| dri ñid du ni mi 'thad de | XIV,14b |
| dregs pa yis ni kha cig la | III,16a |
| gdul bya ma yin śiñ tu dkon | V,13d |
| bdag kyañ nag ces brjod nus sam | XVI,22d |
| bdag gam bdag gi sñam dregs pa | IV,1a |
| bdag gi dños po 'byuñ ba med | XV,6b |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| bdag ñid dga' ba bskyed pa yi | IV,10a |
| bdag ñid gta' mar b'zag byas te | I,9a |
| bdag ñid rnam par dag mi 'dod | VI,15d |
| bdag ñid 'tshoñ la bdag ñid ni | I,8c |
| bdag rtag sñam du sems na ni | I,7b |
| bdag ni 'chi'o sñam sems pa | I,25a |
| bdag ni gtoñ ba po sñam rlom | IV,3d |
| bdag ni mya ñan 'da' 'gyur zes | VIII,7a |
| bdag ni yod par gyur na'añ gzugs | X,23a |
| bdag med ces ni bya bar brjod | XII,13d |
| bdag med sñam pa mi rigs śiñ | X,20b |
| bdag med ston pa ma yin te | XII,12b |
| bdag med la khyod cis mi dga' | X,17d |
| bdag la 'dod chags bral bar zad | I,9d |
| bde gyur dag kyañ rñed dka' ste | II,4b |
| bde ba rtag tu yod min te | II,20b |
| bde ba rtog pa'i dbañ gyur ciñ | II,9a |
| bde ba dor bya zes bya bar | III,12c |
| bde ba zes bya ci yañ med | II,23d |
| bde ba g'zan las skye 'gyur na | III,13b |
| bde ba la sogs dañ ldan srog | X,9a |
| bde ba'i bdag tu mi 'gyur te | II,7b |
| bde ba'i rgyu dag snañ ma yin | II,11d |
| bde bar gyur pa'i lus po ni | II,6a |
| bde bas 'dod chags 'phel 'gyur žiñ | VI,1a |
| bde bas gyogs ltar mi mthoñ na | II,23b |
| bde'o sñam du sems par byed | II,21d |
| bde sogs b'zin du sna tshogs mthoñ | X,9b |
| mdun gyis len žiñ rgyab kyis ni | IX,16a |
| mdog kyañ ci ste 'dzin mi 'gyur | XIII,7d |
| mdog mi sdug pa 'ba' žig byed | VI,14b |
| mdor na mi rtag mi gtsañ dañ | III,25a |
| 'da' bar ya mtshan can kun 'dod | XII,3b |
| 'das pa thob sla cig śos min | VIII,11d |
| 'das dus śin tu riñ ba dañ | IV,22a |
| 'das pa dañ ni da ltar ba | XI,8a |
| 'das pa las kyañ yod ma yin | XV,9d |
| 'das pa las ni 'das gyur pa | XI,5a |
| 'das pa las ni ma 'das pa | XI,5c |
| 'das la 'jig pa yod min te | XI,7c |
| 'das la thog ma yod min la | I,21a |
| 'das la bde ba yod min žiñ | VII,13a |
| 'di kun rañ dbañ med pa ste | XIV,23c |
| 'di ña'i g'zan gyi ma yin zes | III,11c |
| 'di ñid kho nar yid ces bya | XII,5d |
| 'di dañ g'zan du bdag ñid ni | II,19a |
| 'di na g'zan lugs las byuñ ba'i | XVI,6c |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| 'di na yul log gyur pa la | VII,17a |
| 'di na yod pa ma yin no | XIII,6d |
| 'di na yon tan 'gar mi 'gyur | XIII,10b |
| 'di na'añ gnod pa yod min te | V,22b |
| 'di na'añ myañ 'das med min gyi | VIII,23c |
| 'di nas 'byuñ ba'añ bya bar dka' | VIII,12d |
| 'di ni mkhas pa gcig ñid sogs | XIV,21c |
| 'di ni gal te bden 'gyur na | X,22c |
| 'di ni dbaṅ phyug rten min žes | IV,20c |
| 'di ni mi rtag 'gyur min la | XI,8b |
| 'di ni śin tu bya dka' ba'o | V,17d |
| 'di yi 'gro bar spro ba ñid | I,14c |
| 'di la rgyu ni ci yod sñam | X,6b |
| 'di la yon tan 'gar mi 'gyur | XIII,10b |
| 'di las mi rigs gžan ci yod | X,16d |
| 'dir ni de gñis 'ba' žig go | XII,23d |
| 'dir byin pa yi sbyin pa las | V,20a |
| 'du ba dañ ni 'bral ba dag | I,20c |
| 'du śes phuñ po žes bya'o | XIII,22d |
| 'dod chags kyañ ni 'byuñ bar 'gyur | XI,14d |
| 'dod chags rkyen las skye ba gañ | VI,8c |
| 'dod chags rgyu las skye 'gyur žiñ | VI,8a |
| 'dod chags can gyi mi la snañ | VI,12d |
| 'dod chags bran bžin bkol bya ste | VI,5a |
| 'dod chags mdza' min mdza' 'dra ba | VI,7a |
| 'dod chags yun riñ mi gnas te | VIII,24b |
| 'dod chags yun riñ mi gnas so | VIII,1d |
| 'dod chags las ni sdud pa ste | VI,2a |
| 'dod pas bde ba ga la yin | II,5b |
| 'dod re 'phel ba'añ de bžin no | III,2d |
| 'dra ba 'ba' žig skye bar zad | I,16d |
| 'dra la dam pa lta bur 'gyur | I,11d |
| 'dren pa'i slad bžin dam pa ni | XII,7c |
| rdul phran gcig gi gnas gañ yin | IX,14a |
| rdul phran rtag pa ñid mi gsuñs | IX,19d |
| rdul phran rnams la mi 'thad do | IX,13d |
| rdul phran la yañ yod pa'i dños | XVI,11a |
| rdul la cha śas yod med ces | XIII,5a |
| rdo rje bsruñ byar mi 'gyur ro | X,6d |
| ldan 'di mtshuñs pa'añ ma yin pa | XIV,4c |
| ldan pa 'ba' žig la mi skye | III,7b |
| ldog pa rgyu las ga la žig | III,7d |
| ldog pa 'thad pa ñid mi 'gyur | XV,25d |
| ldog byed chos la 'jigs par 'gyur | XII,9d |
| ldoñs pas 'dod pa'i skyon mi mthoñ | III,14b |
| sdañ la bsam thag ci žig yod | V,16d |
| sdig las ci yi phyir na byed | I,9b |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| sdug bsñal kun gyi snod gyur pa | II,2c |
| sdug bsñal gyi ni rgyu mañ po | II,11a |
| sdug bsñal gyur pa'i skye bo la | I,19c |
| sdug bsñal 'ged pas ci žig bya | I,19d |
| sdug bsñal rgya mtsho 'di la mtha' | VII,1a |
| sdug bsñal rjes su sñegs pa 'dra | II,4d |
| sdug bsñal gñis kyis 'jig rten 'di | II,8c |
| sdug bsñal 'dod pas rñed 'gyur gyi | II,5a |
| sdug bsñal rnam par 'ged lta bu | I,19a |
| sdug bsñal snod du 'gyur ba ste | II,6b |
| sdug bsñal dpuñ med las khro sdug | VI,3b |
| sdug bsñal ba dañ bdag med ces | III,25b |
| sdug bsñal rtsom la'añ bde ci yod | II,22b |
| sdug bsñal yin žes gsuñs pa sñam | II,22d |
| sdug bsñal las kyi rnam smin phyir | XII,22a |
| sdug bsñal las thar mi rnams la | IX,24a |
| sdug pa dka' thub can cis yin | VI,1d |
| sdug pas khro ba 'phel 'gyur na | VI,1b |
| nags su 'gro bya sñam sems na | I,24b |
| nañ phugs gtsaň bar mi 'gyur na | III,21b |
| nad kyi dbaň gis thams cad kyaň | VIII,20c |
| nad pa sgrub med dkon de bžin | V,13b |
| nad nañ daň mtshuñs bud med ni | III,8c |
| nad bcos rga ba gso bya des | I,5a |
| nad thebs bu la gduñ 'gyur ba | V,11b |
| nad rnams daň gžan snaň gyur pa | II,11b |
| nam žig skye ba yod par 'gyur | XV,3d |
| nam žig dus na 'chi bdag gis | I,7c |
| nam žig 'byuñ ba yod par 'gyur | XV,11d |
| nam yaň rgyu daň 'bras bu gñis | IX,11c |
| nam yaň blo gros la mi gnas | VI,25d |
| nus med la khros bdag ñid la | VI,14a |
| nus pa gaň la'añ brtse med pa | VI,14c |
| nus pa med pas 'byuñ kun la | II,16a |
| gnas kyaň 'jig rten 'di la ni | VII,2c |
| gnas pa 'jig daň 'dra bar snaň | XV,12d |
| gnas pa stobs chuñ ma yin na | XI,21b |
| gnas pa dus su mi 'gyur ro | XI,19b |
| gnas ma yin par sbyar ba'i sman | VIII,18c |
| gnas med dños po ga la žig | XI,17a |
| gnod pa rtag tu yod 'gyur na | II,15b |
| gnod pas gzir bar byas zin kyaň | I,18a |
| gnod med thar pa ga la yod | X,19b |
| gnod bžin pa ni bde'o žes | II,15c |
| rnam kun khyod 'dod chags mi bya | I,22d |
| rnam kun rñan pa daň mtshuñs 'gyur | VII,23b |
| rnam kun šes yod ma yin pa | X,15b |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| rnam pa kun tu de rnams la | VII,14c |
| rnam pa kun tu 'dod chags ni | III,17c |
| rnam pa kun tu mi rigs so | II,16d |
| rnam pa kun tu'añ rigs ma yin | II,15d |
| rnam pa kun tu'añ rigs ma yin | II,17d |
| rnam pa kun tu'añ mi rigs so | II,18d |
| rnam pa kun tu yod min na | VII,1b |
| rnam pa kun tu'añ rigs ma yin | II,14d |
| rnam pa kun tu rigs ma yin | II,19d |
| rnam pa kun tu rigs ma yin | XIV,8d |
| rnam pa kun tu śin srin las | X,6c |
| rnam pa rtog pa med par zad | I,14b |
| rnam par gnas med sña ma'am | III,6c |
| rnam par dpyad pa 'di fiid kysis | XIII,2a |
| rnam par dbye ba mi rigs te | XVI,13b |
| rnam smin yin phyir chos ma yin | XII,22d |
| rnam śes gnas pa med pa las | VII,8a |
| rnam śes la yañ lta med la | XIII,17b |
| rnams kyi phyogs ni log mi 'gyur | XI,9d |
| sna tshogs rtag par mi rigs so | IX,12d |
| sna yi tshab mas dgar 'gyur ltar | III,23b |
| snod ni cis kyañ ma yin no | V,10d |
| snod ni smad par 'byuñ 'gyur na | III,18b |
| dpyad pa der yañ 'jug pa 'gyur | XIII,5b |
| pha rol nus ldan blta bya ste | IV,25c |
| phal cher ñes par ñan 'gror 'gro | VII,6d |
| phal cher blun pa brjod pa yin | XII,20d |
| phal cher phyi 'chos brjod pa ltar | XII,20b |
| phal mo che na mi rnams ni | VII,6a |
| phul 'gro las ches phul 'gro ba | V,24a |
| pho mo ma niñ yod min pa | X,2b |
| phyi nas kun tu skyes pa yañ | XV,8c |
| phyi nas skyes par mi 'gyur ro | XV,8d |
| phyi nas lta ba kun bzlog pa | VIII,15c |
| phyi nas de dag ñes par go | XI,21c |
| phyi nas mi rtag par 'gyur ro | XI,23d |
| phyi nas yod pa min par grag | XV,23b |
| phyi rol gyur phyir ma skyes skye | XV,22d |
| phyin ci log tu gyur pa'i chos | VII,17c |
| physis ni 'dod chags 'byuñ ba ste | VI,6c |
| phyogs 'ga' rgyu ma yin des na | IX,12b |
| phyogs med phyogs kyi ño bor 'gyur | XVI,8b |
| phyogs źes bya ba phyogs can ni | IX,6a |
| 'phel bźin pa yi bde ba la | II,12a |
| 'phrod pa dus par gyur kyañ gzugs | XIV,14a |
| bar du khro ba byuñ 'gyur źiñ | VI,6b |
| bar du bdag ni bzlog pa dañ | VIII,15b |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| bu sogs rnams phyir ci ste yin | I,12b |
| bud med kun la 'khrig pa la | III,3a |
| bud med dag gis dgos med 'gyur | III,12b |
| bud med la la la chags pa | III,16c |
| bud med lhan cig sbyor ba na'añ | III,13a |
| bud śin gis don yod mi 'gyur | X,10d |
| bum pa 'ga' yañ yod ma yin | XIV,12d |
| bum pa rgyu las grub 'gyur źin | XIV,13a |
| bum pa mñon sum źes bya ba'añ | XIII,1c |
| bum pa med par cis mi rtog | XV,21d |
| bum pa yod pa ma yin pa | XIV,15b |
| bum pa la ni rgyu yod min | XIV,12a |
| bum pa la gzugs yod min źin | XIV,2c |
| bum pa las gźan cis mi 'gyur | XIV,3d |
| bum pa'añ gcig tu mi 'gyur ro | XIV,4b |
| bum yod ma yin 'das pa med | XI,1b |
| bum las min źes khyod 'dod na | XIV,11b |
| boñ tshod mñam par 'dod ma yin | IX,14d |
| bya dgos chad pas byed par 'gyur | I,23d |
| bya 'ga' sa steñ yod min na | II,18d |
| bya ba skye bźin par mi 'gyur | XV,17b |
| bya ba dañ ldan rtag pa med | X,17a |
| bya ba med pa med dañ mtshuñs | X,17c |
| bya ba bźi po thams cad ni | III,25c |
| bya ba rigs pa ma yin no | II,7d |
| bya rog ji ltar de bźin du | XVI,22c |
| byañ chub sems dpa' stobs rñed nas | V,13c |
| byañ chub sems dpa' sems dañ po | V,6a |
| byañ chub sems dpa'i yul du ni | V,14a |
| byams ldan mkhas pa su źig smra | I,8d |
| byas zin 'bad pa med par 'jig | VII,12b |
| byas la yod pa ñid mthoñ nas | IX,4c |
| byis khyod 'dir ni byiñ ba la | VII,1c |
| byis rnams ñes pa kho nar ni | XII,9a |
| byis pa so so'i skye bo ni | IV,9c |
| byed pa log par 'gyur ba ste | X,10b |
| byed pas yañ srid 'gyur te des | VIII,11b |
| byed med mya ñan 'da' gyur źin | VIII,11a |
| bram ze gus pa skye ba ltar | XII,21b |
| bral bar rigs pa ma yin no | VIII,4d |
| bral bas bskyed pa'i sdug bsñal ni | I,17a |
| blun po min pa su źig 'dzin | III,13d |
| blun po'i 'dod chags yon tan dañ | III,7a |
| blun min rgyal srid mi thob la | IV,13a |
| blun la brtse ba yod min na | IV,13b |
| blun la śin tu zab chos la | V,25a |
| blo gros ñan pa khyod ci chags | III,4d |

| | |
|------------------------------------|----------|
| blo gros ldan pa blo bskyed do | VII,9d |
| blo ñan bral ba'i 'jigs pa yis | I,23a |
| blo mchog ldan pas dri źim dañ | XIII,2b |
| blo dañ ldan pa su źig 'gyur | VII,3d |
| blo dañ ldan pa su źig 'dzin | VIII,3d |
| blo ldan mi ni gañ źig smra | III,19d |
| blo ldan gźan gyis smad byar 'gyur | V,14d |
| blo ldan legs pa 'dod pa blañ | XII,25b |
| dbañ du byas la rag las 'gyur | IV,2d |
| dbañ po rnams dañ bral sems kyis | XIII,21a |
| dbañ phyug gis bskyed ña rgyal ni | IV,25a |
| dbugs kyañ sems can rnams la ni | V,1c |
| 'bad rtsol med par spyod pa źes | II,18a |
| 'byuñ ba kun la rluñ bźin du | VI,2c |
| 'byuñ ba śin tu rñed dka' ste | VII,5b |
| 'byuñ bar rigs pa ma yin no | III,17d |
| 'byuñ źin khro ba 'byuñ rigs kyi | III,17b |
| 'bral ba ci ltar dga' ma yin | I,20b |
| 'bras bu chen po 'byuñ 'gyur źes | V,20b |
| 'bras bu ñid du thal bar 'gyur | IX,8d |
| 'bras bu thams cad ñes par ni | VII,11a |
| 'bras bu med ñid gañ 'dod la | XI,15b |
| 'bras bu med par rgyu la ni | IX,8a |
| 'bras bu med par dños po ni | XIV,24a |
| 'bras bu yis ni rgyu bśig pa | IX,18a |
| 'bras bu yis ni rgyu bśig pa | XV,2a |
| 'bras bu yod ces bya bar 'gyur | XI,13b |
| 'bras bu yod ñid gañ 'dod dañ | XI,15a |
| 'bras bu yod pa ma yin pa | XV,25b |
| 'bras bu yod pa mi srid do | XI,12d |
| 'bras bu'i don du 'du ba gañ | XIV,24c |
| 'briñ la tshul khrims gsuñs pa ste | VIII,14b |
| sbyin pa dman pa la gsuñs śin | VIII,14a |
| sbyin pa'i sgra ni rtag tu sñan | V,19d |
| sbyin pa'i sgra yis gsal byed pa | V,19b |
| sbyor dañ grol rnams rñed par dka' | VIII,23d |
| ma skyes pa las phyi rol gyur | XV,22b |
| ma chags pa la bde med ciñ | III,10a |
| ma gtogs gzugs kyañ yod ma yin | XIV,15d |
| ma btañ su źig dga' bar 'gyur | IV,18d |
| ma rtogs sems can rtogs par byed | V,12d |
| ma brten par ni yod ñid med | IX,2b |
| ma mthoñ skrag pa mi rtsom ste | XII,8a |
| ma mthoñ de phyir las kun la | V,4c |
| ma mthoñ der myañ 'das gañ źig | IX,21d |
| ma mthoñ ba yis gzugs mthoñ ba | XIII,3c |
| ma dris ñid du de 'gro ba | I,13c |

ma phrad pa las 'dod chags ni
 ma byas gal te rtag na ni
 ma byas pa ni med ces brjod
 ma byuñ žes bya skye ma yin
 ma 'oñs rtag par 'gyur ram ci
 ma 'oñs tha ma yod min na
 ma 'oñs tha ma yod min žiñ
 ma 'oñs mtha' ñid mthoñ gyur nas
 ma 'oñs bdag ñid du yod gañ
 ma 'oñs bdag tu gnas 'gyur ba
 ma 'oñs pa yi dños mthoñ na
 ma 'oñs pa yi don lta žiñ
 ma 'oñs pa yod 'das pa yod
 ma 'oñs pa yi 'bras mthoñ nas
 ma 'oñs pa la'añ yod min la
 ma 'oñs bum la da ltar ba'i
 ma 'oñs las 'byuñ yod min la
 ma yin de ltar dños po yañ
 ma yin des na gtañ tshigs med
 ma yin yid 'gro spro ma yin
 mañ ñid 'thad par mi 'gyur ro
 mi dgar 'gyur ba rgyu ci žig
 mi dge ñes chen byed pa ste
 mi 'gyur ñan po la yañ min
 mi rtag ñid gar stobs chuñ der
 mi rtag dag las 'byuñ bar 'gyur
 mi rtag pa la ñes par gnod
 mi rtag pas gnas ga la yod
 mi rtag byas par mthoñ gyur nas
 mi rtag yin na ci ltar bur
 mi rtag log par 'gyur ba'am
 mi stoñ ñes pas stoñ pa ñid
 mi stoñ med par stoñ pa ni
 mi ldan pa la gañ mthoñ ba
 mi rnams sñiñ las myur ldog ste
 mi rnams sdug bsñal lus ñid las
 mi rnams ma gtogs mi gtsaň ba'i
 mi phan mdza' bo khyad par du
 mi bya'añ skye bžin par mi 'gyur
 mi mo rnams yid gyo ba ste
 mi gtsaň phyir 'chos me tog la
 mi gtsaň ba yi srin de la
 mi gtsaň ba la gti mug ni
 mi 'tshe ba dañ bdag rtag pa
 mig gis mthoñ gi gžan gyis min
 mig dañ rna ba yis 'dzin pa
 mig dañ gzugs la brten nas yid

VI,3a
 IX,4b
 XV,24b
 XV,23d
 XI,6d
 I,21b
 VII,4a
 VII,22c
 XI,2c
 XI,3b
 XI,11a
 I,8a
 XI,4a
 VII,22a
 VII,13b
 XI,1a
 XV,9c
 XIV,3c
 XVI,21d
 XII,7d
 XIV,7d
 XII,3d
 VI,9b
 XII,1d
 XI,21a
 X,24d
 II,25a
 XI,17b
 IX,4a
 XI,13a
 XI,24c
 XVI,3c
 XVI,7a
 X,21c
 I,17b
 II,2a
 III,18a
 VI,7c
 XV,17d
 IV,22b
 III,23c
 III,20c
 III,17a
 X,6a
 XIII,11b
 XII,19c
 XIII,23a

| | |
|--|----------|
| mig de 'gros dan ldan 'gyur na | XIII,13a |
| mig ni 'byuñ 'gyur rna de bzin | XIII,11a |
| mig ni mig ñid kyis 'dzin par | XIII,16c |
| mig ma soñ bar 'dzin na ni | XIII,15a |
| mig la rnams śes yod min zin | XIII,17a |
| min phyir bum pa gcig ma yin | XIV,7b |
| min zin skyes bu'añ rtag mi 'gyur | X,8d |
| min zes de bzin gsegs pas gsuñs | V,18d |
| min zes bya la rgyu ci yod | V,3d |
| mu ger bya ba gañ 'byuñ ba | III,15b |
| mu stegs can mañ mthoñ nas ni | XII,18b |
| me ni tsha ba ji ltar 'gyur | XVI,9b |
| me la yod ces byar mi ruñ | XIV,17d |
| med gañ de phyogs mi 'gyur na | XVI,5b |
| med ces bya ba tsam zig gis | XVI,16c |
| med der gcig yod ces 'dod na | XIV,20b |
| med na thar pa smos cis dgos | XII,10d |
| med pa ñid du 'gyur na ni | XVI,19b |
| med pa de tshe gañ der brjod | XV,24d |
| med pa zes bya bzlog 'gyur na | XVI,10b |
| med par gañ las 'grub par 'gyur | XVI,20d |
| med par gñen po 'byuñ bar 'gyur | XVI,7d |
| med par mtha' yañ yod ma yin | XI,19d |
| med par yañ ni cis mi 'gyur | XVI,16d |
| med pas 'jigs par ga la 'gyur | XII,17d |
| med phyir gzan gyi phyogs la lan | XVI,14a |
| mo dan lhan cig phrad pa med | III,11b |
| mod la ci ste khyod mi 'jigs | II,5d |
| mya ñan 'das 'gyur zes bya'añ brdzun | X,20d |
| mya ñan 'das pa ma thob kyañ | VIII,22b |
| mya ñan 'das par mi 'gro ste | VIII,10c |
| mya ñan 'das par rañ 'gro yañ | XII,7a |
| mya ñan 'das la khyad par med | V,22d |
| mya ñan 'das la phuñ po rnams | IX,21a |
| myu gu byas pa skye 'gyur ba | X,24b |
| dman 'briñ khyad 'phags yod phyir ro | IV,14d |
| dman las mi sñan zes bya ba | VI,19a |
| dmyal dan mtshuñs par 'jigs bskyed 'gyur | VII,14b |
| rmañ byuñ chos la skrag pa skye | V,25d |
| rmi lam sgyu ma chu zla dan | XIII,25b |
| rmoñs las dregs pa skye bar zad | III,20d |
| rmoñs śiñ dam pa ma yin pa | VI,15c |
| smad 'gyur gzan du smos ci dgos | VIII,17d |
| sman pa 'khrug pa min pa ltar | V,9b |
| sman pa ñan ltar khyod lus la | III,1c |
| sman slad kho nar yañ dag 'byuñ | V,1d |
| sman zes bya bar 'gyur min nam | VIII,20d |

smig rgyu sprin dañ srid pa mtshuñs
 smra po yon tan rnam gžan du
 smra po la khro mi rigs na
 rtsod dus chos la brten rnams kyis
 rtsod pa'i ched du ma gsuñs te
 rtsom pas skyes pa ldog 'gyur na
 brtse ba med la chos mi gnas
 tsha ba min pa ji ltar bsreg
 tsha ba me yañ yod min žes
 tsha ba med ñid du 'gyur te
 tshul khrims kyis ni mtho ris 'gro
 tshul khrims las ni ñams bla yi
 tshogs 'dra sgyu ma'i skyes bu ltar
 tshogs pa žes bya skye 'gyur te
 tshogs bran drug chas bstabs gyur pa
 tshoñ spogs bžin du smad par 'gyur
 mtshan ñid kyis kyañ mtshan gži ni
 mtshan ñid rnams dañ so so ni
 mtshan ñid mi mthun mthoñ ma yin
 mtshan ñid mi mthun ma yin na
 mtshan gži mi rtag ñid gañ las
 mtshan las mtshan gži gžan že na
 mtshuñs par dam pa rnams la snañ
 mtshon pa'i mi brtan pa ñid ltos
 'tsho ba'i thabs so cog la yañ
 mdza' ba yun riñ mi gnas pa
 mdze can ji bžin gcin can de
 mdze po 'phrug bžin 'dod chags kyis
 'dzin par ci yi phyir mi 'gyur
 rdzas ni bya ba ji bžin du
 rdzas rnams kun la gañ mthoñ ba
 rdzogs pa yod ces byar 'gyur la
 za ba rnam par mi šes pa
 zad pa legs žes bya bar brjod
 zad par 'gyur ba ma yin nam
 zas dañ chos gso gtsug la khañ
 gzugs kyi rgyu ni mi snañ ño
 gzugs ñid bum žes gcig ma yin
 gzugs mthoñ tshe na bum pa ni
 gzugs de gsal bar ci ste min
 gzugs ldan bum gžan yod min la
 gzugs ni bum pa'i yan lag ste
 gzugs ni 'ba' žig kho na la
 gzugs ni lta žig ma gtogs par
 gzugs rnams kun la'añ gzugs ñid ni
 gzugs gžan gyi yañ loñs spyod na
 gzugs la bum pa yod ma yin

XIII,25d
 XII,1c
 VI,18c
 IV,15c
 XII,15b
 II,22a
 IV,13d
 XIV,16b
 XVI,9c
 XIV,16a
 XII,11c
 XII,11a
 VII,24b
 II,16b
 IV,2a
 V,20d
 XIV,6a
 XIV,7a
 IX,11d
 XIV,10b
 XV,13b
 XV,13a
 VII,7d
 I,17d
 IV,21a
 VIII,1b
 III,22c
 III,14a
 XIII,8e
 X,11a
 XVI,13c
 XV,24a
 X,16c
 IX,24d
 VIII,24d
 VI,13b
 XIII,8b
 XIV,2a
 XIII,1a
 XIII,13d
 XIV,2b
 XIV,9a
 XIII,4a
 XIII,8a
 XIV,10a
 III,3c
 XIV,2d

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| gzur gnas blo ldan don gñer ba'i | XII,1a |
| bzlog pa mthoñ gi sdug bñal la | II,13b |
| bzlog pa yod pa ma yin no | II,12d |
| bzlog pa yod pa ma yin no | II,13d |
| bzlog pa la ni bzlog mthoñ na | III,6b |
| bzlog par ci yis mthoñ bar 'gyur | XI,21d |
| bzlog la ñams pa mthoñ gyur te | VII,9b |
| ži sgo gñis pa med pa dan | XII,13a |
| gžan gañ žig la yod dños yod | XVI,12b |
| gžan gyi rgyu ru 'gyur ba ste | IX,9b |
| gžan gyi dños po med par ni | XV,6c |
| gžan gyi don du mkhas pa ni | IV,24c |
| gžan gyi phyogs ni bzlog pa dan | XVI,4a |
| gžan gyi phyogs la skyon brjod pa | XVI,15c |
| gžan gyi phyogs la mi dga' na | VIII,10b |
| gžan gyi dbaň dan 'jigs med par | VII,3c |
| gžan gyi las kyis 'tsho khvod kyi | IV,4c |
| gžan gyis skul te byed pa gañ | IV,7a |
| gžan gyis de cis ñar mi rtog | X,14b |
| gžan dan lhan cig bcñs pa la | VIII,4c |
| gžan dag la min rgyu ci žig | XIV,10d |
| gžan dag la yaň spyi thun phyir | I,4a |
| gžan du ži ba med ces gsuňs | XII,4d |
| gžan du šes pa yod pa'i khamś | X,12a |
| gžan ni yod pa min par ñes | IX,24b |
| gžan gnod byas pas bdag la ni | VI,20a |
| gžan rnams kyis ni sdug bñal gnas | IV,4a |
| gžan po lta bur snaň bar 'gyur | II,10d |
| gžan dbaň 'gro ba'i ñaň can la | I,2b |
| gžan tshe skye ba yod ma yin | XV,3b |
| gžan yaň 'chi bar snaň 'gyur na | I,6c |
| gžan yaň yod pa'i ño bor snaň | XV,19d |
| gžan yaň šin tu gsal bar yod | IX,6d |
| gžan la 'jigs pa mi bskyed pa'i | XII,14c |
| gžan las gnas par snaň gyur žiň | X,23c |
| gžan las rnam par 'jig par snaň | X,23d |
| gžan las 'byuň bar snaň gyur la | X,23b |
| gžan las yin no sñam du rlom | VI,16d |
| gžuň bar mi nus de bžin du | VIII,19b |
| gžuň lugs bñad par bya bar 'gyur | XIV,5d |
| bžon pa sogs la mi rnams kyi | II,20a |
| 'on te phyis na šes don med | XIII,12c |
| 'on te mi smra bar 'gro na'aň | XIII,18c |
| 'on te mi tsha na dños gžan | XIV,17c |
| 'on te gžan min na lus kyis | XIII,7c |
| ya mtshan šes bya ci žig yod | XIII,24d |
| yaň dag tu ni rnam šes pa | VI,25b |

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----------|
| yañ dag mthoñ na gnas mchog la | VIII,21a |
| yañ dag don dañ rtog pa źes | VIII,3c |
| yañ dag min smra la ci smos | VI,18d |
| yañ dag bsrñ byed ces bya ba | IV,11a |
| yañ na gañ na rgyu yod pa | IX,18c |
| yañ na rtag par gyur zin nas | XI,23c |
| yañ na blta byar 'dod pa ni | XIII,14c |
| yañ na thams cad skye bźin pa | XV,16c |
| yañ na thams cad mi rtag min | XI,22d |
| yañ na gnas pa brdzun par 'gyur | XI,24d |
| yañ na bźi ga'añ yod pa yi | XV,13c |
| yan gar řiñ zad lta bur snañ | VI,19d |
| yan lag řams pa 'ga' źig ni | III,23a |
| yid kyis kyañ ni 'dzin mi 'gyur | XI,16b |
| yid kyis smig rgyu ltar 'dzin pa | XIII,22b |
| yid du mi 'oñ ba yi sgra | VI,15a |
| yid ni don por bsgrub par bya | V,4d |
| yun ni řin tu řin pos kyañ | III,1a |
| yul de'añ ñan par brtsi ba yin | VII,20b |
| yul ni dge bas yid 'oñ na | VII,20a |
| yul ni dmigs par grags gyur te | VII,17b |
| yul rnams kyis kyañ dga' med pa | VII,25b |
| yul rnams thams cad mtshuñs phyir ro | IV,1d |
| yul rnams de yi spyod yul lo | XIV,25b |
| yul la bdag med mthoñ na ni | XIV,25c |
| yul la mur thug yod min te | III,1b |
| yoñs gtoñ mchod pa ma yin na | IV,17b |
| yoñs mi řes las gti mug ste | VI,3c |
| yoñs 'dzin 'di ko ci źig yin | III,11d |
| yod ces bya ba tsam źig gis | XVI,16a |
| yod řid yod pa ma yin pa | V,21b |
| yod dañ med dañ yod med ces | XVI,25a |
| yod dañ med dañ yod med dañ | VIII,20a |
| yod dañ med dañ yod med dañ | XIV,21a |
| yod des rnal bźin gñid log na | I,1c |
| yod na řes sdom don med 'gyur | XI,12b |
| yod na rtag tu gnas yod min | XI,23b |
| yod pa gdod nas skye 'gyur ba | XV,1c |
| yod pa med ces byar mi rigs | X,11d |
| yod pa'i ño bo'añ yod ma yin | XIII,10d |
| yod par mi mkhas rnams kyis rtog | XI,16d |
| yod min gañ źag srid ma yin | IX,21b |
| yod min de med me yod min | XIV,16d |
| yod med min źes bya ba'i tshul | XIV,21b |
| yon tan cuñ zad kyañ med na | VI,20b |
| yon tan ldan pa sdug pa dañ | III,6a |
| yon tan gnas la 'jigs řes pa | VI,23c |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| yon tan rnams kyis rnam kun tu | X,16a |
| yon tan med sñam śes bñin du | I,18b |
| gyul ñor bdag kyañ yonś gtoñ ba | IV,17c |
| rag las par ni mi 'gyur na | XIV,1b |
| rañ khyim las bñin srid pa ni | VIII,12c |
| rañ gi phyogs ni bsgrub pa ste | XVI,4b |
| rañ ñid kyis kyañ sdig byed na | IV,8c |
| rañ ñid 'chi bdag byed po med | I,1b |
| rañ ñid bur gyur de yi tshe | I,13b |
| rañ ñid 'byuñ bar gyur de la | IX,10c |
| rañ ñid 'bras bur mi 'gyur te | XIV,12b |
| rañ ñid spyo bya smra po ni | I,12c |
| rañ phyogs 'jig rten thams cad la | XII,24a |
| rañ bñin gñan gyis zil gnong ces | II,7c |
| rab tu byed pa thams cad kyis | XVI,1c |
| rigs kun nañ nas rañ las la | IV,6a |
| rigs pa'i don ni gñan las kyañ | XII,25a |
| rigs par mi 'gyur ma yin no | I,13d |
| rigs las 'ga' yañ yod ma yin | IV,22d |
| rigs las dbye ba yod ma yin | XV,11c |
| riñ por gyur kyañ 'bral ba min | I,21d |
| riñ chen rañ bñin mchog rten ni | V,7a |
| rim kyis 'byuñ ba'añ yod min na | XV,11c |
| re re'i bum pa med na ni | XIV,7c |
| reg dañ mi ldan dños po la | X,5a |
| reg ldan reg dañ mi ldan dañ | XIV,8a |
| reñ bu ji ltar 'dzin par 'gyur | XIII,19d |
| ro sogs dag las gzugs gñan žin | XIV,11a |
| rlabs chen yid can de la ni | V,22a |
| rlom can sñin rje ldan pa med | VII,16b |
| brlag bñin pa ni bde'o žes | II,17b |
| la la de ñid la chags te | VIII,2a |
| la la de ñid la sdañ žin | VIII,2b |
| la la de ñid la rmoñs pa | VIII,2c |
| la la sdug bsñal zil mnan žin | VIII,13a |
| la la yi ni bla mar 'gyur | V,12b |
| la la'i slob mar 'gyur ba ste | V,12a |
| la lar kun tu soñ bar mthoñ | X,18a |
| la lar skyes bu lus tsam žig | X,18b |
| la lar rdul tsam žig mthoñ ste | X,18c |
| lañ tsho rgyab tu byuñ gyur nas | VII,2a |
| lam de ñid kyis thams cad kyañ | VIII,24c |
| las kyis dmañs kyañ bram zer ni | IV,23c |
| las ni 'bad pas byed 'gyur žin | VII,12a |
| las byed bde ba yin no žes | II,18c |
| las la chags bral 'ga' yod min | VII,12d |
| luñ la sogs pa'i rgyu rnams kyis | IV,10c |

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----------|
| lus can rnams la bkres sogs kyis | II,15a |
| lus ni dgra ltar mthoñ mod kyi | II,1a |
| lus ni śin tu 'gor bas kyañ | II,7a |
| lus la gus dañ dgra la gus | II,6c |
| lus la lus dbañ ji bzin du | VI,10a |
| lus bzin rnam par 'gyur bar 'gyur | X,4b |
| lus la yon tan med thos nas | VIII,24a |
| len dañ yonś su gtoñ ba ni | V,20c |
| log ltas mya ñan mi 'da' bar | VIII,7c |
| gla pa ltar bu bsod nams ni | VII,23a |
| śā kya gos med bram ze ste | XII,19a |
| śas cher mi la mi 'byuñ na | III,3b |
| śin tu stobs ldan ci yañ med | II,9d |
| śin tu yun riñ bsags pa de | V,18b |
| śin tu yun riñ bslus par 'gyur | XII,6d |
| śes pa yod ñid min ltar mthoñ | X,13d |
| śes med pa yi yod pa yañ | IX,22c |
| śes yod yid tsam žig la ste | X,13a |
| śes yod yon tan ci žig yod | IX,22b |
| śes yod sa bon srid pa yod | IX,23b |
| śes rab can gyis med par mthoñ | X,18d |
| śes la skrag pa bsgrub par bya | XII,8d |
| bśañ khañ la yañ chags skye žiñ | III,16b |
| sa steñ skye bo thams cad ni | V,6b |
| sa steñ sdig pa'i rnam smin ni | VII,7a |
| sa bdag de ni smad de dper | IV,12b |
| sa ni brtan žes bya bar mthoñ | XIII,9a |
| sa'o žes ni bya bar brjod | XIII,9d |
| sa sred ldog pa med ji bzin | III,2b |
| sañś rgyas kun gyi yul 'gyur la | XII,13b |
| sañś rgyas kyis gsuñś lkog gyur la | XII,5a |
| sañś rgyas rnams kyi gyo ba ni | V,1a |
| sañś rgyas rnams kyis chags can la | VI,13a |
| sañś rgyas rnams la med ñid kyañ | XVI,11c |
| su žig khyad bsad mthar byas nas | VI,24a |
| su žig sñiñ brtse skye mi 'gyur | XII,18d |
| su žig phyi mar 'joms par byed | IV,24d |
| su la'añ gti mug kyañ mi 'byuñ | X,22d |
| su la'añ gson pa žes bya ba | I,10a |
| sun 'byin byed pa'i gtan tshigs rñed | XVI,15a |
| sems kyī skad cig las gžan med | I,10b |
| sems can rñom pa can min dkon | VII,16a |
| sems pa can dañ ldan bdag kyañ | X,8a |
| sems ma rtogs par 'gro sogs la | V,4a |
| so so'i skye bo bstan bya des | II,24b |
| so so'i skye bo dag gis rtog | IX,5b |
| so so'i skye bos sdug bsñal ni | II,23a |

| | |
|-------------------------------------|----------|
| so sor dgag par bya ba yin | XIII,2d |
| sogs pa 'dod chags de bzin 'dod | III,23d |
| sogs pa'i rgyan ni don med 'gyur | XI,15d |
| sogs la yod ñid yod min na | VIII,3b |
| soñ ste 'añ ci zig byed par 'gyur | XIII,21b |
| soñ bas yon tan 'ga' yañ med | XIII,14b |
| srid gañ 'jigs pa mi bskyed dkon | VII,14d |
| srid gnas smyon pa ma yin zes | VII,8c |
| srid dañ bral la thar pa'i tshe | IX,22a |
| srid dañ srid thabs zi ba yi | XII,2a |
| srid pa yi ni sred pa bzin | IV,12d |
| srid pa yod pa ma yin pa | XV,18b |
| srid pa yod par mi 'gyur ro | XVI,20b |
| srid pa hrul por byas par 'gyur | VIII,5d |
| srid pa'i sa bon 'gag par 'gyur | XIV,25d |
| srid pa'i sa bon rnam šes te | XIV,25a |
| srid par khyod la rañ 'dod kyis | VIII,3a |
| srid par dam pa su la 'gyur | IV,1b |
| srid pas sgyu ma 'dra ma yin | XV,10d |
| sregs te me yis bud šin bzin | XII,15d |
| srog ni byed pa por mi 'gyur | X,5d |
| sla zes 'jig rten brjod na yañ | XVI,15b |
| slar yañ thams cad 'byuñ ba ste | XV,12b |
| slar yañ mdun du 'byuñ bar 'gyur | VII,2b |
| slar yañ yan lag can du 'gyur | XIII,6b |
| slar yañ sems skye min des na | XI,25b |
| slob ma la ni sri zu bya | V,8b |
| gsad par bya ba'i phyugs rnams ltar | I,6a |
| gsal bar 'jigs pa'i 'o dod 'dra | I,3d |
| gsal bar go 'phañ dam par 'gro | VII,24d |
| gsal bar yod pa min dañ mtshuñs | IX,22d |
| gsuñ bya gsuñ bya min mña' ba | V,3b |
| gsuñs der gañ la gus med pa | VIII,6c |
| gsum rnams kyi yañ chos yid dañ | XII,19b |
| gsum pa byed pa don med 'gyur | XIII,12b |
| gsum pa'añ de la yod ma yin | XI,8d |
| gser gyi snod du skyug pa na | II,21a |
| gson pa bya ba min ltar ro | I,2d |
| gson pa zad pa ma yin na | I,8b |
| bsam khral med pas mya ñan las | VIII,11c |
| bsam pa'añ yod pa ma yin no | IX,23d |
| bsam pas byañ chub sems dpa' la | V,5a |
| bsam bzin pa na bya ba ni | VIII,23a |
| bsod nams kyis bskyed de yi tshe | IV,20b |
| bsod nams chuñ ñu chos 'di la | VIII,5a |
| bsod nams chen po thob 'gyur na | VI,21b |
| bsod nams 'dod pas stoñ pa ñid | VIII,18a |

- Studies in Honour of Hugh Richardson*, Warminster 1980.
- La Vallée Poussin, L. de, (ed.) *Mūlamadhyamakakārikās de Nāgārjuna avec la Prasannapadā Commentaire de Candrakīrti*, St. Petersburg 1903-1913.
- , (ed.) *Madhyamakāvatāra par Candrakīrti*, St. Petersburg 1907-1912.
- , *L'Abhidharmakośa de Vasubandhu*, 6 vols. Louvain 1923-1931.
- , 'Le Nirvāṇa d'après Āryadeva,' MCB 1 (1932), pp. 127-135.
- Lindtner, C., 'Buddhapālita on Emptiness', IJ 23 (1981), pp. 187-217.
- , 'Adversaria Buddhica', WZKS 26 (1982), pp. 167-194.
- , (ed.) *Nagarjuniana*, Copenhagen 1982.
- , (ed.) *Nāgārjunas filosofiske værker*, København 1982.
- May, J. (ed.), *Candrakīrti Prasannapadā Madhyamakavṛtti*, Paris 1959.
- , 'Chūgan' in *Hōbōgin*, V, pp. 470-493.
- , 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence' in *Indianisme et Bouddhisme*, Louvain-la-neuve 1980, pp. 215-232.
- , 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (II)', BEFEO 68 (1981), pp. 75-96.
- , 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (III)', *Études Asiatiques*, XXXV,2 (1981), pp. 46-74.
- , 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (IV)', *Études de Lettres*, 1982, pp. 47-76.
- , 'Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la Permanence (V)', *Acta Indologica*, 1984, pp. 115-144.
- Morris, R. and E. Hardy (eds.) *Āṅguttara Nikāya*. 5 vols. London 1885-1900.
- Murti, T. R. V., *The Central Philosophy of Buddhism*, London 1960.
- Nakamura, H., *Indian Buddhism*, Osaka 1980.
- Nanjio, B. (ed.) *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*, Kyoto 1923.
- Oldenberg, H. and R. Pischel (eds.) *Thera- and Therī-Gāthā*, London 1966.
- Radhakrishnan, S. (ed.) *Dhammapada*, London 1950.
- Rahder, J. (ed.) *Daśabhūmikāsūtra*, Louvain 1926.
- Red mda' ba gžon nu blo gros, *dBu ma bži brgya pa'i 'grel pa*, Sarnath 1974.
- Rhys-Davids, T. W. and J. E. Carpenter (eds.) *Dīgha Nikāya*. 3 vols. London 1890-1911.
- Robinson, R., *Early Mādhyamika in India and China*, Madison 1967.

- Ruegg, D. S., 'The uses of the four positions of the catuṣkoṭi and the problem of the description of reality in Mahāyāna Buddhism', JIP 5 (1977), pp. 1-71.
- , *The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India*, Wiesbaden 1981.
- Sastri, P. S., 'Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva', IHQ 31 (1955), pp. 195-202.
- Schayer, S., *Ausgewählte Kapitel aus der Prasannapadā*, Krakow 1931.
- Shastri, H., 'Notes on the newly-found manuscript of Catuḥśatika of Āryadeva', *Asiatic Society of Bengal. Journal and Proceedings*, n.s. 8 (1911), pp. 431-436.
- , (ed.) 'Catuḥśatikā of Ārya Deva', *Memoirs of the Asiatic Society of Bengal*. 3/8 (1914), pp. 448-514.
- Sprung, M. *Lucid Exposition of the Middle Way*, Boulder 1979.
- Staël-Holstein, A. von (ed.) *Kāśyapaparivarta*, Shanghai 1926.
- Stcherbatsky, T., *The Conception of Buddhist Nirvāṇa*, Leningrad 1927.
- Streng, F., *Emptiness. A study in religious meaning*, Nashville 1967.
- Tola, F. and C. Dragonetti, 'The Yuktiṣaṣṭikā of Nāgārjuna', JIABS 6, n.2 (1983), pp. 94-123.
- , 'Nāgārjuna's Catustava', JIP 13 (1985), pp. 1-54.
- Trenckner V. and R. Chalmers (eds.) *Majjhima Nikāya*. 3 vols. London 1948-1951.
- Tucci, G. 'Study Mahāyānici: La versione cinese del Catuḥśataka di Āryadeva confrontata col testo sanscrito e la traduzione tibetana', *Rivista degli Studi Orientali* X (1925), pp. 521-567.
- , 'Un traité d'Āryadeva sur le Nirvāṇa des hérétiques', TP, 2nd series (1926), pp. 16-31.
- , *Pre-Dinnāga Buddhist Texts on Logic from Chinese Sources*, Baroda 1929.
- , (ed) 'Ratnāvalī of Nāgārjuna' JRAS 1934, pp. 307-325; JRAS 1936, pp. 237-252, 423-435.
- Vaidya, P. L., *Études sur Āryadeva et son Catuḥśataka*, Paris 1923.
- Walleser, M., *Die Mittlere Lehre des Nāgārjuna, nach der chinesischen Version*, Heidelberg 1911.
- , *Die Mittlere Lehre des Nāgārjuna, nach der tibetischen Version*, Heidelberg 1912.
- , (ed.) *Buddhapālitamūlamadhyamakavṛtti*, St. Petersburg 1914-1915.

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----------|
| bsod nams 'bras bu phyug pa ste | VII,18a |
| bsod nams min pa dañ por bzlog | VIII,15a |
| bsod nams min pa 'aṅ 'jig yod min | IV,10d |
| bsruṅ po yin yaṅ mi yi bdag | IV,13c |
| bsruṅ ba na la rag las źes | IV,8a |
| bsruṅ byar sa bdag snaṅ 'gyur na | IV,5b |
| bsregs te me yis bud śiṅ bźin | XII,15d |
| ha caṅ ĩe dañ ches riṅ du | XIII,13c |
| lhan cig rgyu bar snaṅ min nam | I,20d |
| lhan cig dños po la yod na | XI,24b |
| lhan cig gtaṅ du 'jig par 'gyur | VII,15d |
| lhan cig phrad pa med par mthoṅ | VI,4b |
| lhan cig phrad pa med par mthoṅ | VI,4d |
| lhan cig sbyor ba źes bya med | XIV,8b |
| e ma khyod spyod skye bo ni | I,11c |

Selected bibliography

- Andersen, D. and H. Smith (eds.), *Suttanipāṭa*, London 1948.
- Bernhard, F. (ed.) *Udānavarga*, 2 vols. Göttingen 1965-1968.
- Bhaskar, B. J. (ed.) *Āryadeva's Catuḥśatakam*, Nagpur 1971.
- Bhattacharya, K., *The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna*, Delhi 1978.
- Bhattacharya, V., 'The Catuḥśataka of Āryadeva' in *Proceedings and Transactions of the Fourth Oriental Conference*, Allahabad 1928.
- , *The Catuḥśataka of Āryadeva*, Calcutta 1931.
- Conze, E., *The Prajñāpāramitā Literature*, rev. ed. Tokyo 1978.
- Dietz, S., *Die buddhistische Briefliteratur Indiens. Nach dem tibetischen Tanjur herausgegeben, übersetzt und erläutert*, Wiesbaden 1984.
- mDo snags bstan pa'i ni ma, *dBu ma bži brgya pa'i tshig don rnam par bśad pa klu dgoṅs rgyan*, New Delhi 1978.
- Feer, L. (ed.) *Samyutta Nikāya*, 6 vols. London 1884-1904.
- Frauwallner, E., *Die Philosophie des Buddhismus*, Berlin 1969.
- Gokhale, V., *Akṣara-Çatakam, The Hundred Letters*, Heidelberg 1930.
- Gómez, V., 'Proto-Mādhyaṃika in the Pāli Canon', *PEW* 26 (1978), pp. 137-165.
- rGyal tshab dar ma rin chen, *bĴi brgya pa'i rnam bśad legs bśad sniṅ po*, Sarnath 1971.
- Hahn, M., *Nāgārjuna's Ratnāvalī*, Bonn 1982.
- Honda, M., 'Ārya Deva's critique against Sāṃkhya', *JIBS* 23/1 (1974), pp. 491-486.
- Hopkins, J. et al., *The Precious Garland and the Song of the Four Mindfulnesses*, London 1975.
- , *Meditation on Emptiness*, London 1983.
- Jong, J. W. de, *Cinq Chapitres de la Prasannapadā*, Paris 1949.
- , (rev.) Étienne Lamotte, *Le Traité de la Grand Vertu de Sagesse de Nāgārjuna*, III. *Asia Major* 17 (1971), pp. 105-112.
- , (ed.) *Mūlamadhyamakakārikāḥ*, Madras 1977.
- , 'Textcritical Notes on the Prasannapadā', *IJ* 20 (1978), pp. 25-29, 217-252.
- Lamotte, É., *Traité de la Grande Vertu de Sagesse de Nāgārjuna*, 5 vols. Louvain 1949-1980.
- , *L'Enseignement de Vimalakīrti*, Louvain 1962.
- Lang, K. C., 'Āryadeva on the career of the bodhisattva' in *Tibetan*

Warder, A. K., *Indian Buddhism*, Delhi 1970.

Wayman, A., *Calming the Mind and Discerning the Real*, New York 1978.

Yamakami, S., *Systems of Buddhistic Thought*, Calcutta 1912.

gZan dga' gzan phan chos kyi snañ ba, *bsTan bcos bži brgya pa zes bya ba'i tshig le'ur bcas pa'i mchan 'grel*, Simtokha, Bhutan 1976.

